ANGLICA

An International Journal of English Studies

Special Issue: Scotland   **29/3 2020**

UNIVERSITY
OF WARSAW

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction
Keeping the Door(s) Open

In *Spring*, the third novel of Ali Smith's Seasonal Quartet that came out in March 2019, we can read in the blurb that "spring" is "the great connective," that "Ali Smith tells the impossible tale of an impossible time. In a time of walls and lockdown, [she] opens the door." We can say the same for the previous two novels, *Autumn* (2016) and *Winter* (2017), presuming that *Summer*, due out in 2020, will uphold the running theme of highlighting the exclusion of the Other, of putting up walls, of locking out everything that is different, alien, strange. In showing how to keep our doors open, both literally and metaphorically, she speaks up against the policies that are taking over today's world, policies which, to many of us, are unacceptable and are perceived as actions against humanity.

Ali Smith, born in Inverness in 1962, received a joint degree in English language and literature from the University of Aberdeen and has been living in Cambridge since 1992. Her first collection of stories, *Free Love and Other Stories*, came out in 1995 and over the years she has been shortlisted four times for the Man Booker Prize, the last time for *Autumn* in 2017. It is in this first novel of the Quartet that we are witness to Smith's immeasurable anger and overwhelming anxiety at the outcome of the 2016 EU Referendum. In foregrounding what started to take place immediately after the Referendum results were announced: "GO HOME" painted on houses, people reacting to foreign holiday-makers in a negative manner, insults hurled by thugs and anger directed at immigrants, especially Poles and Muslims, as well as quite openly by right-wing politicians in the media, she evokes a very deep thought-provoking reflection on divisions: local, national and international. This is especially evident in the mantra-like chapter in which, referring to the outcome of the Referendum, each sentence repetitively starts with the phrase "All across the country…," showing the existing divisions between, for example, "misery and rejoicing," people feeling "it was the wrong thing" and others feeling "it was the right thing," or that they "had done the right thing and other people had done the wrong thing. […] All across the country, things got nasty. […] All across the country racist bile was general. […] All across the country, people said it was about control. All across the country, everything changed overnight" (59–61).

What, however, has not changed is the very deep and unusual friendship between the main character, thirty-two-year-old Elisabeth Demand, a casual contract junior lecturer teaching a history-of-art course at one of the universities in London, and a Jewish-German World-War II survivor, Daniel Gluck, who has reached the age of 101, is living in a care home and has no next of kin. They have known each other since Elisabeth was eight years old, when Daniel moved into the house next door. Without ever really saying anything about himself or his past,[1] he introduces the little girl to a completely different way of thinking, of perceiving the world, of using language, reading books, and looking at art, pop-art of the 1960s in particular. His staple question on greeting her: "What you reading?" keeps her in good stead. Books are always with her, even when she sits at his bedside when he is in a protracted sleep, still alive but not openly reacting to the outside world. When there is no possibility of dialogue any more, literature and art remain.

Autumn by Ali Smith is an international novel, a novel of contemporary divisions and exclusion, but also a novel of love and enduring friendship. It refers to topics that concern all of us, the love and understanding of one human being towards another, no matter who that person is, where s/he comes from, and also where s/he is heading. It is a reaction to what is happening in our world today, the reflection of which is Brexit, the breaking up of a union, creating borders and divisions that do not lead to anything positive. At the same time, we are also awakened to a wider European phenomenon than solely a British one, or in this case more specifically English, and to what can be perceived today throughout Europe where ultra-nationalist, fascist movements are gaining force.

Smith's concern with injustice and the absolute mess the world is in is further revealed in her second seasonal novel *Winter*, in which we are reminded of one of Shakespeare's lesser known plays, *Cymbeline*, being about:

> a kingdom subsumed in chaos, lies, powermongering, division and a great deal of poisoning, […] where everybody is pretending to be someone or something else […]. And you can't see for the life of you how any of it will resolve in the end, because it's such a tangled up messed-up farce of a mess. (200)

At the same time, we are presented with a very beautiful 21st-century Christmas tale thanks to one of Smith's "radiant disruptors," to quote the writer and critic Olivia Laing (qtd. in Preston, 2019), who appear in a number of Smith's novels. In *Winter*, it is Lux, who brings life, warmth, and quiet understanding into the dead-end existence of Sophie, one of the novel's characters, who lives in an empty, neglected fifteen-bedroom house. Smith's ever-present concern over the shameful and totally unjustified British system of refugee detention and immigration policies surfaces in the position Lux finds herself in. This unexpected 'disruptor,' an immigrant to the UK, is Smith's connective, bringing good, hope and optimism

into a world of misery, despair and disruption. Lux is not the typical immigrant or refugee seeking a new and better life in a more prosperous country or escaping poverty or death in war-torn parts of the world, but is a Croatian-born girl from Canada who "started a university course [in England] three years ago but ran out of money and now can't afford to complete it" (246). And, to quote Lux herself, having to lie low: "now I can't get a good job because nobody knows if I'll still be able to be here this time next year or when they'll decide we have to go. So I'm keeping myself below the radar […]" (247). This situation has its all too clear reflection on the concourse in King's Cross Station in London in such news headlines appropriately appearing, for example, on "two huge Sky News JCDecaux Transvision screens at either end of the departures boards […]" (219):

> [A] poll has found that citizens of this country *oppose a unilateral guarantee* for the citizens who live here and who are originally from a lot of other countries to be able to stay here with full rights of residence after a certain date.
> Panic. Attack. Exclude. (220; original emphasis)

It is these three last words that permeate Ali Smith's overpowering concern over what she sees as ever-present and totally unacceptable in contemporary British politics and propaganda. They also express the main themes of all three novels that have appeared within the seasonal quartet so far. The blunt realism of the presented image of our contemporary world clashes with magic realism and with the introduction of art and artists who mean a great deal to her: Pauline Botty, Barbara Hepworth and Tacita Dean, thanks to which we have, as Alex Preston says in his review of *Spring*, a "dazzling interplay of ideas and images" (2019).

It is in *Spring*, which appeared according to plan in the spring of 2019, that we are brutally confronted with a sinister security firm known as SA4A,[2] which had made itself first known to us in *Autumn*, and the British system of refugee detention, a system Ali Smith has been actively fighting against for years. She has also been involved in what is known as the Refugee Tales Project, which is a call to end indefinite immigration detention. The UK is the only country in Europe that holds people, many of them asylum seekers, in what are officially called Immigration Removal Centres for an indefinite period of time. There are ten such centres whose stated purpose is to detain people who the government intends to deport. The security levels are similar to that of prisons, the conditions often worse than in prisons, and the indefinite period of detention may last for years.

The Refugee Tales themselves have appeared in four volumes to date, starting in 2016, published by Comma Press in Manchester. They are the true stories of asylum seekers who have suffered at the hands of Britain's policy of 'indefinite detention' and are told to writers, poets, dramatists, critics and academics, some of whom are prominent figures in the literary world. They take the form

of a modern *Canterbury Tales*, e.g. "The Detainee's Tale" as told to Ali Smith (2015) or "The Smuggled Person's Tale" as told to Jackie Kay (2018).[3] Let me just quote a short excerpt from the former tale that first appeared in *The Guardian*:

> On the train home this evening, I'll think of the moment you say to me, as we're saying goodbye: people don't know what it's like to be a detainee. They think it's like what the government tells them. They don't know. You have to tell them. (2015)

It was not only in this tale presented to the public through different media that Smith introduced us to the situation of so many detainees in the UK today, but also through her very young and quite amazing character Florence Smith, another of her 'radiant disruptors' in *Spring*:

> The girl is like someone out of a legend or a story, the kind of story that on the one hand isn't really about real life but on the other is the only way you ever really understand anything about real life. She makes people behave like they should, or like they live in a different better world. […] Another old word from history and songs that nobody uses in real life any more. She is good. (314)

As the above-mentioned *Guardian* critic Alex Preston wrote in his review:

> Like Florence Smith, her namesake, Smith is good. She has always been a profoundly moral writer, but in this series of novels she is doing something more than merely anatomizing the iniquities of her age. She's lightening a path out of the nightmarish now.

In all three seasonal novels to date Smith has been unquestionably and astoundingly outspoken on matters that concern immigrants, refugees, detainees, on closing the door to all those who may be in some way inconvenient, but also simply because they are different, alien, from outside. It is also highly significant that in *Spring* – for the first time in these seasonal novels – Smith introduces the Highlands of Scotland, the land she knows so well from her childhood and young adult life, and certain tragic events of that region from the past. Through her intermingling of themes as well as implicit and explicit presentation, the knowledgeable reader will understand the references to the historical complexities leading to the many Highlanders' loss of language and culture, the disastrous Jacobite defeat at Culloden near Inverness in April 1746, people being cleared off their land for the benefit of sheep-farming, among others, that led to closing the door on thousands of Gaels. This in turn resulted in mass migration within Scotland itself and emigration to distant continents.[4] The analogy between past and present is striking, the only difference being in who the dispossessed happen to be. The tragic consequences are often very similar, if not the same.

* * *

As has been illustrated above, Ali Smith's outrage at the injustices of the world has its very pronounced reflection in her writing and what she wishes to pass on to that very world. There is openness and understanding; in other words, her door is kept open, even wide open. We can say the same for the following articles included in this special Scottish issue of *ANGLICA*. The authors, coming from different countries and academic milieus, show only too clearly how different doors have been kept open in the past or are being kept open today. This is presented, for example, through travel and tourism, through a confrontation with otherness, as well as through translation and an interest in other languages and cultures.

Gillian Beattie-Smith's presentation of a Highland Lady abroad on the basis of Elizabeth Grant's *Memoirs of a Highland Lady* (1898) shows emigration and the travelling Scot in a somewhat different light to what we so often associate with the Highlands of Scotland. The daughter of the Laird of the Rothiemurchus estate in the Cairngorms, very near to the small town of Kingussie which appears in Ali Smith's *Spring*, experiences different forms of emigration but never is she made to feel unwelcome. We read about the time she spent in England and Ireland, France and India. Due to her father's debts, the family was forced to live in India for a while, whereas a number of years later, there was a move to France for two years (1843–1845). This in turn was due to the need to reduce expenditure on her husband's Wicklow Estate in Ireland. Wherever she went, however, she was always the Highland Lady, foregrounding her Highland identity even when drawing cultural parallels, for example, between France and Scotland. She could afford to do this as her emigration was only temporary, even if brought about by strained circumstances. The doors were always kept open for her. The opposite, however, can be observed on Elizabeth Grant's husband's Baltiboys Estate in County Wicklow where during the famine and as a result of the Poor Law of Ireland, which brought about the opposite of what was planned, brutal capitalism took over compassion. Tenants started facing evictions and were encouraged to leave for America. The doors in Ireland were rapidly closing on them.

It is interesting to note that Elizabeth Grant's family home, the Rothiemurchus estate, has, over the years, become quite a tourist attraction, also due to it having been the residence of the 'Highland Lady.' Through her memoirs this Lady created her own identity, whereas her family estate, still in the Grant family today, is an example of the construction of place identities. **Irmina Wawrzyczek's** article "Scottish Wilderness Rejuvenated. The Regional Identity of Scotland as a Tourist Destination in *The Scots Magazine* 2017–2018," written within the field of Tourism Studies, shows how the said magazine, with the active involvement of Scottish National Heritage, promotes Scotland's wilderness, ironically brought about in part by the forced exodus of many thousands of Highlanders in the past. The Scottish wilderness is presented as the dominant identity marker of the region. Within the context of today's identity-based economy, every trick is laid out on the table to bring the tourists in. Everybody is welcome.

Elizabeth Grant wrote her journals that included descriptions and reflections on her travels abroad in the first half of the 19th century, where her personal identity as a 'Highland Lady' was foregrounded. *The Scots Magazine* promotes region, or specific localities as an identity marker to bring travellers in, whereas the contemporary Scottish writer[5] Kenneth White's mental journeys become the backbone of his travelogues – also called waybooks – and poems. **Monika Kocot**, in her "Writing the Road: On the Drifting and Travelling-Seeing in Kenneth White's Geopoetics," introduces us to the writer's intellectual nomadism, to White's philosophy of travelling, to how he perceives 'life as a journey,' as well as to his exploration of different mindscapes and the inseparable link between writing and walking.[6] White, through his 'road literature,' is presented to us as a 'border-crosser,' as a traveller whose mental cartography is completely freed from the constraints of any ideology or religious beliefs. Here we also learn about his perception of drifting, of what he calls travelling-seeing (*voyage-voyance*), with special emphasis on one of his travelogues/waybooks, *Travels in the Drifting Dawn.* His philosophy of life has its reflection in the International Institute of Geopoetics that he founded in 1989. The Scottish Centre for Geopoetics was set up in Edinburgh in 1995 and the following year, the National Library of Scotland held the exhibition *White World, the Itinerary of Kenneth White*, curated by Toni McManus. It is of significance to note that it was subsequently re-titled *Open World*.[7]

Kenneth White's intellectual nomadism, 'travelling-writing' and 'travelling-seeing' point to an open world, as reflected in the above-mentioned exhibition, and he and his work – as observed above – can be perceived as 'border-crossers.' Another 'border-crosser,' but in the more literal sense, is Alan Riach, to whose collection *Homecoming: New Poems 2001–2009* (2009) and the journey motif **Barry Keane** devotes his article "Finding Your Way Home. Explorations of the Journey Motif in Alan Riach's *Homecoming*." Here we encounter the poet's remembering, leaving, finding and rediscovering home. 'Home' is regarded as a place of departure but the motif is also understood in terms "of an international-ist summation which locates and bolsters Scotland's own sense of identity," the collection of poems encompassing "the arc of departure, settling, travelling, returning, and re-settling," to quote the author of the article. As we know, people are constantly on the move, always searching for something, aiming towards something, or escaping from something. There is forced emigration and the lack of acceptance as has been depicted in Ali Smith's seasonal novels, but there is also emigration accompanied by acceptance as in the case of Alan Riach's move to New Zealand. The door to his new destination was wide open as was the door to Scotland, a country he always could, and finally did, come back to.

The doors were also open for Polish physicist Marian Smoluchowski (1872–1917) when he went to Glasgow in 1896. He spent the academic year of 1896/97 at Glasgow University as Research Fellow working with Sir William Thomson, later known as Lord Kelvin. His academic collaboration with the

Glasgow physicists of the time resulted in long-standing friendships and an exchange of research in the field of physics. Smoluchowski also loved mountain-climbing and, when in Scotland, he made the most of the opportunity to travel to the Highlands and experience the Scottish mountains. He was always made very welcome. **Aleksandra Budrewicz's** "A Polish Physicist Visits Glasgow. Marian Smoluchowski's Depictions of Scotland" gives us an interesting account of the physicist's experiences both as a researcher at Glasgow University and as a tourist and climber. The account is based on his diaries, which have survived the passage of time, and on his essays entitled "Wycieczki górskie w Szkocji (1896)" ['Climbing Excursions in Scotland (1896)'], which appeared in the magazine *Taternik* during the years 1915–1921.

Moving from the élite Glasgow society of 19th-century academia and the highly positive experiences of a foreign tourist in the Scottish Highlands, **Tom Hubbard** brings us into somewhat more recent times with his "*Namiętność* in a Caledonian Metropolis. Scottish Urban Fiction and Its Cultures." The fiction in question presents Scotland's Irish, Jewish, Polish and Asian incomers, presented by Patrick McGill, J.D. Simons, Fred Urquart, and Suhayl Saadi respectively. With the exception of Fred Urquart's works, in which we have Edinburgh and "a slightly disguised Cupar in Fife," as Tom Hubbard describes it, we are confronted with a totally different Glasgow, that of the city's infamous slum district, the Gorbals. We are also witness to an ethnic mix resulting in multiple identities, the not always easy co-habitation of different cultures, but also the acceptance of the mutual need of one another. Despite the difficulties and frequent misunderstandings, there is enrichment through diversity, a reminder of what we also encounter in Ali Smith's *Winter*.

Unfortunately, as has been revealed all too often, acceptance does not always take place. Diversity may not be desired and any form of otherness is frequently rejected. **Ewa Szymańska-Sabala** investigates Kafkaesque surrealism revisited by Jackie Kay when she asks: "What lurks behind the shell?" Scots Makar Jackie Kay, who knows only too well what it means to be rejected and perceived as the Other simply because she looks a little different than the vast majority, also knew how to prove her point when she reached out to Kafka's modernist novella "The Metamorphosis" from 1915 for her short story "Shell" that came out in 2002. Both the stories themselves and Ewa Szymańska-Sabala's analysis give much food for thought concerning what social exclusion means to those concerned.

Moving from a European writer from the beginning of the 20th century and one of the leading Scottish literati of today writing about what it means to be different in our contemporary world, let us now turn to the building of relationships and the enhancing of intercultural communication through the compiling of bilingual or multilingual dictionaries. **Mark O'Fionnáin** introduces us to the quite amazing venture undertaken by the German Peter Simon Pallas (1741–1811) who decided to create a comparative dictionary containing near on 300 words in Russian and

their equivalents in 200 languages and dialects. Among the languages taken into consideration, we can find Scottish Gaelic, of course as perceived in the 1770s. The dictionary itself appeared in St Petersburg in the 1780s. We can learn a lot from the article about the history and layout of the dictionary, but of special interest is obviously how Scottish Gaelic is presented and compared with other languages.

Remaining in the world of the Gaels, **Petra Johana Poncarová** looks into the Gaelic dimension of the Ossianic controversy and into leading Gaelic writer and scholar Derick Thomson's contribution to the dispelling of certain long-standing beliefs. In her article she not only wishes to highlight the detailed work Thomson put into researching James Macpherson's phenomenally successful 18th-century 'translations' of the 3rd-century hero Fingal as told to his son Ossian, but also to encourage research on the significance of Derick Thomson's work in promoting the Gaelic language and culture. Although Thomson's research into the Gaelic sources Macpherson used for his work – fourteen or fifteen ballads – was described in his *Gaelic Sources of Macpherson's "Ossian,"* published over a half a century ago (1952), and that the conclusions reached by Thomson, as Petra Johana Poncarová writes, "go against the widespread impression that there were no sources and that Macpherson made it all up," it is still often overlooked by scholars and the controversy still does not seem to have come to an end. At the same time, we have to remember how throughout his long academic career as Professor of Celtic at Glasgow University (1963–1991) and in his numerous other roles as poet, publisher and editor Thomson quietly and in his own steadfast manner worked towards opening the door to that still little-known cultural world of the Highlands of Scotland.

This same world is more often than not still perceived by many through the prism of Shakespeare's depiction of the medieval King of the Scots, Macbeth, which does not always fully correspond with Scottish historians' accounts and view of this monarch (e.g. see Steel, 34; Halliday, 122–123; Barrell, 12–13). **Agnieszka Piskorska**, however, is primarily concerned with the resemblance of Shakespeare's *Macbeth* to its cinematic depiction by Justin Kurzel (2015), at the same time looking at how the film director's version differs from other film adaptations of the play. Looking at her chosen topic from a Relevance-Theoretic perspective within Translation Studies, she refers to the notion of intersemiotic translation, interpretative resemblance, and interpretants. It is interesting to see how this most recent screen adaptation works towards making medieval Scotland believable to the contemporary viewer.

Within the medium of film and Translation Studies Agnieszka Piskorska's article looked into how Justin Kurzel was translating Shakespeare's *Macbeth* for the contemporary viewer. **Dominika Lewandowska-Rodak**, on the other hand, looks more closely at what she calls "the art of translating Alasdair Gray," one of Glasgow's best known contemporary writers. Of particular interest is how Gray's texts function as book-objects and how very often the actual text is only

part of the story, as, for example, in his masterpiece *Lanark* (1981), *1982, Janine* (1984), and *Poor Things* (1992).[8] Because many of Gray's works are illustrated by himself, the illustrations making up an essential part of the book in question, his writing is often described as book-making, not book-writing. Being objects of art, when deprived of their illustrations, they lose an essential part of their composition. This is what happened in the Polish version of *Poor Things*, which appeared as *Biedne istoty* in 1997. Dominika Lewandowska-Rodak's insightful presentation of Gray as a writer and artist, and of what happened in the transference process – also in reference to a certain dose of manipulation in the Polish translation of the novel – is a thought-provoking example of how doors can close on one of the most interesting writers of today.

The accepted synonym for translation is communication and ideally we translate to pass on something new, interesting and often culturally quite distant to our target readers. We wish to acquaint them with works that have appeared in a different culture and in a language they are not familiar with. In the process, however, as the example presented by Dominika Lewandowska-Rodak has shown, this also often involves – for all sorts of different reasons – manipulation, which, in turn, hinders or redirects the communication process we ideally desire. The manipulation of another literary work of art has been observed by **Izabela Szymańska** and is analysed in detail in her article "Transediting Literature. R.L. Stevenson's *A Child's Garden of Verses* in Polish." Reaching for André Lefevere's work on rewriting and manipulation (1992) as her theoretical framework, she provides us with an insight into the Polish version of this collection, which appeared in 1992 under the title *Czarodziejski ogród wierszy.*[9] The poems in question were selected and translated by Ludmiła Marjańska, a well-known Polish translator of the post-war period. Here we are introduced to the relatively new notion of 'transediting,' involving the selection, translation, and editing of a given work of literature, which in the case of Stevenson's famous collection of poems for children resulted in a Polish volume of verses that is significantly different to its original. The motives lying behind such a process make fascinating reading.

The above issue concerning what often happens in the translation process begs the question concerning the ethics of translation, which has been taken up by **J. Derrick McClure**, albeit in a completely different context. The title of his article "Translating Polish Poetry into Scots: An Ethical Question" touches upon whether we should translate from a language we do not really know very well. A highly skilled translator from and into several languages, the author is fully aware of the misinterpretations that may occur and the potholes he may fall into simply because of his imperfect knowledge of Polish. The temptation, however, of trying to render into Scots poems by such masters as Adam Mickiewicz or Tadeusz Różewicz, for example, simply cannot be resisted. The discussion that ensues touches upon various aspects of poetic translation, the primary concern, however, being how well the translator needs to know the source language to produce valid

translations. Of interest are undoubtedly Derrick McClure's own included renderings of Polish poetry, ranging from the 19th-century Mickiewicz to the work of our contemporary, Piotr Sommer. It is the work of such enthusiasts that opens the door for people to at least have a peep at what has been written in a strange and often unknown culture.

Elżbieta Niewiadoma concludes this special Scottish issue with her analysis of the recent Polish translation of the special 25th anniversary edition of Glasgow-born Grant Morrison's ground-breaking Batman graphic novel: *Arkham Asylum: A Serious House on Serious Earth.* Fascinated by the graphic novel as a genre, its tradition, and the complexities involved in translating it into another language and culture, she introduces us to the history of the Polish renderings of this particular work (2005/2015) and guides us through her observations of the translation process, reaching her own conclusions as to the competence of both the translators and editors of such a venture.

To conclude the above discussion and presentation of the authors included in this special Scottish issue of *ANGLICA*, we can clearly see that the topics touched upon by them reflect the opening of innumerable doors, or the desire to create awareness of the need for such an opening. This is, in a variety of ways, in line with Ali Smith's very strong message in her recently published seasonal novels.

Aniela Korzeniowska
https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6835-3940

Notes

1   We can learn a little and guess more through the chapters recalling the Gestapo occupation of Nice in the south of France in 1943, the arrest of Daniel's twenty-two year old sister Hannah, at that time going under the name of Adrienne Albert (63-66), and his end-of-life recollections concerning his "[l]ittle sister. Never more than twenty, twenty one. There are no pictures left of her. The photos at their mother's house? long burnt, lost, street litter" (189).
2   These security firms are privately owned.
3   The Project also involved the idea of '28 Tales for 28 days.' In the call for a 28-day time limit for detention, 28 tales appeared online each day over 28 days. They were filmed in August 2018, released daily, starting from 11 September, and on 25 October, the message of the tales was taken to parliamentarians inside the Palace of Westminster (cf. http://refugeetales.org/crowdfunding-28-tales-for-28-days/).
4   For an amazingly well researched and detailed account of one of the most tragic eras in Scottish history, see T.M. Devine's *The Scottish Clearances. A History of the Dispossessed* (2018).

5   It is worth noting that although born in the Gorbals in Glasgow in 1936 and with a double MA (Hons) in French and German from Glasgow University, Kenneth White grew up on the west coast of Scotland in Ayrshire, and since the 1960s has been primarily based in France.

6   For more on the origins of White's writing, according to the author himself, see the highly enlightening interview conducted with him by Marco Fazzini in *Scottish Poets in Conversation* (2012).

7   On White as a philosopher and academic – he lectured at the Universities of Glasgow and Bordeaux as well as at the Sorbonne – see https://www.scottishpoetrylibrary.org.uk/poet/kenneth-white/

8   Another very interesting example is *Something Leather* from 1990.

9   There have been no subsequent editions or new translations of this work.

References

"28 Tales for 28 Days."
    http://refugeetales.org/crowdfunding-28-tales-for-28-days/

Barrell, A.D.M. 2000. *Medieval Scotland.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Devine, T. M. 2019 [2018]. *The Scottish Clearances. A History of the Dispossessed.* London: Penguin Books.

Fazzini, Marco. 2012. "Kenneth White." *Scottish Poets in Conversation.* Aberdeen: Aberdeen University Press. 61–76.

Halliday, James. 1996 [1990]. *Scotland. A Concise History*. Edinburgh: Gordon Wright Publishing.

Lefevere, André. 1992. *Translation, Rewriting, and the Manipulation of Literary Fame*. London: Routledge.

Preston, Alex. "Spring by Ali Smith review – luminous and generous."
    https://www.theguardian.com/books/2019/mar/19/spring-ali-smith-review

Smith, Ali. 2015. "The Detainee's Tale."
    https://www.theguardian.com/books/2015/jun/27/ali-smith-so-far-the-detainees-tale-extract

—. 2017 [2016]. *Autumn*. London: Penguin Books.

—. 2018 [2017]. *Winter*. London: Penguin Books.

—. 2019. *Spring.* London: Hamish Hamilton.

Steel, Tom. 1984. *Scotland's Story.* London: Fontana/Collins.

White, Kenneth.
    https://www.scottishpoetrylibrary.org.uk/poet/kenneth-white

Gillian Beattie-Smith
ⓘD https://orcid.org/0000-0001-5909-1400
The Open University, UK

A Highland Lady Abroad:
The Journeys of Elizabeth Grant

Abstract

Elizabeth Grant began writing as a young girl, and, with her sisters, wrote short stories which were published in well-known journals of the period. Her writing provided a necessary income throughout her life. She kept a journal, wrote sketches, travel articles, and short stories, but in Scotland, her best-known work is *Memoirs of a Highland Lady*, which was first published in 1898 and after several editions remains popular. This paper considers her writing about the Highlands, Ireland and France to examine the creation and performance of her identity as a Highland Lady.

Keywords: Highlands, travel writing, identity, gender

1. Introduction

Elizabeth Grant was a 19th-century travel writer, a short-story writer, a member of the Scottish landed gentry, a commentator on, and a recorder of, Scottish and Highland life. Her identity was created by means of her place in Scotland and she became known as the 'Highland Lady,' offering allusions to her gender, social status, and cultural heritage. Elizabeth's father, John Peter Grant, was a Scottish laird, whom *Blackwood's Magazine* recorded as "one of those brilliant men who are not born to succeed" ("Review of *Memoirs of a Highland Lady*" 537). The Grant family owned, and still do own, 5700 acres of land forming the Rothiemurchus estate near Aviemore, Scotland. Her father had been born into wealth, and into privilege, which extended further during his terms of office as a Member of the UK Parliament. But he was a hopeless estate manager, and so, although Elizabeth Grant was born into the social position associated with estate ownership and family history, money was frequently absent, and she wrote, not simply for pleasure, but for income needed to support the family. She wrote about life in Scotland, and about her life and experiences in England and Ireland, France and India. This article reflects on her writing, drawn from her everyday life in the countries in which she lived and travelled.

2. Elizabeth Grant: Her Body of Work and Its Reception

Elizabeth Grant was "an inveterate writer" (Tod x). Writing, for her, was a life-time pursuit and, as she lived to 88, there was a considerable body of work. In her youth, she wrote for the purpose of raising money for her father's Highland estate, Rothiemurchus, and later, after her marriage to Colonel Henry Smith, she wrote to supplement the income from her husband's estate, Baltiboys in County Wicklow, Ireland. She was published in well-known and popular journals of the period, including Chambers' *Edinburgh Journal*, *The Inspector and National Magazine*, *Fraser's Magazine, Ackerman's Forget Me Not* and *Howitt's Journal.* Chamber's *Edinburgh Journal* published her short stories of the Highlands, her travel writing about France, and her ten Irish narratives, told in the personae of Hannah White, and in an assertion of personal opinion, as Mrs Wright. *The Inspector and National Magazine* published the eight short stories in the series, "The Painter's Progress." Other articles, sketches, reflections were published widely. Her journals are extensive and have yet to be published in their entirety. She began writing a journal in 1814 while a girl at Rothiemurchus, and, although she did not take it up as a daily record until 1840, she kept a journal until her death in 1885. Her Irish journals illuminate 19th-century life on an Irish estate, the effects of the Great Irish Famine on the tenant farmers, and provide a personal, and historic insight into land management in Ireland (Grant 1991). But in Scotland, it is her *Memoirs of a Highland Lady* that have remained popular since their first publication by John Murray in 1898.

　　Memoirs of a Highland Lady relates the narratives of the people and life in the Highlands in the first quarter of the 19th century, before her family's move to India in 1827 and her marriage to Irish Lieutenant Colonel Henry Smith in 1829. It was Elizabeth Grant's niece, Lady Jane Strachey, who published the first edition of *Memoirs*, under the title *Memoirs of a Highland Lady. The Autobiography of Elizabeth Grant of Rochiemurchus, afterwards Mrs Smith of Baltiboys, 1797–1830.* However, as Peter Butter notes, Lady Strachey, "the Victorian lady imposes some censorship on the Georgian one" (208–215). Murray's 1911 edition further reduced the text by omitting much of the record of the time in the Netherlands and India, and the Albemarle Library edition of 1950, edited by Angus Davidson, further emphasised her writing about Scotland by editing the content of her travels abroad. But, in 1988, Canongate published Andrew Tod's comprehensive edition of *Memoirs*, drawing on the original manuscripts held by the Grant family, which have recently been lodged with the National Library of Scotland. All references in this article to *Memoirs* are to Andrew Tod's 1988 Canongate edition.

　　Two further members of Elizabeth Grant's family were involved in the editing of her work. Patricia Pelly, the great-great-grand-daughter of Elizabeth Grant, worked with Andrew Tod to edit Elizabeth Grant's journals of Ireland

and France. The Irish journals were first edited in 1980 by David Thomson and Moyra McGusty, Elizabeth Grant's great grand-daughter. Such retention of editorial control of her work illustrates a continuance of the features of women's writing as personal, private, and familial, and of women's writing about their lives remaining the property of the family, ensuring the location of the woman in domestic context.

David Daiches regards Elizabeth Grant's *Memoirs* "as vivid," but asserts that it is "one of the lesser Scottish diaries of the second rank" (76). Nonetheless, as an historical record of her times, her journals have been compared with those of Henry Cockburn (1856). In a review of the first edition of *Memoirs*, her style is described as having "charm […] not in literary style or in the relation of stirring events, for the Peninsular War and the Battle of Waterloo make as little impression on her as the Great Plague did upon Pepys, but in the absolute lack of pose, and the candour with which she states her opinions" (Lang 404).

The Irish journals have received the greatest attention for their historic content and Janet TeBrake argues they have "historical value" (52). However, she suggests caution is needed in interpreting personal narratives. TeBrake argues, "[h]er journal is not only a personal view of her times, it also offers interpretations of events, people and the world around her that reflect her élite status. She speaks for those who cannot speak for themselves, but we will never know the exact feelings or opinions of those for whom she spoke" (53–54). TeBrake also observes the difficulties of gender with regard to women's historical records, and reflects that "like other journals and diaries compiled by women, it has been primarily read for pleasure or its literary value and has not yet received the scholarly attention from historians that it deserves" (55).

The record, however, is becoming adjusted and Elizabeth Grant's work is cited frequently as a historical source. For example, in his study of *The Geography and Implications of Post-Famine Population Decline in Baltiboys, County Wicklow*, Matthew Stout examines changes in tenancies on the Baltiboys estate which was the home of Elizabeth Grant, Mrs Smith, and her family (15–34). Stout draws on her very detailed record of the Irish famine and suggests that the estate used it to precipitate the eviction of tenants. As a result of the Poor Law of Ireland, landowners whose tenants were on land which was valued at under £4 were to pay the rates of their tenants, and the change in legislation affected thousands of tenants.[1] On one estate alone, for example, there were over 3000 tenants on land valued at under £5 (Fitzpatrick 585–588). Eviction and transport to America were seen to be the solution for landowners. Elizabeth Grant wrote: "The beggars are the small holders, entitled to no relief, and so we shall gradually get rid of them; they must give up their patches and take to labour […]. It will bear very hard upon us who do our duty but we must make the best of it. Some will be ruined; we shall rise again, it is to be hoped in a year or two" (1991, 313). Patrick J. Duffy cites her record when he refers to "[m]any smaller properties [which] were also

involved in migrating groups of tenants, like Elizabeth [Grant] Smith who migrated a small number of tenants from her Baltiboys property in Wicklow" (79–104).

3. Style, Genre, and Interpretation

TeBrake has identified Elizabeth Grant as "a very opinionated woman who was also a member of the land-owning élite" (51). Her sense of privilege is evident throughout her writing However, Grant's journal writing has the purpose of educating her children in their genealogical, social, and cultural heritage, and such purpose requires a performance of self by the author, which engenders confidence and affiliation with Grant's matrilineal identity. In order to impress upon her readers the importance of their place, hyperbole is used, which, may be interpreted as being 'very opinionated.' Elizabeth Grant was an educated woman and her understanding and knowledge of politics, both in Scotland and in Ireland, are extensive. She does not evade offering opinion on political, as well as social conditions wherever she travels. Indeed, she emphasises it in the style of the genre, as explored by Chloe Chard's study of hyperbole, which shows that the technique is used by both men and women travel writers to impress upon readers the veracity of the record and personal perspective (84). TeBrake's argument that Grant is 'opinionated' may arise out of gendered perspectives of social norms. For example, heredity is historically transferred through patrilineal lines, and yet Elizabeth Grant hands status and place to her children through her own, feminine, opinions and oppositions. This view is shared by Margaret Elphinstone, who argues that "travel by women is a challenge to a hierarchy which is constructed out of gendered, as well as imperialist, oppositions" (327). Elizabeth Grant's writing therefore "transgress[es] a hierarchy of gender that imposes silence upon women's excursions into a psychic space unknown to patriarchy" (330). Elizabeth Grant's social position, education, and opportunities to travel, and to write, enable a performance of an identity which crosses gender boundaries.

Elizabeth Grant writes in an informal manner which, through its similarity to conversation, is engaging. Daiches argues the "we become familiar with the diarist's personal voice, so that it is almost as if we were hearing […] her speak" (76). *Memoirs of a Highland Lady* was originally written for her children. According to Peter Butter, her personal narrative writing written for her family has "a spontaneity and sparkle" and "*Memoirs* is much her best work" because it "has the advantage of dealing with her times of most intense experience in youth and of that experience having been matured over the years without losing its freshness" (209).

Elizabeth Grant began writing a journal while still a girl, in 1814, and living at the Rothiemurchus estate.[2] It was intended as "a regular history of our doings, great and small" (1988, I, 329–330). She sent her work to her Aunt Lissy, who,

although she had left Scotland, remembered the Highlands well and preferred them, as Grant writes, "as she had known them – primitive, when nobody spoke English, when all young men wore the kilt, when printed calicoes had never been seen, when there was no wheaten bread to be got and the Laird worshipped as a divinity by every human being in the place" (1988, I, 329–330). But Grant also wanted "to convince her [aunt] of her errour" of her preference for the Highlands of the past (1988, I, 329–330). Elizabeth Grant wrote "[t]o prove to her [aunt] that life could still be happier among the mountains than elsewhere, progress notwithstanding" (1988, I, 329–330).

The early journals were addressed to her aunt to persuade her of the importance of change in the Highlands, but also to reassure her that Highland culture and society still continued, and that some aspects of place were still as she remembered them. The reassurance that cultural heritage survives is created by extensive descriptions which, at times, are hyperbolic in their emphasis. This addressivity, achieved through the shared understanding of cultural, geographical, historical, and social allusions was an early feature of Elizabeth Grant's writing. Evidence that her aunt valued the writing is recorded in her reception of the journals, and in conversations about the Highlands with Aunt Lizzy's husband and his brother. The value of the journals for Elizabeth Grant was not only in the record of moments, but also in the conversation with the reader, using allusions to Highland life, which were shared and understood, and which formed a personal and private bond with her readers, thus consolidating family and social ties. But, the journals and the memoirs, the private writing of Grant, while originally written for her aunt, her children, and her niece, were also written for her unnamed "descendants" and, as such, form part of a discourse on the Highlands with an unknown and not yet living readership.

4. The Performance of a 'Highland Lady' Identity

The names by which she is known as author differ. Elizabeth Grant's sketches about Ireland centred on the fictional characters of Hannah White and Mrs Wright. The texts are not attributed to her by the name of Grant or Mrs Smith, as she was then, nor to "a Highland Lady," but she is identified using "by the Author of My Father the Laird," thus identifying her as an author with a place in public space, but not by name. The Irish sketches were published between 1848 and 1850 in Chambers' *Edinburgh Journal*, the periodical which had also published "A Highlander of the Last Age" and her three-part study of the changes in Highland life: "My Father the Laird," "My Brother the Laird" and "My Nephew the Laird." The three-part study of the Lairds introduces the writer and the texts in a parenthetical paragraph and states Elizabeth Grant to be "a lady advanced in life, the daughter of a Highland proprietor of ancient name."[3] Her relational

identity to her father is emphasised by the publishers of her work in her literary identity, even though at this time in her life, in terms of the social norms of the period, her relational identity as a woman would have been to her husband. But it is her Highland identity which is foregrounded, even when she is writing about Ireland, or France, or India.

Memoirs provides vivid descriptions of childhood on the Rothiemurchus estate, where the children had freedom to roam outside, and freedom to study, read and write inside. In the season, the family held, and Elizabeth Grant attended, balls in Edinburgh. It was British custom until the end of the first half of the 20th century for élite families to hold balls, known as 'routs,' during the 'season.' Grant explains, "[a]ll the Beaux strove for tickets because all the Belles of the season made their first appearance there" (1988, II, 11). The season for balls began in January and lasted until Easter, and it was at such social gatherings that marriage matches were made. She describes one ball held at their house in Charlotte Square, Edinburgh, which led to the appointment of a guard following an attack on the house. Prior to the Great Reform Act of 1832, John Peter Grant, Elizabeth Grant's father, had a purchased seat in Parliament, as the Member for the 'rotten borough' of Great Grimsby, where he spoke in favour of the agronomist, not the labourer in the run up to the 1815 Corn Laws.[4] His position caused so much resentment that their Edinburgh house was attacked in a response to his political views, and the family had to be given a guard (1988, II, 11). The attack on the house came the evening of a ball. Elizabeth Grant wrote:

> Our first intimation of danger was from a volley of stones rattling through the windows, which had been left without closed shutters on account of the heat of the crowded rooms. A great mob had collected unknown to us, as we had musick within, and much noise from the buzz of the crowd. A score of ladies fainted by way of improving matters. Lady Matilda Wynyard, who had always all her senses about her, came up to my mother and told her she need be under no alarm. The General, who had some hint of what was preparing, had given the necessary orders, and one of the Company, a highland Captain Macpherson, had been despatched some time since for the military. A violent ringing of the door bell, and the heavy tread of soldiers' feet announced to us our guard had come. (1988, II, 11)

She dramatises the event and the setting, but also shows her opinion through her characterisations, and provides the reader with a picture of life in an élite family in the New Town of Edinburgh.

In 1828, Elizabeth Grant and her family fled to India to escape the effects of her father's bankruptcy. He had lost his seat in Parliament, and no longer had parliamentary privileges. The creditors chased the family to the coast of England where they sailed to France and on to India, where they were exiled until the debts were cleared. But with the help of family and the social connections frequently referred to in her writing as of great importance, Elizabeth Grant's father had

secured a post with the East India Company. On arrival in Bombay, Elizabeth Grant reports her father remark, "if this be exile […] it is splendid exile," and her mother's comments on, "those bowing men" and their "extraordinary deference" (1988, II, 222). A contemporary reader might make judgements of the apparent injustice of a British bankrupt being received with such deference and with "light vastness, beauty, regal pomp, and *true affection*" and be struck by the contemporary irony of Elizabeth Grant's record that "we were such great people," but in the historical, political and social context in which she lived, there was no irony, privilege was perceived to be a right by birth (1988, II, 224). Throughout her life, she established herself in a hierarchical position of difference and privilege.

Maria Frawley contends that for women like Elizabeth Grant, "travel writing […] offered more than an opportunity to participate in a form with great popular appeal; it also offered women the opportunity to establish or solidify their credibility in a public arena shared by men" (33). For Elizabeth Grant, travel writing gave her access to public as well as domestic space. Michael Cotsell considers that women achieved "a marginal sagedom" through travel writing, achieving a liminal identity between masculine and feminine ideologies (14). Deirdre David argues that women who succeeded in establishing a position in the public sphere did so, not only by subverting the private, domestic sphere, but also by employing the dominant masculine culture and adopting and ratifying an ancillary role in it (179). Women, like Grant, might perform "dutiful, daughterly work for [their] political fathers," but the performance of ancillary roles enabled their personal feminism to be accepted (69). As David points out, language and culture are shaped by "the hegemonic structures of patriarchy," and, therefore, women's writing and performance of self can be at the same time both subversive, and "implicitly authorized" by the dominant social structures (144). Such duality can be seen in Grant's support of her father, as well as in the expression of her social opinions.

It was in India that Elizabeth Grant met Colonel Henry Smith. He owned an estate in Ireland, and, soon after marriage, they moved to the estate, Baltiboys, in County Wicklow. However, the costs of running the estate in Ireland were high and there were political difficulties in the country, including considerable changes to the laws governing tenancies. The high costs of running the estate meant that change was necessary. To reduce their expenditure, the whole family – Elizabeth Grant, her husband, his friend, Colonel Litchfield, their children, her sister Mary, and her husband and children, as well as their governesses – all travelled to France, where they lived between 1843 to 1845. Elizabeth Grant kept a journal of their residency and she wrote travel articles, including "A Month in the Pyrenees"; "A Few Weeks at Cauterets among the Pyrenees"; and five articles entitled "Wintering in Pau," each of which was published under the identity already established in Chambers' *Edinburgh Journal* as by "a Lady." It was in 1845, while resident in France, that she began *Memoirs* as part of the familial discourse with her sister and her children. The entry to her *Journal* for 8 June 1845 reads:

> After breakfast and my little walk I write the recollections of my life, which I began
> to do on my birthday to please the girls, who eagerly listen to the story of their
> mother's youth, now as a pleasing tale, by and bye it will be out of a wish to feel
> acquainted with people and places I shall not be at hand to introduce them to […]
> the pleasure of talking over these bygone times with my children attaches us the
> more to one another. As we become more confidential in our intercourse, we make
> the tale profitable too by the comments we engraft upon it, and the best of all it
> encreases (sic) my content with the present, the contrast between my maiden days and
> married life being to all rational feelings so much in favour of the latter. (1996, 239)

Identity is a shifting performance of self which is created relational to place,
to people, to structures. The context can exacerbate or limit aspects of personal
identity. During their time in France, Grant and her family lived in Pau, in the
Pyrenees, and later, in Avranches, Normandy. In her writing, she provides detailed
descriptions of people and places, and her encounters, but the descriptions are
given as parallels or contrasts to Grant's life in Scotland. It is the difference on
which she focuses, and Grant's Highlander identity becomes hyperbolised as
a result. It is always the identity of the Highland Lady which she foregrounds.

5. A Highland Lady in France

There is a long history of allegiances and alliances between Scotland and France,
but there are also nearly 1000 years of rivalry and wars between England and
France. For example, in 1295, John Balliol, a Norman King of Scotland, who
still had lands in France, formed a diplomatic and military alliance with Philippe
IV of France. In 1421, 1200 Scots joined the French at Bauge where they defeated
the English. Aubigny-sur-Nère, which lies between Orleans and Nevers, was
awarded to Sir John Stuart by Charles VII of France in 1423 in the name of the
Auld Alliance, and the town still celebrates its links to Scotland. It is still known
as the city of the Stuarts. But during Elizabeth Grant's lifetime, and from 1793
to 1815, Scotland, as part of Britain, had been in effect at war with France and
there were consequences on the lives of all, including those who lived in the
Highlands of Scotland, distant as they may seem from the battles and revolu-
tion. In *Memoirs*, Elizabeth Grant comments on her father's profession at law as
a response to the continuing effects of the French Revolution. For example, the
fear of the spread of revolution from France across Europe was real, but land-
owners and the élite especially feared the loss of title and their land. Elizabeth
Grant says it was "necessary to the usefulness of a country gentleman" because
the French Revolution "had made it a fashion for all men to provide themselves
with some means of earning a future livelihood, should" what she identifies as,
"the torrent of democracy reach to other lands" (1988, I, 6). The Napoleonic
Wars had also been a threat. Again, in *Memoirs*, she explains the preparations in

Scotland for war and possible invasion, and writes, "we owe Napoleon thanks. It was the terrour of his expected invasion that roused this patriotick fever amongst our mountains, where […] the alarm was so great that every preparation was in train for repelling the enemy" (1988, I, 109).

Until Culloden, each landowner in the Highlands had had the right to raise a *leddy*, or small regiment, comprising the tenants and workers. Although the right had been outlawed, Grant's father had retained it on his land at Rothiemurchus, more for pomp and pleasure than for purpose. On occasion he would gather the *leddy* and all the participants dressed up for the performance. Elizabeth Grant considered it to be a "spectacle" which made show of the social hierarchy of laird and tenants and the privilege of private ownership of land, to hold back what she considers the "torrent of democracy":

> It was a kilted regiment, and a fine set of smart well set up men they were, with their plumed bonnets, dirks, and purses, and their lowheeled buckled shoes. My father became his trappings well, and […] my Mother rode to the ground beside him, dressed in a tartan petticoat, red jacket gaudily laced, and just such a bonnet and feathers as he wore himself, with the addition of a huge Cairngorm on the side of it […] the bright sun seldom shone upon a more exhilarating spectacle. The Laird, their Colonel, reigning all hearts. After the 'Dismiss,' bread and cheese and whisky […] were profusely administered. (1988, I, 108)

She lists, she alliterates and she hyperbolises, all to stress the auto-stereotype of the Highlanders and to emphasise what she calls "the persistence of tradition" (1988, I, 108).

The presence and absence of Napoleon is in conversation several times, and his influence on life at the time is evident in her writing. While in Pau, she reads in the *Scotsman* of the death of Sir Hudson Lowe, who had effectively been Napoleon's gaoler. His confinement by Lowe, some suggest, led to Napoleon's death, and others have suggested Lowe had Napoleon poisoned. He was a man disliked and considered by Wellington, as Grant records, "a man wanting in education and judgement" (1996, 77). She reflects:

> I remember fancying him to be rude in manner, rough in temper, a large coarse soldier, hoping I might never encounter him, sure he must be a monster whom I never could be brought to endure. I was a girl at this time in the Highlands where we were too apt to be shewn but one side of the picture and to take up our opinions rather strongly. After I married, on our voyage home we touched at Ceylon and […] I was taken to dinner by a military man, a General Officer covered with orders, a little pale elderly person, very quiet, very gentlemanly and very agreeable; he had been everywhere, knew everybody. I thought him very pleasant for our conversation was becoming very interesting when I was startled by someone asking 'Sir Hudson Lowe' to do him the honour to take wine. It was a lesson in morals. (1996, 78)

Later, in Avranches, Grant has a lengthy conversation with a young painter, whom she describes as a "legitimist," someone who supported the Bourbon dynastic succession to the French throne. She records the banter and the teasing – she of his hopes, and he of the end of Napoleon:

> We are never to be forgiven for shutting up Buonaparte in St. Helena. "Blame the father-in-law," said I; "it was to satisfy the Emperours of Russia and Austria and the Bourbons that the troublesome *ambitieux* was chained." How he opened his eyes. And when I described the beauty of St. Helena which I had seen, the comforts provided for the prisoner who had refused them, the gentlemanly manner of Sir Hudson Lowe whom I had known, he looked as if I were telling fairy tales. (1996, 162–163)

In Pau in 1843, there was a British community of around 400 in a town whose civilian population was 1400. Jane, Duchess of Gordon, who had been particularly influential in Elizabeth Grant's childhood and education, was one member of that community. The Duchess had bought land in Pau in 1836 and then donated £1000 for the construction of the church. But although there are many English, the Grants do not join their company. At Pau, she calls the English "gossips" and at Avranches comments, "what a horrid set of British have congregated here" (1996, 204). There are times she is exasperated with the management of the household and the difficulties she has in France because people take time to do their work, but she gives the opinion: "The French do everything in earnest – no wonder they seldom fail" (1996, 27). She comments the French have a "total absence of selfishness," adding, after the shoemaker repaired shoes for free, the tailor gave her buttons at no charge, and a young girl gave her own umbrella to save Elizabeth Grant's silk dress, "I am getting quite fond of these obliging people" (1996, 36).

Her descriptions of the country around her are extensive, and she draws further parallels with Scotland. For example, following a long description of the town, its open spaces, hills, and narrow streets, squares filled with trees, and what she describes as "the jewel of the little town […] the old castle on its rock with the river flowing round one side and the arc stretching along its bank for a mile beyond the Basse Plante. Edinburgh in miniature as to situation without those hideous barracks to spoil a picturesque old building" (1996, 21–22).

She draws cultural parallels between France and Scotland from her observations of the dancing. For example, she notices "heeling and toe-ing, shuffling and double-shuffling, cutting, entrechatting, and swinging round with an air of audacity altogether like our highlanders" (1996, 105). Other comparisons between the French and the Scots are in the women's headwear. In Pau she describes "headwear of starched muslin, full of quills frills close to the face and a crown like a drum" (1996, 35). Outside La Rochelle, she records: "A new kind of cap began to present itself, quite as big as the drums and the pillow cases but carried out behind like the flags of the lancers or the old prints in Froissart's chronicles"

(1996, 139). She tells the readers: "The caps of the women though invariably immense […] [were] something like the highland mutch" (1996, 142).

At the end of 1844, they were in Avranches, after finding Pau too expensive, but Elizabeth was ill and had been advised to rest. Her journal records that on 17 July 1845 they were all back at Baltiboys in Ireland. The journals of France, the Highlands, Ireland and India are each a personal reflective account of not only her life as a member of the landowning élite, but of the lives, cultures and social conditions of those she encountered, but always from a Highland perspective.

6. Conclusion

Ruth Perry argues that "narrative is a universal human response to dilemmas about the metaphysics of existence" (5). She considers that although narratives are used by both readers and writers "to face the exigencies of their lives," through an examination of the "anxieties and pleasures" which the author illustrates, readers can "trace the configuration of forces operating on people" (5). In Grant's writing what gives her pleasure is described at length and the pleasure extended, but the anxieties are skimmed over, alluded to, abbreviated. But Grant writes about her life in her *Memoirs* in order to provide her intended reader, her children, with a means of contextualising their own lives with hers. Elizabeth Grant's *Memoirs* provides a guide on "how to manoeuvre materially and morally in the world" by means of direction through first person focus on home and family (Perry 6). The text points to the domestic as a contextualising space for identity and for making progress through life, not as a delineating or confining space of gender (6). Drawing on David's arguments of how 19th-century women negotiated space and relational identity, Grant adopted and ratified an auxiliary domestic role, which enabled her opinions to bear weight in her social hierarchical context (David 179). She directs her readers to follow her example in her narratives as a means of facing life's exigencies.

Elizabeth Grant's *Memoirs* ends with a marriage as a signifier of improvement, and possibly of 19th-century redemption. However, in the closing passages of her *Memoirs*, Elizabeth refers to the loss of her former identity and to the onset of a new one. She writes, "and then indeed I felt I was gone out from among my own kindred, and had set up independently – a husband – a baby – an end indeed of Eliza Grant" (1988, II, 320). And yet, throughout her writing she retains the identity of the Highland Lady. Elizabeth Grant highlights, what Perry refers to as the "exigencies" of her life with the effect of indicating the reader's own (5). The narratives which illustrate the exigencies, also serve to create a relational identity of Elizabeth Grant to her familial, genealogical, and social locations. In the locations through which she travels – France, Ireland, India – Elizabeth Grant provides images of other people and other places, different from those

which are familiar. Those images and narratives are offered in objective opposition, and in an assertion of her subjective locus in family, in Highland culture and society, and in her 19th-century place in a Scottish social hierarchy. Grant remains throughout, a Highland Lady.

Notes

1   Poverty was widespread in Ireland in the first half of the 19th century. Around one-third of all Irish land tenancies were between 0.4 and 5 acres, which could only feed a family if the main crop were potatoes. Poor relief was only available to those in workhouses. In 1838, the Irish Poor Law was passed as an Act of the British Parliament in Westminster. Its aims were to make provision for the poor in Ireland. A system of financial support was raised by a levy of local rates on the value of land. Under the new legislation, landowners were to pay the rates of tenants whose land was valued at less than £4. The financial impact on landowners led them to reduce the numbers of tenancies, which was achieved by eviction or by combining small holdings. The wider social impact was significant. The population in the workhouses quickly doubled and many people left Ireland for England or America. Elizabeth Grant's journals record that the Baltiboys estate encouraged families to leave for America.

2   The Rothiemurchus estate, on which Elizabeth grew up, remains in the ownership of the Grant family. It is a well-established business which includes forestry and agriculture, as it did in her lifetime. However, it is also a tourist destination where visitors can select from a range of outdoor activities, one of which is to take the 'Highland Lady Safari' which encompasses a tour of the Doune and locations on the estate to which she referred in her journals. It is interesting to see, therefore, that the Home Tour and the literary tour of Scotland, which increased in popularity in the late 18th century, have increased in their commercial nature to the extent of making the residence of the Highland Lady a tourist destination and an idealised representation of the Highlands of Scotland.

3   See the introductory paragraph by the editors to "My Father the Laird" in Chambers' Edinburgh Journal, 119, April 11, 1846. The text reads: "It may be well to state that this piece – the first of a short series in which, as it appears to us, domestic life is sketched with singular spirit and fidelity of pencil – is really what it appears to be, the composition of a lady advanced in life, the daughter of a Highland proprietor of ancient name. This first paper depicts the north-country gentleman of the conclusion of what we may call the age of old-world things – the time when there was no symmetric agriculture, no struggling activity, and only a simple and antiquated kind of refinement.

A second paper shows a transition state of things in the middle of the last war; and a third, we believe, will set forth the contrast afforded by the present state of society."

4   When the Napoleonic Wars came to an end in 1815, the price of corn fell. This reduced the price of bread to the benefit of the working classes, but also reduced profits for landowners. The Corn Law of 1815 increased corn and bread prices, and this led to riots. Reforms took place during the 19th century, but the distrust of landowners remained. A call for reforms to the franchise, to constituency boundaries, and to representation of the people grew in response to the development of industrial cities which had no representation, and to the so-called 'rotten boroughs' in which small numbers of landowning voters could elect two Members of Parliament, thus providing disproportionate representation. A bill was presented to Parliament in 1831, but its defeat gave rise to many serious riots across Britain, including Scotland. Parliament records the riots in Edinburgh, which Elizabeth Grant describes, and refers to there being only one cavalry regiment in the whole of Scotland which could contend with them. In 1832, Reform Acts became law in Scotland, and in England and Wales, which extended part of the franchise, and introduced changes in constituency boundaries. Further reform bills were introduced across the 19th century.

References

Butter, Peter. 2005. "Elizabeth Grant." *A History of Scottish Women's Writing*. Ed. Douglas Gifford and Dorothy McMillan. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press. 208–215.

Chard, Chloe. 1999. *Pleasure and Guilt on the Grand Tour: Travel Writing and Imaginative Geography 1600–1830*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.

Cockburn, Henry. 1910 [1856]. *Memorials of His Own Time*, 1779–1830. Edinburgh: T. N. Foulis.

Cotsell, Michael, ed. 1990. *Creditable Warriors, 1830–1876*. Atlantic Highlands, N.J.: Ashfield Press.

Daiches, David. 1993. *The New Companion to Scottish Culture*. London: Polygon.

David, Deidre. 1987. *Intellectual Women and Victorian Patriarchy*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.

Duffy, Patrick J. 2004. "'Disencumbering our Crowded Places': Theory and Practice of Estate Migration Schemes in Mid-nineteenth Century Ireland." *To and From Ireland: Planned Migration Schemes c.1600–2000*. Ed. Patrick J. Duffy. Dublin: Geography Publications. 79–104.

Elphinstone, Margaret. 2000. "Travellers in Time: Three Travel Narratives by Scottish Women Writers." *Terranglian Territories: Proceedings of the Seventh*

International Conference on the Literature of Region and Nation. Ed. Susanne Hagemann. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang. 326–330.

Fitzpatrick, David. 1989. "XXVIII Emigration, 1801–70." *New History of Ireland: Ireland under the Union 1800–70.* Vol. V. Ed. W. E. Vaughan. Oxford: Oxford University Press. 562–622.

Frawley, Maria H. 1994. *A Wider Range: Travel Writing by Women in Victorian England.* London and Toronto: Associated University Presses.

Grant, Elizabeth. 1980. *The Irish Journals of Elizabeth Smith, 1840–1850.* Ed. David Thomson and Moyra McGusty. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

—. 1988. *Memoirs of a Highland Lady*. Vols I and II. Ed. Andrew Tod. Edinburgh: Canongate.

—. 1991. *The Highland Lady in Ireland: Journals: 1840–1850.* Ed. Andrew Tod and Patricia Pelly. Edinburgh: Canongate.

—. 1996. *A Highland Lady in France 1843–1845*. Ed. Patricia Pelly and Andrew Tod. East Linton: Tuckwell Press.

Lang, Mrs Andrew. 1898. "Memoirs of a Highland Lady." *Longman's Magazine* 31.5: 404–419.

Perry, Ruth. 2004. *Novel Relations: The Transformation of Kindship in English Literature and Culture 1748–1818*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

"Review of *Memoirs of a Highland Lady.*" 1898. *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* DCCCCXC. CLXIII. Edinburgh: William Blackwood & Sons. 537.

Stout, Matthew. 1996. "The Geography and Implications of Post-Famine Population Decline in Baltiboys, County Wicklow." *'Fearful Realities': New Perspectives on the Famine*. Ed. Chris Morash and Richard Hayes. Blackrock, Dublin: Irish Academic Press. 15–34.

TeBrake, Janet. 1995. "Personal Narratives as Historical Sources: The Journal of Elizabeth Smith, 1840–1850." *History Ireland* 3.1: 51–55.

Tod, Andrew. 1996. "Introduction." *A Highland Lady in France 1843–1845.* Ed. Patricia Pelly and Andrew Tod. East Linton: Tuckwell Press. vii–xvii.

Irmina Wawrzyczek
https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3286-9627
Maria Curie-Skłodowska University, Lublin

Scottish Wilderness Rejuvenated: The Regional Identity of Scotland as a Tourist Destination in *The Scots Magazine* 2017–2018

Abstract

Vital academic debates concerning national and regional identities have recently been conducted in the trans-disciplinary field of Tourism Studies, in the context of today's identity-based economy. Tourist destinations compete on the market by promoting their place identities constructed in response to the needs and tastes of tourism consumers. Scotland, long preoccupied with her historically complicated cultural identity, is also involved in projecting a commodified regional identity. The following analysis of a sample of *The Scots Magazine* texts, approached here as elements of Scotland's coordinated destination marketing, demonstrates the ascendancy of revived and discursively renewed wilderness as the dominant identity marker of the region.

Keywords: Scotland, wilderness, *The Scots Magazine,* destination place identity, identity-based tourism

1. Introduction

Like many small countries involved in ethnopolitical conflicts with great neighbouring powers, Scotland and the Scots have for centuries been concerned with preserving and strengthening their cultural identity. Since the Scots became a "stateless nation" after the union with England in 1707, the identity of their country as a region of the United Kingdom has been particularly problematic and defined around different markers: literature, language, religion and nationalism (Brown; Szymańska and Korzeniowska). Other Scottish identity markers and expressions debated recently in the context of political devolution in the UK after 1997 and the emergence of a supranational European identity involve sports, popular historical myths, territoriality and regional institutional structuration (Bairner 45–68; McLeod; Brown 2012; Clayton).

The present contribution to the cultural reflection on Scotland's identity concerns the sphere of tourism. Located at the intersection of Media and Tourism

Studies, it deals with tourism promotional media as sites where many types of identities are made and unmade. The material under scrutiny involves eighteen monthly issues of *The Scots Magazine* – the entire year 2017 and the first half of 2018 – treated as cultural texts in which a particular type of Scotland's place identity as a tourist destination is constructed. The notion of place identity is understood here as "a combination of selected physical attributes of a destination with a system of meanings and values attached to them by means of carefully planned discursive operations" (Garzone 30–31). Consequently, the employed analytical method is that of multimodal discourse analysis, which consists in looking jointly at the visual and the verbal aspects of the magazine content, applying relevant semiotic, narrative and sociolinguistic tools (Dann; Jewitt). On the basis of the identified place-making strategies it is argued that *The Scots Magazine* perpetuates the 'old' regional image of Scotland as Britain's wilderness in a discursively uplifted form adjusted to the tourism trends and practices of the 21st century.

A fact well recognised in today's Tourism Studies is the commodification of local cultures and landscape resources as a result of the global expansion of tourism as a valuable sector of economy bringing growth and development to many countries and probably the most popular leisure activity of the 21st century. Selling places and experiences as tourism "products" requires effective marketing and promotional operations focused on the construction of distinctive and competitive place identities of whole countries, regions and localities (Kneafsey; Dredge and Jenkins; Ritchie and Crouch). Scotland is no exception to this rule and her destination marketing organisations (DMOs) creatively participate in the highly competitive struggle for potential visitors to the region.

However, the identity effect of the activities designed to strengthen Scotland's positioning on the tourism market has not often been addressed lately. The available studies tend to concentrate on the relationship between tourism development and Scottish national identity, the perpetuation of the older image of "tartan" Scotland and the mechanisms of the Scottish heritage industry (McCrone et al.; Butler; Bhandari 2014, 2016), while the latest place identity constructs have not received sufficient attention. A useful attempt to follow more recent tourism place-marketing strategies for Scotland by reinventing its regional identity comes from Stephen J. Page, William Steel, and Joanne Connell. In their analysis of the photographic imagery in Scottish 2004 holiday brochures promoting the then niche adventure tourism to the region, the authors signal a revival of the Victorian image of Scotland's landscapes as "wild and untouched by humans" (54). The present examination of a leading glossy Scottish-interest magazine 14 years later reveals, as the once nascent adventure tourism sector has become one of the country's main drawcards ("Adventure Tourism in Scotland"), that a re-wilded regional identity of Scotland in an up-lifted version has been reinforced and is currently put forth to the public on a broad scale.

2. *The Scots Magazine* and Tourism Destination Marketing

With a monthly average readership of over 178,000 in mid-2018 (25,109 print-only copies sold; also available as a digital edition), *The Scots Magazine* – a B5 format glossy of about 130 pages – enjoys the position of the world's best-selling Scottish-interest publication focused on Scotland, her people, places, culture and leisure ("The Media in Figures: Scots Magazines' Circulation Figures"). Although it is a quality regional magazine not allocated under the travel periodical category, much of its content in fact promotes Scotland as a destination to both the domestic and overseas reading public. Today's marketing synergy and collective omni-channel tourism campaigns often blur the distinction between the promotional and other media. This is visible in *The Scots Magazine*, where in addition to much of the editorial content, a strong indication of its tourism promotional function comes from the frequent advertising of visitors' accommodation, tourism operators, gastronomy, architectural heritage, cultural events, guidebooks, as well as tourist gear. Hence, the image of Scotland as a tourist destination projected by the magazine can be treated as both organic, i.e. transmitted unintentionally via a medium ostensibly unconnected with the regional DMOs, and induced, i.e. purposefully constructed in agreement with the current marketing policy adopted by the tourism agencies and operators (Ferreira Lopes).

There are three factors well understood by tourism providers and managers today: that this branch of the global economy is characterised by a growing number of new destinations; that these developments go hand in hand with an increasing diversification and competition among them: and that the role of the media in this struggle for uniqueness cannot be overstated. Modern mass media linked up with all the new technologies are imperative for the economic success of local, regional and national tourism industries. The powerful effects of media communications can bring sweeping changes of attitudes and behaviour among tourists and tourism providers. Thus, tourism promotion media constitute a rich and dynamically evolving terrain for observing from many disciplinary perspectives the strategies of creating unique destination identities (Morgan and Pritchard; Cano and Prentice; Getz and Fairley; Kumar; Ayalew).

Even when approached from the cultural point of view, tourism's affinity to the economy and its trends must not be forgotten. One such important analytical advance of the 21st century, with tremendous impact on promotion and advertising, is the appropriation of identity theories for economic models of behaviour and the emergence of the concept of identity-based economy (Akerlof and Kranton 2000, 2010; Bond et al.; Reed et al.). The applied economist Marien André argues that tourism is quintessentially an identity-based branch of economy as "on the one hand it spreads a destination's international reputation (stressing its differentiation as an added value) while on the other, it generates direct economic activity" (18). In fact, long before the concept of identity-based economy was coined, identity

had been an important issue in the study of tourism. Like many social scientists before them, modern Tourism Studies researchers assume that the identities of both tourists and hosts are dynamic constructs "shaped, re-envisioned, and manipulated in tandem with encounters with others and in response to broader economic, ecological, and political factors" (Adams 450). This statement applies not only to people, but also to places. Place-making, or the production of distinctive and competitive place identity at national, regional and local levels involves the transformation of physical geographical spaces into marketable tourism products (Dredge and Jenkins).

3. Wilderness in Tourism Promotion

Clarifying the concept of wilderness in the 21st century is not an easy task due to the contested meaning of the word. The European Parliament resolution of 3 February 2009 on Wilderness in Europe expressed strong support for the strengthening of wilderness-related measures and recommended a development of an EU wilderness strategy. The European Wilderness Society, an international nonprofit non-government organisation, is a response to the EU call. Founded in 2014 with the mission to identify, manage and promote European wilderness where it still exists, it defined wilderness as "the native habitats and species, […] large enough for the effective ecological functioning of natural processes, […] unmodified or only slightly modified and without intrusive or extractive human activity, settlements, infrastructure or visual disturbance," with no human extraction, no human intervention and where dynamic natural processes take place ("European Wilderness Definition"). In 2013, under an EU contract, a group of experts indicated 522 areas in 27 EU countries with a potential to meet the European Wilderness Quality, none of them in the UK (Kuiters et al. 34–36). However, Scottish National Heritage had already been formed in 1992, an executive non-departmental public body of the Scottish Government responsible for the country's natural heritage, particularly the protected areas in Scotland accounting for 20% of its total area. The SNH identified "42 wild land areas following a detailed analysis in 2014 of where wildness can be found across all of Scotland's landscapes" ("Wild Land Area Descriptions"). The applied criteria were more people-friendly than the EU ones and ruled that such lands should "have largely semi-natural landscapes that show minimal signs of human influence, […] bring significant economic benefits – attracting visitors and tourists, […] offer people psychological and spiritual benefit, [and] […] provide increasingly important havens for Scotland's wildlife" ("Landscape Policy: Wild Land").

While politicians struggle for a functional definition of wilderness, many researchers point to the multiplicity of meanings attached to the concept. They tend to see it as a social construction, "a kind of meaning certain people give to the

landscape" depending on the value they attach to environmental goods: historical, indigenous, ecological, ecotouristic, etc. (Williams 125). The academic discussion on the meaning and standards of wilderness in Europe also resonates with the doubts expressed by some environmentally-conscious Scots. Jim Crumley, a celebrated Scottish nature writer, argues that the SNH criteria of designating Wild Land Areas in Scotland are based on "essentially emotional responses to those lands by people," without paying attention to what nature chooses for itself to prosper (54).

The strategy of promoting destinations as wilderness is neither new nor invented in Scotland, although in Britain it is most often linked with the Knoydart Peninsula in the Western Scottish Highlands. Accessible only by boat due to its harsh terrain and remoteness, it is a paradise for hill walkers, mountaineers, wildlife enthusiasts, and recently also for mountain bikers. Yet this fact does not prevent other areas in Britain from promoting themselves under the wilderness label, as did the authors of the guidebook *England's Last Wilderness – A Journey Through the North Pennines* (Bellamy and Quayle), or the mountain hiker and blogger Mark Horrell, who reported his trip to the Cambrian Mountains under the title "The Welsh Wilderness." Since 2013, Ireland has had an independent tour operator called *Wilderness Ireland* offering "a range of adventure holidays, tours and incredible wilderness experiences" ("About Wilderness Ireland"). Outside the UK, wild destinations are even more numerous. Many of them are recognised as or call themselves Europe's last wilderness, like, for instance, the Polish Białowieża forest (Gross). Iceland has built its tourism campaigns on nature-based attractions and wilderness characteristics, particularly of its Highlands (Sæþórsdóttir et al.), and Lapland has romanticised itself in the same way (Pedersen and Viken). It seems that in recent years Scotland's DMOs have also re-discovered the country's old "wilderness" label as a driver for success on today's competitive tourism market.

4. *The Scots Magazine*: Analysis

For practical reasons, three regular sections of the studied *Scots Magazine* issues were selected for close reading and detailed analysis in search of the verbal and visual discourses of wilderness: the front covers, the opening photographic section "Great Scottish Journeys" and the monthly column "Wild About Scotland" by Jim Crumley, Scotland's leading wildlife expert and author. Two elements of the covers were analysed in detail: the main images and coverlines. Each cover is dominated by one big photograph taking up almost the entire space. Thirteen of those pictures show landscape: ten of them mountains and lochs at different seasons of the year, and four rugged coastlines. The remaining five show landscape with single objects of human material civilisation (a bridge, lighthouses and small boats). Content analysis revealed a total absence of people, of human

settlement, farms and fields, cattle, historical and industrial buildings, roads and vehicles. Two photos contain allusions to the human presence in the shape of a distant winding path in a glen and a single trail of boot imprints in the sand of an empty beach.

A qualitative-semiotic analysis of the cover images revealed other regularities. They are all dramatic photos of sweeping landscapes or breathtaking and poetic landscape shots that capture the drama as well as splendour of Scottish nature, mostly in the Highlands. Contemplated jointly, they constitute a kaleidoscope of images featuring inaccessible rocks, smooth lake surfaces, wind-shaped dunes and virgin snow creating the impression of a remote land unspoiled by human intervention or even presence. Yet, the Scottish wilderness from the magazine's front covers is also friendly and romantic due to the omnipresent sun, the visual cliché prevalent in tourism promotion texts (Dann 194–195). It is never the full tropical sun on a brightly blue cloudless sky, to be sure, as it is usually captured during the golden hour, when the landscape is bathed in magical reddish yellow light, or just after sunset, with a soft pastel-toned glow over everything, or behind clouds, with the help of tinted solar filters. The cumulative effect of those images is that of the warmth, seduction, magic and beauty of Scotland's remote wild areas.

The visual discourse of wilderness represented by the cover photographs is linguistically enhanced by the matching lexical register of the coverlines:

1a. Island adventure: *Go wild* for the Outer Hebrides. (June 2017)
1b. The *wild North*: Discover Scotland's most magnificent landscapes. (Oct. 2017)
1c. Winter in the Highlands: The *savage beauty* of our *wildest season*. (Dec. 2017)
1d. Harris & Lewis: Journey to *the edge of the world*. (Feb. 2017)
1e. *Wild country*: Discover how John Muir Trust protects our most treasured land-scapes. (Oct. 2018) (emphases mine)

The multimodal discursive operations identified in the section "Great Scottish Journeys" serve the construction of Scotland as wilderness in a similar way. This opening section of each magazine issue typically occupies 5 pages and consists of about 8–10 photographs of different sizes, the first one invariably an impressive double-page spread. The monthly editions of the series are devoted to different parts of Scotland, often connected by some element, for instance places along the North Coast 500 route in the issues of July–November 2017; places on the A83 road from Tarbet to Lochgilphead (May 2017); or places on the West Highland Way, a popular long-distance walking trail (April 2017). The quantitative analysis of 18 editions of "Great Scottish Journeys" yielded 146 photographs altogether, only 11 of them showing people, mostly hikers. Yet unlike the cover pictures, as many as 112 feature man-made objects: roads, historical and rural/ farm buildings, fishing trawlers, boats and small ports, albeit always seen in the distance and dominated by pristine landscape.

The verbal part of each section consists of two regular text boxes, a quarter of a page each: one containing a brief description of a photographed route and the other, entitled "Fact File," presenting a list of regional titbits. Moreover, each photograph is provided with a caption in tiny print at the top or at the bottom. Those short text pieces depict Scottish places as wilderness by means of specific attributive adjectives in the noun phrases denoting elements of the landscape, such as "enormous skies," "huge mountains," "some truly wild scenery," "wild moorland," "savage beauty of the landscape," "colossal mountains […] and rugged coastline," "jagged peaks," "craggy cliffs," "peace and solitude," "unspoilt Galloway coast" and many more in the same vein. Like the iconic sun artistically captured in the photographs, the vocabulary of wonder and admiration serves as a linguistic strategy of making the Scottish wild spaces alluring and inviting: "gorgeous sandy beach," "stunning views," "a necklace of beautiful beaches," "magnificent vantage points," "an incredible vista," only to mention a few. Scottish scenery itself is expressively described as "breathtaking," "dazzling," "exquisite," "superb," "enthralling," "astonishing," and "head-spinning."

The third magazine section explored for evidence of the discursive rewilding of Scotland was the five-page long section "Wild About Scotland" found in all the examined issues except April and August 2017. A close reading of some features in the section reveals that its title is a play on words fusing the informal phrase "to be wild about something" with Scotland's wildlife, as those articles are entirely devoted to the celebration of regional wild fauna and flora. Jim Crumley, the author of them all, expertly writes here about animal and plant species living and growing in the wild. The articles are all based on the authors' personal encounter with and research on a particular animal/bird/fish in a particular territory. Unlike the sections analysed above, "Wild About Scotland" is only slightly dominated by photographs, which make up from half to two-thirds of the feature, but each edition opens up with a spectacular double-page photo of the story's "protagonist." Despite the poetic, sentimental and occasionally exalted style, there is no lack of in-depth information in the main texts, each ending with a short list of essential facts. The structure of each feature of the series is similar, although the elements never appear in the same order: the circumstances of the author's encounter with the animal/bird/plant, its graphic description, information about its ways and habits, history, current population and status in Scotland and a call for action if a problem of the species survival or wellbeing is observed.

In addition to his fixed topics of "native habitats and species" and "havens for Scotland's wildlife" (to use phrases from the official wilderness definition), Crumley conveys the wilderness effect by means of much more subtle narrative and stylistic techniques than the attributive phrases found in the previous sections. Here are some textual examples:

2a. It helps if you realise that some of them [trees in Cairngorms pinewoods] will remember the brush of wolf fur 250 or 300 years ago [...]. (Jan. 2017, 46)

2b. Such is the power of our wildcat that it can […] convince us of just how crucial the Scottish wildcat is as a wilderness presence. (March 2017, 44)

2c. They [whooper swans] turn up here in October and stay [...] well into April, and I think of them as the very soul of wildness. (July 2018, 66)

These and many more similar passages construct the image of Scottish nature as timeless, tranquil, wise, living its own life and persisting despite human intervention. Crumley sees Scotland's wilderness not necessarily as remote, inaccessible and void of people, but often at your fingertips. This kind of not-so-wild wilderness is likely to appeal to prospective tourists interested in non-extreme outdoor activities.

The vast array of photographs in "Wild About Scotland" show wildlife and landscapes in close-up and from a distance, static and dynamic, during all seasons of the year. Yet they all have one thing in common: no humans and no traces of material culture. This selection principle makes Scotland much more of a wilderness than the accompanying texts. Thus the two modes used jointly by Crumley to promote Scotland's wildlife meet both the strict and the more relaxed European criteria of wilderness.

The strategy of constructing Scotland's place identity as wilderness is also visibly present in the magazine's middle part "Outdoor Scotland" targeted at readers interested in sports, adventure and recreation in the open, particularly in its regular sections "On Your Bike" and "Take a Hike," two pages each. Although they have not all been closely analysed here, the SNH criteria of wilderness echoing in the randomly selected fragments are those concerning significant economic benefits through attracting visitors and tourists as well as psychological and spiritual benefits experienced by visitors:

3a. [A hiking trail] is worth the effort for *the solitude found by walking* through the Forest of Atholl. (Dec. 2017, 69)

3b. This hidden singletrack treasure may be rarely used, but it certainly *delivers the feelgood factor.* (March 2017, 76)

3c. *The excitement of riding* in such a place was hard to contain, and *we didn't stop smiling.* (Sept. 2017, 78) (emphases mine)

Many photographs in both sections routinely show landscapes, and while "On your Bike" frequently features riding or resting bikers, the hiking sections show no people whatsoever, hikers or locals.

The Scots Magazine image of wild Scotland fits well into the marketing strategy of many tourist organisations and institutions that stay in business by selling the region in the same way. The independent tour operator *Wilderness Scotland* specialises in offering adventure holidays in the most remote regions

of the Highlands and Islands of Scotland and claims to "know the wild places of Scotland better than anyone" ("About Wilderness Scotland"). *Wilderness Travel*, a global tourism operator evolved from a small American agency in California, had an "Islands and Highlands of Scotland" offer in the season 2018 advertised as a "fabled realm of mist-shrouded crags and heathered moors" and "wild seascapes" ("Highlands and Islands of Scotland: Hiking the Outer Hebrides and Isle of Skye"). Although the offer of *VisitScotland*, the national tourism agency for Scotland, is much more diversified and segmented, the marketing appeal of Scottish wilderness underlies its holiday programmes promising the experience of "deep lochs, high mountains, a dramatic west coast, beautiful beaches, historic castles, quaint Highland villages, diverse nature and wildlife" ("12 Day Highland Explorer") as well as "[h]uge horizons and white sands backed by wild hills" ("Length of the Outer Hebrides"). The perpetuation of Scotland's destination place identity as wilderness is an evidently collective promotional effort, in which *The Scots Magazine* plays its part.

5. Conclusion

It seems that after a period of Scotland's identity-building projects centred around the revival of Scottish Gaelic, the celebration of Scots as a literary medium, as religion, sports, the kitschy tartan version of the Highlands clan culture and regional politics after devolution in 1999 and Brexit, the cultural image of Scotland as wilderness has re-emerged in the field of tourism. Yet its current commodified version constructed for the sake of promoting tourism to the region differs significantly from Scotland's savage, dreadful and hostile wilderness dominating English 18th- and 19th-century travel writing (Bhandari 39–44). The "wild" Scotland of the 21st century is inviting, hospitable, accessible and alluring any day in the year. It offers the experience of physically challenging and spiritually beneficial recreation in a terrain undisturbed by undue human presence. This kind of wildness does not imply Scotland's underdevelopment and backwardness, as in earlier centuries, but positively distinguishes the region as committed to the conservation of its unique environmental heritage and ready to share its natural beauty with visitors. It promises both active and contemplative pleasures. In times of growing demand for sports, adventure and ecotourism and for high value attached to unique experience in exotic and remote settings, accompanied by the desire for experiential learning, this revived identity construct of Scotland is likely to pay off on the increasingly crowded European tourism market.

Acknowledgements

References

"12 Day Highland Explorer." *VisitScotland*.
    www.visitscotland.com/info/tours/12-day-highland-explorer-906ec5ba
"About Wilderness Ireland." *Wilderness Ireland*.
    https://www.wildernessireland.com/about-us/
"About Wilderness Scotland." *Wilderness Sotland*.
    https://www.wildernessscotland.com/about-us/
Adams, Kathleen M. 2016. "Identity." *Encyclopedia of Tourism*. Ed. Jafar Jafari
    and Honggen Xiao. Cham: Springer International Publishing. 450–452.
"Adventure Tourism In Scotland: Research Report." 2015. *Highlands and Islands
    Enterprise*.
    http://www.hie.co.uk/regional-information/economic-reports-and-research/
    archive/adventure-tourism-research-2015.html. pdf.
Akerlof, George A., and Rachel E. Kranton. 2000. "Economies and Identity." *The
    Quarterly Journal of Economies* 115.3: 715–753.
Akerlof, George A., and Rachel E. Kranton. 2010. *Identity Economics: How Our
    Identities Shape Our Work, Wages, and Well-Being*. Princeton: Princeton
    University Press.
André, Marien. 2011."Tourism and Identity." Centre Maurits Coppieters Papers 1.
    Brussels: CMC. 13–23.
Ayalew, Mekonen T. 2016. "The Role of Media in Tourism Promotion: A Case Study
    in Ethiopia." *Journal of Hospitality Management and Tourism* 7.5: 50–56.
Bairner, Alan. 2001. *Sport, Nationalism, and Globalization: European and North
    American Perspectives*. Albany: State University of New York Press.
Bellamy, David, and Brendan Quayle. 1989. *England's Last Wilderness – A Journey
    Through the North Pennines*. London: Michael Joseph.
Bhandari, Kalyan. 2014. *Tourism and National Identity: Heritage and Nationhood
    in Scotland.* Bristol, Buffalo and Toronto: Channel View Publications.
—. 2016. "Imagining the Scottish Nation: Tourism and Homeland Nationalism
    in Scotland." *Current Issues in Tourism* 19.9: 913–929.
Bond, Ross, David McCrone, and Alice Brown. 2003. "National Identity and Eco-
    nomic Development: Reiteration, Recapture, Reinterpretation, and Repudia-
    tion." *Nations and Nationalism* 9.3: 371–391.

Brown, David. 2014. "Scotland: Religion, Culture and National Identity." *International Journal for the Study of the Christian Church* 14.2: 88–99.

Brown, Ian, ed. 2012. *From Tartan to Tartanry: Scottish Culture, History and Myth.* Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

Butler, Richard W. 1998. "Tartan Mythology: The Traditional Tourist Image of Scotland." *Destinations: Cultural Landscapes of Tourism*. Ed. Greg Ringer. Abingdon: Routledge. 121–139.

Cano, Virginia, and Richard Prentice. 1998. "Opportunities for Endearment to Place Through Electronic 'Visiting': WWW Homepages and the Tourism Promotion of Scotland." *Tourism Management* 19.1: 67–73.

Clayton, Tristan. 2002. "Politics and Nationalism in Scotland: A Clydeside Case Study of Identity Construction." *Political Geography* 21.6: 813–843.

Crumley, Jim. 2017. "Defining The Wilderness." *The Scots Magazine*, September. 50–54.

Dann, Graham M. S. 1996. *The Language of Tourism: A Sociolinguistic Perspective.* Wallingford: CABI.

Dredge, Dianne, and John Jenkins. 2003. "Destination Place Identity and Regional Tourism Policy." *Tourism Geographies* 5.4: 383–407.

European Parliament Resolution of 3 February 2009 on Wilderness in Europe (Resolution 2008/2210(INI)).
http://www.europarl.europa.eu/sides/getDoc.do?pubRef=-//EP//TEXT+TA+P6-TA-2009-0034+0+DOC+XML+V0//EN

"European Wilderness Definition." *European Wilderness Network*.
http://european-wilderness.network/european-wilderness-definition/

Ferreira Lopes, Sérgio Dominique. 2011. "Destination Image: Origins, Developments and Implications." *PASOS. Revista De Turismo Y Patrimonia Cultural* 9.2: 305–315.

Garzone, Giuliana. 2009. "Identity in Tourist Communication on the Internet: Italy's and Spain's Websites Contrasted." *Identities across Media and Modes: Discursive Perspectives*. Ed. Giuliana Garzone and Paola Catenaccio. Bern: Peter Lang AG.

Getz, Donald, and Sheranne Fairley. 2004. "Media Management at Sport Events for Destination Promotion: Case Studies and Concepts." *Event Management* 8.3: 127–139.

Gross, Michael. 2016. "Europe's Last Wilderness Threatened." *Current Biology Magazine* 26, July 25. R641–R643.

"Highlands and Islands of Scotland: Hiking the Outer Hebrides and Isle of Skye."
https://www.wildernesstravel.com/trip/scotland/loch-ness-isle-of-skye-inverness-glencoe-hiking-tour

Horrell, Mark. 2011. "The Welsh Wilderness."
https://www.markhorrell.com/blog/2011/the-welsh-wilderness/

Jewitt, Carey, ed. 2016. *The Routledge Handbook of Multimodal Analysis.* 2nd edition. London and New York: Routledge.

Kneafsey, Moya. 1998. "Tourism and Place Identity: A Case-study in Rural Ireland." *Irish Geography* 31.2: 111–123.

Kuiters, A. T., M. van Eupen, S. Carver, M. Fisher, Z. Kun, and V. Vancura. 2013. *Wilderness Register and Indicator for Europe Final Report* (EEA Contract No:07.0307/2011/610387/SER/B.3). Edinburgh.

Kumar, S. Praveen. 2014. "Role of Media in the Promotion of Tourism Industry in India." *Global Review of Research in Tourism, Hospitality and Leisure Management* 1.3: 187–192.

"Landscape Policy: Wild Land." *nature.scot*. https://www.nature.scot/professional-advice/landscape-change/landscape-policy-and-guidance/landscape-policy-wild-land

"Length of the Outer Hebrides." *VisitScotland*. www.visitscotland.com/info/tours/length-of-the-outer-hebrides-e922bae4

MacLeod, Gordon. 1998. "In What Sense a Region? Place Hybridity, Symbolic Shape, and Institutional Formation in (Post-)modern Scotland." *Political Geography* 17.7: 833–863.

McCrone, David, Angela Morris, and Richard Kiely. 1995. *Scotland – the Brand: The Making of Scottish Heritage.* Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

Morgan, Nigel, and Annette Pritchard. 1998. *Tourism Promotion and Power: Creating Images, Creating Identities*. Chichester: John Wiley and Sons.

Page, Stephen J., William Steele, and Joanne Connell. 2006. "Analysing the Promotion of Adventure Tourism: A Case Study of Scotland." *Journal of Sport and Tourism* 11.1: 51–76.

Pedersen, K., and Arvid Viken. 1996. "From Sami Nomadism to Global Tourism." *People and Tourism in Fragile Environments.* Ed. Martin F. Price. Chichester: John Wiley and Sons. 69–88.

Reed, Americus, Mark R. Forehand, Stefano Puntoni, and Luk Warlop. 2012. "Identity-based Consumer Behavior." *International Journal of Research in Marketing* 29.4: 310–321.

Ritchie, J. R. Brent, and Geoffrey Ian Crouch. 2003. *The Competitive Destination: A Sustainable Tourism Perspective.* Wallingford: CABI.

Rose, Gillian. 2001. *Visual Methodologies.* London: Sage.

Sæþórsdóttir, Anna Dóra, C. Michael Hall, and Jarkko Saarinen. 2011. "Making Wilderness: Tourism and the History of the Wilderness Idea in Iceland." *Polar Geography* 34.4. 249–273.

Szymańska, Izabela, and Aniela Korzeniowska, ed. 2013. *Facets of Scottish Identity*. Warszawa: Wydawnictwo Naukowe Semper.

"The Media in Figures: Scots Magazines' Circulation Figures." *allmediascotland.com*. http://www.allmediascotland.com/press/84165/the-media-in-figures-scots-magazines-circulation-figures/

The Scots Magazine. January 2017–June 2018.

"Wild Land Area Descriptions." *nature.scot*.
 https://www.nature.scot/wild-land-area-descriptions

Williams, Daniel R. 2002. "Social Construction of Arctic Wilderness: Place Meanings, Value pluralism, and Globalization." *Wilderness in the Circumpolar North: Searching for Compatibility in Ecological, Traditional, and Ecotourism Values*. Ed. Alan E. Watson, Lilian Alessa, and Janet Sproull. Anchorage, AK. Proceedings RMRS-P-26. Ogden, UT: U.S. Department of Agriculture, Forest Service, Rocky Mountain Research Station. 120–132.

Monika Kocot
🆔 https://orcid.org/0000-0001-8111-4998
University of Łódź

Writing the Road:
On Drifting and Travelling-Seeing
in Kenneth White's Geopoetics

Abstract

The article will offer a comparative reading of Kenneth White's poetry, essays and travelogues/waybooks, with the focus on the issue of travelling, in particular the theme of drifting, the practice of writing-travelling and travelling-seeing (*voyage-voyance*). I will also try to demonstrate that there is a link between White's theory of geopoetics and the practice of *voyage-voyance* in his writing. I will focus mainly on selected passages from the chapters of *Travels in the Drifting Dawn* and poems in which White discusses the issue of his writing-travelling and the process of self-realisation.

Keywords: Kenneth White, writing-travelling, waybook, drifting, intellectual nomadism, voyage-voyance, geopoetics

> "Drifting, drifting… that's the way it looks on the edges of our civilisation.
> A drifting, a searching, beyond all the known grounds, for an other ground."
> (Kenneth White)

1. Introduction

"It's this other ground that is the theme of the here gathered texts – an other ground: a space of being, an area of the mind; and the way(s) to it" (1990b, 7) – this is how Kenneth White begins one of his travelogues, *Travels in the Drifting Dawn*. In his view, his book is "the account of displacement going deeper than geography, by someone who is first and foremost a pedestrian, sometimes a hitch-hiker, always a precarious inhabitant, just passing through" (1990b, 7). From the very beginning he speaks of "an other ground," understood not only geographically but first and foremost mentally. Characteristically, a book of travelling is seen here as an account of displacement experienced by someone who is "just passing through" or, as we

can see in the epigraph, by someone who is "drifting," searching "beyond all the known grounds" (see Kocot 2020b). What kind of "drifting" is White addressing here? What "other ground" is he writing about? This article offers a comparative reading of Kenneth White's poetry, essays and travelogues/waybooks, with the focus on the issue of travelling, in particular the theme of *voyage-voyance*, and the practice of *savoir-voir*. In my opinion, there is a link between White's theory of geopoetics[1] and the practice of *voyage-voyance* in his writing. I focus mainly on selected passages from the chapters of *Travels in the Drifting Dawn*, and poems in which White discusses the issue of his writing-travelling; in my analyses I try to show the link between the practice of travelling and the process of self-realisation. I also refer to "Writing the Road," a theoretical essay on the philosophy of waybooks from White's collection of essays titled *The Wanderer and his Charts: Essays of Cultural Renewal*.

In their essay on border-crossers in contemporary Scottish literature, Ian Brown and Colin Nicholson observe that any act of creation involves going beyond established limits of perceived possibility or acceptability:

> Out of such transgression comes generic growth. A sense of where the core lies and what is liminal is central to self-definition, whether individual, generic or cultural. Exploratory crossing of boundaries is, therefore, a way of knowing, at least with less uncertainty, one's identity – or identities. Working in more than one literary genre is, beyond any possible economic advantage from extending a potential audience, to assert the existence of another identity, or at least that one's identity is complex and multiple. (262)

Brown and Nicholson add that this practice requires not only a variety of skills and complexity of identity, but also the need to find expression in different modes or languages (262). White's artistic expressions are published in two languages, English and French. Interestingly, some of his writings come originally in French, and some in English. For instance, the theory concerning *voyage-voyance*, or travelling-writing, was originally published in French, and so far only some of the books or essays have been translated into English. It might be argued that White's capacity to break conventions and established artistic modes depends also on his choice of language.

Brown and Nicholson place White among border-crossers such as Iain Crichton Smith, George Mackay Brown, Tom McGrath, Ian Hamilton Finlay, Edwin Morgan, Liz Lochhead, Christopher Whyte, George Gunn and Jackie Kay, but they emphasise that White is "the only Scottish poet to have elaborated a theory of writing out of the notion of border crossings" (268). They mean not only geographical border crossings, but also transgression of generic and cultural limits.

White himself divides his writing into three different forms: poem-books, essay-books, and prose-books or "waybooks": "At one point, I likened this triple

literary activity to an arrow. The essays, maintaining direction, are the feathers; the prose, ongoing autobiography, or what I like to call "waybooks" (alias transcendental travelogues) is the arrow's shaft; and the poem is the arrow-head" (1990b, 9). It is important to note that for White the whole arrow is in movement, it is "going somewhere, not just marking time or making remarks about this, that and the next thing" (1990b,9). In his essays, White attempts to "draw up a new mental cartography" (1998, 163), to propose a new, geopoetic way of being-in-the-world, whereas his "waybooks" describe his travels in various parts of the world; one could argue that they form a peculiar testimony of White's geopoetic practice of *voyage-voyance*, writing-travelling (see Kocot 2020a). In his three waybooks or travelogues, White has spoken of his mental continent as Euramerasia, "with Asia both as background and as ultimate area" (McManus 108). This is why we find numerous references to Japanese Zen and Chinese Ch'an literature and philosophy, not only in *Pilgrim of the Void* (which presents White's travels in Asia), but also in *The Blue Road* (White's vision of America) and in *Travels in the Drifting Dawn* (which completes the Euramerasian adventure and focuses on White's travels in Europe).

2. Geopoetics or Open World Poetics

In their essay on border-crossers, Brown and Nicholson note that White's "geopoetics" "grows out of his elaborate sense of a physical and cultural geography of intersecting centres and peripheries, both 'centre' and 'periphery' always remaining interchangeable terms" (268), and they add: "since it involves what White has called 'the orchestration of all cultures, an original synthesis,' it is fitting he shares Alexander von Humboldt's conviction that the external world and our thoughts and feelings are as inextricably linked as thought and language" (268). One could argue that geopoetic discourse is inspired not only by Humboldt's theory, but also by the literary movements (such as German Romanticism) White was drawn to. The list of people and traditions that have influenced White is quite long. I hope I will be able to discuss some of these links and associations. We will come back to the issue of centres and peripheries in the latter part of this article.

   On the website of *The Scottish Centre for Geopoetics* (founded in 1995 by Tony McManus and others, affiliated to the International Institute of Geopoetics founded by White in 1989 in Paris) we read that White "had always been of the persuasion that the richest poetics came from contact with the earth, from a plunge into biospheric space, from an attempt to read the lines of the world" ("The International Institute of Geopoetics. Inaugural Text"). We also learn that the term geopoetics cannot be understood as deep ecology or as a literary school. For White, it should be seen as "a major movement involving the very foundations of human life on earth" ("The International Institute of Geopoetics. Inaugural

Text"). These "foundations" may suggest that we are entering a peculiar space where philosophy (both Western and Eastern) is deeply intertwined with poetry (see Kocot 2019):

> In the fundamental geopoetic field come together poets and thinkers of all times and of all countries. To quote only a few examples, in the West, one can think of Heraclitus ("man is separated from what is closest to him"), Hölderlin ("man lives poetically on the earth"), or Wallace Stevens ("the poems of heaven and hell have been written, it remains to write the poem of the earth"). In the East, there is the Taoist Tchuang-tzu, the man of the ancient pool, Matsuo Bashō, and beautiful world-meditations such as one can find in the *Hua Yen Sutra*.[2] ("The International Institute of Geopoetics. Inaugural Text")

A similar message emphasising a cross-cultural, transdisciplinary and, last but not least, poetic mode of being-in-the-world can be found in White's "L'aventure poétique," translated by the author for Tony McManus:

> Today, for the first time in the history of humanity, winds blow from all regions of the globe at once, and each and every one of us has access to all cultures of the world. That can give rise to cacophony, to disarray, lassitude in front of so much accumulated richness, but it can also give rise, with analytical work and synthesis [...] to a new way of thinking, a great world poem, liveable by everyone. (qtd. in McManus 196)

Characteristically, this new way of thinking promotes a rhizomatic framework of associations across many (at times too many) disciplines and cultures, which is why some (especially British) critics find it too (intellectually/aesthetically?) demanding, and they reject its basic assumptions.

For the French, White's writing has always been much more convincing and inspiring; this is partly related to the fact that White often refers to French philosophers (such as Maurice Merleau-Ponty, Maurice Blanchot or Gilles Deleuze), and literary figures (Arthur Rimbaud, Charles Baudelaire, Gérard de Nerval, Paul Valéry, to mention just a few). But French influences, both in terms of philosophy and aesthetics, are at least to some extent secondary. As Brown and Nicholson observe, when White first began to talk about "geopoetics" in the late 1970s, "he found preliminary stimulus and encouragement in Walt Whitman" (268), and we can find numerous passages in White's *The Wanderer and His Charts* where he dwells on Whitman's geopoetic spirit and his passion for travelling. In the chapter "Writing the Road," which might be seen as White's own (and definitely winding) history of road literature, he discusses poetic affinities between Whitman, Emerson, and Carlyle. For him, what had come to Whitman from Carlyle and Emerson, was "Romanticism (transcendental idealism)" but he, White argues, "translated it into Americanese, and gave it a new lease of life. The result was the 'Open Road'" (2004, 100). And here he quotes his poetic master:

"From this hour I ordain myself loos'd of limits and imaginary lines" (2004, 100). But one could quote further, as those lines describe in almost exactly the same measure both Whitman's and White's poetic practice: "Pausing, searching, receiving, contemplating, / Gently, but with undeniable will, divesting myself of the holds that would hold me. / I inhale great draughts of space, / The east and the west are mine, and the north and the south are mine" (Whitman 139). It is also interesting to take a look at what he deems inspiring in Whitman's poetry:

> "breaking through copied forms" (W.C. Williams' phrase), the oceanic surge of his line, the inventiveness of his vocabulary and these particularly felicitous moments of contact with the "cool-breath'd earth," when the rant and the brag (so irritating to some, so exhilarating to others, even if they take it, as it must be taken, with a humorous grain of salt) gives way to a quieter kind of poetics. (White 2004, 100)

If one thinks of White's writing, be it prose, travelogue or poetry, one cannot help noticing how strikingly similar it is to that of Whitman: the flood of images, loosely woven "collages" of "written-through" images or phrases, rhizomatic narrative structures, language games. But, apparently, the similarity can be found not only in Whitmanesque inclusiveness but also in Whitman's gorgeous egotism: White is aware of the fact that for some readers "the rant and the brag" of the speaking persona might be problematic. We will come back to this issue in the latter part of this article, as the way I see it the issue of emptiness, voidness and silence is inextricably linked with White's truly insatiable appetite for new words, mind-bending phrases and rhizomatic narrative strands.

For White, the romantic transcendental travelogue "moves through a spiritual topography, towards what Hölderlin calls 'completion'" (2004, 96); "it is a journey from self to Self, from confusion and ignorance to a cosmo-poetic reading of the universe" (96). White emphasises here not the destination of these travelogues but their method: "the idea is to give a sense all along the way of what is open and flowing and cannot be defined in any cut-and-dried fashion" (96). In his book *L'Esprit nomade* (*The Nomad Mind*) he speaks of waybook and transcendental travelogue, and about what he calls "white world," communication between the self and the world, and the need to "worldify the self, littoralise being" (1996, 34).

In one of the chapters of *The Wanderer and His Charts*, entitled tellingly "Elements of a New Cartography," White mentions other authors whom he sees as precursors to his geopoetic project: Ezra Pound, T.S. Eliot, Charles Olson, Rainer Maria-Rilke, Henri Michaux (2004, 163). White also quotes Deleuze and Guattari, who in *A Thousand Plateaux* attempt to define a "nomadic" type of writing: "writing has nothing to do with meaning, but everything to do with serpentine movement and cartography" (qtd. in White 2004, 164). Characteristically, in his writing practice White combines contemporary post-structuralist philosophy of the text with the quite ancient literary aesthetics and philosophical depth he finds in Japanese Zen and Chinese Ch'an literature, but first and foremost in Taoist sources.

Brown and Nicholson observe that White's fascination with establishing a new way of writing in the West is linked with his reading of Far Eastern philosophy and literature: "[i]mmersed in Zen Buddhism, he was also powerfully drawn to the Taoist literary form that he sees making fun of heavy logic, moving rapidly through multiple spaces and mixing up all genres" (268). It is worth pointing out here that the Eastern texts White is drawn to (and here Tony McManus mentions the "whispered teachings" of Tibetan Buddhism, the "white line" of Milarepa and Marpa, the most iconoclastic Zen texts, the writings of Tchuang-tzu) are those which challenge established belief-systems and ritual practices (see McManus 109). White's writing (poetry, essays, waybooks) contains hundreds and hundreds of quotations, paraphrases, epigraphs, multimodal references to Eastern (Hindu, Buddhist, Taoist) religious texts. But that does not mean that White's interest in these texts is religious. In the introduction to *Le Plateau de l'albatros*, he quite explicitly rejects religious discourse. For him geopoetics concerns a new mental cartography (freed from the constraints of ideology and religious beliefs) and the search for a new language that would be able to express this other way of being in the world; it would seem that "a rapport with the earth (energies, rhythms, forms)" is of crucial importance here (see McManus 74; Kocot 2020a, 2020b).

White's deep fascination, if not obsession, with Eastern philosophy, aesthetics and poetic traditions can be associated with his geopoetic idea of nondualistic "finer world-living" (1992a, 167). In the already quoted passage from the website of *The Scottish Centre for Geopoetics*, White refers to Tchuang-tzu (4th century BC, the co-founder of Taoism), Matsuo Bashō (1644–1694, the Japanese master of *haiku*, *haibun* and *renga*), and the *Hua Yen Sūtra*, one of the most influential Mahayana sūtras of East Asian Buddhism. Even though we are entering different realms of philosophy (Taoism, Japanese Zen Buddhism and Chinese Ch'an Buddhism) and a number of aesthetic traditions, what seems crucial is the emphasis put on a mind-bending imaginary which aims at making one realise the state of Oneness (of oneself and the world).

I would argue that White is so influenced by Bashō's philosophy of writing that he tries to follow in his footsteps; he does that literally in his *Pilgrim of the Void* where we find whole chapters devoted to Bashō and the history of his school of writing. Bashō's travel-accounts are extremely inspiring for White, not only in terms of their prosimetric form, but first and foremost because of the philosophy of living that informs this writing (see Kocot 2020a). Let us have a look at the quote which opens Bashō's *Oku no hosomichi*, and which could easily relate, at least to some extent, to White's writing as well. This time I am quoting the translation we find in White's "Writing the Road" in *The Wanderer and His Charts*: "The passing days and months are eternal travellers in time. The years that come and go are travellers too. Life itself is a journey. As for those who spend their days upon the waters in boats, and those who grow old leading horses, their very home is the open road. Many ancient died on that road. I myself have long been tempted out

by the cloud-moving wind" (2004, 109). It is quite intriguing that White ends this quote here, as the next sentence introduces a peculiar relationship between the traveller and the cloud; in my view this passage testifies to one more similarity between Bashō and his geopoetically-oriented follower: "In which year it was I do not recall, but I, too, began to be lured by the wind like a fragmentary cloud and have since been unable to resist wanderlust, roaming out to the seashores" (Sato 50). The *wanderlust* and the practice of roaming along the seashores are two features that characterise Bashō's and White's writing. It is even more vivid when one studies White's travels in Japan where he literally follows in his master's footsteps (see Kocot 2020a).

Let us contrast Bashō's travelogue with a passage from White's waybook *Pilgrim of the Void*, where we are introduced to his philosophy of travelling. From the very beginning we can see how much White relies on Buddhist sources, in this particular case on the teaching of the Chinese Ch'an master Hsuan-chuen, the Dharma Successor of Hui-Neng (the Sixth Patriarch). I am quoting a longer passage so that we can notice the way White interweaves Taoist and Buddhist references:

> So a book of travels? Yes, no doubt – but more, a book concerning a certain (and uncertain) way of being in the world. Hsuan-chuen gives a pleasant description of the tao-jen, the-man-on-the-way:
>> Take a look at that easy going fellow, out on the way
>> Who has given up all striving
>> Neither avoiding the false nor seeking the true
>> For ignorance after all is really enlightenment
>> And this changing body is the body of deep reality
> It looks like there may be something beyond the strict categories of true and false, something beyond the heavy notions of spiritual and material – maybe a space in which these notions and categories are no longer seen as contradictory. Maybe the girl I saw was the body of the Dharma, maybe she was just a figment of my excited imagination. Who can say? Maybe the thing is, not to ask yourself so many questions, but to get out on the road, the life-road, and live it, taking it all as it comes, the up and the down, the sordid and the marvellous, the tough and the gentle. When the monk asked the master: "What is Tao?," the answer came like a shot: "Go!" Wherever we go, we're going home. (1992b, 14–15)

In a slightly rhizomatic fashion White talks of his travelogue as a book concerning a very peculiar way of being in the world. He quotes Hsuan-chuen's *Cheng-Tao-Ko*, also known as *Shodoka* or *Song of Enlightenment*, a text of seminal importance to Ch'an, Zen and Taoism, and he stresses the importance of a spontaneous way of acting, embracing the life-road as it is, without any projections and prejudices. The Tao, the Way, is understood here as a dynamic process where the traveller is open to what s/he encounters on the road, because s/he knows (at heart) that, to quote Bashō, "his/her very home is the open road" (qtd. in White 2004, 109; see Kocot 2020a). As Omar Bsaithi aptly notes, when going through White's waybook

the reader "must not expect a linear narration of exciting adventures or a simple description of exotic locations, but rather an exploration of different *mindscapes*, different manners of looking at the world, which, of course, does not exclude the physical dimension of the journey" (Bsaithi 74; see Kocot 2020a). One could not agree more. As we will see, sometimes the travel is all about not travelling at all.

3. The Practice of Writing-Travelling and Travelling-Seeing

In a collection of interviews titled *Coast to Coast*, we find an interview with Matthew Graves who asks White about the relationship between his writing and travel, and this is how White responds:

> From the very beginning, writing, for me, went with walking. That was on the moors, or along the shores, of a village on the west coast of Scotland. And it meant going forward in an uninscribed space, noting everything that sprang into the mind: signs of growth and passage, such as the lines on the bark of a tree, or the tracks of animals and birds. Walking was a way of getting rid of the weight of society, and at the same time a way of opening my senses [...]. Afterwards came thought-patterns, and roads of culture. Moving about meant leaving narrow frameworks, congested areas, and entering a territory. It meant accumulating details, while maintaining a sense of movement, and the approach to an emptiness, a silence, a poem. (1996, 32)

White makes it explicitly clear that for him writing "goes" with walking. In other words writing is inextricably linked with walking with no particular aim or direction in mind. I'm using the phrase "in mind," as in White's writing walking is often referred to as a walking meditation, as a practice of mindfulness. At the same time one cannot help noticing the similarity between the message of this quote and the passage on drifting quoted at the beginning of this article. Perhaps "drifting" might mean both aimless walking, wandering, and the practice of mindfulness?

The emptiness and silence White mentions in this passage are often associated with the process of "spacing out." We can see that for instance in the poem titled "Coastline" where White shares his views on writing poetry:

Write poetry?

rather follow the coast
fragment after fragment

going forward

breathing

spacing it out (1990a, 55)

It is important to note the spacing between the lines and the emphasis put on "following the coast," on "going forward," but also on breathing and the process of ordering, arranging (the coast by going forward and breathing?). One could argue that for White the process of spacing oneself out and the activity of spacing something out do not have to exclude each other. The way I see it, this is what makes this process so intriguing from the cognitive point of view. By letting go, becoming detached but focused on studying the details of the (natural) surroundings, the speaker is slowly entering the "nowhere." And this is precisely where the dynamics of emptiness or whiteness begin to operate.

It is even more explicit in his poem "White Valley." We find the poem in the second book of White's *Open World* collection. The book is entitled *In the Backlands* and it is preceded by an introduction where White stresses the importance of Alba, the Scottish Gaelic name for Scotland, which also means "white" or "bright." It is one of many instances in White's writing where the issues of Scottishness and whiteness become interwoven with the theme of emptiness, silences, and spiritual investigations: "Going back into the silences. Gathering cold elements. Alban investigations, white world. At the tentative limits. No metaphysical solemnity, no encumbering religiosity. A great emptiness – broken now and then by exclamations, like the cry of a Laughing Gull" (2003, 43)."White Valley" begins with images of emptiness, the experience of which is essential to the process of freeing one's mind; this time "breathing" refers not only to the act of breathing as such but more importantly to the act of letting go which might open the space of self-realisation (which again is associated here with experiencing oneness of self and the universe):

> Not much to be seen in this valley
> a few lines, a lot of whiteness
> we're at the end of the world, or at its beginning
> maybe the quaternary ice has just withdrawn
>
> as yet
> no life, no living noise
> not even a bird, not even a hare
> nothing
> but the wailing of the wind
>
> yet the mind moves here with ease
> advances into emptiness
>
> *breathes*
>
> and line after line
> something like a universe
> lays itself out (2003, 52; original emphasis)

The whiteness of the scene, its phenomenal emptiness, with only a few contours (lines), brings to mind classical Japanese and Chinese ink on paper landscapes where the invisible (hidden) is more important than the visible (present). The viewer/the reader is gently introduced to the space of voidness and silence; we learn that the mind moves here with ease, precisely because of the immensity of this empty space. The mind "breathes," it does not feed on hundreds of stimuli like a typical "monkey" mind; it is calm, and that is what initiates a peculiar process: "line after line / something like a universe / lays itself out," in other words the universe slowly, sequentially appears out of nothing as it were. White's obsession with voidness and whiteness and their relation with non-dualistic "finer world-living" (1992a, 167) and the process of self-discovery or self-realisation is of utmost importance here.

Brown and Nicholson aptly note that White's "world-ranging fields of energy and sometimes arcane philosophical investigations repeatedly ground themselves in Scottish specificities" (268). The importance of Scottish roots, Celtic roots to be precise, is emphasised in one of the chapters of *Travels in the Drifting Dawn* where White dwells on the theme of Scotus Vagans, the Wandering Scot. For White, the motif testifies to a long history of travelling, or passion for travelling, for going beyond established geographical and cultural borders (see Kocot 2020b). At the same time, he stresses the idea of a mental journey. This link will be made even more explicit in the passage on Taoist travelling. When addressing his practice of wandering, he immediately combines it with moving beyond a historical and geographical context (out of MacNies, Camerons, MacKenzies, MacGregors), and entering "the white," the space of breathing, the space of meditation in motion:

> Scot. I like the etymology of that word as "wanderer." Yes, that's it. The extravagant (*extra vagans*: wandering outside) Scot. *Scotus vagans*. Wandering, more or less obscurely, in accordance with a fundamental orientation. Which brings us (going hither and thither, but you get there in the end) to the Orient. I no longer remember when that seed of the East got planted in me, but the soil was ready and it took root, naturally, unobtrusively, without straining or excessive flourish. It went along with that urge, always present, not to be embedded in history, but to work a way out of it. Out of MacNies and Camerons and Mackenzies and MacGregors – the white. A kind of transpersonal thing. A breathing space, a cool area. *Kenshō jobutsu*. Seeing into your own nature is becoming Buddha. But what is Buddha? Seeing into your own nature, *entendu*. Listen to that curlew out there. (1990b, 133)

As I have mentioned, some of White's books or essays published in French have not been translated. Here is a short quote from an essay titled "Petit Album Nomade" in which White dwells on the philosophy of his transcendental travelogues and the way his travels (*voyages*) relate to two words in French which sound almost like homophones: *voie* (life-way) and *voir* (seeing):

> Dans une série de livres, *La figure du dehors*, *Une apocalypse tranquille*, *L'esprit nomade*, j'ai essayé (il s'agit en effet d'*essais*, un genre explorateur) de dégager l'espace de cette littérature-là et de dresser la généalogie d'une sorte de récit de voyage d'un type nouveau, qui pourra bien sûr prendre plusieurs formes, adopter plusieurs tonalités, selon la personnalité des écrivains. En anglais, je l'ai appelé *waybook*, en allemand *Wegbuch*, et en français, faute de la possibilité d'un terme aussi court: *voyage-voyance*. Dans tous ces termes, en plus de la notion de voyage, il y a la notion de voie (ligne de vie) et de voir (percevoir un autre espace, ouvrir d'autres dimensions). S'il n'y a pas cet autre espace, cette autre dimension, on ne sort pas de l'"universel reportage" que stigmatisait déjà Mallarmé. (1999, 180)

> In a series of books, *La figure du dehors*, *Une apocalypse tranquille*, *L'esprit nomade*, I tried (these are indeed essays [attempts], an exploratory genre) to clear the space of that literature and to constitute a genealogy of a kind of travel narrative belonging to a new type, which can of course take several forms, assume several tones, according to the personality of the writers. In English, I called it waybook, in German *Wegbuch*, and in French, for lack of a similarly short term: *voyage-voyance*. In all these terms, in addition to the notion of travel, there is the notion of a path (the life line) and of seeing (perceiving another space, opening other dimensions). If this other space, other dimension, is not there, one does not escape the "universal reporting" that was stigmatized already by Mallarmé. (1999, 180; trans. Justyna Fruzińska)

We read that the genre is called *Wegbuch* in German, waybook in English, but the name in French says much more than the one in German and English. In French it is called *voyage-voyance,* which Mohammed Hashas translates as travel and vision that cannot exist without each other (49). In the passage we are looking at, White associates the notion of the way (*voie*) with the line of life (*ligne de vie*) and with seeing (perceiving that other space, opening other dimensions) (see Kocot 2020a). Without the element of vision and seeing, we are not talking about the waybook but about the "universal reporting." Hashas aptly notices that for White, travel (*voyage*) should be both mental and physical "so that the mindscape will correspond to the landscape, and vice versa, which will in turn be expressed in a particular wordscape that is fraught with whiteness and desire for the white world" (49; see Kocot 2020a). We will come back to the theme of whiteness in a moment.

In *L'Ermitage Des Brumes*: *Occident, Orient et au-Delà* White adds that waybooks are not only travel accounts but first and foremost books of the way (*livre de la voie*), and the most important thing is spiritual affirmation of the new, opening our eyes to the unknown (see Kocot 2020a):

> Tout en traversant des territoires, à l'horizontale, si je puis dire, ces livres cherchent à découvrir des chemins de culture occultés par l'histoire, des pistes de pensée (un lieu, un moment, peut-être l'occasion, non d'une vague réflexion, mais d'une percée de l'esprit), et des sentiers du sentir, où jaillissent les sensations les plus fraîches

possibles: "à chaque pas le vent pur," comme dit le koan zen. Sous le voyage, il y a toujours la voie (*waybook* – livre de la voie, non seulement livre de voyage) – mais d'une manière discrète. (2005, 79)

While traversing territories, horizontally, if I may say so, these books try to discover cultural paths overshadowed by history, ways of thought (a place, a moment, perhaps an opportunity, not for a vague reflection but a turning point of the spirit), and pathways of feeling, where the freshest possible sensations appear: "each step pure wind,"as the zenkoan says. Within the journey [voyage], there is always the way [voie] (waybook – a book of the way, not only a travel book) – but in a discreet way" (2005, 79; trans. Justyna Fruzińska).

In the passage from *Le poète cosmographe*, we read that for White travelling (*voyage*) should be accompanied with *voyance*, with knowing how to look in order to see (*savoir voir*), with mindful being in the world, and with constant movement (see Kocot 2020a): "Il y a beaucoup de choses à découvrir, à partir du moindre signe, sur la culture picte, la culture celte, la vie des Vikings […]. Pour cela, bien sûr, il faut être sur le qui-vive. Voyager, pour moi, c'est bouger, certes, et j'aime le mouvement, mais c'est aussi savoir voir. C'est pour cela que je parle de voyages-voyances" (1987, 53). ["There are many things to discover, starting with the slightest sign, about Pict culture, Celtic culture, the life of the Vikings [...]. For that, of course, one needs to be on the alert. Traveling for me is about moving, of course, and I like movement, but it's also about knowing how to see. That's why I'm talking about sites-sights [voyages-voyances]" (1987, 53; trans. Justyna Fruzińska)].

Hashas aptly observes that if the *voyage* is to be accompanied with *voyance* (*savoir voir*) and with movement, then the term *voyage-voyance* can be approximately synonymous with "intellectual nomadism," the term often used by White, especially in his book *L'esprit nomade*, devoted almost entirely to the philosophy of intellectual nomadism. Interestingly, he takes the term from Emerson who describes intellectual nomadism as "the faculty of seeing far in all directions" (2004, 8). In *The Wanderer and His Charts*, White writes that for Emerson "the house of the intellectual nomad is a chariot in which, like a Kalmuk (a member of a Buddhist Mongol people), he will traverse all latitudes, never forgetting his 'inner law'" (8). This Emersonian image stuck in White's mind to such an extent that texts from Mongolia and adjacent territories were to constitute a significant section of his library, including an album of documents printed in 1985: images of gateways and roads, together with manuscripts in six languages (Sanskrit, Prakrit, Chinese, Tibetan, Mongol and Uigour) (2004, 8).

Characteristically, *voyage-voyance* and intellectual nomadism are often associated in White's writing with "drifting" and with a strong desire to reach "nowhere." We find passages of this kind in the second part of *Travels in the Drifting Dawn*, tellingly entitled "The Gates," which opens with an epigraph from *Mumonkan*, a collection of Japanese koans: "The great path has no gates /

When you go through the gateless gate / You walk freely between heaven and earth." This quote clearly signals White's preoccupation with gates leading to "an other ground: a space of being, an area of the mind" (1990b, 7). Here is how he discusses his aimless aim in the chapter written in Brittany: "Travelling this way, where am I going? – nowhere. I pass through many places of the mind – to get nowhere. Nowhere is difficult, but I'll get there some day. […] Nowhere is anywhere, is mywhere" (1990b, 68). But the passage I find most intriguing in terms of philosophical investigations and cross-cultural inspirations is the one written in Marseilles. Interestingly, the passage is almost entirely quoted from *The Book of Lieh-tzu* (also known as *True Classic of Simplicity and Vacuity* or *Classic of the Perfect Emptiness*), one of the major Taoist works, compared to the poetic narrative of Lao-tzu and the philosophical writings of Tchuang-tzu. Let us have a look at the quote and see how the motif of drifting takes on a new meaning when seen in relation to the Tao of travelling:

> In the beginning Lieh Tzu was fond of travelling. The adept Hu-ch'iu Tzu said to him: "I hear you're fond of travelling. What is it in travelling that pleases you?"
> "For me," said Lieh Tzu, "the pleasure of travelling consists in the appreciation of variety. When most people travel, they merely contemplate what is before their eyes. When I travel, I contemplate the processes of mutability."
> "I wonder," said Hu-ch'iu Tzu, "whether your travels are not very much the same as other people's, despite the fact that you think them so different. Whenever people look at anything, they are necessarily looking at processes of change, and one may well appreciate the mutability of outside things, while wholly unaware of one's own mutability. Those who take infinite trouble about external travels, have no idea how to set about the sight-seeing that can be done within. The traveller abroad is dependent upon outside things. He whose sight-seeing is inward, can find all he needs in himself. Such is the highest form of travelling, while it is a poor sort of journey that is dependent upon outside things."
> After this, Lieh Tzu never went anywhere at all, aware that till now he had not really known what travelling means. (1990b, 145–146)

Here White finishes the quote and offers his comment on the relation between the story and his practice of travelling and search of a no-place:

> I suppose I'm still at the stage of "going places" – yet this going from place to place always leads me, sooner or later, to a no-place. It's the no-place that fundamentally attracts me. Whether or not it is possible to settle there is […] what remains to be seen.
> But even then, even if I really get to the no-place, that won't mean the end of drifting. As the Ch'an master O Hu says: "Do not say that only those who have clearly realised the self are forced to drift about. Even those who have clearly realised it continue to drift." They continue to drift, just as they continue to eat rice. Otherwise they would be imprisoning or corpsifying the living truth. You've got to remain in the current. (1990b, 146)

Quite surprisingly, White suggests that his travelling resembles the practice of "drifting" in Ch'an master O Hu's story. It is important to note that this post-enlightenment kind of "drifting" has nothing to do with simple wandering, moving with the current, or searching for an other ground; on the contrary, master O Hu speaks of "drifting" which comes as a result of the advanced practice of mindful living (Yü 212). It would be interesting to note that in the latter part of his teaching, obviously not quoted by White, master O Hu elaborates on "drifting" and admonishes his interlocutor against speaking about this kind of "drifting" by saying that it is like "a cangue round the neck and fetters on the legs" (Yü 212).

4. Conclusion

In White's writing, be it poetry or prose, epigraphs or, as in this case, longer quotations, they set the scene for reflection on the nature of things, or open the space of dialogue with seemingly distant texts. It is important to study how White uses these quotations, and how he often omits a significant part of the text he quotes in order to direct the readers' attention to what he deems crucial. This is what happens in the story in question. Here is the ending of Lieh Tzu's story on travelling; in my view, it offers a significant but latent context to White's meditations on travelling. Seeing that Lieh Tzu stopped travelling, Hu-ch'iu Tzu tells him what real travel is all about:

> Travel is such a wonderful experience! Especially when you forget you are travelling. Then you will enjoy whatever you see and do. Those who look into themselves when they travel will not think about what they see. In fact, there is no distinction between the viewer and the seen. You experience everything with the totality of yourself, so that every blade of grass, every mountain, every lake is alive and is a part of you. When there is no division between you and what is other, this is the ultimate experience of travelling. (*Lieh-tzu: A Taoist Guide to Practical Living* 58)

The real journey does not happen outside of oneself; on the contrary, it happens within, and when this type of journey takes place the "other ground," the "no-place that fundamentally attracts" White imperceptibly emerges within. This oneness of the self (Self?) and the (natural) world is inextricably linked with the process of self-realisation. White speaks of this process in many of his poems, but I would like to come back to his "White Valley" which concludes with the emphasis on a discrete and secret process of self-realisation which takes place in solitude:

> without doing much naming
> without breaking the immensity of the silence
> discretely, secretly
> someone is saying

here I am, here
I begin. (2003, 52)

In *Travels in the Drifting Dawn* (the chapter written in Scotland's North) White's Tao of emptiness is presented in a similar fashion. The speaker is accompanied only by birds, and he is sinking deep into the state of "no-who-where," transcending the limits of self-identity and place (see Kocot 2020b):

> To travel north is to travel into the mind. I suppose the same might be said for the south, the east, and the west (any "pure direction," as it were), but I'm not sure if the north, with maybe the east, isn't privileged. As you go north, the landscape becomes more naked, points of interest become rarer. The self becomes spaced-out. That blue-grey silence among the reeds of the stream – a heron! Wind scouring the sands, and a grey gull struggling to make headway. Little black lochans full of water lilies. Spaced-out, and lost in the high open joyance. (1990b, 143–144)

Marco Fazzini observes that ever since White published his reflections on the "intellectual nomad" (in his *L'Esprit nomade*) "he has given this figure the power to transform his exile into a soul-searching investigation through meditation" (2009, 118). For Fazzini, White's aim is to "attain a heightened illumination where emptiness ('blankness') and 'whiteness' are reconciled through their etymologies" (2009, 118). I would only add that in the process of "drifting" – which can be understood as intellectual nomadism, *voyage-voyance*, and even the practice of mindfulness – White seeks to (re-)discover this other ground: "a space of being, an area of the mind" he mentions in his *Travels in the Drifting Dawn*. And just as the dawn is drifting, those white epiphanies he experiences and silent hierophanies he witnesses bring him closer to the suchness of things. It might be argued, however, that writing about those experiences is so challenging for White that at times, instead of post-enlightenment internal "drifting" he refers to by quoting Ch'an master O Hu (and Hsuan-chuen with his *Song of Enlighten-ment*), he offers narratives of postmodern intertextual "drifting." White seems to be obsessed with finding his way, or the Way. He says: "I'm not out to cover kilometres, or to reach a particular place, I'm out for a kind of spatial poetics, with emptiness at its centre. And you begin again, for the pleasure, to get at an even finer sense of emptiness-plenitude" (1996, 37). He collects stories and quotes that take him places both in the sense of physical journeys or mental journeys (intellectual nomadism). Both types of travelling bring him images and sensa-tions which in turn become the backbone of his travelogues and poems. It has been quite some time since White produced his last travelogue. I wonder what the next one will be like. Perhaps it will be much more minimalistic, similar to Bashō's later *haibun*?

Notes

1   The theory of geopoetics and its links with the motif of open world poetics
      and intellectual nomadism have been the subject of a number of books and
      articles. I will only mention a few, focusing on those written in French:
      Duclos 2006, Delbard 1999, Margatin 2006, Roncato 2014, Bowd et al.
      2005. In my view it is easier to discuss White's writing in French as the
      majority of his waybooks, poems, and (theoretical) essays are originally in
      French; sadly, some idiosyncratic aspects of White's writing disappear in
      English translation. Two highly comprehensive studies of White's *oeuvre*
      in English are Tony McManus's *The Radical Field* and a collection, *Ground-
      ing a World*: *Essays on the Work of Kenneth White* edited by Gavin Bowd,
      Charles Forsdick and Norman Bissell. In French, Michèle Duclos's *Ken-
      neth White nomade intellectuel, poète du monde* and a collection of articles,
      Le Monde ouvert de Kenneth White, remain important points of reference.
      Olivier Delbard's *Les Lieux de Kenneth White* and especially his PhD thesis
      on poetics of space in Kenneth White's and Gary Snyder's writing offer fresh
      comparative perspectives on White's literary and cultural practice. Unfortu-
      nately, the scope of this article does not allow me to develop my views on
      White's reception in francophone and anglophone environments. The list of
      publications on White's oeuvre in French can be found at: http://www.ken-
      nethwhite.org/oeuvres/index.php?rub=fr&srub=sur_kw&tag=1561495427,
      whereas publications in English are listed at: http://www.kennethwhite.
      org/oeuvres/index.php?rub=en&srub=narrative&tag=1570560061.http://
      www.kennethwhite.org/oeuvres/index.php?rub=en&srub=interview&tag=
      1561495441
2   *Hua Yen Sutra* (Sanskrit *The Avataṃsaka Sutra*), is one of the most influential
      Mahayana sūtras of East Asian Buddhism, rendered in English as *Flower
      Garland Sūtra*, *Flower Adornment Sūtra*, or *Flower Ornament Scripture*.

References

Bashō, Matsuo.1966. *The Narrow Road to the Deep North and Other Travel
      Sketches*. Trans. Nobuyuki Yuasa. London: Penguin Books.
—. 2000. *Narrow Road to the Interior and Other Writings*. Trans. Sam Hamill.
      Boulder: Shambhala.
Bowd, Gavin, Charles Forsdick, and Norman Bissell, ed. 2005. *Grounding a World*:
      Essays on the Work of Kenneth White. Glasgow: Alba.
Brown, Ian, and Colin Nicholson. 2007. "The Border Crossers and Reconfiguration
      of the Possible: Poet-Playwright-Novelists from the Mid-Twentieth Century
      on." *The Edinburgh History of Scottish Literature: Modern Transformations:*

New Identities (from 1918). Vol. 3. Ed. Ian Brown. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press. 262–272.

Bsaithi, Omar. 2008. *Land and Mind: Kenneth White's Geopoetics in the Arabian Context*. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing.

Delbard, Olivier. 1995. "Poetique du paysage: l'approche americane de Gary Snyder et l'approche europeenne de Kenneth White." PhD diss., Université Paris IV Sorbonne.

—. 1999. *Les lieux de Kenneth White: Paysage, pensée, poétique*. Paris: L'Harmattan.

Duclos, Michèle, ed. 1995. *Le Monde ouvert de Kenneth White: Essais et témoignages*. Talence: Presses universitaires de Bordeaux.

—. 2006. *Kenneth White nomade intellectuel, poète du monde*. Grenoble: Ellug.

Fazzini, Marco. 2000. *Crossings: Essays on Contemporary Scottish Poetry and Hybridity.* Venice: Supernova.

—. 2009. "Kenneth White and John Burnside." *The Edinburgh Companion to Contemporary Scottish Poetry*. Ed. Matt McGuire and Colin Nicolson. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press. 111–125.

Hashas, Mohammed. 2017. *Intercultural Geopoetics in Kenneth White's Open World*. Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing.

Kocot, Monika. 2019. "Geopoetics and the Poetry of Consciousness: A Transmodern Perspective." *Transmodern Perspectives on Contemporary Literatures in English*. Ed. Jessica Aliaga-Lavrijsen and José María Yebra-Pertusa. London: Routledge. 178–203.

—. 2020a. "Kenneth White's North Road Travelling." *W drodze / On the Road - Perspektywy badawcze*. Ed. Anna Suwalska-Kołecka and Jakub Ligor. Płock: Wydawnictwo Naukowe Mazowieckiej Uczelni Publicznej w Płocku (forthcoming).

—. 2020b. "Mercurial Reinventions: Kenneth White's Travels in the Drifting Dawn." *L'Ecosse : la différence / Scotland: the Difference*. Ed. Arnaud Fiasson, Pierre Fournier, and Sabrina Juillet Garzon. Besançon: Presses universitaires de Franche-Comté (forthcoming).

Lieh-tzu: A Taoist Guide to Practical Living. 1995. Trans. Eva Wong. Boston: Shambhala.

Margantin, Laurent. 2006. *Kenneth White et la géopoétique*. Paris: L'Harmattan.

McManus, Tony. 2007. *The Radical Field. Kenneth White and Geopoetics.* Dingwall: Sandstone Press.

Roncato, Christophe. 2014. *Kenneth White, une oeuvre-monde*. Rennes: Presses universitaires de Rennes.

Sato, Hiroaki, trans. 1996. *Basho's Narrow Road: Spring & Autumn Passages: Two Works by Bashō Matsuo*. Berkeley, Ca.: Stone Bridge Press.

The Book of Lieh-tzu A Classic of the Tao. 1990 [1960]. Trans. A.C. Graham. Columbia New York: New York University Press.

"The International Institute of Geopoetics. Inaugural Text."
    http://www.geopoetics.org.uk/what-is-geopoetics/

White, Kenneth. 1987. *Le Poète cosmographe. Entretiens*. Ed. Michèle Duclos.
    Bordeaux: Presses universitaires de Bordeaux.

—. 1990a. *Handbook for the Diamond Country. Collected Shorter Poems 1960–
    1990*. Edinburgh: Mainstream Publishing.

—. 1990b. *Travels in the Drifting Dawn*. London: Penguin Books.

—. 1992a. "Elements of Geopoetics." *Edinburgh Review* 88:163–178.

—. 1992b. *Pilgrim of the Void. Travels in South-East Asia and the North Pacific*.
    Edinburgh: Mainstream Publishing.

—. 1996. *Coast to Coast. Interviews and Conversations 1985–1995*. Glasgow:
    Open World.

—. 1998. *On Scottish Ground: Selected Essays.* Edinburgh: Polygon.

—. 1999. "Petit album nomade." *Pour une littérature voyageuse*. Ed. Alain Borer
    et al. Brussels: Editions Complexe. 167–196.

—. 2003. *Open World. The Collected Poems 1960–2000*. Edinburgh: Polygon.

—. 2004. *The Wanderer and his Charts: Essays of Cultural Renewal*. Edinburgh:
    Polygon.

—. 2005. *L'Ermitage des Brumes*: *Occident, Orient et au-delà*. Paris: Éditions
    Dervy.

Whitman, Walt. 1995. *The Complete Poems of Walt Whitman*. Ware, Hertfordshire:
    Wordsworth Poetry Library.

Yü, Lu K'uan. 1960. *Ch'an and Zen Teaching*. Vol.1. London: Rider.

Barry Keane
  https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9389-6357Z
University of Warsaw

Finding Your Way Home: Explorations of the Journey Motif in Alan Riach's *Homecoming*

Abstract

This article endeavours to explore how Alan Riach in his poetry collection *Homecoming* (2009) treats the motif of home as an internationalist summation which locates and bolsters Scotland's own sense of identity, contextualised in terms of the poet's personal understanding of his own poetic purchase on the themes of remembering, leaving, finding, and rediscovering home. Moreover, critical attention is paid to the way Riach's poems forge a construct wherein a cultural agenda represents the clearest way forward for the accomplishment of Scotland's nationalist aspirations.

Keywords: Sottish poetry, Alan Riach, cultural agenda, journey motif, memory

> "I long to reach my home and see the day of my return. It is my never-failing wish. And what if one of the gods does wreck me out on the wine-dark sea? I have a heart that is inured to suffering and I shall steel it to endure that too. For in my day I have had many bitter and painful experiences in war and on the stormy seas. So let this new disaster come. It only makes one more."
> (Homer, *The Odyssey*, 76)

1. Introduction

The motif of Odysseus returning home is an irresistible poetic position, imagining as it does the poet as journeyman, with all the accompanying heroic epithets, who, after years of exile, yearns to reconnect with the sources of self, those being family, home and hearth, and homeland. Alan Riach, celebrated Scottish poet and cultural activist, proposes a correlative of this outlook in his collection *Homecoming* as an "intuitive place of departure, leave-taking, putting the home you come from behind you, and setting forth like Odysseus, into the unforeseen" (7). The axiom of the journey motif, the human dilemma of home, is very much dependent on

the premise of setting out, 'the leave-taking'; and Riach found himself regarding home as a place of departure for the far-off and unknown when, in 1986, he left Scotland as a young English Literature scholar in order to take up a postdoctoral position at the University of Waikato in Hamilton, New Zealand. This was a place that would be home for the next fourteen years, one where he would forge a career, marry, start a family, and commensurately write collections of poetry and literary criticism which would earn him a considerable literary and scholarly reputation.

The literary exiled hero is often seen committing to work that will bring them home in the actual sense, or in the imaginary and creative spheres; and Riach, as scholar, poet, and the principal 'lyrical I' of what are often autobiographical poems, committed to all three when he made a decision to return home to Scotland in 2000, and actually doing so in 2001 in order to take up the position of Professor of Scottish Literature at Glasgow University. Following this move, between 2001 and 2009 he set about compiling earlier poems and writing new poems for *Homecoming* that would encompass the arc of departure, settling, travelling, returning, and re-settling. The collection was published in 2009 and reprinted in 2014 so as to coincide with the year-long Homecoming Scotland celebrations; and with the restated aim – as could be read on Riach's publisher's webpage – of "putting Scotland in touch with the wider world, as the country prepared to welcome back its sons and daughters" (Luath Press). This 2014 reprint also became a part of the conversation about the nature and identity of Scotland in the run-up to the "aye, naw, mibbe" (McDermid) scenario of the Scottish Independence Referendum.

2. Setting Out

The arc of Riach's *Homecoming* begins with a section entitled "Seven Preludes" (23–29), written in New Zealand; and these early poems establish the tones and themes that are to be found throughout the collection. In "On the Island," for instance, there is the accompanying spirit of a father figure whose voice fortifies his son by his "distant presence" for the unsettling early days of an expatriate life where a career would have to be pursued on the other side of the world. In this poem, Riach alludes to the companionship of a rootedness in the connection of home which can always be summoned when there is a crisis of spirit or a faltering of resolution:

> Your voice was a nearness, a guide
> I had to keep close to, to keep
> to the road […]
> to find a way of seeing in that dark, […] (2014, 23)

But if representations of home and the familiar are presented as untetherable heart-strings, these same representations are adorned by the poetics which understand the replacement of concrete things with mood and reverie. This dichotomy is

evocatively illustrated in the poem "October 1st, 1988," where the poet calls to his father like a distraught Odysseus unable to clasp the shade of his mother Anticlea languishing in the underworld:

> There is no harbour
> and no sunlight;
> the span of the bridge is not there (2014, 24)

We see in the poem "Where?" for example, how a feeling of dislocation whilst living in New Zealand was most acutely felt by the poet when he was trying to good-humouredly inculcate a sense of Scottishness in his three-year-old boy, an act of playful instruction, not so much grounded in the presenting of heritage markers as nurturing an instinctive feeling about oneself, one's own character, and a determined affirmation of one's origins and birthright:

> 'Yes,' I tell him. 'We are Scottish.'
> He's been there twice, started moving, crawled, fast,
> from standstill to speed that first visit,
> and then before we left,
> a few steps, hesitant,
> from his grandmother's hands to his mother's.
> Now he sees the planes fly over
> in different directions, all of them heading one way.
> 'Where is that plane going?' I ask him.
> No hesitation, certainty impatient
> with a question and answer so doubtless: 'To Scotland.' (2014, 26)

We can assume that the subsequent years saw the poet continue to contend for his children, with a twinkle in his eye, that all roads and air routes lead to Scotland. It is thus hardly surprising that Riach retrospectively chose to explore in such poems his own sense of identity in terms of 'being in the moment' but 'elsewhere' vis-à-vis spectrums of emotions revealed by way of the expressionist perspicacity of seeing beyond, self-reflection and snippets of memory, all of which are most fascinatingly adorned by Riach's elicitations of the firmament and topographical description. Such acuity is evocative, indeed, of Hugh MacDiarmid's expressionist poetry, and in this vein, the poem "The Weather Log" conveys the idea of the poet as being set apart, or disenfranchised from the scene that he is looking upon, leaving him with a flurry of questions, but with no inkling of the kind of answers which could ever be forthcoming:

> The dark October streets are washed –
> The usual, leaves and rain –
> The orange arm of the windmill scythes
> slowly through again.

A growling in November midnight
draws us through, to look at the sky –
Turning, angled, circling, at the source of its cone of light,
in the air outside, up high –
Twistily, above Queen's Park, a helicop-
ter – other torches flicker in the trees below, on the hilltop.

Who are they looking for, and why? (2014, 112)

In addition to the motif of leaving matters hanging in the air with weighty ques-
tions, there is much in this poem that obtains thematically for the entire collection.
Indeed, here and elsewhere, Riach favours images over symbols for the verbal
expression of something concrete, discernible by the way in which he seeks to
capture fleeting variations of reality and enter into communion with the fullness
of the scene before him. Such an artistic position foregrounds the relationships of
both poetry and the painterly scene, and travel and language, as being "the values
of taking one's time and walking in landscapes experienced not as possessions but
visceral quotidian experiences" (2016, 160). This outlook is clearly in evidence
throughout *Homecoming* and can be discerned in snippets of poems such as a frag-
ment from "The Wall," where we read: "the silence of it, / and a warm sun / on the
cold trees" (2014, 58). Such poetic tropes resonate closely with Henri Bergson's
intimation of knowing a place by way of intellect and intuition (see Bergson);
and these vistas of telling and retelling merge resonantly in *Homecoming* with the
legacy of Parnassian verse, which extolled the writing of poems as an exotic compo-
sition of a single theme with a select number of words and motifs (see Epstein
541–542). And what could be more striking than these lines in the poem "The
Magnetics of Earth," where soul merges with landscape and intuits the familiar:

[…] Beyond them, the pinnacles
strike upwards for clear air,
looking for more sky
through blue-gold haze –
A sisterhood of rising shapeliness.
A brotherhood of strange familiarities,
slanted by distortions in their growth,
twisted as families are, by
love and difference, cruelty and friendliness and force. (2014, 50–51)

These metaphysical responses frame amplified cogitational moments for Riach's
poetry. Not only do they encompass imaginative flights that humanise the envi-
ronment, but they also enable the description of encounters through humorous
observation, soaring flights of reflection, and, significantly, foreground the efforts
to assert a unifying cultural agenda in what is a patchwork and at-odds-with-itself
national landscape.

3. The Exile

Riach exchanged exile for tourist and visitor in travel poems not related to New Zealand. With these poems, Riach as both poet and lyrical subject is something of a Somerset Maugham figure (see Hooper) of the new millennium, absorbing the environment and reflecting on places, other people's histories and points of familiarity, and measuring them against his own life and experience. An example of this can be found in "Five poems from Istanbul: *Love poem: missing you*" where described moments swing like a pendulum between remembered past and perceived present, going there… being somewhere… going back again… and all the while the poet is bedevilled by troubled wonderings and grim musings as to whether he should or could be elsewhere:

> It's only that you are not here
> that makes the virtues and the facts
> of all you are seem, wishfully, near. (2014, 73)

But where Maugham once said: "I am attached to England, but I have never felt myself very much at home there" (98), Riach often looks to make an "optimistic enquiry into the possibilities of growth in the potential of other countries" (2014, 18) as part of the great summation of an internationalist framework, one where Scotland may find its place. But this goal often seems elusive and ungraspable in *Homecoming*. As a result, Riach demonstrates a determination to hold back and spare readers the painful details, underscoring the Sisyphus-like nature of the task at hand: to effect a sea-change of national and cultural awareness and centralise the arts to Scotland's understanding of itself. This chariness cannot but spill over to other poems, as with "At Chambésy" where a Circe-esque erotically charged evening is described with an infusion of innuendo and just a dash of the wink-and-the-nod:

> The Alpine ice; the fevered brains
> And our sedate enquiries, sketching:
> A delicate triangulation, balanced.
>
> Let's leave it at that. (2014, 71)

But promise of the internationalist summation, relocating Scotland's sense of self precisely 'where it is' and 'wherever it can be,' is always ready to emerge. And this remains the case, even if the emphasis shifts in favour of the delectations of 'the elsewhere,' particularly when the poet recounts his enjoyment of the sunny splendour of a literary jaunt, the sun-dazzling upside of being the 'invited poet,' so described with the zestful élan of a synaesthesia of colour and sound in "Five poems from Istanbul: *Chilling out in the Breeze in Zekeriyakoy*":

there will be one simple dive
that takes us into the blue light (2014, 73)

4. The Return

As Andrew McNeillie writes of *Homecoming*, "Scotland is Riach's agenda whether it's left behind for a long or short time" (2009). And as an exponent of Scottish culture and a nationalist activist looking to nudge Scotland towards full nation status, Riach's agenda or vision for Scotland has been for the past several years at the crosshairs of history, brought into even sharper focus as a result of the wayward result of the Scottish Independence Referendum and the existentially derailing outcome of the Brexit vote. For all that, Riach seems always reluctant to place his poetry at the service of pamphleteering and lecturing to the yet-to-be-convinced. His hopes for how the future may coalesce around a Scottish nation, free and unfettered, confident in its strides, are uttered like unspoken truths carried by one who understands that eventually the pendulum must swing in the right direction. The most demonstrative example of this 'quarter-given' outlook is to be found in "The Wallace Triptych," described by Riach as a lyrical affirmation of "the struggle for self-determination" (17); which makes various aspirational claims:

> This shilpit nation, set against itself
> I'll make complete, and fit to speak to others
> independently. (2014, 37)

At this point in the poem, however, like Wallace with battle-fury upon him, the poet could let loose with the pen and exert a vision of the complexity that obtains for Scotland's present-day reality and near-off future (one which is becoming more knottily complicated with each coming day). Instead, Riach imparts Wallace's grand vision with a taciturnity that always suggests the far-offness of such accomplishments:

> The variedness of folk, and words. […]
>
> The bridge. The water running. Brightness.
> The prospect. (2014, 37)

Here the poem ends, with Wallace's expectations 'left at that,' from which we may infer that that neither Wallace nor Riach are entirely comfortable with the 'prospect of the prospect.'

5. Setting to Rights

Riach is interested in stories related to the abstract sense of home, one without gardens, or bedrooms, or occasions of childhood, and this extends to the home of his birth. But what is 'home' in the idea of homecoming if it is not communities of childhood and family, or the greater construct that is Scotland as a place of emotional belonging, with all its political and cultural entanglements. And it is perhaps in the gentle epiphanies arising from moments of perspicacity that the poems capture this tugging recall to place and memory. For, if poetry is the home which Riach carries within himself, then this same fact allows us to understand his imperative to reaffirm a position that culture in its creative sense can harness not only artistic expression but also the collective appreciation of the results. What is more, Riach adds layers to this outlook by marrying these aspirations of 'the prospect' to the envisioning of Scotland's Gaelic communities, seen as continuous and organic, and being able to hold their own against the encroachment of modernity. Indeed, Riach is at his most compelling as visionary in his description of this same plight in the poem "Thieves," with these communities seen as being on the cusp of vanishing, threatened principally by the 'second-homers.' Ironically, these are exactly the kind of people who can afford to make the trip back for the Scotland Homecoming Festival and who are pricing the locals out of their own local property markets. In other words, these same communities must be made sustainable beyond the mass appeal of snapshot pictures so as to be able to:

> […] live in their own dynamics, create an economy sustaining
> All the arts and conversation. (2014, 127)

Ultimately, Riach trusts that the demonstration of culture will create a plasticity to the prevailing dynamics that will reshape an obstinate stasis, one where oral traditions achieve a complementary position alongside written cultures, and, by extension, the reinvigoration of a national consciousness which will counter the cosmopolitan Anglo-centred dilution of Scotland's identity. This Gordian Knot is intimated in the poem "Co-ordinate Points: *The Interview at St Andrews*" where we are presented with a proposal that St Andrews becomes "the hub and the hold / of Scotland," a suggestion given short shrift:

> 'Oh dear, dear, dear, dear!
> Dear boy, can't you see?
> There are English girls taught here!
> That must never be!' (2014, 160)

But just as Riach understands the difficulty of cleaving the Union's gnarly knot, he is able to deftly swivel and re-situate the aspiration of Scottish self-determination by redefining Scotland's association with appropriated Celtic icons and their commensurate

associations of place; finding in mythology a metaphorical transcendence for the Scottish nation. In the poem "The Bridge to Dunskiath," for example, we see how:

> Here the young Cuchulain met the woman Skathach,
> who taught him the arts of war. […]
>
> And this was where Cuchulain loved
> and bred with Skathach's daughter
> and from this place his child would follow him
> sworn by his vengeful mother to silence
> until his father, in the midst of slaughter, learned
> that this was his own son he'd wounded mortally,
> upon the point of dying. (2014, 176–177)

This appropriation of the Gaelic hero story has a confident mode of dialogue which marries the idea of both nationalism (Cuchulain as a requisitioned 'Scottish' mythological hero) and internationalism (Cuchulain, the 'Irish' mythological figure transcending the absence of self-determination); and thereby addressing the idea of self-expression in a traditional and historical sense. But if Riach is sure about what he'd like to see: say a Scotland saying 'Yes' in a second Independence Referendum, then the cleaving harm that Cuchulain inflicts on his son and himself must be understood as facing squarely the part played by Scotland in its own current crisis. As "The Bridge to Dunskiath" draws the collection to a close, with the lines:

> We stood upon the rocks of Skathach's Castle,
> surrounded by the cliffs and ocean breaking,
> having crossed to that place, pausing to wonder
> before trying to find our way back. (2014, 177)

we can see that the halcyon optimism of *Homecoming* lies in the warning that the Odyssean journey will always be fatally thwarted when borders are raised. Indeed, as Riach sagaciously notes in the poem "Elgar in Scotland: *In Oban 1924*," home can be a place where "your trust becomes connected over year upon year, / whatever the absences are, the gulfs" (150); clearly a contention that only the imaginative spirit and literary perceptions of place can resolve the tug of war between the minutiae of matter-of-fact existence and grandiose ambitions to harness an awareness of the fact that too much that should be cherished may indeed be lost.

6. Conclusion

With some justification, Riach is not optimistic, but he does remain stoically hopeful. As we learn in the poet's introduction to his most recent poetry collection, *The Winter Book* (2017), Riach's father, as ardently nationalist as his son, had died "three weeks before his postal vote" (11). But not before we are told he "[had] converted five of his carers. And they converted their husbands" (11). Riach's elegiac recounting of his father's 'last-stand political campaigning' ends with the words "I would call that victory, as far as such can be" (11), a fitting claim for the potential of imperatives and the prerogatives to strike a match when light is in retreat. This match-lit darkness is in fact the very artifice of Riach's Homeric *nostos*, it being the location of an imaginative mindscape between a place that is home and the place from which the call to return must be heard.

References

Bergson, Henri. 1907. *L'Évolution créatrice*. Paris: Librarie Félix Alcan.

Epstein, Enda. 1970. "Themes in Parnassian Poetry." *The Modern Language Review* 65.3: 541–551.

Homer. 1991. *The Odyssey*. Trans. E.V. Rieu, Rev. D.C.H. Rieu. London: Penguin Classics.

Hooper, Glen. 1997. "Trading Places: Somerset Maugham's *Tales From Abroad*." *Journal of the Short Story in English* 29: 2–11.

Maugham, Somerset. 2011. *The Summing Up*. London: Vintage Books.

McDermid, Val. 2014. "Scottish Writers on the Referendum – Independence Day?" *The Guardian* (19 July 2014). https://www.theguardian.com/books/2014/jul/19/scottish-referendum-independence-uk-how-writers-vote

McNeillie, Andrew. 2009. "Dwelling Places." *Times Literary Supplement*. https://www.the-tls.co.uk/articles/private/dwelling-places.

Riach, Alan. 1991. *Hugh MacDiarmid's Epic Poetry*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

—. 2014. *Homecoming. New Poems 2001–2009.* Edinburgh: Luath Press.

—. 2014. *Homecoming. New Poems 2001–2009.* https://www.luath.co.uk/productsh/homecoming-new-poems-2001-2009-t468s/

—. 2016. "Scottish Poetry, 1945–2010." *The Cambridge Companion to British Poetry, 1945–2010*. Ed. Edward Larrissy. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. 148–162.

—. 2017. *The Winter Book. New Poems*. Edinburgh: Luath Press.

Watson, Roderick. 2011. "MacDiarmid and International Modernism." *The Edinburgh Companion to Hugh MacDiarmid*. Ed. Scott Lyall and Margery Palmer McCulloch. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press. 6–22.

Aleksandra Budrewicz
[ID] https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0654-6464
Pedagogical University of Cracow

A Polish Physicist Visits Glasgow:
Marian Smoluchowski's Depictions of Scotland

Abstract

The paper discusses selected essays by Marian Smoluchowski (1872–1917), a 19th-century Polish physicist. Smoluchowski's scientific output was outstanding (he was a pioneer of stochastic physics); apart from science, however, he was a passionate mountaineer. Smoluchowski enjoyed travelling, one of the places he visited being Scotland. He described it in his essays, e.g. "Wycieczki górskie w Szkocji" (1896), which will be discussed here. Smoluchowski's visions and impressions of Scotland are also placed against the backdrop of selected other 19th-century Polish travellers who visited and wrote about Scotland.

Keywords: mountains, Poland, science, Scotland, travelogue

1. Polish Physicists in Scotland

For Polish-Scottish relations, Smoluchowski's stay in Scotland is only an episode, therefore starting research on this issue needs to be justified: on 28th June 2017 the Senate of Poland passed a formal resolution which listed Smoluchowski's scientific achievements and announced the need for further research ("Uchwała Senatu…" 2) while the Polish Physics Society officially proclaimed the year 2017 a time to commemorate the centenary of Smoluchowski's death. He is still remembered and respected as a great scientist but so far little has been written on his fascination with Scottish landscapes and mountains.

Two outstanding Polish physicists who greatly contributed to world science, August Witkowski (1854–1913) and Marian Smoluchowski, had fellowships at the University of Glasgow and worked with Professor William Thomson (Lord Kelvin). Witkowski spent a year in Glasgow (1881), and was awarded an *honoris causa* degree by the Jagiellonian University (1892), the University of Glasgow (1901) and the University of Technology in Lvov (1912) (Rafalska-Łasocka 50–52). Smoluchowski followed him and was in charge of the Department of Physics; he also gave a speech during Witkowski's funeral ("Pogrzeb śp. A. Witkowskiego").

He worked with Kelvin in Glasgow during the winter term of 1896, and in 1901, together with Witkowski, was awarded an *honoris causa* degree by the University of Glasgow. Lord Kelvin gave a speech during the ceremony; two Polish scientists were then distinguished (*Record of the ninth jubilee of the University of Glasgow* 81). Kelvin was their patron and teacher, but perhaps the word "guide" would be a more apposite description of his role (cf. Natanson 1913, 200; "Kronika" 1896, 3; "Wiadomości bieżące" 1896, 336; "Jubileusz Lorda Kelvina" 4). From 6th December 1890 Lord Kelvin was an active member of the Academy of Science in Cracow, of the Department of Maths and Biology ("Skład Akademii Umiejętności" 19).

2. Smoluchowski and Kelvin

Marian Ritter Smoluchowski was born on 28th May 1872 in Vorderbrühl near Vienna. His father used the name Ritter von Smolan. His mother, Stefania, was a sister of Stanisław Szczepanowski, an entrepreneur and a politician who was closely connected with British culture. He attended the famous and well-respected Collegium Theresianum. Between 1890–1894 he studied physics in Vienna, and as early as in 1895 he received his PhD for the work *Acoustical Studies of the Elasticity of Soft Materials*. He was also distinguished with a diamond ring, *sub auspiciis imperatoris*.[1] From November 1895 to June 1896 he worked in Paris at the Sorbonne, in the laboratory of Gabriel Lippman. This is also the time when his love for nature and hiking started. Smoluchowski spent his summer holidays abroad, climbing in the Alps with his brother Tadeusz. In 1885 he went to Zakopane for the first time, and was deeply impressed by the Tatra mountains, and when he studied in Italy, he used this opportunity to get to know the Alps better.

Smoluchowski studied in both Paris and Great Britain. When in London and Glasgow he made the most of the opportunity to visit the Scottish Highlands. He also studied in Berlin and became a professor in 1898 in Vienna. He travelled widely through Italy, France and Spain, and went back to England and Scotland. He stayed in Glasgow during the academic year of 1896/1897 and was awarded the title of *Research Fellow* of the university (*Kronika Uniwersytetu Lwowskiego* 523). Some parts of the diary he kept at the time have survived.[2] On its basis we can partially reconstitute when he did research work at the most prestigious European universities. He was fluent in several languages, and wrote his notes in the languages of the country he was currently living in. From August 1896 they became more precise and detailed, as he included more information of the places he visited. During his stay in London, for example, we learn more about the city's most popular tourist attractions, such as Kew Gardens, the National Gallery, Westminster Abbey, Tower Bridge, the Natural History Museum, Regents Park, the British Museum (Smoluchowski 1896, 6–7). Under the date 11.09, he wrote in pencil

"Euston St – Crew – Carlisle – Glasgow" (1896, 7). Later on, he went on trips from Glasgow. On 16th September, for example, he wrote "Ben Lomond," on 21st September "Fort William" and "Ben Nevis" (1896, 8). This is important, as Smoluchowski described his trips around Scotland and climbing its mountains.[3]

The names of the places he used in his essay "Wycieczki górskie w Szkocji" are in accordance with the notes in his diary (Loch Cornish, Glen Sligachen). From October 1896 the word "University" often appears in his diary, together with the names of its colleges and cultural places of Glasgow. On 21st December Smoluchowski wrote that Lord Kelvin had read some preliminary results of his research before they were submitted to the *Edinburgh Review* (1896, 10). Later on, he used the name of Carruthers Beattie, a scholar he co-operated with under Kelvin's guidance (they co-wrote several articles).[4] He used the following address: M. Smoluchowski de Smolan, PhD, Glasgow, 38 Park Road (Smoluchowski 1890–1900, 34), and this was also the version of his name used by the laboratory at the University of Glasgow when referring to him in the academic year 1896/97.[5] In a note devoted to Kelvin, Smoluchowski emphasised the Scottish scientist's "greatness of mind" and the fact that his interests included as diverse subjects as the study of atoms and the structure of the Earth: "Any other scientist, even a great expert in his field, pales in comparison to Kelvin" (1908b, 4). Like Kelvin, Smoluchowski was also interested in various areas of physics; to him, it was the type of science which is relatively easy to learn as "it can be limited to a number of main rules which facilitate the comprehension of the whole content" (1917, 7). Like Kelvin, Smoluchowski used simple research tools in order to carry out innovative ideas.

This is how he recalled his cooperation with Kelvin:

> While co-working with others, it was Kelvin who would offer ideas and guide the work. I believe he was too restless, or impatient, perhaps. I do enjoy recalling this amazingly interesting time I spent in Glasgow 11 years ago when Thomson (Lord Kelvin then already!), Beattie and I would work on certain new phenomena of the electrical conductivity of gases. I vividly remember that each morning Kelvin would enter the laboratory, and, while opening the door, would ask: "Have you discovered anything new, gentlemen?" It did not happen every day in our type of research but you can imagine the enthusiasm when we could tell him about "something new"! (1908b, 15; trans. A.B.)

In 1897 Smoluchowski returned to Vienna, where he received his post-doctoral degree. He then moved to Lvov, where he gave a series of lectures on theoretical physics, and on 3rd March 1900 he was nominated a professor. As much as Smoluchowski respected Kelvin, he did not hesitate to criticise some of his ideas. On the basis of Smoluchowski's hand-written notes and references to Kelvin in his articles, we can assume that it was Clerk Maxwell who particularly influenced the Polish scientist's research. It may also be a natural consequence of

parallel research interests which they shared. After their joint work in Glasgow (1896–1897), the scholars met several times.

Smoluchowski became a professor of theoretical physics at the University of Lvov in 1903. He attended the 9th jubilee of the University of Glasgow (12–15 June 1901) as a formal emissary of the University of Lvov ("Kronika" *Gazeta Lwowska* 1901, 3; "Kronika" *Słowo Polskie* 1901, 2).[6] Two months later, in Paris, he took part in an international congress of physicists (6–12 August 1901) under Kelvin's auspices. He wrote a long report on that conference (Smoluchowski 1901). He was a member of several British scientific societies of which Kelvin was the honorary member. We do not know, however, whether Smoluchowski and Kelvin met when the Polish physicist was in Cavendish Laboratory in Cambridge between August 1905 and April 1906 (Rovenchak 2).[7] After Kelvin's death (17 December 1907) Smoluchowski gave a lecture on 21st January 1908 at a meeting of The Society of Biologists; it was entitled "On Lord Kelvin (Sir William Thomson)" (*Kronika* 1908, 3). In a Lvov magazine *Ateneum Polskie* Smoluchowski published an article entitled "Lord Kelvin" (1908a), which was probably a longer version of this lecture.

At the time, Smoluchowski had already been recognised as an excellent scientist. He was successful in his personal affairs as well, as he was happily married to Zofia Baraniecka. The Alps fascinated him all the time. His foreign trips included Hungary, Croatia, Bosnia, the islands of Jersey and Wight, Cambridge and London as well as the Sussex countryside. He came to Cracow in 1915, and then the University of Vienna wanted to invite him to become the head of the Department of Experimental Physics. In 1916 Smoluchowski became the rector of the Jagiellonian University. In preparation for his office as rector, he went to Ojców, where he took numerous refreshing walks and rested. He took part in the Great War for a couple of months (working for the military censorship). He died at the age of just 45, on 5th September 1917 in Cracow, due to an outbreak of dysentery in the city.

3. In the Mountains of Scotland

Smoluchowski was a scholar, polyglot, musician, painter and sportsman. He loved tourism, skiing, swimming, and horse riding (Szpecht 59). He was said to be an excellent hiker, and there are several articles which explore this aspect of his biography (Goetel 1953; Goetel 1917–1918; Goetel 1917; Klemensiewicz; Roszkowska). When compared to his important contributions to science, his essay on hiking in Scotland may seem insignificant, but I believe it is worth some attention because of its tone of excited amazement at the pristine nature of Scottish landscapes as well as its unabashed romanticism[8]; moreover, it offers the possibility of comparing the reports of various Polish trips to the Scottish

Highlands in the 19th century. The research on literary travel at that time emphasised climbers' involvement with nature (Buckton-Tucker 259); in his study on traveling through the Highlands Peter Womack notes that "the strength of the land […] speaks directly to the powers of imagination" (77), while Walery Goetel observed that the Highlands attracted Smoluchowski as they were mysterious and impossible to reach (1917, 222). Zygmunt Klemensiewicz, a fellow mountaineer, in turn claimed: "His yearning for the mountains never diminishes; when he is far from great mountain ranges, he visits the small ones – like Scotland during his studies in Glasgow" (4).

Smoluchowski's essay "Wycieczki górskie w Szkocji" [Excursions in the Highlands of Scotland] (1915–1921) was originally a lecture he gave in German in Vienna, during a meeting of the Academic Section of the Alps Society. Later on, the text was published, but the form of a lecture determined its final shape: the author addressed an audience of professionals who were particularly interested in the technical issues of the expedition (its logistics as well as dealing with numerous difficulties). The Vienna audience were mainly students, which – again – determined the language and the scope of erudition in the text. Most of the students knew the Alps, but only some of them were familiar with the Scottish mountains, therefore Smoluchowski used the following strategies in order to show Scotland as an attractive place:

1) He increased the interest of the audience by emphasising hydrobiological "mysteries" of the exotic place: first he talked about his own surprise at the unusual colours of the mountains, then he highlighted the notion of "mystery" (something which cognitively disturbs). Finally, he explained the given phenomena and strengthened the cognitive effect by contrasting his "knowledge" with "lack of knowledge," for example when he spoke about the marshes in the mountains: "I always thought that marshland and swamp could be found in the lowlands; today I learned the hard way and I know how false my idea was" (1915–1921, 6).

2) He emphasised the cognitive values of the excursion: thanks to a British man he met by accident Smoluchowski learnt about "a new tourism method" (1915–1921, 6): it concerned rainy weather in the mountains and the advice was to wear a rubber coat, to hide under a ledge, and to walk briskly when the rain stopped.

3) He informed the listeners/readers about potential dangers in the Highlands: "a rocky ridge you could fall from" (1915–1921, 6; trans. A.B.); "caution – a swampy valley in Sligachen […] it must be awful to get lost in this region!" (1915–1921, 7; trans. A.B.); "a couple of years ago a tourist fell from the peak of Sgurr-na-Gillean and died, which obviously made me respect these mountains even more" (1915–1921, 8; trans. A.B.).

4) He added some humour to his narration of Scotland, in which he sometimes made funny remarks on the Scottish Highlands; however, it was

probably his identifying with the Alps which linked the lecturer to his audience: "I cannot think of my reaching the summit of Ben Nevis as a great climbing achievement, and the whole route can be summarised as follows: a convenient paved horse route leads to the summit. The difficulty is none, as you are obliged to pay one shilling for using the route!" (1915–1921, 7; trans. A.B.)

It needs to be said that the very fact of preparing a lecture for his alpinist companions was more important for Smoluchowski than any fascination with natural phenomena we would expect from a doctor of physics who worked at the Sorbonne. Ben Nevis is not just the highest peak in Scotland; it is the highest mountain in the British Isles. In the mid-1880s a meteorological station was established there, and it was one of the first of this kind in the world. The Polish press mentioned this fact and explained that measurements were done once an hour (T.R. 559), and that the sun shone there only two hours per day (K.S. 229). Ben Nevis was an attraction for all astronomers, and Smoluchowski was particularly interested in astronomy from a very early age. The astronomical congress in Upsalla in 1896 announced a year, (1.05.1896–1.05.1897), of "international measurements above the clouds" (K.W. 1896, 269; trans. A.B.). This means that Smoluchowski reached Ben Nevis when these important measurements were being taken. For all experimental physicists (Smoluchowski was one of them) this was an enormous attraction. Smoluchowski, however, wrote about Ben Nevis as if he deliberately chose to ignore the scientific significance of the mountain:

> At the very summit there is a well-managed hostel effusively called "The Ben Nevis Hotel," connected with a small meteorological observatory. I resisted the temptation to enter the 'hotel' and I limited myself to the platonic delight of watching the magnificent scenery from a snow-covered terrace. (1915–1921, 8; trans. A.B.)

This passage shows Smoluchowski's attitude as a tourist or alpinist: he enjoyed the mountain landscape the most when he was alone. On the basis of the essay in question we can distinguish between two kinds of emotions which accompanied him on his hiking tours.

First of all, we need to highlight the fact that he was always well prepared for his expeditions: he had proper clothes, a compass and a map, he would always read a guidebook as well and would use some of its suggestions while hiking. He would have it with him during the excursion and make use of its descriptions and photos so that he could prepare his own route (Smoluchowski 1915–1921, 8–9). He mentions other people he saw or met, but he clearly wanted to be alone during the ascent. He reached Ben Lomond with an Englishman he had met by accident, but he emphasised that the man insisted that they walk together. He descended alone, though, choosing a more difficult and dangerous route. When the rest of the passengers of the tourist ferry went to see Cornish Loch, Smoluchowski decided to observe the hills nearby (1915–1921, 8). He was alone in unknown territory,

and he tried to find a way back home using his instinct. The Polish scientist was also proud that he had chosen a more difficult route, whereas others took "a different, easier way" (Smoluchowski 1915–1921, 8; trans. A.B.). He then proceeded on his own. The word "alone" is used very often, as if Smoluchowski created a programme for "tourists being independent and not relying on their guide" (Świerz 1928, 28; trans. A.B.). When he affirmed his physical stamina, he felt satisfaction as an experienced mountaineer (he uses the term "real ecstasy").

The other feelings felt were triggered by the landscapes. Small islands on Loch Lomond and their vegetation inspired him to use the phrase "the ferociously romantic character of the pristine forests" (Smoluchowski 1915–1921, 6), Katrin is called "bucolic" (1915–1921, 6), the castle in Dunrobin is a set of beautiful ruins (1915–1921, 7), whereas from the peak of Ben Nevis one can see "a strange, melancholic but incredible landscape" (1915–1921, 8). The language Smoluchowski uses to describe his memories of the Scottish Highlands demonstrates a deep-seated romanticism (on the seventh page he also mentions Fingal and Ossian). Despite his ignorance concerning the wild and dangerous nature, and despite his emphasis on treating some aspects of the excursion as a sporting achievement, the essay is a Romantic model of experiencing direct contact with nature.

Another aspect of Smoluchowski's reports is his visual aesthetics. His key words are "landscape" and "wonderful." A certain analogy with impressionistic painting can be observed in the way he noticed and described sights, in particular light:

> In the south, east and north – it is a distant and broad country, a confusion of large ridges, cone-like steep rocks and delicate, green and brown peaks which are covered with delicate mist; in between there are numerous mountain lakes which are long and dark blue. […] From above its [the lake's] blue-black, quiet and smooth depth, there gloomily appear mountain massifs, covered with snow and almost one with the clouds. (1915–1921, 7–8; trans. A.B.)

His vivid descriptions remind us that Smoluchowski was also a painter.[9] This very impressionistic aspect of looking at nature can be seen in his other texts: "nightfall was just turning into a pinkish daylight which was slowly embracing the snowy peaks of the mountains" (1913, 104); "above there were huge ledges with their long blue shadows which could be seen on the snowy slopes" (1913, 105).

Smoluchowski's descriptions can be compared with some of the earlier Polish excursions in these places, written by Krystyn Lach-Szyrma (1828), Tomasz Wilhelm Kochański (1828),[10] Teodor Tripplin (1851) and Stanisław Bełza (1900, 1911).[11] We do not know whether Smoluchowski was familiar with any of them; he probably had not read Lach-Szyrma's essay on Ben Lomond before he undertook his own excursion. The former concentrated on the heathlands (Lach-Szyrma 57) which intrigued Smoluchowski so much that he used the word "mystery" while describing them. These texts represent the 19th-century culture of travelling and

describing the journey. They are of different length, which determines the scope of facts and details in the descriptions. What all these texts written in Polish have in common is the city of Glasgow and the hills in the not-too-far distance (Loch Lomond, Loch Katrin, Ben Lomond). Polish writers created a literary stereotype of Scotland. To them, it was a mountainous and romantic land combining nature and cultural memory.

Smoluchowski's predecessors had visited the places in Scotland which had been mentioned in Walter Scott's *Rob Roy* (vol. 4). They were aware of that; they either quoted Scott or referred to his work through various allusions (usually to *The Lady of the Lake* and *Rob Roy*). They all referred to Ossian's songs and to Fingal,[12] Ossian being mentioned more often than Scott.[13] The landscapes they saw and described were not autonomous environmental places but rather cultural and biological hybrids which linked individual geographical locations with certain literary descriptions. In other words, people went to see Loch Lomond and Ben Lomond hoping to relive the experience of Ossian or Rob Roy. Polish travellers followed in Polish footsteps (Tripplin verified Lach-Szyrma's descriptions, whereas Bełza acknowledged his predecessors), Walter Scott and Macpherson. Literary archetypes and their imitations in the form of memoirs/travelogues merged and consolidated a stereotype of Scotland as a mountainous region in which man meets primordial nature. Glasgow, with its smoking chimneys, was just a theatrical curtain behind which a primal Romantic wildness and a beauty untouched by civilization were to be found. This cultural code appealed to Smoluchowski as well. At the same time, all the travellers were deluded: they went to see a wilderness but they were constantly coming across memorabilia left by their predecessors.[14]

A chronological list of the above-mentioned Polish travellers' texts on Scotland shows that the depictions of the habitants were less popular, but the number of quotations from poetry and historiographical sources gradually increased. The spiritual excitement and the idea of the 'sublime' slowly gave way to the notion of consumerism. An accidental person whom Smoluchowski met during his walk is not anymore an example of 'living memory' or a great source of knowledge of Scotland's past, but an opportunity to receive some practical advice (for example, how one should protect oneself from sudden rain in the mountains, etc.).

All 19th-century Polish depictions of Scotland, apart from Smoluchowski's, demonstrate a fascination with water. This is relatively easy to explain: such was the way of travelling, tourist ships were popular on the Scottish lochs. The depictions of the lochs are picturesque and, despite Scott's influence, it is possible to read them as interesting documents of one's fascination with the movement of the waves, the sounds, the phenomena of the mist and of the changes of the contours of objects in different forms of water. Smoluchowski's reflections upon the changes of colours are less interesting and quite unoriginal. The interest of Polish travellers (Lach-Szyrma's and Bełza's in particular) focuses on waterfalls and cascades. The water is falling down as if it was trying to rebel against the currents

of rivers and streams. They perceived them as a symbol of freedom, independence, surprise, a sudden departure from reality which one knows and anticipates. In their essays, Scotland becomes a land of lakes, streams and cascades, instead of mountains, hills and rocks. Their gaze is always turned upwards, either being on a ship or on a road below the mountains. Some decided to climb certain hills. Lach-Szyrma, for example, wrote about "a marvellous view" from Ben Lomond (114). The common perspective was either horizontal or vertical. Smoluchowski introduced a change: he climbed the mountains, looked downwards and observed a given place, although he also wrote about the mountains which he saw from the perspective of a lake. He walked alone with no guide, which is another difference as his predecessors would always make sure they were following in someone else's footsteps in the hope of collecting some historical memorabilia, or to listen to some local rural stories. The generation living at the end of the 19th century needed the mountains to acknowledge their readiness to undertake the tasks which required high competences and a great amount of effort.

Notes

1   A student of Smoluchowski's, Kazimierz Gostkowski, explained that such an award was given to students who had received excellent grades from the beginning of their secondary-school education. The ring could also be used when a person wished to officially complain if he/she was unfairly treated (Gostkowski 23).

2   Smoluchowski's manuscripts were collected and arranged by Małgorzata Dziekan and Paweł Polak and in their article "Rękopisy Mariana Smoluchowskiego – ważne źródło do badan nad filozofią w Polsce." The authors discuss philosophical issues only.

3   On the basis of these notes it is possible to confirm that "in September 1896 the late Marian Smoluchowski went for a trip to the Scottish mountains and islands" (Smoluchowski 1915–1921, 5, editors' footnote; trans. A.B.).

4   For example Kelvin, Beattie and Smolan (1897, 393–428; 1898, 277–278).

5   Cf. *Marian Ritter von Smolan Smoluchowski,* www.universitystory.gla.ac.uk/biography/?id=WH24566&type=P

6   The Jagiellonian University was represented by Jerzy Mycielski, Bolesław Wicherkiewicz and August Witkowski ("Ruch artystyczny i literacki").

7   Rovenchak's article is based on the materials from the archive of the University of Lvov and offers valuable biographical information on Smoluchowski, for example the addresses of the places where he lived.

8   Cf. Smoluchowski (1913, 103): "We were excited about the mysteriousness of the places which were difficult to reach and had not been visited by skiers. These peaks, which were among the highest Carpathian mountains of Galicia and

Hungary, seduced us. […] We enjoyed the combination of what we had expected and what was also the modest romantic adventure of our expedition" (trans. A.B.).

9   Goetel (1953, 93–94) noticed "an artistic element" in Smoluchowski's descriptions of Scotland.

10   Kochański was the author of *Obrazy Londynu, Paryża, Wiednia, Petersburga, Berlina i Rzymu czyli opisanie osobliwości, zwyczajów i obyczajów mieszkańców sześciu głównych stolic Europy* (1829) (only three issues were published, the ones devoted to London and Paris).

11   The version of Bełza's text I quote in this article dates from 1900 – chronologically, it is the closest to the time of Smoluchowski's essay, therefore it records Scotland as seen by the scientist.

12   Cf. Kochański (1828, 200): "Before I begin to describe Fingal's cave I need to inform my readers about Fingal. The whole of Scotland and the Hebrides are filled with keepsakes related to Fingal; there are numerous ruins which are proudly named after him" (trans. A.B.).

13   Józef Ignacy Kraszewski commented on Tripplin's descriptions in the following way: "beautiful landscapes of the mountain land affect the traveller's eyes and the spirit of Ossian can be seen there as well" (3; trans. A.B.).

14   Tripplin offered a personal confession: "I just love this religion of memorabilia. It proves that there is a spiritual life somewhere there and it elevates people above the level of infinitesimal material objects" (127).

References

Autobiografia.
        http://www.ifpan.edu.pl/ON-1/Historia/art/16na.pdf
Bełza, Stanisław. 1900. *Odgłosy Szkocji.* 2nd edition. Kraków: G. Gebethner.
—. 1911. *Odgłosy Szkocji*. Vol. 1–3. Warszawa: Ziarno.
Buckton-Tucker, Rosalind. 2010. "Romanticism and the Philosophy of Travel." *International Journal of Arts and Sciences* 3.10: 258–265.
Dziekan, Małgorzata, and Paweł Polak. 2017. "Rękopisy Mariana Smoluchowskiego – ważne źródło do badań nad filozofią w Polsce." *Zagadnienia Filozoficzne w Nauce* 67: 141–169.
Goetel, Walery. 1917. "Ze wspomnień osobistych o Marianie Smoluchowskim." *Kosmos* 42.5–12: 218–230.
—. 1917–1918. "Marian Smoluchowski." *Pamiętnik Towarzystwa Tatrzańskiego* 36: 42–52.
—. 1953. "Marian Smoluchowski – człowiek gór." *Wierchy* 22: 80–100.
Gostkowski, Kazimierz. 1953. "Kilka wspomnień o Marianie Smoluchowskim." *Postępy Fizyki* 4: 233.
"Jubileusz Lorda Kelvina." 1896. *Gazeta Lwowska* 86.152: 4.

Kelvin, Lord, John Carruthers Beattie, and Marian de Smolan. 1897. "Experiments on the Electrical Phenomena Produced in Gases by Röntgen Rays, by Ultra Violet Light, and by Uranium." *Proceedings of the Royal Society of Edinburgh* 21: 393–428.

Kelvin, Lord, John Carruthers Beattie, and Marian de Smolan. 1898. "On Electric Equilibrium Between Uranium and an Insulated Metal in Its Neighbourhood." *The London, Edinburgh, and Dublin Philosophical Magazine and Journal of Science* 45: 277–278.

Klemensiewicz, Zenon. 1915–1921. "Marian Smoluchowski." *Taternik* 3-4.

Kochański, Tomasz W. 1828. "Grota Fingala na wyspie Staffie (Wyimek z dziennika podróży Tomasz W. Kochańskiego)." *Rozmaitości: Pismo dodatkowe do Gazety Lwowskiej* 32: 259–262.

—. 1829. *Obrazy Londynu, Paryża, Wiednia, Petersburga, Berlina i Rzymu czyli opisanie osobliwości, zwyczajów i obyczajów mieszkańców sześciu głównych stolic Europy*. Lwów.

Kraszewski, Józef Ignacy. 1851. "Listy do redakcji *Gazety Warszawskiej.*" *Gazeta Warszawska* 263: 3.

"Kronika." 1896. *Gazeta Lwowska* 86.115: 3

"Kronika." 1901. *Słowo Polskie* 6.294 (the morning issue): 2.

"Kronika." 1901. *Gazeta Lwowska* 91.144: 3.

"Kronika." 1908. *Gazeta Lwowska* 15: 3.

Kronika Uniwersytetu Lwowskiego. II. (1898/9 – 1909/10). 1912. Ed. Wiktor Hahn. Lwów.

K.S. 1896. "Heliograf." *Wszechświat* 15.15: 229.

K.W. 1896. "Rok spostrzeżeń międzynarodowych nad chmurami." *Wszechświat* 15.17: 269.

Lach-Szyrma, Krystyn. 1828. *Anglia i Szkocja: Przypomnienia z podróży roku 1820–1824 odbytej*. Vol. 2. Warszawa: Drukarnia A. Gałęzowskiego i spółki. *Marian Ritter von Smolan Smoluchowski* www.universitystory.gla.ac.uk/biography/?id=WH24566&type=P

Natanson, Władysław. 1913. "Kilka słów wspomnienia o ś.p. Auguście Witkowskim." *Wiadomości Matematyczne*" 17.1–4: 200.

"Pogrzeb ś. p. Augusta Witkowskiego." 1913. *Czas* 66.40: 1–2.

Rafalska-Łasocka, Alicja. 2012/2013. "Życie wypełnione pracą: W stulecie śmierci prof. Augusta Witkowskiego." *Alma Mater* 1152.153: 50–52.

Record of the ninth jubilee of the University of Glasgow. 1451–1901. 1901. Glasgow: James MacLehose and Sons.

Roszkowska, Ewa. 2012. "Alpejska działalność Smoluchowskiego." *Folia Turistica.* 26: 213–238.

Rovenchak, Andrij. 2012. "Lviv Period for Smoluchowski: Science, Teaching, and Beyond." *Condensed Matter Physics* 15.4: 1–15.

"Ruch artystyczny i literacki" 1901. *Czas* 54.129 (the evening issue): 3.

"Skład Akademii Umiejętności w Krakowie." 1895. *Rocznik Akademii Umiejętności w Krakowie 1894/5*. Kraków.

Smoluchowski, Marian. 1890–1900. "Notatki i wyciągi z dzieł naukowych robione w latach 1890–1900." Biblioteka Jagiellońska, ms. No. 9409 II. 34 https://jbc.bj.uj.edu.pl/dlibra/publication/539473/edition/527926/content?ref= desc.

—. 1896. "Dziennik Mariana Smoluchowskiego od 25 maja do 31 grudnia 1896 r." Biblioteka Jagiellońska, ms. No. 9434I, cards 6–7. https://jbc.bj.uj.edu.pl/dlibra/publication/554125/edition/529989/content?ref =desc

—. 1901. "Kongres międzynarodowy fizyków odbyty w Paryżu od d. 6–12 sierpnia 1901 r." *Wiadomości Matematyczne* 55.1–3: 84.

—. 1908a. "Lord Kelvin." *Ateneum Polskie* 1.2: 212–228.

—. 1908b. *Lord Kelvin.* Lwów.

—. 1913. "Mihailecul (1926 m) i Farcaul (1961 m) w zimie." *Taternik* 7.6: 103–107.

—. 1915–1921. "Wycieczki górskie w Szkocji." *Taternik* 5–9.

—. 1917. *Poradnik dla samouków: Wskazówki metodyczne dla studiujących poszczególne nauki.* Vol. 2. Warszawa.

Szpecht, Józef. 1939. *Wśród fizyków polskich. Seria I*. Lwów: Państwowe Wydawnictwo Książek Szkolnych.

Świerz, Mieczysław. 1928. "Ci, którzy odeszli…" *Taternik* 28.

T.R. 1895. "Stacje meteorologiczne na znacznych wysokościach." *Wszechświat* 14.35: 559.

Tripplin, Teodor. 1851. *Wspomnienia z podróży po Danii, Norwegii, Anglii, Portugalii i państwie marokańskim*. *4. Szkocja*. Warszawa: Drukarnia Gazety Codziennej.

"Uchwała Senatu Rzeczypospolitej Polskiej z dnia 28 czerwca 2017 r. w 100. rocznicę śmierci Mariana Smoluchowskiego – genialnego polskiego fizyka." 2017. *Monitor Polski* 683: 2.

"Wiadomości bieżące." 1896. *Wszechświat* 15.21: 36.

Womack, Peter. 1989. *Improvement and Romance: Constructing the Myth of the Highlands*. London: Macmillan.

Tom Hubbard
  https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9419-1204
Széchenyi Academy of Arts and Letters, Budapest

Namiętność in a Caledonian Metropolis: Scottish Urban Fiction and Its Cultures

Abstract

The "city novel" was an essentially 19th-century phenomenon. By the time Scottish writers had belatedly addressed themselves to this genre, the *Bildungsroman* model of urban fiction (the transplanted "Young Man from the Provinces") had given way to modernism and to a realism more magical than literal. This article discusses fictions which reflect Scotland's ethnic mix and multiple identities, i.e. the country's accommodation (or otherwise) of Irish, Jewish, Polish and Asian incomers: Patrick MacGill's *The Rat-Pit* (1915), J. David Simons's *The Liberation of Celia Kahn* (2011/2014), Suhayl Saadi's *The Burning Mirror* (2001), and Fred Urquhart's *Jezebel's Dust* (1951).

Keywords: Glasgow, Edinburgh, Dundee, Aberdeen, Fife, feminism, culture clash, class

1. Scottish Interest in Polish Culture

This article is concerned partly with historical Scottish-Polish connections. It may be helpful, at the outset, to offer a few examples from the neglected but rich field of contemporary Scottish interest in Polish literature and in the other arts of the country, notably: the Edinburgh-born journalist and historian Neal Ascherson with his encyclopaedic knowledge of the centuries of Polish history, displayed in his book *The Struggles for Poland*, as well as his reportage of Polish politics during the 1980s, from the rise of *Solidarność* and Jaruzelski's imposition of martial law; the artist and impresario Richard Demarco and his long commitment to bringing the Polish avant-garde in the visual and performing arts to Edinburgh; the late composer and pianist Ronald Stevenson who wrote on Paderewski, stressing the Pole's activity as both composer and pianist, and who made a transcription for piano of themes from Paderewski's opera *Manru*. More recently, Derrick McClure and David Malcolm have been translating much Polish poetry into the Scots language. A substantial book of essays could be devoted to the Scottish reception of Polish culture.

2. Literal and Magical Realism: The Imagined City

The present focus is on Scottish urban fiction, itself a vast subject, and even here there is a Polish dimension, as implied by the title of this paper. *Namiętność* is a Polish word meaning *passion*. Scotland was a latecomer to the "big city" novel, which was essentially a 19th-century creation, a reflection of the growth of large European conurbations, of the flight of ambitious young men – usually men – from small towns and villages in search of fortune and/or congenial employment unavailable to them in their native backwaters. The critic Lionel Trilling sees this as a "backbone" of the 19th-century novel – a kind of subgenre that he calls "the Young Man from the Provinces," and he enumerates examples such as Rastignac in Balzac's *Le Père Goriot* – Rastignac who is determined to conquer Paris, and Pip in Dickens's *Great Expectations*, bound for London and the life of a "gentleman" (Trilling 74). I myself would add the darker and more complex Raskolnikov in Dostoevsky's *Crime and Punishment* (*Prestuplenie i nakazanie*).

Trilling sees this subgenre of the Young Man from the Provinces as having its roots in two seemingly opposed phenomena: on the one hand, the solid realities of social class and social mobility, what I would call the more "literal" side of literary realism; and on the other hand, what Trilling calls "the thread of legendary romance, even of downright magic" (74). Yes, there can be something of the fairy tale about the Young Man's progress, from say Dick Whittington, the poor country lad with his resourceful feline friend, and his transformation into Lord Mayor of London; or Hans Christian Andersen's seemingly *magical* transformation of an ugly duckling into a swan, reflecting his own *literal* passage from small-town Odense to hitting the big time in Copenhagen.

The *literal* and the *magical*: the two ends of a spectrum on which the big city novel can be placed, though a single novel can veer constantly from the literal to the magical, from the magical to the literal. The literal and the magical are not always mutually exclusive. The magic is often black magic: the dream city of the romantic provincial aspirant can become the nightmare city, the city of dreadful night. There is an abundance of that in both Dickens and Dostoevsky. This will blend with the *literal* realism of the slums, the plight of the proletariat, or *lumpenproletariat*.

Ireland came late to the city novel with James Joyce's *Ulysses* of 1922. For Joyce, Dublin was the Hibernian Metropolis. I would claim Glasgow as the Caledonian Metropolis, though my Scottish examples will not be confined to Glasgow. Alasdair Gray's *Lanark* of 1981, however, comes almost sixty years after *Ulysses*; it is the much later example of a Scottish urban novel with a vast and complex canvas.[1] There is a famous passage in *Lanark* where the book self-consciously heralds its own innovatory quality, as in this conversation between two of the characters:

"Glasgow is a magnificent city," said McAlpin. "Why do we hardly ever notice that?" "Because nobody imagines living here," said Thaw. "[…] think of Florence, Paris, London, New York. Nobody visiting them for the first time is a stranger because he's already visited them in paintings, novels, history books and films. But if a city hasn't been used by an artist not even the inhabitants live there imaginatively. What is Glasgow to most of us? A house, the place where we work, a football park or golf course, some pubs and connecting streets. That's all. No, I'm wrong, there's also the cinema and library. And when our imagination needs exercise we use these to visit London, Paris, Rome under the Caesars, the American West at the turn of the century, anywhere but here and now. Imaginatively Glasgow exists as a music hall song and a few bad novels. That's all we've given to the world outside. It's all we've given to ourselves." (243)

"A few bad novels" – thus does *Lanark* dismiss earlier attempts at literary representation of the Caledonian metropolis. *Lanark* itself displays now *literal* realism and then *magical* realism. It is two novels in one: the tale of Duncan Thaw, working-class intellectual and struggling artist, a student at Glasgow School of Art, and beset with sexual frustration – that is the *Bildungsroman* pattern from the 19th century, with our ambitious young man, though he is not a provincial this time but a city boy from the beginning. His story is towards the *literal* end of our spectrum, though with "magical" touches. The other story is that of the character Lanark, who gives the whole book its title, and this is the definitely *magical* side of the novel, an evocation of a surreal dystopia, a city of dreadful nightmare, the *black* magic in abundance.

An "imagined" city, as cited so explicitly in *Lanark*, may differ vastly from the city as it actually exists. This is emphasised comically and absurdly in a French novel of 1884, *Á rebours*, translated into English as *Against Nature*, by Joris-Karl Huysmans. This novel has been called the Bible of the decadents of the 1890s and it notoriously influenced Oscar Wilde's *The Picture of Dorian Gray*. Its central character is Des Esseintes, an extreme aesthete who spends much of his time cooped up in his Parisian home, enjoying the arts, preferring this to going outside into the real world, into the crowded streets. For him, culture is more important than nature. One of his pursuits is reading the novels of Charles Dickens and this reveals for him the imagined city of London. As someone who rarely travels, he has of course never visited London, but he decides to do so at last, inspired by Dickens. So he makes his way towards the Gare St Lazare train station, ticket in hand, then thinks: if he experiences the *real* London, the *literal* London, that will destroy for him the city as evoked in Dickens's novels. He decides not to undertake the journey after all, turns on his heels, and heads back home to his collection of magical artistic artefacts (Huysmans 132–143).

Since the publication of Alasdair Gray's *Lanark*, many Scottish urban novels have appeared, for example from James Kelman and his authentic take on working-class life in Glasgow, and Irvine Welsh with his self-consciously supposed revelation of Edinburgh as more gritty than respectable. Given such a field, selection is

mandatory, and it has been two Polish novels of the 1890s which have helped me bring my topic into focus. These are Bolesław Prus's *Lalka*, which I have read in English translation as *The Doll*, and Władysław Reymont's *Ziemia obiecana*, or in English *The Promised Land*, though I read that in French translation, there being no recent English one in existence. *The Doll* is set in Warsaw and *The Promised Land* in Łódź. Two very different cities: Warsaw with a long history stretching back through the centuries; Łódź originally a small village at the beginning of the 19th century, but by the end a vast conurbation of textile mills and a workforce drawn from its rural origins. What the two books have in common, though, is their panoramic representation of diverse social classes, generations, races, ethnicities, religions, ideologies. The protagonist of *The Doll* is a nouveau riche, a wealthy businessman who is still an outsider, so he is still someone who wants to conquer the city and move into a higher class – a vain ambition, as it turns out. The three main characters in Reymont's book are a Pole, a member of the gentry turned ambitious industrialist, a German, and a Jew. Insofar as the two books display a "literal" realism, their readers can follow the action together with the maps of their cities, as the names of streets are specified. As you read, you can do a virtual tour of Warsaw and Łódź. This is "literal" realism as topographical realism. It is the solidity of these novels – their rich canvas of diverse characters and diverse locations – which have influenced the present choice of their late 20th-century and 21st-century Scottish counterparts.

3. "The black country with a cold heart"

Patrick MacGill's *The Rat-Pit*, published in 1915, is an Irish as well as a Scottish novel, that very ambiguity having perhaps got in the way of it being regarded as a member of the Scottish canon. MacGill was an Irishman, from County Donegal, who like many from the working classes of that part of Ireland, sailed across the water to Scotland for employment – digging potatoes – the "tattie-hokers" they were called. *The Rat-Pit* draws on its author's own experiences in Scotland, but its main character is Norah Ryan, a pious and initially naïve young Catholic – she is a Young *Woman* from the Provinces, and it is the focus on *female* aspirants that has also determined the choice of fiction for this article.

Compared with the isolation and repression of Donegal, where proprietors and priests are in cahoots to keep the lower orders in check, Scotland seems to offer a desirable alternative. Norah's mother is a strict, old-fashioned woman who defends priestly censorship of subversive books that have been brought back from Scotland by one of the young seasonal workers.[2] But will Scotland prove to be a "promised land" – a *ziemia obiecana*? Norah herself becomes one of the imported workers in Scotland, but her *Bildungsroman* there, as it were, proves to be a tragic tale. She is good-looking and is seduced by Alec Morrison, a young

middle-class Scot whose politically progressive views are superficial and half-baked, and he is distinctly patronising towards the classes he professes to want to "save." Norah becomes pregnant by him; as a good Catholic she constantly blames herself for her sin. Gravitating to the city of Glasgow, she finds accommodation in an overcrowded hostel, the "rat-pit" of the novel's title, as rats indeed scurry about within these walls. Readers of a certain age will recall the eloquence of the Glasgow shipyard workers' leader Jimmy Reid when in 1972 he condemned the "rat race" – the struggle to survive in a laissez-faire, ultra-competitive economy: "A rat-race is for rats," he declared. "We're not rats, we're human beings" (Reid 7).

One of her friends warns Norah that urban Scotland is "the black country with the cold heart" (MacGill 192). Norah soon finds that Scotland is indeed as exploitative and unequal as rural Ireland, if not more so. The best money, it becomes clear, is to be obtained by prostitution, and there is a bitter irony in one of Norah's few possessions: a picture of the Virgin Mary. Norah is an outsider on several fronts: as a woman in a male-dominated society; as a Catholic in a predominantly Protestant country; above all, as one of the poor in a city whose topography dramatically marks the boundaries between the social classes. Norah is living in a slum which is tantalisingly near the City Chambers, Glasgow's *ratusz*, a building resplendent with its marble staircase, the seat of municipal power, which Meg, a friend of Norah, describes as the place "where the rich people meet and talk" (234). From their rat-pit the women can view the tower of the city's centre of governance.

The friend Meg also speaks bitterly of their landlady – the woman who owns the rat-pit building – describing her as someone who goes to church every Sunday "with prayer books under her arm" (263) and who makes a lot of money out of the desperation of her lodgers. Meg informs Norah that this woman "lives oot in Hillhead" (263), a residential bourgeois district in the West End of the city, far from the city centre where the rat-pit is located. If one has a map of Glasgow at hand while reading MacGill's novel, it becomes clear that in this instance geographical distance matches the sociological distance.

4. "Jerusalem on the Clyde"

The district of Hillhead, this archetypal site of affluence, features in a more recent Glasgow novel. *The Liberation of Celia Kahn* was first published in 2011; its author is a Glasgow Jewish novelist called J. David Simons, who was born in the city in 1953. The City Chambers, just mentioned as Glasgow's seat of power, also features in this novel: the big square in front of the building is the traditional site of political protest, and Simons's book offers vivid descriptions of the demonstrations, concerning as it does the determination of the powerless to fight

back. *The Liberation of Celia Kahn* tends more towards a literal than a magical realism, with this caveat: despite its subject-matter of social struggle it is not at all a gloomy book; in fact it is often very funny, especially on the subject of sex. The magic is in the humour, in an irreverent Jewish humour, an irreverent Scottish Jewish humour that can be gloriously vulgar and filthy.

1915 was the year of publication of Patrick MacGill's *The Rat-Pit*. The first part of *The Liberation of Celia Kahn* narrates events that take place in that same year, 1915. Whereas Alasdair Gray's *Lanark* is in part set during a dystopian future, Simons's novel is set in the past, in the early 20ᵗʰ century. It can reasonably be described as a historical novel, and also as a political novel. History is not used here as a picturesque background: in the Walter Scott manner, individual characters live their private lives affected by public events, and in turn these characters seek to shape public matters. The heroine of Simons's novel, Celia Kahn, is a young Glasgow Jewish woman who becomes strongly politicised. Her politics organically infuse her personality, her personality infuses her politics.

In the course of the novel, there is an explanation of the historical background of Jewish settlement in Glasgow. A good many Russian and east European Jewish people, fleeing the anti-semitic pogroms under the Russian Tsarist régime at the end of the 19ᵗʰ century, boarded ships at Hamburg and landed at the Edinburgh port of Leith. From there they travelled west across Scotland and arrived in Glasgow, intending to take the ship to New York and the promised land of America. However, many families decided that they had had enough of travelling and so they made their homes in Glasgow.

A leading leitmotif in *The Liberation of Celia Kahn* is the sheer variety of Jewish attitudes in the Caledonian metropolis. The Glasgow Jews are not a homogeneous people: their differences are ideological, and as was the case in *The Rat-Pit*, generational. Parents and children differ sharply in their political and religious views: such tensions have animated much classic fiction – think of Turgenev's *Fathers and Children*. However, on occasion there can also be somewhat conspiratorial alliances between family members of different generations, e.g. Celia's Uncle Mendel is a charming, eccentric rogue who is much loved by his niece:

> She thought about her Uncle Mendel. Of course, he had a partiality for a little too much *schnapps* – even she who was not very worldly in the ways of alcoholic consumption could see that. But apart from a fondness for a game of *kalookie*, she never imagined her uncle was a gambling man. Rather he was a person with strong socialist views who cooked fish wrapped in damp newspaper over his fire until it peeled succulently off the bone. He told her Old Testament stories, read her the doctrines of Karl Marx, explained to her the secret meaning of the playing cards. How diamonds represented money and springtime, clubs stood for work and summer, spades health and winter, and hearts autumn and love. "Never be low in hearts," he would tell her as she sorted through her hand. "Especially in the autumn." "Why

in the autumn?" "Because then the winter will be very cold." If the Jews had an
equivalent of Santa Claus, she imagined her uncle would be first in line for the part,
albeit with a tendency for too much Christmas sherry. (Simons 8)

Uncle Mendel becomes a mentor to Celia, encouraging her own left-wing and
progressive views as she grows from girlhood to womanhood. Here is an example
of where members of different generations can actually be in accord. It follows that
members of the same generation do not always agree. Celia's dad disapproves of
Mendel's politics – he does not believe that socialism will solve the problem of anti-
Semitism. Celia's mother clashes even more strongly with her daughter; she does
not think that a nice Jewish girl should become a feminist, she should find a respect-
able middle-class Jewish boy with money and settle down with him. Celia's
mother is intensely conservative and loyal to Britain and its Empire, Glasgow
in the early 20th century being regarded as the second city of the British Empire.

A respectable middle-class Jewish boy? Celia Kahn, who lives with her family
in the markedly working-class district of the Gorbals, becomes very conscious of
the dimension of class. Uncle Mendel has of course prepared her for the dialectic
of class struggle. As in MacGill's *The Rat-Pit*, the Hillhead district of Glasgow
is considered to be the archetypal residential site of the *haute bourgeoisie*, and
as a working-class Gorbals girl Celia's attitude to that part of the city is both
suspicious and sardonic. The people there may be Jews, but they are rich Jews:
again, we are reminded of the heterogeneity of Glasgow Jewry. Nevertheless, Celia
does acquire a boyfriend, Jonny, from a well-off family in Hillhead. Visiting his
family home there, she is amazed by the opulence; she has never seen anything
like it before. Previously, however, one of her left-wing comrades had taken her
to the Willow Tea Rooms in Sauchiehall Street, the famous tea-rooms designed
by Charles Rennie Mackintosh, that Glasgow artist of European reputation. This
place is also the haunt of the better-off. Celia is apprehensive as, in the words
of the novel, she "put[s] out her foot, crosse[s] the threshold" (Simons 24). She
crosses many thresholds as she matures, as she encounters the sheer diversity
of the new experiences which Glasgow has to offer her. As the Glasgow Asian
writer Suhayl Saadi puts it in one of his short stories: "Glesca wis full ae border
launds, places where you could cross over" (Saadi 122).

The Liberation of Celia Kahn is very much a Young Woman's lived *Bildungs-
sroman*. Celia is not a Young Woman from the Provinces, though. Like Alasdair
Gray's Duncan Thaw she is urban bred, "a Glasgow girl from the Gorbals"
(Simons 243) through and through. Belonging to Glasgow, and to the Gorbals in
particular, is essential to her multiple identities as a Jew of East European ancestry,
as a secular Jew who has no time for the synagogue, as a socialist and a feminist.
One attitude that she does share with her elders is a scepticism about Zionism,
about setting off for Palestine to work in a kibbutz although her boyfriend Jonny
wants to do just that. The novel ends with more than a hint that there could be

trouble with the indigenous people of Palestine. What, Celia wonders, could she have in common with the Holy Land, as an East European Scottish Jew? Uncle Mendel is not a Zionist but the idea of the kibbutz at least interests him as potentially socialistic. Her father, though, a conservative suspicious of anything that hints of socialism, is quite content to stay in Glasgow. Referring to the famous religious tribal divide of the West of Scotland, he remarks that anti-Semitism is not a problem in Glasgow: "The Protestants and Catholics are too busy hating each other to bother with us Jews" (236). Non-Zionist Jews, we learn, regard the Gorbals as "Jerusalem on the Clyde" (166).

This again is a novel that you can read together with a map of the city. David Simons does not just cite *districts* of Glasgow – he gives us specific streets: Thistle Street and the Briggait in and near the Gorbals, Great Western Road at the posh Hillhead end. Celia and one of her comrades take a break and head up to the hilly Queen's Park on the city's southside. At the highest point of the park, the women delight in the view – you can see the whole city spread out to the north – Celia makes out the shipyards, the museum, the university, the many church spires. A counterpart in Alasdair Gray's *Lanark* and his other books would be his images, as a visual artist, of a panoramic Glasgow, of a panoramic Scotland no less, with the well-known landmarks arranged before you in a single picture.

The Liberation of Celia Kahn is indeed, among so much else, a historical novel. Via Celia's political participation, Simons evokes the famous Govan rent strike of 1915, when the women chase away the representatives of the landlords with such weapons as a chamber-pot full of piss. There is a demonstration against the exploiting bosses in George Square, facing the City Chambers. Celia and Uncle Mendel are among the protesters before the gathering is dispersed by the police. George Square is still the traditional site of political demonstrations, and has unofficially been renamed Freedom Square. George Square had been named after a British king.

Celia Kahn's most intense political commitment, however, is as a feminist championing birth control, a new and controversial topic in the early decades of the 20th century. She goes to the Langside public library south of Queen's Park to borrow a book by Marie Stopes, the pioneer of contraception. Now this might sound terribly earnest and worthy but David Simons's sense of humour always kicks in when you need it. This is a serious book but never a solemn one. Celia and her comrades have a struggle on their hands – Catholic women in particular are resistant to the idea of artificial methods of birth control – but our feminist adventurers also have a lot of fun. They order a consignment of French caps – female contraceptives – which they intend to distribute to the women of Glasgow, especially the poor ones who cannot afford to have too many kids. They collect the boxes of French caps from the docks, they have been drinking and are a bit pissed. A friendly young clerk looks at the delivery note and tells the women that they will never sell French caps – berets – to the men of Glasgow; these guys prefer to wear the traditional Scottish flat bonnet. It is not clear whether the young

man is unaware what the French caps really are, or whether he does know and just wants to tease these attractive drunk women, but anyway he sets Celia and her pal into a fit of the giggles, and her pal blows the young lad a scarlet lipstick kiss. Indeed, there is a lot of sex in this novel, much *namiętność*, erotic and political.

5. "A mixed marriage"

Before moving on to a Scottish-Polish novel of *namiętność*, let me say a little about Suhayl Saadi, a Glasgow writer of Asian origin, born in 1961. As the Glasgow Jews became assimilated into the general population and moved out of the Gorbals and much of the Southside, the immigrants from Pakistan and the Indian subcontinent moved in, and ran the shops once owned by Jewish people. Today, we refer to people from other lands who have settled in our country as the "new Scots." They may be Pakistani, Polish, even English. We describe today's Scots by civic, not ethnic, criteria. Suhayl Saadi's collection of short stories, *The Burning Mirror*, published in 2001, contains a story called "The Dancers," which centres on a young Glasgow Asian woman called Roshani. She is at a disco in a Southside Glasgow club with her pal Zarqa, a voluptuous, highly-sexed girl who wears a lot of lipstick and is a magnet for men, including white men. This is a milieu where ecstasy tablets and large quantities of vodka are consumed. This is a tale whose undercurrent mingles Eros and Thanatos, as if the dance could develop into a *Liebestod*.

Roshani is more reserved, more troubled than Zarqa. There has been tragedy in her family: she has not been able to overcome her intense grief for her beloved father, who had never found a congenial job, became mentally ill and committed suicide by drowning in the River Clyde. Her life has been a complex one from the beginning, as her father was a Pakistani Moslem and her mother an Irish Catholic from Belfast. "A *mixed marriage*, everybody called it, as though it had been a recipe or a cocktail. […] It had been a romance of underdogs" (Saadi 122–123). Roshani has grown up as a Glasgow Scot with a Scottish accent, and like Celia Kahn she has multiple identities, although for Roshani this amounts to a more melancholy experience. When she feels Irish, she thinks of her Pakistani name Roshani as metamorphosed into Roísín Dhu, the Irish Gaelic for black rose (124). Black rose: the very name suggests a blend of death and sexuality.

This story, as well as others in Saadi's collection, tends more towards the magical than the literal as it travels along my spectrum, above all perhaps in its *mélange* of diverse linguistic registers. As Catherine McInerney says in an essay on the book: "The exploration of cultural customs and values, and the mixture of Punjabi and Scots employed to tell the tales is simply unlike anything you will ever have read or heard before" (McInerney 16). Quite so.

6. "Nammy what?"

Namiętność. This is the Polish word introduced to Scottish readers by the novelist and short story writer Fred Urquhart, who lived from 1912 to 1995. He was a close observer of the sexual charges between young Scottish women and the Polish soldiers who were stationed in Scotland during World War II. It is the more remarkable that he handled this so well in his fiction because he was gay. However, a novelist is in many ways akin to a good actor; the novelist must also step out of his or her own personality in order to get into the skin of characters who are utterly unlike him or her self. Urquhart deals with these erotic Scottish-Polish exchanges in several of his fictions, above all in the novella entitled "Namiętność – The Laundry Girl and the Pole" of 1940 (collected in the volume *The Clouds are Big with Mercy*, 1946) and in the novel *Jezebel's Dust* of 1951 (and most recently reprinted in 2011). The novella is set in the thinly-disguised location of Cupar in Fife, the novel in Edinburgh. In both cases, the initial and subsequent sexual encounters are treated as a comedy of manners.

Scottish fiction is at its best when it treats sex as comedy – and we have encountered a great deal of sex in these novels. Eminently quotable from the novella is this wonderful banter which takes place as the Scottish women and the Polish men are eating together in a fish and chip shop:

> Every now and then Stanislaus said: "Good evening, Marguerite. Beautiful Scottish girl, I love you." He was very proud of his last sentence. "Good?" he said after it. "Good?"
> "Very good," Meg said, taking one of his cigarettes. "Now, what about teachin' us that in Polish?"
> "In Polish?" Stanislaus grinned. "I love you. All the same, all countries." And he put his hand on Meg's knee, winking suggestively.
> "Here, here, not so quick;" Meg cried. "You're a fast worker. Don't be so passionate!"
> "Passion…ate?" he said. "Passion ….Ah, namietnosc!"
> "Nammy what?" said Meg. "Gee, I'd never be able to say that. It'll be easier for you to learn English than for us to learn Polish."
> "I should say so!" Bell said. "It's a wonder to me that they can understand it them-sels. I see that some o' the shops ha'e bills up already wi' Polish written on them. It looks terrible. Like a jig-saw puzzle."
> "I think that's what he thinks he's doin.'" Meg pulled Stanislaus' hand onto the table. "Now, keep it there!" she said, putting her own hands on top of it. (Urquhart 1946, 20–21)

Urquhart's Scottish women are caught between powerful attraction to the exotic men, handsome in their uniforms, with their sexy Polish accents, and a certain wariness about these lads being just a bit too eager and quick in their strategies of seduction. Even so, it is not too long before one of the girls is taught how to say "I love you" in Polish – Kocham ciebie.

Such motifs are developed more fully by this writer ten years later. In *Jezebel's Dust*, Lily and Bessie are two working-class Edinburgh girls during the war years; they find themselves in company with the foreign sailors and soldiers stationed in the Scottish capital – free French, Norwegian and American as well as of course Polish. Lily is an uninhibited young woman, feisty and sweary, eager to chase and to be chased by hunks in uniform; Bessie is more cautious. Inevitably, however, they both get caught up in their respective sexual tangles. As with the other novels discussed here, there is citation of specific streets and venues (such as cinemas and dance-halls, these supreme loci of sexual congress), and there is such a variety of cultures represented, from these overseas servicemen to the strongly stratified nature of Edinburgh society in terms of class. The comedy of culture-clash with the inevitable mutual misunderstandings, as well as the comedy of snobbery, are handled in masterly fashion. This also concerns the darker side of it all. One genteel Edinburgh lady, a Mrs Munro, opines that "You should never trust foreigners" (Urquhart 2011, 11). In this novel, xenophobic and insular attitudes are not confined to any single social class, and Bessie's proletarian dad is vehemently against his daughter getting mixed up with visiting exotics. In our own day, Scotland is not as European-minded as it likes to think it is; there is a lot of lip-service paid to the continental cultural sophistication to which our country desperately needs to return, especially given the bigotry and philistinism of the Brexit British state. Bessie's dad spouts an ignorance and hypocrisy that is all too common when he claims that he is "all for Internationalism," that "it's only by marryin' folk from other countries that wars'll eventually stop. The only good thing I can see about war," he adds, "is that it lets folk see that folks from other countries are much the same as themselves. All the same, I don't hold with the Poles" (149). The novel's comedy metamorphoses almost inexorably into tragedy as the cultural differences threaten the Scottish-Polish erotic entwinements. There is much violence, sexual *and mortal* violence, to counterpoint the laughter. Ominously for future post-war politics, Bessie's Polish boyfriend Dmitri (*sic*) spits out his hatred of communism and of Stalin in particular. The outspoken Lily mischievously remarks that working-class Scotsmen tend to be left-wing, including Bessie's own dad, so she had better not introduce Dmitri to her old man.

Linguistic variety is a feature of Suhayl Saadi's fiction, whereas the Edinburgh girls in Fred Urquhart's *Jezebel's Dust* find themselves having to explain Scottish and even English idioms that they use casually, with an initial lack of awareness that these will confuse their Polish fancy-men. For her Dmitri's sake, Bessie must distinguish between "dear" meaning expensive, as of a dress in a shop window, which the Polish boyfriend wants to buy for her, and "dear" as an expression of affection. Likewise, Dmitri is puzzled by the word "hen," as used by Scots men when they address a woman in a friendly if sometimes patronising manner. Bessie's sexy pal Lily tries to explain "hen" to Dmitri and this leads to a delicious double entendre:

> "Well, it's like this," Lily said. "A hen lays eggs. A hen is a lady bird, like me and
> Bessie. The other bird is a cock." She looked around to see that nobody was paying
> much attention, then she gave a low: "Cockadoodledoo!"
> Realisation dawned on Dmitri's face. "Ah, you hen! Me cock!" he cried. And he leaned
> over Bessie, slapping his chest and saying: "Dmitri cock, yes? Dmitri veree nice cock, yes."
> Bessie blushed and looked at the table […]. (54–55)

The word "talent" also has to be explained as referring to sexually-desirable
members of the opposite sex when one is out looking for "pick-ups." More gener-
ally as regards the linguistic themes of this novel, Urquhart displays an excellent
ear for working-class Edinburgh spoken Scots. That alone would account for
much of the sparkle and the energy of this literary work.

7. "Three northern cities"

Jezebel's Dust, then, is an Edinburgh novel, and thus far I have mostly discussed
books set in Glasgow. That is almost inevitable, given that Scotland's population
density is greatest in Glasgow and its urban hinterland. However, that should not
blind us to work set in our other two major cities, Aberdeen and Dundee. Joan
Lingard's novel *Dreams of Love and Modest Glory*, from 1995, occupies a vast
historical canvas, across many countries and generations. Two young Aberdeen
women, from the middle-class western part of the city, meet two handsome east
European seamen whose ship is moored in the Aberdeen docks. Thus begin rela-
tionships which are conducted from the latter years of the Tsarist Russian Empire,
through to the Bolshevik revolution, the establishment of the Soviet Union and
beyond. When I interviewed Joan for the Scottish PEN Centre she gave me this
summing-up of the novel:

> The title of the book comes from a poem by Pushkin. I put two Scottish women
> into a complex situation, one in Russia, the other in Latvia, to point up the cultural
> differences. Garnet [one of the women] marries a count, Lily marries a man whose
> stock is more peasant than nobility. The action takes place in three northern cities
> – Aberdeen, Riga, St Petersburg. I contrasted Aberdeen and its attitudes with the
> other two cities. (Lingard 2008, 88)

8. Conclusion (by way of Kierkegaard in Dundee and international dancing in Fife)

It remains to offer a few contrasting observations by way of suggesting a shifting
of the ground (quite literally) towards those urban centres that receive less
representation in Scottish fiction than Glasgow and Edinburgh. This will help to

round off the discussion in a way that attempts to restore some balance in literary attention to other Scottish loci which have real – or imagined – international links.

Dundee has tended to feature more in poetry and song than in prose fiction, but Bill Duncan's surreal prose collection, *The Smiling School for Calvinists*, published in 2001, contains such gems as the short-short story, occupying a third of a page, about the seemingly unlikely presence in a Dundee pub of a book by the Danish existentialist philosopher Søren Kierkegaard (203). Earlier in his collection, Duncan makes wry reference to the tongue-in-cheek claim that "from the upper deck of the Number 37 [bus], the coastline of Scandinavia is visible on a fine day" (13). Denmark is east-central Scotland's next landfall to the east, and is on the same latitude, but the distance between the two nations is a watery 700 kilometres or so, thus defeating the otherwise prodigious buses of Dundee; Kierkegaard's country (via the Baltic island of Bornholm) is far nearer to coastal Poland, at a mere 200 kilometres! Bill Duncan's series of small-scale scherzi, typical of Dundee's quirkily reductive humour, may lack the textures and amplitudes of the novels discussed in this paper, but his book offers a relaxed counterpoint to their ambitious reach.

Lastly, I will unashamedly put in a plug for my own production, *Slavonic Dances*, a set of interrelated stories dealing with Scottish encounters with eastern and east-central Europe, all of them essentially comedies of manners – comedies initially, that is. The first tale, "Mrs Makarowski," has a mostly urban setting, in the town of Leven in my native Fife. Not all industrial urban centres are large cities. The story concerns a homely working-class Fife woman in the 1940s who meets a Polish soldier at a dance. She loves him dearly, but is utterly bemused by his Polishness: this is the source of both the story's comedy and its tragedy. Her life is shattered when there are revelations about his unhappy past in the country he has had to leave behind. I wrote this story before I had heard of Fred Urquhart's fiction dealing with similar material. In a way that rather points up the sheer scale of the wartime romances between Scottish women and Polish soldiers based in Scotland, and the consequences of these relationships. A cousin of my father's was one of these women – she married a gentleman from Bydgoszcz. They were a close couple but there were problems.

I introduce my book at readings by referring to my interest in both the absurdities and epiphanies of cultural exchange. In a 1926 essay on Joseph Conrad, Thomas Mann argued that the arts of the 20th century went beyond tragedy and comedy and towards the *grotesque* (Mann 106). We might be forgiven for speculating that this might be even more true for the arts (and the realities) of the 21st century.

The raison d'être of this paper has been an attempt to chart relatively unfamiliar territory in the wider field of comparative Scottish and European literary studies. I am a former editor / researcher of the Bibliography of Scottish Literature in Translation (BOSLIT), an online resource which has been dormant for some time, but which is to be hosted, in due course, at the University of Glasgow.

When it is up and running it will greatly enhance the potential for comparative Scottish and other-European literary studies. I would add that for many years I taught Scottish literature and culture at a variety of European and North American universities, in particular in France, the USA and Hungary. I am a veteran in the field. I am concerned that the scholarly dialogues should be reciprocal, in effect catering for the converse of BOSLIT; that is to say, to develop the study of Scottish reception of European (and non-European) literatures. To that end, my hope is that such processes would be encouraged by my choice of non-canonical literary works which are remarkable for their pan-European and otherwise international subject-matter and dramatis personae. More than ever before, relevant research programmes must make their departure from the existing comfort zones and display a genuinely pioneering spirit. Younger scholars in particular, not least those seeking neglected topics, will surely benefit from such bold innovations.

Notes

1   The use of the word "canvas" here can indeed be referenced to Gray who was both a painter and a visual artist.
2   Here we have generational as well as ideological conflict.

References

Ascherson, Neal. 1987. *The Struggles for Poland*. London: Michael Joseph.

Duncan, Bill. 2001. *The Smiling School for Calvinists*. London: Bloomsbury.

Gray, Alasdair. 1981. *Lanark: a Life in Four Books*. Edinburgh: Canongate.

Hubbard, Tom. 2017. *Slavonic Dances: Three Novellas: Mrs Makarowski, The Kilt, The Carrying Stream*. Ochertyre: Grace Note Publications.

Huysmans, J.K. 1959. *Against Nature*. Trans. Robert Baldick. Harmondsworth: Penguin Classics.

Lingard, Joan. 1995. *Dreams of Love and Modest Glory*. London: Sinclair-Stevenson.

—. 2008. "Interview: Joan Lingard Talks to Tom Hubbard." *The Irish Review* (Cork) 38: 83–93.

MacGill, Patrick. 2001. *The Rat-Pit*. Dublin: New Island.

Mann, Thomas. 1973. "Joseph Conrad's *The Secret Agent*." *Conrad: The Secret Agent Casebook*. Ed. Ian Watt. London: Macmillan. 99–112.

McInerney, Catherine. 2003. "The Enthusiast's View." *An Extract from Suhayl Saadi's The Burning Mirror*. Edinburgh: Scottish Book Trust. 11–16.

Prus, Bolesław. 1996. *The Doll*. Trans. David Welsh, revised by Dariusz Tołczyk and Anna Zoranko. Budapest: Central European University Press.

Reid, James. 1972. *Alienation*. Glasgow: University of Glasgow Publications.

Reymont, Władysław. 2011. *La Terre promise*. Traduit du polonais par Olivier Gautreau. Genève: Zoé.

Saadi, Suhayl. 2001. *The Burning Mirror*. Edinburgh: Polygon.

Simons, J. David. 2014. *The Liberation of Celia Kahn*. Glasgow: Saraband.

Stevenson, Ronald. 1992. *The Paderewski Paradox / Le paradoxe Paderewski*. Morges: La Société Paderewski.

Trilling, Lionel. 1970. *The Liberal Imagination.* Harmondsworth: Penguin Books.

Urquhart, Fred. 1946. "Namiętność: The Laundry Girl and the Pole" [elsewhere and usually cited as 'The Laundry Girl and the Pole']. *The Clouds are Big with Mercy*. Glasgow: William MacLellan. 7–61.

—. 2011 [1951]. *Jezebel's Dust*. Glasgow: Kennedy & Boyd.

Ewa Szymańska-Sabala
 https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3455-0508
Warsaw School of Pedagogical Sciences

What Lurks Behind the Shell? Kafkaesque Surrealism Revisited by Jackie Kay

Abstract

This essay seeks to analyse Jackie Kay's short story "Shell" (2002) with reference to a metamorphic tradition, in particular the modernist novella *The Metamorphosis* (1915) by Franz Kafka. Since both texts tackle the subject of the bodily transformation of a solitary character, albeit in two distinctly different manners, the paper will juxtapose them in order to investigate the writer's reassessment of the monstrous body and the conflict it reveals about the social exclusion of otherness. It will also discuss Kay's ingenious treatment of metamorphosis as a powerful source of self-invention.

Keywords: metamorphosis, modernism, obesity, discrimination, subversion

1. Introduction

What lies at the heart of the literary oeuvre of Jackie Kay is, undoubtedly, her belief in inclusivity as an underlying principle of a healthy society. While her initial interests revolved primarily around the issues of marginalisation ensuing from racial, ethnical, and sexual otherness characteristic of a largely homogeneous Scottish society, her later works give voice to a range of social misfits, who vainly struggle to conceal their sense of inadequacy. The Scottish Makar – National Poet of Scotland – since 2016, Kay is valued as an ambassador of heterogeneity that encompasses the disadvantaged: the elderly, the overweight, the abandoned, the obsessed, and the disenchanted. As a poet, a novelist, and a short story writer, she expresses her "overabundance of empathy" (Korzeniowska 138) with remarkable inventiveness. This paper aims to analyse Kay's ingenious strategy of exploring the modernist novella *The Metamorphosis* by Franz Kafka as an intertext for the story "Shell" published in 2002 in Kay's first short story collection *Why Don't You Stop Talking*. It will investigate Kay's concept of forming an analogy between the monstrous body of Gregor Samsa and the morbidly obese protagonist of "Shell," and its subversion through a revised outlook of a metamorphic process.

Kay juxtaposes the horrifying transmutation of Kafka's protagonist, which initiates the process of his long and painful agony in alienation, by a metamorphic act seen as an antidote for exclusion, and leading to the liberation from social constraints. The transformation in "Shell" bears the quality of self-invention, it opens the space for self-fulfilment, and simultaneously protects the protagonist from a societal bias towards othernesss. Although the story exposes discrimination against overweight people, obesity may be interpreted here in broader terms, as a representation of a diversity which does not adhere to the collective norms and expectations, and the protagonist could stand for all those who vainly seek social acceptance.[1] Hence, the metamorphosis is depicted as an attractive break from a social prejudice.

2. Metamorphic Tradition

Ovid's magnum opus *Metamorphoses*, and the subsequent literary works which it inspired over the centuries, placed the phenomenon of corporeal transformation within an explicable context. Most frequently it has been accounted for as a punitive or revengeful act of divine or malicious powers; however, it has also been employed in order to infuse a text with comic connotations or provide a powerful vehicle for plot development. Once positive, the outlook on vitality and dynamism governing Ovidian fluid universe came to evoke negative connotations, when shape-shifting became explicitly associated with evil forces in the Christian tradition (Warner 2). Such a devilish property characterises for instance the mysterious figure of Gil-Martin in the Scottish masterpiece *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner* (1824) by James Hogg, where the diabolic character assumes the shape of the protagonist in order to perpetrate crimes in his name. Kafka's story holds a particular position among the literature of bodily transformation. According to David Gallagher, it marks "a clear demonstrable shift in the representation of metamorphosis in modernism and postmodernism with writers representing metamorphic states as psychological or mental phenomena" (13). The external reasons for the very act of transformation remain inexplicable in the text, leaving the protagonist and the reader at a loss. Causality is replaced by arbitrariness, and Ovidian vivacity gives way to misery and despair. Trapped in a monstrous body, the main character experiences double alienation, from his family and his self, and becomes his own other. The transmutation deprives him of human dignity and dooms him to a tragic end. Interestingly, Kay's text provides an altogether different outlook on a metamorphic act, endowing it with a variety of positive connotations.

The predicament of a travelling salesman, Gregor Samsa, is revealed to himself and to the reader in the opening sentence of Kafka's novella: "One morning, when Gregor Samsa woke from troubled dreams, he found himself transformed

in his bed into a horrible vermin." The discovery is followed by a matter-of-fact statement: "It wasn't a dream" (Kafka n.p.). From the very beginning, Kafka excludes the possibility of interpreting Gregor's nightmarish position in oneiric terms, providing instead a surrealistic treatment of the concept of metamorphosis (cf. Gallagher 141). The transformation occurs in a realistic setting, portrayed with great attention to detail, which, combined with the understated and emotionless narrative mode, contributes to creating an acute sense of the absurd. Likewise, Jackie Kay situates the protagonist of "Shell" in a recognizable, contemporary household. Doreen – a single mother of a black teenage son, barely copes with everyday life and her son Louis's scornful attitude. Extremely overweight, she finds it more and more challenging to bear her loneliness and exhaustion and begins to observe a gradual change in her eating habits and painful physical sensations. One day, she develops scales on her limbs, and her back hardens into a mosaic shell. Transformed into a tortoise, she leaves home and seeks refuge in the garden.

Similarly to Kafka's novella, the reader of "Shell" is confronted with an act of metamorphosis. However, the events they witness happen at opposite times in the two stories. While Gregor Samsa's atrocious change occurs in the first sentence of the tale, Doreen's transformation constitutes a concluding act. Yet, on closer inspection, it is the opening scene of "Shell" that, in fact, corresponds to the emergence of Gregor's hideous shape and immediately forms a connection between the monstrous body of the transmuted Samsa and the morbidly obese woman. The reader witnesses Doreen's struggle to get out of bed, when she "throw[s] her duvet right back so that it doesn't get in her way" and then "rocks back and forth, back and forth, until she gathers enough steam to rise" (Kay 137). Doreen's awkward horizontal position and her clumsiness combined with determination are clearly reminiscent of Gregor's efforts to bring his unruly insectile body under control and safely leave his bed: "He lay on his armour-like back, and if he lifted his head a little he could see his brown belly, slightly domed and divided by arches into stiff sections […] [h]is many legs waved about helplessly […] continuously moving in different directions […]. If he wanted to bend one of them, then that was the first one that would stretch itself out […]. Gregor was already sticking half way out of bed […] all he had to do was rock back and forth" (Kafka n.p.).

3. The Stigma of Obesity

The transformation of Gregor Samsa has been subject to a variety of interpretations throughout the century: from a psychoanalytical analysis linking Samsa's downfall to a self-imposed punishment for usurping the position of his father, through a Marxist reading of Samsa as a representative of the exploited proletariat to a feminist treatment of the evolution of Gregor's sister.[2] Regardless of the diversity of outlooks, what always remains central and intact is the disfigured, hideous

body and the horror it arouses. Jackie Kay endeavours to juxtapose the repulsive image of the deformed Gregor Samsa and her monstrously overweight protagonist in order to subversively expose the predicament of obese people. With just a few images, the reader gains an insight into the burden of fatness, which transforms everyday routines into a series of challenges. Taking a shower becomes almost a strategic operation, cutting toe nails requires securing a whole afternoon, and picking up dropped keys turns out to be a sheer impossibility. However, life in slow motion is particularly bothersome when confronted with the outside world. Doreen, for example, finds it extremely difficult to cross the road: "There never seems to be enough time. The green is always over too quickly […]. Small steps, one at a time, are all she can manage" (Kay 141). Driving does not seem much better. It exposes Doreen to the risk of being ridiculed, since her seat is adjusted "at an angle, almost in the sleeping position" (Kay 140), and her slow pace infuriates impatient drivers, who flash their lights or gesture obscenely at her. Doreen's lack of confidence has grown since she lost her job. Unable to meet the financial needs of her son, she also feels his resentment towards her.

Through her protagonist's story, Kay portrays the plight of overweight individuals who suffer social stigma and the resulting exclusion and loneliness. Obesity is sometimes referred to as the last socially acceptable form of discrimination as it is generally considered to be self-inflicted and a manifestation of destructive behaviour. Commonly viewed as a consequence of a lack of control, a fat body is stereotypically "equated with the ugly, moral failure, inability to delay gratification, poor impulse control, greed, and self-indulgence" (Backstrom 692). The condition is rarely perceived as a medical problem and therefore individual indulgence tends to be blamed rather than "binge-eating disorder as a condition beyond one's control like anorexia and bulimia" (Backstrom 691). Pejorative perceptions of obesity, particularly acute in the case of women, imposes a harsh, preemptory social judgement on them: "in this society everyone who sees a fat woman feels they know something about her that she doesn't herself know […] the prestige of a privileged understanding of her *will* (she's addicted), her *history* (she's frustrated), her *perception* (she can't see herself as she really looks), her *prognosis* (she's killing herself)" (Moon and Sedgwick 305; original emphasis).

Protecting her protagonist's privacy against such ruthless claims, Kay leaves the reader in the dark as to the reasons for Doreen's present state. Sparse hints testify to her loneliness as a single mother and her decreasing self-confidence following the loss of her job. Only time indicators in the text such as: "not any more," "unlike before," "it's been a while since" imply that Doreen did once lead a different life, yet her weight-gain is neither determined as a cause nor an effect of her current situation. Her body resists any *ad hoc* interpretations and remains an enigma, resembling, also in this respect, the condition of Kafka's protagonist. Not only are the reasons for Gregor's metamorphosis unexplained but also his insectile form is depicted in extremely vague terms. Portrayed briefly as unusually

broad, covered with a carapace and equipped with big jaws and numerous legs, Gregor can be merely categorised as an unspecified type of beetle. Various interpretative attempts to classify his transformed body within a certain category have been futile. As Harold Bloom points out, Kafka himself "did everything possible to evade interpretation of his work" (4) and his strong objection to placing an illustration of the transformed Gregor on the cover of the book additionally testifies to his resolve. The novella's open-endedness creates then a fertile ground for revisions, "precluding that closure of discourse that would imprison us in our old histories" (Pelikan Straus 651).

4. The Subversion of Monstrosity

The sense of ambiguity created around both characters is accompanied by yet another property which they share, namely the paradox of their visible invisibility. Both bodies generate morbid interest, being simultaneously looked through and treated with a certain embarrassed indifference. It is the mixture of horror and fascination they raise in the onlookers that brings to mind freak shows, which exposed bodily anomalies for collective inspection. As Elisabeth Grosz observes, the existence of freaks "imperils categories and oppositions dominant in social life" (56), introducing an element of threatening ambiguity. They shake "fundamental categories of self-definition and boundaries dividing self from others" (Grosz 57). In this respect, monstrous bodies represent the abject that disturbs social order. Samsa's transformed body violates the binary opposition of a human/an animal, Doreen embodies the monstrosity of excess. Fat people were common exhibits in freak shows in the 19th and early 20th century and "a few carnivals carried sideshows made up exclusively of extremely heavy people" (Bogdan 32). Apart from being looked at, they were also a target of jokes and mockery. Like other exhibits, they not only entertained the public, but also "confirm[ed] the viewer as bounded, belonging to a 'proper' social category" (Grosz 65). While Gregor's monstrous form becomes a source of self-disgust and debasement for him, Kay's protagonist seems to accept her fatness, patiently bearing its burden. There is a great deal of sensual fondness in the depiction of Doreen's generous size, which renders her body pleasant rather than off-putting. A close-up of Doreen in the shower is one such example: "She stands under the water with her eyes closed tight and her tongue hanging out. Turning slowly, so that the water can get on to her back. She sways from side to side, letting her weight be carried first on one foot then the other. The water on her back is deeply pleasurable. Every drop seems to stay for a second before sliding off" (1). When Doreen fantasises about having a lover, she considers it from her body perspective: "The thought of somebody exploring her body, her rolls of fat, her big thighs, her fat dimpled arms, is exciting. Perhaps a new lover could come along and wake

up her rolls of flesh. Maybe a tongue could lick under the folds. A lover could reach the parts of herself she hasn't been able to find" (146). As a consequence, Kay effectively undermines her already established analogy between Doreen's monstrous looks and the deformed shape of Gregor Samsa, thus exposing the bias against "people whose body size does not adhere to society's confining standards" (Braziel and LeBesco 3).

Much as the transformation in Kafka's novella remains inexplicable, it can be inferred that Samsa's alteration occurs as a response to his oppressive working environment, the instrumental treatment of the family, and his growing isolation, and, ultimately, the incarnation reflects his earlier predicament. The new shape is non-negotiable, it is inflicted upon the character in the manner by which mythical gods condemned culprits, turning them into non-human forms. Once transformed, Gregor experiences further degradation living in a junk room and feeding on rotten food, but, most of all, having lost his identity. Marina Warner perceives his transmutation as "a means of communicating a profoundly altered concept of the self, in which the emerging being does not express self-knowledge but destroys the possibility of self-recognition" (116). The final act of Gregor's transformation is his miserable death; his carapace is disposed of by a charlady.

5. The Power of Metamorphosis

Remarkably, Jackie Kay reverses the very act of metamorphosis, endowing it with vitality and self-knowledge. The painful process of Doreen's bodily change is preceded by her gradual distancing from her daily chores and waking from apathy and resignation:

> Just recently, something has been happening to her body, her lower back is in agony and she feels heavy like a crate full of goods, lethargic and exhausted […]. Her whole back feels very unstable as if it could crack […]. If her back cracked, a different Doreen altogether might come out from the inside. For the past couple of months, she can't escape this certain feeling of another woman living inside her, quietly. (142)

The physical symptoms of her inner change are observed by Doreen with a mixture of alarm and fascination. The cracking skin on her hands, her stiffening neck and a growing lump on her back make Doreen

> really curious, almost proud about what is happening to her […]. Part of her doesn't want the whole strange business to stop. Wherever it is she is going to, she is on the journey now […]. All she wants to do is follow, keep going slowly further and further on, digging deeper and deeper till she might emerge from who knows where. Eventually, she might end up being a different person altogether, with a different life, another past entirely. (147, 149)

Nancy Gray Diaz observes that an act of metamorphosis frequently appears as a response to a moment of crisis and becomes a climactic event (2). Indeed, Doreen can clearly recall the circumstances of the completion of her transformation. Humiliated by her son "standing there, scowling, a look of green poison on his face, a look of hatred […] making things up as if she was a total imbecile, as if her brain was the size of a pea" (Kay 153), she suddenly feels "an enormous pain burst forth from the middle of her back and then a terrible tightening […]. Her shoulders curled around themselves as she felt a hot, searing pain shoot out between her shoulder blades and another stab across her lower spine. A heavy weight spread across the huge sweep of her back" (153). Unlike Samsa's revolting shape, Doreen's transformed body, which begins to have a life of its own, does not fill her with revulsion; even her peculiar droppings provoke her curiosity rather than disgust. The protruding shell on her back provides Doreen with both security and a sense of beauty:

> It was highly domed like the roof of an ancient church. The lines were quite beautiful, delicate. Her back was an olive-grey colour. She could see herself as some small cobbled street in a medieval town. Or as an early map. An intricate pattern on her back forming light circles. Like a view of fields from the air […]. It is hard […] it is protective, it is loyal and trustworthy: if she wants to she can hide her whole head inside the musky damp darkness, the forgiving darkness. Simply pull her neck back and hide underneath that capacious carapace. (154, 149)

While Gregor Samsa's metamorphosis is an ordeal in a defamiliarised body for the protagonist, Jackie Kay endeavours to domesticate the overweight body through the subversive act of transforming it into a tortoise. Gregor's estrangement from the world and himself, aptly defined as "alienation without grace" (Skulsky 171) is contrasted with an achievement of self-invention. The social perception of fatness as a deplorable transgression of boundaries (cf. Braziel and LeBesco 3) is mockingly replaced by Kay with the transgression between a human and an animalistic form. Here the metamorphosis represents an act of liberation from the social persecution of otherness and emphasises the integral property of corporeality as being constantly in transition. In the perspective of Kay's story, social stigma and the marginalisation attached to obesity are so acute that an escape into an animalistic form seems to provide a long-awaited sense of relief. The transformation appears to be an antidote to the protagonist's previous vulnerability and a source of empowerment for her. Doreen's altered self allows her to secure her own borders and leave behind the socially imposed, predictable role. She is finally able to shake off the clichéd gregarious personality, so frequently ascribed to overweight people:

> Since she had it [the carapace], the neighbours haven't bothered her. She is retreated. She has gone from being an outgoing bubbly kind of a woman to a shy, introverted one. Being shy is quite sexy. She enjoys holding herself in, taking things deliciously

slowly. Her own company is quite fulfilling. At last, she has learnt to live in the moment, to let it be, let it hang and swing and rock in the air. A moment has a smell, a taste, a sound. (150–151)

Undoubtedly, what is essential for the interpretative aspect of a metamorphic process is the shape of the newly-acquired body. In the case of Gregor Samsa, the reader is "struck by the symbolic force of the image of the insect" (Diaz 7), which evokes revulsion, disgust, fear or, in the best of cases, indifference. Since the creature appears of no use to anybody, it is not worthy of anybody's notice. Gregor's symbolic value is encapsulated in the picture of his dried up and flat carapace, swept up as rubbish. Interestingly, Kay's transformed protagonist is also equipped with a shell,[3] but this one appears to have a value in itself – as a shelter and retreat, a place of one's own and a space for reflection. Doreen's physical limitations such as slowness, clumsiness or heaviness correspond to her transformed tortoise shape but they are inborn features of her incarnation and do not bother her the way they used to. Kay revitalises the act of transmutation and infuses it with invigorating power.

Much of Kafka's novella appears quite bleak in its existential overtones, as what is, frequently overlooked is its humorous aspects. Kafka uses subtle irony or gallows humour which enhances the mood of absurdity of the story. At the discovery of turning into a giant bug, Gregor resolves to "sleep a little longer and forget all this nonsense" (n.p.). His concerns as to whether his affliction will make an apt excuse for missing a day of work or his diagnosis of the transformation as "vertigo" or "silliness" caused by insufficient sleep, take away much of the initial horror. A matter-of-fact narration, devoid of any emotional impact, seems hardly adequate to the nightmarish incident. The character of a charwoman, who treats the huge insect as if it were a family pet, is another example of Kafka's predilection for the absurd: "At first she would call to him as she did so with words that she probably considered friendly, such as 'come on then, you old dung-beetle!,' or 'look at the old dung-beetle there!'" (n.p.). A similar effect is achieved by the use of understatements in "Shell," where the protagonist blames her back sensations on excessive gardening or refers to her transformed shape as an encumbrance. Kay also injects her story with subtly ironic comments: "Louis […] put his arm around a bit of her. He didn't comment on her shell. Whether he noticed it and was being polite, or whether he hadn't yet noticed, she couldn't tell" (154). There is also a lot of situational humour in Doreen's struggle to reconcile her newly-acquired identity with her chores. Having grazed on buttercups, "she finds some shade and lies down to sleep. The alarm clock is with her; she places it at her side in the middle of the grass and sets it for half an hour before Louis will come home" (151). Since both stories are narrated in free indirect speech, the reader has access to the characters' thoughts, feelings, and subjective experience; yet, both narratives reflect a slightly distorted perception on the side

of the protagonists. Their new incarnations also alter their field of vision, which becomes, by necessity, fragmented. The reader is then kept at bay, and should be wary of any simplistic interpretations with regard to the protagonists' choices and decisions.

6. Conclusion

As Nancy Diaz notices, "metamorphosis represents the conjunction of self and the world, and it plays out the individual's conflict with […] the values of that world" (10). Franz Kafka's troubled story was his response to the anxieties of the modern era: an oppressive institutional system, dehumanised family relations, and an enduring sense of estrangement. Almost a century later, Jackie Kay revisits Kafka's concept in order to expose contemporary social ailments, among which persecution of otherness is in her view particularly acute. Her protagonist's voice represents the excluded ones, whose size, looks, colour, and gender are at odds with social uniformity. Her rewriting of *The Metamorphosis* skilfully plays with the characteristic style of Kafka's masterpiece: a sober, factual and understated account of extraordinary incidents, highly subjective focalisation, gallows humour and fragmented narration, which reflects the protagonist's distress and impaired vision. Kay's subversive revision, which provides an insight into the plight of a marginalised individual, provokes a reflection upon the ruthless treatment of differences in society. In a subversively light-hearted way, it re-directs the notion of monstrosity from the persecuted individual upon the judgemental community.

Notes

1   Kay also explores the figure of metamorphosis in her novel *Trumpet* (1998), where the protagonist, a black Scottish musician, posthumously turns out to be a woman. In an extremely inventive way, Kay challenges the rigid preconceptions about sexuality, gender, and ethnicity, making the reader wonder about the essentialist approach to social categorisations.

2   In the vast body of Kafka criticism, the interpretative works on *The Metamorphosis* focus primarily on the above critical approaches. The particularly insightful Marxist outlook on the novella appears in Walter Sokel's text "From Marx to Myth: The Structure and Function of Self-Alienation in Kafka's *Metamorphosis*" (1983), where the author refers to Gregor Samsa's plight as breadwinner as an example of self-alienation, resulting from his exploitation by both his employers and his family. Sokel also situates Gregor in the broader context of the Marxist myth, drawing a parallel between his sacrifice for the family and the proletariat's position as the scapegoat of humanity. In her

article "Transforming Franz Kafka's *Metamorphosis*" (1989), Nina Pelikan Straus departs from a psychoanalytical reading of a father-son conflict towards a feminist outlook, perceptively noticing the reversal of gender roles triggered by Gregor's transmutation and the exchange of female/male prerogatives between Grete and her brother.

3   Interestingly, Laura Backstrom's paper (2012) quotes a severely overweight woman who refers to her condition as "living in a shell."

References

Backstrom, Laura. 2012. "From the Freak Show to the Living Room: Cultural Representations of Dwarfism and Obesity." *Sociological Forum* 27.3: 682–707.

Bloom, Harold, ed. 2010. *Franz Kafka*. New York: Infobase Publishing.

Bogdan, Robert. 1996. "The Social Construction of Freaks." *Freakery: Cultural Spectacles of the Extraordinary Body*. Ed. Rosemarie Garland Thomson. New York: New York University Press. 23–37.

Braziel, Jana Evans, and Kathleen LeBesco, ed. 2001. *Bodies Out of Bounds: Fatness and Transgression*. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press.

Diaz, Nancy Gray. 1988. *The Radical Self: Metamorphosis to Animal Form in Modern Latin American Narrative*. Columbia: University of Missouri Press.

Gallagher, David. 2009. *Transformation of the Body and the Influence of Ovid's Metamorphoses on Germanic Literature of the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries*. Amsterdam: Rodopi.

Grosz, Elisabeth. 1996. "Intolerable Ambiguity: Freak as/at the Limit." *Freakery: Cultural Spectacles of the Extraordinary Body*. Ed. Rosemarie Garland Thomson. New York: New York University Press. 55–68.

Kafka, Franz. 2002. *The Metamorphosis*.
http://www.gutenberg.org/files/5200/5200-h/5200-h.htm

Kay, Jackie. 2002. "The Shell." *Why Don't You Stop Talking*? Basingstoke and Oxford: Picador. 135–155.

Korzeniowska, Aniela. 2018. "Extinction by Jackie Kay, and Anger." *Polish Scholars on Scottish Writers: An Interpretative Collage*. Ed. Aniela Korzeniowska and Izabela Szymańska. Warszawa: Wydawnictwo Naukowe Semper. 135–143.

Moon, Michaelle, and Eve Kosofsky Sedgwick. 2001. "Divinity: A Dossier, a Performance Piece, a Little-Understood Emotion." *Bodies Out of Bounds: Fatness and Transgression*. Ed. Jana Evans Braziel and Kathleen LeBesco. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press. 292–328.

Pelikan Straus, Nina. 1989. "Transforming Franz Kafka's Metamorphosis." *The Metamorphosis. Signs* 14.3: 651–667.

Skulsky, Harold. 1981. *Metamorphosis: The Mind in Exile*. Cambridge, Massachusetts and London: Harvard University Press.

Sokel, Walter, H. 1983. "From Marx to Myth: The Structure and Function of Self-Alienation in Kafka's Metamorphosis." *Literary Review* 26: 485–495.

Warner, Marina. 2002. *Fantastic Metamorphoses, Other Worlds: Ways of Telling the Self*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Mark Ó Fionnáin
https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3345-8475
The John Paul II Catholic University of Lublin

Scottish Gaelic in Peter Simon Pallas's
Сравнительные Словари

Abstract

In the 1780s a multilingual dictionary was issued in Saint Petersburg, edited by the German Peter Simon Pallas (1741–1811). It was a comparative dictionary, containing almost 300 words in Russian and their equivalents in 200 languages and dialects from all over the world. Amongst those to be found within is Scottish Gaelic. This dictionary thus offers a brief snapshot of Scottish Gaelic from the 1700s seen through the prism of Cyrillic and this article aims to present some background history of the dictionary itself, and to show how Scottish Gaelic is presented in the text.

Keywords: Scottish Gaelic, Cyrillic, Pallas, linguistics, lexicography

1. The History of the Dictionary

Pallas's comparative dictionary really began several years previously when Ludwig Christian Bacmeister (1730–1806) published his *Объявленіе и Прошеніе касающіяся до Собранія Разныхъ Языковъ въ Примѣрахъ* ['An Announcement and Request Concerning the Gathering of Various Languages in Examples'] in 1773. Bacmeister was another German living in Saint Petersburg and was at this time a State Councillor and Deputy Librarian at the Imperial Academy. In this pamphlet, Bacmeister asks his acquaintances in science and learning from near and afar to provide him with translations from languages according to the model he provides in the same pamphlet. He issued his publication in four languages – Russian (the language of the Empire), Latin (the old language of science), German (the new language of science) and French (the language of the nobility at that time in Russia) – and forwarded it to cultural institutions all over Europe.

Although Bacmeister was not the first individual to show an interest in comparing vocabularies from various languages, he was one of the first who thought of the idea of compiling a dictionary in which examples of languages the world over would be collated. This was in tune with the (fairly novel) thought at the time that all the languages of the world had one single ancestor, and that common

roots between languages could be found by comparing examples of vocabulary. Some word lists had appeared in print previously in diverse publications giving translations of words in various languages, but Bacmeister's approach, as laid out in his pamphlet, was very much a new model for his time, in that he sets about acquiring his linguistic vocabulary in a scientific manner. His *Объявленіе и Прошеніе* can be divided into three parts. In the first, Bacmeister lays down the best method for recording the phonetics of the linguistic samples obtained, for example that they should be transcribed in French if possible, if not, then in German or another European language known to the collector, but that Latin should be avoided. Furthermore, the sources and the translators and their names should also be recorded, along with their social status and where that particular language is spoken. In the second part of his pamphlet, he gives the list of words and sentences which he wishes to be translated. Amongst these are the numbers 1–22, the tens from 30–100 (including, for some reason, 71, 72 and 99), 200 and 1,000. He then gives 22 sentences, some short, some long, that are also to be translated. These included:

- 10. Носъ по середи лица ['The nose is in the middle of the face']
- 11. У насъ двѣ ноги, и на каждой рукѣ по пяти пальцевъ ['We have two legs and five fingers on each hand']
- 12. Волосы ростутъ на головѣ ['Hair grows on the head']
- 13. Языкъ и зубы во рту ['The tongue and teeth are in the mouth']

As can be seen from the brief examples above, and has been discussed in more detail by Klubkova, some of the sentences are linked by a certain theme (such as parts of the body as in the examples above) whilst others contain several related words (such as 'tongue,' 'teeth' and 'mouth' as in no. 13 above) and thus are not necessarily as quirky as they might appear at first sight.

In the third section of his pamphlet Bacmeister gives the example of one phrase taken from the Bible: "Let everyone be subject to the governing authorities, for there is no authority except that which God has established. The authorities that exist have been established by God" (Romans 13:1), and shows how it was translated from Russian into Arabic, French into Finnish, German into Swedish and Latin into Finnish in an effort to illustrate how translation between disparate languages is possible, even if they do not contain the same turns of phrase or even concepts.

As a result of his request, Bacmeister received a lot of information from various sources – Friedrich von Adelung, in his book on the history of linguistics in Russia in the time of Catherine the Great, states that Bacmeister had in his possession 72 *Ganze Uebersetzungen* ['whole translations'] (including Scottish Gaelic, although it is here listed by Adelung as 'Galisch' whilst in Pallas's *Dictionary* itself it goes under the heading of *Эрзо-Шотландский* ['Scottish

Erse']), 5 *Uebersetzungen einzelner Stücke* ['translations of individual pieces'] and 24 *Wörterverzeichnisse und Sprachbemerkungen* ['indices of words and language notes'] (Adelung 26–31) – but for unknown reasons nothing came of it.

Regarding the source for Scottish Gaelic, Adelung notes that Bacmeister got it "von Pennant, durch Pallas" ['by Pennant, *via* Pallas']. Presumably this 'Pennant' is Thomas Pennant (1726–1798), the famous Welsh traveller and naturalist who travelled the British Isles and Europe and who wrote about his journeys in Scotland in the late 1700s, namely *A Tour in Scotland* and *A Tour in Scotland and Voyage to the Hebrides 1772*. Both books contain some original verses in, and translations to and from, Scottish Gaelic, as well as a selection of Gaelic proverbs. As there is no separate Gaelic vocabulary list in these publications, Pennant must thus have provided an independent list of words which Bacmeister received via Pallas and with whom he was already acquainted. It so happens that Pallas and Pennant had also both known each other for some time: as Pennant had travelled all over Europe as well as the British Isles he had encountered Pallas on his voyages. They had even agreed to co-write a book together but Pallas was called away, leaving behind an outline sketch of the proposed work and leaving Pennant to complete the book proper. The result – *Synopsis of Quadrupeds* – eventually came out in the year 1771 (Pennant 7–8).

It is also worth noting at this juncture that there is no Scots given in the Dictionary: the list of the Germanic languages given in the dictionary is as follows: [по] Готӥйски ['[in] Gothic'], Англо-Саксонски ['Anglo-Saxon'], Аглинкси ['English'], Тевтонски ['Teutonic'], Нижне-Германски ['Lower German'], Германски ['German'], Цимбрски ['Tsimbrski'] (= Cimbrian, the German dialects spoken in Italy), Датски ['Danish'], Исландски ['Icelandic'], Шведски ['Swedish'], Голландкси ['Dutch'] and Фризски ['Frisian']. It might thus appear that Scots would not seem to have qualified as either a language in its own right or as a dialect of English proper, at least in the opinion of Pallas. However, Adelung, in his list of the linguistic material that Bacmeister had in his possession, states that there are whole translations of Bacmeister's list in both 'Galisch' and 'Schottisch', and that 'Schottisch' was also provided by Pennant *via* Pallas. It would thus seem that if 'Galisch' means (Scottish) Gaelic, then 'Schottisch' must be taken to mean Scots and that, therefore, material in Scots was at least received and made available for the dictionary but, for some unknown reason, it was not deemed worthy enough to be included in the enterprise.

Although nothing concrete ever arose from his research, Bacmeister's material did not go to waste. Catherine the Great (1729–1796), who was Empress of the Russian Empire at this time, had earlier also expressed an interest in a comparative dictionary of all languages, initially of those of her Empire, and thus appointed Peter Simon Pallas to the task of compiling one, based, to a certain degree, on Bacmeister's initial work. Pallas was already well known to Catherine the Great when she appointed him. He was a doctor and naturalist, he had published

extensively on his journeys throughout the Russian Empire, he had explored Siberia and had spent seven years exploring the north and east of Asia (and which was the reason he never got around to writing the book with Pennant). He was an expert on Siberian and Mongolian flora and fauna and, even though he had no linguistic experience, it was he who was chosen to take charge of the planned dictionary.

Pallas's completed dictionary came out under the Latin title of *Linguarum Totius Orbis Vocabularia Comparativa* or, in Russian, *Сравнительные Словари Всѣхъ Языков и Нарѣчій* ['Comparative Vocabularies of Every Language and Dialect']. The first part was issued in 1787 and the second two years later. Only 500 copies were printed and they were mainly distributed amongst foreign ambassadors and diplomats. This first volume of two parts, despite its ambitious title, only contained languages from Europe, Asia and the "southern Islands"; those of Africa and America were intended to appear in a second volume which never appeared, although preliminary work was set in motion. A second edition of the dictionary was issued in 1790, however, but in this case the words in all of the languages were listed in (Russian) alphabetical order which, whilst making it easier to see whether there existed any patterns between languages and their vocabulary, was of no use if one wished to look up a particular word in a given language.

2. The Layout of the *Сравнительные Словари*

Regarding the dictionary itself, there are around 900 pages altogether, excluding the introduction (first in Latin, then in Russian) and the notes on the languages contained, and every page is divided into two columns. There are 273 basic headwords and, as an appendix, there are the numbers 1–10, 100 and 1,000. The Russian headword is given at the top of each column and then there follows the translations in the 200 languages and dialects, except in the case of the numbers where it increases to 222. The translations on each page are listed according to numbers, followed by the name of the language and the headword in that language.

The words, for the most part, can be divided into themes. They start with the two most important concepts at that time, namely *Богъ* ['God'] and *небо* ['heaven'], followed by:

- family members (numbers 3–15, such as 'father,' 'mother,' 'son,' 'daughter')
- parts of the body (16–47, e.g. 'face,' 'nose,' 'hand' etc.)
- the senses (48–53)
- abstract concepts to do with people's lives (54–74, for example 'love,' 'life,' 'marriage,' 'work' etc.),
- nature (75–112, e.g. 'sun,' 'wind,' 'rain' 'river' and so forth).

The second part covers:

- plants and their parts (126–143, such as 'wood,' 'tree,' 'leaves,' 'fruit' etc.)
- animals (144–164, e.g. 'fish,' 'fly,' 'bull' etc.)
- household and farming (165–178, e.g. 'house,' 'door,' 'city' etc.)
- colours and adjectives describing people (201–217, e.g. 'black,' 'white,' 'light,' 'good' etc.)
- verbs (227–246, such as 'eat,' 'drink,' 'sleep' etc.)
- pronouns and prepositions (247–273, for example 'I,' 'you,' 'on,' 'under' etc.)
- the numbers 1–10, 100 and 1,000

along with a good selection of other words that are not particularly easy to label or classify.

Of all the languages and dialects in the dictionary the first twelve places are taken up by the Slavic family and the second set of places by the Celtic. This list starts with 'Celtic,' *По Кельтски* ['in Celtic'], although it is unclear what this 'Celtic' actually is and Adelung has no mention of any 'Celtic' amongst Bacmeister's papers, at number 13, *По Бретански* ['in Breton'], number 14, *По Ирландски* ['in Irish'], number 16, *По Эрзо-Шотландски* ['in Scottish Erse'], number 17, *По Валски* ['in Welsh'], number 18, and *По Корнвалски* ['in Cornish'], number 19. Manx is thus the only Celtic and Gaelic language missing. Number 15 is occupied by Basque, by which Pallas states he means that which is spoken in France, not in Spain. This would seem to be a decision taken under the influence of the thought prevalent at that time, namely that the Basques of France were somehow linked to the Celts, unlike those of Spain whose language was to be covered in the second volume which never came about. Proof of this opinion can still be seen in the 1830s in, for example, John Reid's work where he lists Basque as one of the "dialects" of Celtic (Reid ix; and also see Igartua), although this division of Basque into two 'separate' languages was one of the criticisms levelled by Kraus at Pallas (Bulich 229) – although not that Basque is not Celtic. Pallas also provides a list of lexicographical sources he used for his 'Celtic,' 'Gothic' and 'Anglo-Saxon' vocabularies, a list which includes Lhuyd's 1707 work *Archaeologia Brittannica* and Bullet's *Dictionaire Celtique* from 1759 amongst other works, but as he also claims in his introduction that the first 47 languages in the dictionary – and, thus, Scottish Gaelic – were based on the materials Bacmeister gathered, it is unclear what part these other dictionary sources might have played in Pallas's vocabulary lists, especially in relation to Gaelic, for which Bacmeister had received original material.

Any analysis of the Scottish Gaelic words – or, indeed, those of any language – given in the dictionary is complicated by the fact that they are written in Cyrillic, which might seem somewhat obvious, as the dictionary was compiled for a Russian

readership. However, Pallas acknowledged that Cyrillic was not without its faults regarding the representation of other languages. He writes in his introduction that, although there is no better system of transliterating words from near and afar than Cyrillic, some modifications had to be made and, to this end, Pallas took it upon himself to modify the sounds of the Russian letters in the transcriptions of the foreign vocabulary by adding extra information as to what foreign sounds they represent and how they should be pronounced ("Explicatio litteraram Alphabeti Roſſici"), for example, *Γ* was to stand for /h/ "aspiranti graecorum et *H h* germanorum atque latinorum anologa," *Э* for *Ö* or *Œ* "germanorum et latinorum" and *Ѳ* "ut eadam graecorum littera vel uti *th* anglorum." However, this was not always successfully applied, as can be seen from several Scottish Gaelic examples. In the case of words such as *athair*, *briathar* or *fiodh*, the same Russian letter that Pallas notes is to be pronounced as the English dental /θ/, i.e. Ѳ, is used to represent the Gaelic digraph ‹th› which, however, is pronounced as /h/. This results in the following Cyrillic "transcription" of the three Gaelic examples given above as *аѳеръ* /aθer/, *брїаѳаръ* /bri:aθar/ and *фїоѳъ* /fi:oθ/.[1] This thus implies to the Russian reader that the English dental /θ/ is to be heard in Gaelic words in the second half of the 18th century, even though it is generally accepted that this sound had been lost in Common Gaelic by the 13th century (McManus 351), and therefore it is most unlikely that it still existed in Scottish Gaelic five hundred years later. Regarding the unsuitability of Cyrillic for realising the phonetics of the world's languages, Muradova (146) claims that this makes any analysis of the Celtic entries moot, as it is too difficult to draw any conclusions about the orthography at that time. Despite this, conclusions have been drawn about some of the Celtic languages, namely Breton (Gargadennec and Laurent, and on which Muradova based her own very brief article), and Irish (Ó Fionnáin), and, as such, bearing in mind the foregoing, it is worth looking at the Scottish Gaelic entries in the dictionary.

3. Scottish Gaelic in the *Сравнительные Словари*

Scottish Gaelic in the Dictionary is one of the best represented languages, in that there is a translation for almost every one of the 285 words and numbers given, unlike some of the other European languages: entry 166 *борона* ['harrow'] is the only entry for which Scottish Gaelic is lacking. Sometimes there is also more than one option offered: e.g. *жизнь* ['life'] is explained as all of *беаѳа*, *анамъ*, *саогалъ* [/beaθa/ /anam/ /saogal/ = 'beatha,' 'anam,' 'saoghal'] or *холмъ* 'hill' as *тулахъ, кноканъ, томанъ* [/tulax/, /knokan/, /toman/ = 'tulach,' 'cnocan,' 'toman'].

Amongst the Scottish Gaelic words in the dictionary there are those which are:

3.1. Phonetically Correct

These are words which were transcribed according to their sounds and which are (relatively) correct: words which, as far as possible, give a correct Gaelic pronunciation and which can thus be recognised without too much effort. These include:

- Богъ ['god'] – дїа /di:a/ = Dia
- мужъ ['husband'] – ферпозда /ferpozda/ = fear-pòsta
- волосъ ['hair'] – фолтъ /folt/ = falt
- горло ['throat'] – скорнанъ /skornan/ = sgòrnan
- зубъ ['tooth'] – фїакулъ /fi:akul/ = fiacaill
- локоть ['elbow'] – уйланъ /ujlan/ = uileann
- сонъ '[sleep]' – кодалъ, суанъ /kodal/ /suan/ = cadal, suan

3.2. Phonetically Incorrect

These are words which were written down incorrectly for various reasons. Amongst these are:

a) A slender ‹s›, i.e. /ʃ/, is written as broad, i.e. /s/, giving, for example:

- время ['time'] – аимсаиръ /aimsair/ = aimsir
- вода ['water'] – уизге /uizge/ = uisge

b) Cases in which a Gaelic letter and an English letter (and possibly a similar-looking Russian one) were confused with each other, for example the Gaelic ‹c› /k/ and ‹ch› /x/ being confused with their English equivalents which are usually pronounced as /s/ and /ʧ/, or the letter ‹c› being mistaken for an ‹e›. Another issue is where pairs of letters, e.g. ‹bh› are taken as separate letters with one sound each and thus transcribed, as opposed to one digraph producing one sound between them. Amongst the many misspellings in Cyrillic are:

- дѣва ['virgin'] – чаиллэгъ /ʧaillœg/ = c[h]aileag
- голова ['head'] – ченъ /ʧen/ = c[h]eann
- овесъ ['oats'] – коирце /koirtse/ = coirce
- яицо ['egg'] – убгъ /ubh/ = ubh / ugh
- домъ ['house'] – тиггъ /tigh/ = taigh
- бѣло ['white'] – сїоннъ /si:onn/ = fionn (in this case, presumably the old long ‹s›, i.e. ‹ʃ›, was mistaken for ‹f›)
- толстъ ['fat'] – рамгаръ /ramhar/ = reamhar

c) Words where the initial mutation was preserved. It is unclear whether this was a result of the transcription, i.e. the transcriber saw the words written down and copied them without question and accepted the mutated word as it was, or else whether there was an oral source and, again, the mutated words were accepted unquestioningly in the context they appeared in. Examples of mutated words in the dictionary include:

- сестра ['sister'] – фїуѳаръ /fi:uθar/ = [an] p[h]iuthar
- носъ ['nose'] – тзронъ /tzron/ = [an t-]sròn
- весна ['spring'] – теappaxъ /tearrax/ = [an t-]earrach

d) At times the letter ‹h› was omitted. This is a frequent occurrence in the Irish language entries in the dictionary, but this is presumably due to the fact that the transcriber of the Irish words was unaware of the Irish manuscript style used for writing Irish at the time where a dot over the preceding letter represented the letter ‹h›. However, as Scottish Gaelic has always been written with the Roman alphabet, and thus the letter ‹h› cannot be easily overlooked, it is not clear how some of these Gaelic words are lacking ‹h›, as can be seen in the examples below:

- языкъ ['tongue'] – тэнгадъ /tœngad/ = teangadh
- бракъ ['marriage'] – посадъ /posad/ = pòsadh
- вѣтрь ['wind'] – гаотъ /gaot/ = gaoth
- земля ['land'] – таламъ /talam/ = talamh
- дерево ['tree'] – краобъ /kraob/ = craobh
- черно ['black'] – дубъ /dub/ = dubh
- рука '[hand'] – лямъ /lʲam/ = làmh

3.3. Confused Words

Whereas most of the examples offered above can be guessed at and worked out with somewhat minimal effort, there are some which require more of an attempt, such as the following:

- вихрь ['whirlwind'] – гаотжуртэнъ /gaotʒurtœn/ [gaoth chuartain?]
- виноградъ ['vine, grape'] – бїондгэре /bi:ondhœre/ [fiondhearc?]
- быкъ ['ox'] – дѣмъ /dʲem/ [damh?]
- ровъ ['ditch'] – блэдгэжамъ /blœdhœʒam/ (possibly meant to be *claodhui-cham* 'to ditch' or *cladhaigheam* 'to dig': see the relevant contemporary entries in Shaw)

And then there are those that, at the moment, have utterly failed to be deciphered, probably due to confusion amongst both letters and sounds, for example:

• жито ['rye'] – эрвґефъ /œrvhef/ (the Gaelic is *seagal*)

4. Conclusion

It is clear that there are some major problems with Pallas's work as a source of Scottish Gaelic from the 18th century. The entries have many mistakes: mutated consonants left in where they should not have been, or omitted (as in the case of ‹h›) where they should have been included; the incorrect transcription of the digraph ‹th› as /θ/, thus implying that this sound survived in Gaelic centuries after it had actually died out; the confusion of broad and slender ‹s›, i.e. /s/ and /ʃ/; none of which are made any the easier to recognise due to the use of the Cyrillic alphabet. It is also not clear when such mistakes were made – in the original list sent by Pennant or when they were being transcribed into Russian. Despite all of these caveats, there is still linguistic and lexicographical worth in the Scottish Gaelic as it is presented in the work, as it does help show the words in common use at the time and, in the case of those more puzzling entries, there might be more information to come if only the code can be broken or, indeed, if Pennant's original list were to be examined.

Notes

1   These and all following IPA renditions are based on Pallas's own guide on how to read the Cyrillic. The English translations of the Russian words are those given by Pallas himself.

References

Adelung, Friedrich von. 1815. *Catherinens der Grossen Verdienste um die Vergleichende Sprachenkunde*. St. Petersburg: Freidrich Drechsler.

Bacmeister, Ludwig. 1773. *Объявленіе и Прошеніе Касающіяся до Собранія Разныхъ Языковъ въ Примѣрахъ*. Saint-Petersburg: Typis Academiae Scientiarum.

Bulich, Sergey (Буличъ, Сергей). 1904. *Очеркъ Исторіи Языкознанія въ Россіи*. Saint-Petersburg: M. Merkushev.

Gargadennec, Roger, and Charles Laurent. 1968. "Le dictionnaire breton de Catherine de Russie." *Annales de Bretagne* 75.4: 789–833.

Igartua, Iván. 2009. "Euskara Hizkuntza Zeltikoa Zenean: Oharra XVIII. Mendeko Uste Genetikoez." *Anuario del Seminario de Filogía Vasca "Julio de Urquijo"* XLIII.1–2: 531–538.

Klubkova, Tatyana. 2016. "The First Russian Linguistic Questionnaire." *Bulletin of the Kalmyk Institute for Humanities of the Russian Academy of Sciences* 23.1: 181–188.

McManus, Damien. 1994. "An Nua-Ghaeilge Chlasaiceach." *Stair na Gaeilge in ómós do: P[h]ádraig Ó Fiannachta*. Ed. Liam Breatnach, Kim McCone, Damien McManus, Cathal Ó Háinle, and Nicholas Williams. Maigh Nuad: Coláiste Phádraig. 335–446.

Muradova, Anna. 2006. "Some Breton words in the Dictionary of the Russian Empress." *Parallels between Celtic and Slavic*. Ed. Séamas Mac Mathúna and Maxim Fomin. Belfast: The Stationery Office. 143–148.

Ó Fionnáin, Mark (in print). "An Ghaeilge trí shúile an Rúisigh sna 1780í: *Сравнительные Словари* Peter Simon Pallas." *Éigse* 41.

Pallas, Peter Simon. 1787, 1789. *Сравнительные Словари Всѣхъ Языков и Нарѣчій*. Saint-Petersburg: Typis Iohannis Caroli Schnoor.

Pennant, Thomas. 1793. *The Literary Life of the Late Thomas Pennant by Himself*. London: Benjamin White.

Reid, John. 1832. *Bibliotheca Scoto-Celtica; or, an Account of all the Books Which Have Been Printed in the Gaelic Language*. Glasgow: John Reid & Co.

Shaw, William. 1780. *A Galic and English Dictionary: Containing All the Words in the Scotch and Irish Dialects of the Celtic that Could be Collected from the Voice, and Old Books and Mss*. London: W. and A. Strahan.

The first word in the *Сравнительные Словари*, i.e. 'God.'
Scottish Gaelic is at number 17.

I. БОГЪ.

1	По Славянски	-	БогЪ.	34	ПоНижне-Германски	ГодЪ.
2	—Славяно - Венгер-			35	—Германски	ГоштЪ.
		ски	БугЪ.	36	—Цимбрски	ГиштЪ.
3	—Иллирїйски		БоогЪ.	37	—Датски	ГудЪ.
4	—Богемски		Бу.	38	—Исландски	ГудЪ.
5	—Сербски	- -	БогЪ.	39	—Шведски	ГудЪ.
6	—Вендски	- -	БогЪ.	40	—Голландски	ГодтЪ.
7	—Сорабски		БогЪ.	41	—Фризски	ГодЪ.
8	—Полабски		БусацЪ.	42	—Литовски	ДїэвасЪ.
9	—Кашубски		БогЪ.	43	—Лашышски	ДэсЪ.
10	—Польски	- -	БогЪ.	44	—Кривинго - Ли-	
11	—Малороссїйски		БигЪ.		вонски	ДїэвасЪ.
12	—Суздальски	-	СтодЪ.	45	—Албански	Перенди.
13	—Кельшски		Дїу, Ю.	46	—Волошски	Думнезеу.
14	—Брешански	-	Дуэ, Доэ.	47	—Венгерски	Иштень,
15	—Басконски	-	ДувЪ,ЮнЪ,Яинс,	48	—Аварски	- БечасЪ.
			Яинкоа, ЭнкоаꞋ.	49	—Кубачински	БечасЪ.
16	—Ирландски	-	Иꙗ.	50	—Лезгински, рода	
17	—Эрзо - Шошланд-				АицугЪ	БедшётЪ.
		ски	Дїа.	51	——р. ДжарЪ	- БедшётЪ.
18	—Валски	- -	Дїу.	52	——р. ХунзагЪ	БеджётЪ.
19	—Коривалски	-	Дсу.	53	——р. Дидо	- БедиштЪ.
20	—Еллински	-	ѲеосЪ.	54	—Чюхонски	Юмала.
21	—Ново-Гречески		ѲеосЪ.	55	—Эсшландски	ЮммалЪ.
22	—Лашински	-	ДеусЪ.	56	—Корельски	Юмала.
23	—Ишалїански	-	Дїо.	57	—Олонецки	ЮмалЪ.
24	—Неаполишански		Длїо.	58	—Лопарски	ЮбмелЪ, ИбмелЪ
25	—Испански	-	ДїосЪ.	59	—Зырянски	ІенЪ.
26	—Портульски		ДеосЪ.	60	—Пермякски	ІенЪ-лэнЪ.
27	—Роменски и дре-			61	—Мордовски	ПаасЪ.
	вне-Французски	ДеуЪ, ДексЪ, Дї-		62	—Мокшански	Шкай, ШкипаасЪ
		едЪ,	ДїорЪ.	63	—Черемиски	Юму.
28	—Ново-Французски	Дїа.	64	—Чювашски	Тора.
29	—Валлезански	-	Ди.	65	—Вошяцки	ИнмарЪ.
30	—Гошїйски	-	ГуфЪ.	66	—Вогульски, по р.	
31	—Англо-Саксонски	ГодЪ.			Чюссовой	ТаромЪ,СаирснгЪ-
32	—Аглински	-	ГодЪ.			ТаромЪ. (*)
33	—Тевшонски	-	ГошЪ, КошЪ,			
			КуошЪ, ДїсшЪ.			

(*) То есть: свѣшлой сіяніе: идолЪ у Вог-
гуличь называешся ШашшанЪ.

A

Petra Johana Poncarová
https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7021-1661
Charles University, Prague

Derick Thomson and the Ossian Controversy

Abstract

This paper focuses on Derick Thomson's engagement with the Ossian controversy and maps his contributions, both scholarly and popularising, and the development of his attitudes. As the Gaelic dimension of the Ossian controversy still tends to be overlooked and many contributors to the debate exhibit very little awareness of it, a survey of Thomson's scholarship provides numerous relevant impulses for further research. Moreover, since many aspects of Thomson's career have not received due attention, this essay also strives to provide more understanding of Derick Thomson as a scholar.

Keywords: Derick Thomson (Ruaraidh MacThòmais), James Macpherson, Ossianic poetry, Ossian controversy, Scottish Gaelic studies

1. Introduction

To this day, the chief association with "the poems of Ossian" would likely be "the famous fraud," "the great hoax." Such opinions can be heard from students and even scholars working in Scottish and British literature: Ossianic poetry is a scam and James Macpherson was a cunning trickster who has been rightfully exposed by apostles of truth. This label all too often means that a vastly important phenomenon with momentous impact on European literature and art in the 18th and 19th centuries is omitted from course syllabi, conference programmes, and general discourse. In terms of research, the situation has been changing, mostly due to the gradual rise of Scottish and Scottish Gaelic Studies as a field – one such hopeful sign is the publication of the *International Companion to James Macpherson and the Poems of Ossian* (Scottish Literature International, 2017) – but there is still much to be done.

But whose perception has been shaping the views of Macpherson and Ossian? More people would likely list Samuel Johnson or Hugh Trevor Roper among their influences, if they were able to cite a specific name, rather than John Francis Campbell or Derick Thomson, proving once more that until recently commentators with little or no knowledge of the language and cultural context could enjoy prestige and recognition as experts on Scottish Gaelic matters (and in some cases

this still holds true).[1] An exceptionally exciting chapter in Scottish and European cultural history has thus been put aside, labelled a fraud, with the debate revolving around the axis of fraudulence/authenticity, and the opinions of scholars who actually had a profound knowledge of the subject and tended to express a balanced opinion, neither blackening Macpherson nor extolling him, unfortunately enjoying much less currency.

2. Derick Thomson and His Ground-Breaking Reseach into the Ossian Contribution

One of the greatest contributors to Ossian scholarship in the 20th century was Derick S. Thomson (1921–2012, Ruaraidh MacThòmais in Gaelic).[2] Thomson is acknowledged as one of the best Scottish Gaelic poets of the 20th century and has been described as the father of modern Gaelic publishing and a man who did more for the preservation and development of the Gaelic language than anyone else in the history of the Gael. Thomson grew up in a bilingual family on the Isle of Lewis in the Outer Hebrides and from early on, exhibited a keen interest in poetry, scholarship, and Scottish national independence. He studied at Aberdeen and at Cambridge and enjoyed a long and respected career as a scholar and academic. He was appointed Assistant in Celtic at the University of Edinburgh in 1948 and moved to Glasgow in 1949 to take up a newly established lectureship in Welsh. The most substantial academic outcome of his interest in Welsh language and literature was a highly acclaimed edition of *Branwen Uerch Lyr* (1961, Dublin Institute of Advanced Studies), the second of the four branches of the Mabinogion.

In 1956, he was appointed Reader in Celtic and served as the Head of the Celtic Department at the University of Aberdeen, where he spent seven years. In 1963, he became Chair of Celtic at the University of Glasgow and held the position for almost thirty years, until his retirement in 1991. As Donald Meek points out,

> his academic hallmark lay pre-eminently in placing Gaelic literature, rather than the minutiae of the language itself, at the centre of his curriculum. The rebalanced programme for Celtic and Gaelic studies was particularly evident at Glasgow where, as Professor, he built a powerful and vibrant department which was at its peak in the 1960s and 1970s, and contributed immensely to the formation of Gaelic teachers, broadcasters, writers and academics. (2012, 18)

Thomson's *Introduction to Gaelic Poetry* (1974) and *The Companion to Gaelic Scotland* (1983, edited) played a pivotal part in making information about Gaelic literature and culture accessible to the English-speaking public and remain both indispensable and so-far unsurpassed. From 1961 to 1976, he edited *Scottish Gaelic Studies* and also served as President of the Scottish Gaelic Text Society (Comunn Litreachas Gàidhlig na h-Alba) and prepared some of its volumes, such

as *The MacDiarmid MS Anthology* (1992) and selected poems of Alasdair Mac Mhaighstir Alasdair (1996). The works of the great 18th-century poet were one of Thomson's lifelong research interests, the other being Macpherson's Ossian. Both these topics have an important European and political dimension, which is probably one of the reasons why Thomson was attracted to them in the first place.

His first and ground-breaking contribution to the field was the book based on the thesis which he submitted as the conclusion of his degree in Anglo-Saxon, Norse and Celtic at Cambridge, entitled simply *The Gaelic Sources of Macpherson's "Ossian"* (1952). The title itself makes an important and radical statement – it suggests that there were Gaelic sources Macpherson could use and that he did use them. A similar point was made already by the great 19th-century folklore collector John Francis Campbell[3] in the introduction to the fourth volume of his *Popular Tales of the West Highlands* (5–23), but Thomson was the first scholar who undertook the task of identifying the particular passages in specific ballads and devoted a monograph to the subject.

He describes the volume as an "attempt to illustrate Macpherson's manner of working" and "to identify particular sources which he may have used," stressing that the novel point is not the evidence used, but the approach (1952, 9), consisting in "a detailed comparison of Macpherson's texts with authentic Gaelic ballads" (10). His verdict is that it can be proved, conclusively in most cases, that Macpherson used "some fourteen or fifteen ballads" and that "the use he makes of his material varied from ballad to ballad," ranging from passing references in one or two instances to very close engagement in other cases, and that "we can point with some degree of confidence to the exact source or sources which he used" (10). He notes that the merging of motifs and characters from the Ulster cycle and the Fenian cycle, something Macpherson was reproached for, was in fact merely following an existing trend in the popular tradition (11).

Thomson concludes that Macpherson probably arranged his material in his own way, using ideas "against which the reader familiar with Irish and Scottish Gaelic tales is prejudiced," but notes that it is "perhaps not impossible that Macpherson was, in fact, under the impression that he was collecting the 'disjecta membra' of an old Gaelic epic" (12). These findings go against the widespread impression that there were no sources to be employed and that Macpherson "made it all up." The consideration of Macpherson's possible beliefs and motifs is a conjecture, and an acknowledged one at that, but when assessed in the light of the fact that Macpherson must have encountered different versions of the same stories, with recurring motifs and characters, assuming that it all had one source that got corrupted by years of oral and written transmission does not seem such a wild surmise.

In the introduction, Thomson also looks back on the controversy of two hundred years and sums it up with remarkable assurance and clarity, backed by detailed acquaintance with the multiple and often confusing sources, and the

historical and philosophical contexts. He points out that the debate was "misdirected for more than a century," as "the point of issue was taken to be whether there existed Gaelic poems, preferably in ancient MSS, composed by a bard called Ossian in the third century A.D." (3). These clearly did not exist but what did exist were the Ossianic ballads, common throughout the Highlands and Islands in the 18th century and long before. These were, however, treated with contempt by some enquirers into the matter, notably William Shaw, who showed disgust that the evidence produced was largely of an oral nature (3–4). However, these ballads are to be regarded as the much sought-after sources of Macpherson's publications (5). Thomson thus points out that the controversy was also affected by the dichotomy between the supposedly pristine original and the corrupted copy, the manuscript fetish, and disdain for orally transmitted literature.

Fortunately, not everyone shared William Shaw's attitudes and Thomson stresses that "the Ossianic controversy had the good result of stimulating investigation into the oral traditions of the Highlands, and in the course of this investigation many collections of Ossianic ballads were made, and others which had been made previously were brought to light" (5).

Coming to Thomson's monograph almost seventy years later and glancing over the contents, with chapters such as "Macpherson's debt to Irish historians," "Macpherson's use of his sources," "The Gaelic 'Ossian' of 1807," and "Letters and testimonies bearing on the controversy," it is evident that it elucidates numerous points of continuing widespread confusion. The information is there, but the combination of factors touched upon at the beginning of this essay and the startling lack of attention paid to Thomson's works in general means that it has not reached the audience it should have influenced, namely everyone with a serious interest in Scottish literature in general and the Ossian controversy in particular.

Thomson continued to work on the subject throughout his life. His academic articles on the topic include: "Bogus Gaelic Literature c. 1750 – c. 1820," *Transactions of the Gaelic Society of Glasgow* (Vol. 5, 1958); "Ossian, MacPherson, and the Gaelic World of the Eighteenth Century," *Aberdeen University Review* (Vol. XL, 1963); "Macpherson's Ossian: Ballads to Epics," *The Heroic Process* (Dun Laoghaire, 1987); "Macpherson's Ossian: Ballad Origins and Epic Ambitions," *Religion, Myth, and Folklore in the World's Epics*, ed. Lauri Honko (1990); and "James Macpherson: The Gaelic Dimension," *From Gaelic to Romantic: Ossianic Translations*, ed. F. Stafford and H. Gaskill (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 1998). He discussed the reception of Ossian in Japan in "Oisean san Iapan" ['Ossian in Japan'] in *Gairm* 76 (1971) and contributed the entry "Ossian" to *Cassell's Encyclopaedia of World Literature*, Vol. 1 (1972), to *The Companion to Gaelic Scotland*, ed. Derick Thomson (1983, 1994), and the entry "Macpherson and Ossian" to *A Companion to Scottish Culture*, ed. David Daiches (1981).

In terms of impact, one of the most influential pieces is the summary in *The Companion to Gaelic Scotland*. Thomson edited the volume and contributed many

of the entries. The companion was intended as a handbook of the most important information on Gaelic Scotland in English and the entries are succinct, cutting to the heart of the matter. Given the limited space and the expected impact of the publication, Thomson chose to say the following about Macpherson:

> MacPherson was neither as honest as he claimed nor as inventive as his opponents implied. In *Fingal*, his most elaborate work, we can identify at least twelve passages, some of them fairly lengthy, in which he used genuine Gaelic ballad sources, sometimes specific versions. He used, for example, ballads dealing with Garbh mac Stairn and Manus for the groundwork of his plot, and three other ballads ('Fingal's Visit to Norway,' 'Duan na h-Inghinn' and 'Ossian's Courtship') for important episodes or sub-plots; other ballads were exploited in a more restricted way. He used many names from the ballads, often distorting them violently, and he juggled historical data to suit his own ends. (1994, 189–190)

One cannot say that Thomson seeks to extol Macpherson, he is rather harsh towards him, but even in this harsh tone, he puts forward two crucial points that other supposed experts on the matter refuse to realise – the names of the specific ballads and a description of the different ways Macpherson worked with the Gaelic material.

In all his contributions to Ossian scholarship, Thomson sought to stress one vital aspect of the phenomenon that tended to be overlooked in many contributions, i.e. the Gaelic dimension of the whole affair. His last longer work on the subject, "James Macpherson: The Gaelic Dimension" sums up many of his conclusions. In the essay, Thomson goes back to letters written by people Macpherson was staying with on his return from his collecting trip to the Hebrides and points out that he indeed had in his possession the Book of the Dean of Lismore, one of the most important surviving Gaelic manuscripts. He sums up that "a significant part of the work of creating *Fingal* was taking place in Badenoch in early 1761, with the active collaboration of a Gaelic poet who seems to have been making a fairly accurate translation of passages from *Fingal*, while various authentic Gaelic manuscripts and orally-delivered versions were floating about in the background" (1998, 20–21).

He also returns to the issue of authenticity: "[…] it is clearly established that he used a range of ballads in a number of different ways, sometimes adopting and adapting a plot, sometimes producing a loose translation of a sequence of lines or stanzas, and more often taking names or incidents or references from the Gaelic texts and reproducing variants of these. […] The most detailed use of Gaelic ballads is in *Fingal*, while *Temora* is least indebted to Gaelic sources" (21). Thomson's conclusion is that "Macpherson was acquainted with a good range of Gaelic ballads, and had access to fairly good advice from friends, but relied rather much on his own faulty Gaelic judgement, and in any case had a grand plan which placed his Gaelic sources in a somewhat subsidiary role" (23). In

the closing part of the essay, Thomson notes that "Macpherson's legacy, in the Gaelic context, was a mixed one, generating a significant amount of collecting, literary and even scholarly activity, some dubious literary activity, some political debate, and, more distantly, genuine literary admiration and stimulation" (26). Thomson himself explored the "dubious literary activity" in his essay "Bogus Gaelic Literature c. 1750 – c. 1820," but all the listed categories could still be taken as directions for research in Scottish Gaelic studies.

Thomson also discussed Macpherson in his non-scholarly works, in pamphlets and educational materials he produced in his capacity of Gaelic activist. There are no contradictions in opinions or distortions of previously stated positions, but in contrast to his academic works, Thomson here tends to stress the positive aspects of Macpherson's influence on the Gàidhealtachd and on Scotland as a whole.

In the booklet *Why Gaelic Matters* (1983), which was a publication for popular readership with the aim of strengthening the position of Gaelic in Scotland and boosting Scottish national awareness and self-confidence, Macpherson is mentioned in the brief overview of the history of Gaelic and Thomson sums the whole matter up in the following manner:

> In the mid-eighteenth century, James Macpherson became aware of this strong tradition [of Gaelic ballads], added his own nationalistic interpretation to it, and published his supposed translations as *Fingal* and *Temora* (1761–3). He knew some of the Gaelic ballads and traditions, but invented some himself. His work had a wide-ranging influence on literary fashion at the time, and many European repercussions. (1983, 16)

One of the reasons behind Macpherson's literary efforts was the desire to put Gaelic-speaking Scotland, poverty-stricken and downtrodden in the aftermath of the failed Jacobite rebellions, on the European culture map and to prove that it had an ancient literature and culture worth attention (see for example Stafford). In this, he partly succeeded, and Thomson recognises his importance in the history of Gaelic Scotland, as his publications kindled more interest in all things Gaelic and, perhaps for the first time, managed to make Gaelic Scotland, which was often deemed barbaric, backward, and politically unreliable by the British public and subject to severe post-Culloden repercussions, appealing and "cool" on the European level.

Thomson also wrote a portrait of Macpherson for the children's publication *Ainmeil an Eachdraidh* (The Famous People of History) which he edited and published in 1997 at Gairm, a publishing venture attached to the seminal Gaelic quarterly of the same name that he founded and edited for fifty years. The book, according to the subtitle, presents the lives of twelve people who were famous: "ann an caochladh sheòrsachan eachdraidh, gu h-àraid an Albainn" ['in different manners, especially in Scotland']. It is an interesting medley and Macpherson got the honour to appear alongside his famous countrymen and countrywomen,

such as the inventor James Watt or the great Gaelic poet Mary Macpherson, and a rather random selection of non-Scottish worthies including Michael Faraday and Julius Caesar. The short volume was aimed at older school pupils and likely intended for use in teaching history and Gaelic.

Thomson's account of Macpherson in this children's book is still remarkably balanced, but the focus on the success of Macpherson's efforts and the European impact is even more pronounced than in *Why Gaelic Matters*. The article points out that not many Gaels in history achieved such fame and influence in their time as Macpherson. Thomson mentions the European Ossianic vogue at the time, the translations into various languages, including the more recent ones into Japanese and Russian, implying that the poetry still appeals to readers. He also stresses the fact that thanks to the uproar, more people started to collect old Gaelic poetry and folklore. Importantly, Thomson mentions the fact that he himself learnt nothing about Macpherson in school. The message of the article is that Macpherson created something successful and globally appealing, an immensely important part of the Romantic movement, and that it should be talked about, researched and taught, not ignored as an embarrassment.

3. Conclusion: Thomson's Continuing Relevance and Directions for Future Research

Derick Thomson's contributions to the debate remind us of a number of important points about the Ossian controversy that should be generally known, but regrettably are not: Gaelic Scotland has an old and rich literary tradition; the Ossianic tradition is genuine and existed long before Macpherson; it is well-attested in manuscripts and by later collectors; Macpherson was a native Gaelic speaker; he knew Gaelic traditions from his childhood in Badenoch and drew on existing ballads, but in his publications, he altered them to suit his own purposes and added his own writing to them. He had in his possession genuine old Gaelic manuscripts, some of which have been preserved to our times (and many thanks to his activities, as the Ossianic craze fired by Macpherson's publications persuaded people that old manuscripts had value) and some of which have been lost, so we will probably never get to know their actual contents.

In the Ossianic controversy, especially in the earlier stages although examples can be found even in the latter half of the 20th century, many contributors to the debate came with a pre-existing agenda. With Thomson, who was throughout his life a dedicated Gaelic revivalist and an ardent Scottish nationalist, so one could perhaps expect a certain bias and efforts to further the cause at the expense of research integrity, we find rigorous scholarship, balance, and level-headedness. Different aspects are underlined in Thomson's different contributions, but there are no contradictions and no sudden reversals.

He distinguishes three strains of research into Ossian: the enquiries revolving around authenticity, i.e. focusing on Macpherson's sources and the Gaelic tradition; the evaluation of the intrinsic merits of his publications as literature; and, lastly, the huge field of studies concerned with the impact in the fields of literature, fine arts, and music, literary criticism, folklore collecting, philosophy, and others. There are some directions Thomson indicated but did not pursue, and nowadays, for example with the developing theories of adaptation and translation, fan fiction studies, and other areas, we might be better equipped to do so. For Thomson, Ossian was both a deeply Gaelic and European matter, and there is still much both the public and the academic community can learn from the remarkable corpus of his Ossianic scholarship.

Acknowledgements

Notes

1   One such example is Samuel Johnson himself, whose misguided opinions about various matters pertaining to Gaelic Scotland and its literature were corrected, with great passion and virulence, by the Gaelic-speaking Rev. Donald MacNicol, in his *Remarks on Dr Samuel Johnson's Journey to the Hebrides* (1779), described by Thomson as "a vigorous commentary, which is still full of interest, and which made Dr. Johnson 'growl hideously'" (1952, 7); or Thomas M. Curley, author of the recent deceptively respectable publication *Samuel Johnson, the Ossian Fraud, and the Celtic Revival in Great Britain and Ireland* (Cambridge University Press, 2009), which has been elegantly picked apart by Niall Mackenzie in *Scottish Gaelic Studies* 26 (Summer 2010): 146–154. Hugh Trevor-Roper's claims on the "invention of the Highland tradition," expressed in an essay included in the volume *The Invention of Tradition* (1983, ed. E. Hobsbawm and T. Ranger), still seem to enjoy a good deal of popularity too.

2   The overview of Thomson's life and career is based on his autobiographical essays ("A Man Reared in Lewis" and "Some Recollections") and on Donald Meek's funerary oration and obituary for Thomson – all listed in References.

3   John Francis Campbell (Iain Frangan Caimbeul), also known by the Gaelic nickname Iain Òg Ìleach (1821–1885), was a Celticist, folklore collector and editor, traveller, barrister, courtier to Queen Victoria, and scientific inventor

with strong links to Islay. Apart from the four volumes of influential *Popular Tales of the West Highlands*, he also wrote the study *The Celtic Dragon Myth* (1911) and published the 1872 edition of *Leabhar na Féinne*.

References

Campbell, John Francis. 1984. *Popular Tales of the West Highlands*. Vol. 4. Middlesex: Wildwood House Ltd.

MacThòmais, Ruaraidh [Derick Thomson]. 1997. "Seumas Mac a' Phearsain." *Ainmeil an Eachdraidh*. Ed. Ruaraidh MacThòmais. Glasgow: Gairm.

Meek, Donald. 2012. "Derick Thomson: A Colossus of Twentieth-Century Scotland." *West Highland Free Press* 2086 (20 April): 18.

—. 2013. "Appreciation of Professor Derick S. Thomson: Funeral Oration, as Delivered." *Passages from Tiree* (personal blog).
    http://meekwrite.blogspot.cz/2013/04/appreciation-of-professor-derick-s.html

Stafford, Fiona J. 1988. *The Sublime Savage: A Study of James Macpherson and the Poems of Ossian*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

Thomson, Derick. 1952. *The Gaelic Sources of Macpherson's "Ossian."* Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd.

—. 1979. "A Man Reared in Lewis." *As I Remember: Ten Scottish Authors Recall How Writing Began for Them*. Ed. Maurice Lindsay. London: Robert Hale. 123–140.

—. 1983. *Why Gaelic Matters*. Edinburgh: The Saltire Society.

—. 1994. "James Macpherson." *The Companion to Gaelic Scotland*. Ed. Derick Thomson. Glasgow: Gairm. 189–190.

—. 1998. "James Macpherson: The Gaelic Dimension." *From Gaelic to Romantic: Ossianic Translations*. Ed. Fiona Stafford and Howard Gaskill. Amsterdam and Atlanta: Rodopi. 17–26.

—. 2005. "Some recollections." *Spirits of the Age: Scottish Self Portraits.* Ed. Paul Henderson Scott. Edinburgh: The Saltire Society. 55–67.

Agnieszka Piskorska
https://orcid.org/0000-0002-7297-1776
University of Warsaw

Scotland with a Pinch of Westeros?
The Case of Justin Kurzel's *Macbeth*

Abstract

The paper discusses the resemblance between Shakespeare's play *Macbeth* and its cinematic adaptation directed by Justin Kurzel (2015) with respect to the image of Scotland in the geographical and historical sense. To this end, tools derived from translation studies are employed, such as the notion of intersemiotic translation, interpretive resemblance and interpretants. It is argued that alterations introduced in the adaptation are motivated by psychological reality and coherence of the plot, making the representation of medieval Scotland believable. In this respect, Kurzel's production differs from many other cinematic versions of *Macbeth*, exploiting mostly the universality of the crime and madness motifs.

Keywords: cinematic adaptation, interpretant, intersemiotic translation, relevance theory, resemblance

1. Introduction

Sir Sean Connery, who played Macbeth in a 1961 Canadian TV production, admits that it has a reputation of an unlucky work due to its being "deeply drenched in sorcery." Not daring to utter its real name, actors therefore refer to it as "the Scottish play." Taking into account that *Macbeth*'s Scottishness has often been downplayed or dropped altogether in favour of the universality of the crime-remorse-madness motif, it seems that this name (i.e. "the Scottish play") may not always be applicable, for example when the setting has been moved to an East London social housing estate (theatre performance directed by Felix Mortimer and Joshua Nawras) or feudal Japan (the famous *Throne of Blood* directed by Akira Kurosawa, starring Toshirô Mifune). No wonder then that in her characteristically entitled essay "Out damned Scot: Dislocating Macbeth in transnational film and media culture," Courtney Lehmann claims that in many cinematic productions Scotland becomes "Scotland," "a powerful metonymy for a place that is everywhere and nowhere in particular" (311).

Shot on the Isle of Skye (the Inner Hebrides), with the characters speaking Shakespeare's verse, Kurzel's movie does not dislocate *Macbeth*, thereby creating strong expectations of historical authenticity and fidelity to the original play. Naturally, such expectations do not arise when the main protagonist is a samurai or wears biker boots. As *The Guardian* reviewer Danny Leigh notes, the film's "gimmick there is no gimmick: according to historical record, the setting is the Scotland of 1057, a place of cruel violence where crowns are made from bone and dogs lap at the blood of kings."

Scholars dealing with adaptation (e.g. Stam 2012) tend to undermine a default expectation of maximal similarity to the original text, calling it "the chimera of fidelity" and denying it the status of a methodological principle (75). Drawing on the intertextuality theory by Kristeva, rooted in Bakhtin's dialogism, they prefer to look at the relation between the original and adaptation in terms of "endless permutation of textualities" (Stam 2005, 8). Despite reluctance to recognise any scholarly value in the expectations of faithfulness, it is pervasive among the audience. A possible explanation for this is offered by Venuti, who evokes Bourdieu's notions of elite vs. popular taste. Elite taste requires application of specialised knowledge to appreciate a cultural object per se, which may involve recognising its intertextuality. Popular taste, on the other hand, is catered to by providing the viewer with the possibility of identifying with characters as real people, i.e. by vicarious participation in this object. It might be the case then that the majority of viewers watching *Macbeth* the movie (and other adaptations) represent the popular taste, expecting it to correspond to historical facts and resemble the plot of Shakespeare's play as closely as possible. Even a quick look at Internet forums and social media where viewers express their comments and opinions suggests that indeed such expectations are widespread.

It should be noted that these two layers of expectations may not be easy to satisfy simultaneously, as Shakespeare's vision of medieval Scotland is not accurate to historical detail in the first place. Much as Raphael Holinshed's *Chronicles of England, Scotland and Ireland* were a source of information for Shakespeare, he subsequently transformed it, combining facts from the lives of three Scottish rulers to create Macbeth's character. As Anna Cetera (203) writes in her commentary to *Macbeth*, this "marks the triumph of literary fiction over history" (trans. A.P.) and sheds light on Shakespeare's intentions as a playwright. The bard had a penchant for psychological nuances and, on the practical side, was King James's subject and member of The King's Men. What he wrote had to please the king, who had authored *Daemonologie*, a three-part diatribe against sorcery, claimed descent from Banquo and was married to a Dane. Consequently, Shakespeare tampered with those historical facts that could potentially disconcert the king, such as the role of Banquo in Duncan's murder or Macbeth's victory over the Danes.

All in all, it can be stated that although Shakespeare's aim was to inspire reflection on power and the human mind among his contemporary audiences rather

than chronicle the Scottish past, his image of medieval Scotland is psychologically and historically plausible, which is all that can be expected of a literary work. In the following body of this essay Kurzel's vision will be examined against this background with the help of selected theoretical tools originating from translation studies. The aim of this analysis is at least partially utilitarian, as a film version may be more accessible to secondary school students than a theatrical staging. Judging by some reviews in which Kurzel's *Macbeth* is likened to *The Game of Thrones* and Scotland to Westeros – the fictional location of the blockbuster HBO series (e.g. the *Radio Times* interview), class instructors should perhaps be wary of recommending this picture as a credible representation of Shakespeare's play and medieval Scotland. Or perhaps a "pinch of Westeros" does not threaten the authenticity of Scotland? In what follows an attempt will be made to address this question. First, some general notions on translation and adaptation will be presented, to be subsequently applied in the analyses of selected aspects of *Macbeth*.

2. Adaptation as Translation

In his seminal paper "On Linguistic Aspects of Translation" Roman Jakobson distinguished the category of intersemiotic translation or transmutation (next to interlingual and intralingual translation), defining it as "interpretation of verbal signs by means of signs of non-verbal sign systems" (233). Although not very precise as it stands, this definition opens the possibility of applying translation studies methodology to the analysis of films as adaptations of literary works, an example of which is a film based on a play. The parallels and differences between interlingual and intersemiotic translation should be carefully considered before any further claims are ventured. Naturally, the use of the cinematic mode of presentation itself requires making creative decisions about issues which are not specified in literary texts, such as casting specific actors, intricacies of camerawork, light, etc. Stam is therefore right to observe that "the myth of facility," according to which "the director merely films what's there" (2005, 7) is ill-founded, since many elements are simply not "there" and others need to be creatively transformed to fit the visual medium. Intersemiotic translation is definitely much less restrained by the form of the original than interlingual translation and involves greater responsibility for the final outcome on the part of the filmmakers. That said, it should be kept in mind that the parallel between the two types of translation still holds, as the interlingual translator does not merely translate "what's there" either. According to Venuti (90), both translations and adaptations are "second order creations," and the relation between them and their source texts should be seen as hermeneutical.

Jakobson's tersely formulated definition of intersemiotic translation was developed by Aguiar and Queiroz, who incorporated into it Charles S. Peirce's

concept of a semiotic triad, in which a sign relation is explained in terms of three elements: a sign, its subject matter, referred to as object, and its effect, referred to as interpretant. On one of the possible readings of the sign relation applied to intersemiotic translation, sign is identified with the target text, object with the source text and interpretant with the effect exerted by the target text upon the audience. In this model, then, the relation between the adaptation and the original is construed in mentalistic terms, as it arises as part of the recipient's (a viewer's or a critic's) interpretation of both works. This kind of perspective appears to be the most promising in adaptation analysis and is represented by the two approaches presented below.

One of the most systematic accounts of adaptations applying translation studies methodology has been offered by Lawrence Venuti, according to whom the most important analogy between translation and adaptation is that both are decontextualised and then recontextualised. In the case of adapting a written text to a visual medium, however, these processes have to allow for a greater number of elements constituting the final product (mise-en-scène, directing, acting styles, music, etc.). The many dimensions of filmmaking require decisions on issues which are neither specified nor even capable of being inferred from the text (90).

The notion which is crucial for accounting for the relation between an adaptation and the original is that of an interpretant, a term overlapping in meaning albeit not synonymous with the one introduced by Peirce. Here it is defined as a category that mediates the interpretation process between the source and the target. Venuti distinguishes two kinds of interpretants: formal and thematic, with the former being involved in establishing a relation of equivalence in the content, genre and style and the latter corresponding to codes, values and ideologies that filmmakers may highlight or confront in their communication with an audience (95). Applying the notion of interpretants, the analyst focuses on shifts, additions, omissions and other elements that mark the difference between the original and the adaptation. An illustrative example relevant for the present consideration is that of Franco Zeffirelli's adaptation of *Romeo and Juliet* (1968), in which among the omitted elements were the servants' dialogue about violence in love and sex, and a fragment of Romeo's text in which he reveals his interest in the physical side of love. On the other hand, the characters' eroticism is portrayed through their costumes and a particular manner of taking the shot. According to Venuti, these omissions and shifts point to a thematic interpretant by virtue of which heterosexual love is idealised and romanticised, and so is Romeo and his attitude to Juliet. The filmmakers' decisions are thus not mere alterations of the original play but carefully thought-out moves resulting from the need to recontextualise the story of Romeo and Juliet's relationship in a way consistent with their vision.

The approach to translation developed by Ernst-August Gutt has not been so far extensively applied to adaptation analysis. Drawing on methodology proposed within relevance theory (Sperber and Wilson), Gutt suggests that the relation

between the translation and the original can be captured in terms of interpretive resemblance. This notion was originally put forward with the view to accounting for all uses of language based on resemblance relations, such as – among others – various kinds of quotations. Like quotations, translations can bear different degrees of resemblance to the original utterance. Indirect quotations do not reproduce the exact form of the original message, yet they can be used to communicate the same message effectively. Within the relevance-theoretic framework, interpretive resemblance between utterances or texts is captured in terms of their shared implications, i.e. assumptions the hearer can mentally represent on their basis. Applying this concept to the source text–target text relation, Gutt claims that the translator intending to convey the same message to the target text audience as was communicated by the original produces a target text which preserves the explicatures and implicatures of the source text, where explicatures are understood as assumptions developed on the basis of the linguistic form of an utterance and implicatures are assumptions inferred from the text and context. On the strong reading of this postulate, all explicatures are rendered as explicatures and all implicatures are rendered as implicatures, without any shifts between them. As Gutt himself admits, such a strong expectation of preserving interpretive resemblance can rarely be fulfilled since it is generally impossible to guarantee that readers of different cultural background will arrive at the same implicit meaning of a text. A common practice is therefore to shift information from the implicit to the explicit level (less frequently the other way around; cf. also Vinay and Darbelnet). On the weaker version of the postulate, which seems much more plausible to attain, the expectation is that "the sum total of the explicatures and implicatures of the translation must equal the sum total of the explicatures and implicatures of the original" (Gutt 100). As will be shown below, many of the differences between the original and adaptation can be straightforwardly accounted for as shifts between the explicit and implicit content.

3. *Macbeth*: Interpretants and Interpretive Resemblance

In this section three aspects of the film will be analysed with respect to its hermeneutic relation to the play, namely selected decisions inherent in filmmaking for which there is no basis in the literary text, addition of a scene and an alteration within a well-known element of a plot. The methodology presented in the previous section – the notion of interpretant and the sum total of explicatures and implicatures will be employed in the analysis below.

Decisions which have to be made by filmmakers on a fairly arbitrary basis concern all the visual elements, many of which are scarcely described in stage directions or not described at all. As was mentioned before, *Macbeth* was filmed in Scotland, among the raw beauty of Isle of Skye landscapes, the choice of location

therefore can be seen as neutral, as it does not steer the interpretation away from "the Scottish play." An interesting element of mise-en-scène is Inverness Castle, presented as a wooden building of modest size located on muddy ground, which stands in stark contrast to the magnificent royal Dunsinane Castle shown later. Considered as a formal interpretant, this contrast can be taken to emphasise the difference between Macbeth's position as Thane of Glamis (later of Cawdor) and as King of Scotland, thereby providing a psychologically credible explanation for his greed, ambition and ability to kill Duncan. Only a psychopath does not need any motivation to kill; Macbeth is not one as is evidenced by this monologue, in which he scrutinises Duncan's personality and rule, as well as his own attitude:

> First, as I am his kinsman and his subject,
> Strong both against the deed; then, as his host,
> Who should against his murderer shut the door,
> Not bear the knife myself. Besides, this Duncan
> Hath borne his faculties so meek, hath been
> So clear in his great office, that his virtues
> Will plead like angels, trumpet-tongu'd, against
> The deep damnation of his taking-off;
> And pity, like a naked new-born babe,
> Striding the blast, or heaven's cherubin, hors'd
> Upon the sightless couriers of the air,
> Shall blow the horrid deed in every eye,
> That tears shall drown the wind. I have no spur
> To prick the sides of my intent, but only
> Vaulting ambition, which o'erleaps itself
> And falls on th' other. (Act 1, scene 7)

Using relevance-theoretic terminology, it can be stated that the magnitude of Macbeth's social promotion from thane to king is part of the implicit import of the original play. Learning from Macbeth's words about his doubts and ambition, the reader is encouraged to think that the temptation must have been huge, and that it was the decisive factor that made the protagonist a murderer. The visual contrast between his place of living as thane and his royal seat communicates this assumption explicitly – not only is the viewer encouraged to imagine this difference, but they are given direct evidence of the material property Macbeth gained by becoming King of Scotland.

Another minor visual element closely connected to the previously discussed one is the appearance of the three witches, who look like ordinary peasants rather than practitioners of magic. In other words, there is nothing (or little) in their appearance that would suggest their supernatural power. This in turn can be treated as a thematic interpretant used in order to undermine their credentials, so to speak, as prophets who can foretell the protagonist's future, in this way shifting the burden of responsibility for murder on Macbeth and his wife.

The opening scene shows Macbeth and his wife at the funeral of a child that was a few years old. As is known, the play does not provide any explicit information about their deceased children. On the other hand, all the other protagonists playing significant roles in the plot do have children whose presence is also significant – Banquo's son Fleance was supposed to have been killed with his father, Duncan's sons fled to England and Ireland following their father's murder, and Macduff's children were slaughtered on Macbeth's order. The fact that nothing in the play is said about Macbeth and his wife's children can be treated as an example of "thematic silence" (Kurzon), i.e. withdrawing information about a specific state of affairs which would be highly relevant if communicated. It can be thus hypothesised that if the opening scene is treated as a thematic interpretant, it strengthens the implicit assumption that the protagonists, like numerous other rulers in the Middle Ages, hoped for their dynasty to survive. This interpretant may be seen as indicating that the filmmakers adopted the perspective of historical realism in their production.

Considering Lady Macbeth's obsession with denying her femininity, revealed in the fragment below:

> Come, you spirits
> That tend on mortal thoughts, unsex me here;
> And fill me from the crown to the toe top-full
> Of direst cruelty. make thick my blood,
> Stop up th' access and passage to remorse,
> That no compunctious visitings of nature
> Shake my fell purpose nor keep peace between
> Th' effect and it. Come to my woman's breasts,
> And take my milk for gall, you murd'ring ministers,
> Wherever in your sightless substances
> You wait on nature's mischief. (Act 1, Scene 5)

the opening scene can also be analysed as a formal interpretant, on the assumption that this monologue encourages the reader to infer that Lady Macbeth's obsessive behaviour is caused by the loss of a child in the past. Then, this inference would be realised on the explicit level in the film, constituting the instance of a shift between implicit and explicit communication rather than addition.

The last fragment to be analysed here concerns what is perhaps the best remembered fragment of *Macbeth*, namely the fulfilment of the witches' prophecy:

> Macbeth shall never vanquish'd be until
> Great Birnam wood to high Dunsinane Hill
> Shall come against him. (Act 4, Scene 1)

The original stage directions at the beginning of Act V, Scene 6, announce the arrival of "Malcolm, Siward, Macduff, and their Army, with boughs." The filmmakers

chose to portray this scene differently – the woods are set on fire and wind blows the ashes towards Dunsinane hill, a great alteration as it might seem at first glance. When approached as a formal interpretant, it provides equivalence with the original, by playing the role of a military trick that led to the downfall of Macbeth. Besides, using fire in this scene may be motivated by the need to provide coherence in the movie plot: fire appears on the screen several times, e.g. in the funeral scene and in the scene when Lady Macduff and her children are killed. For a contemporary viewer even superficially familiar with medieval war tactics, burning woods presents a more convincing image than an army of warriors hiding behind boughs. Thus, if treated as a thematic interpretant, the scene can again be seen as a factor highlighting the filmmakers' intention to stick to historical authenticity. In relevance-theoretic terms the relation between the original scene and that deployed in the adaptation can be explained as two different visual images prompting the same inference in the audience, namely that Macbeth was finally outwitted by a trick performed on him, and – as I am inclined to think – that words should not always be understood in their literal sense.

4. Conclusion

This article has addressed the issues of how representative the image of Scotland presented in Justin Kurzel's adaptation of *Macbeth* is for the real Scotland of the Middle Ages and how it corresponds with the original play. Scotland so understood is not only a geographical location, but primarily a medieval state troubled with dynastic fights spurred by ambition and desire to eliminate pretenders from other clans. Although some of the filmmakers' decisions may appear as departures from the original play, possibly motivated by the need to highlight similarity to popular productions such as *Game of Thrones*, a closer analysis indicates that the various additions and alterations play the role of formal and thematic interpretants in the adaptation. Especially significant is the observation made in the analysis that what was considered as thematic interpretants, i.e. the addition of the funeral scene and replacing the army with boughs by fire, points to the filmmakers' intention to enhance the historical credibility of the adaptation. Taking a relevance-oriented stance on the role of interpretants it can be concluded that they tend to mark shifts between implicit and explicit import of the play rather than introduce genuine alterations. Despite superficial differences, this version of *Macbeth* can be said to meet the widespread expectation of realism and fidelity to the original. As was underscored, the perspective adopted in this analysis is that of a viewer and her interpretation of the relation between the play and its adaptation. Needless to say, other viewers may have different interpretations.

References

Aguiar, Daniella, and João Queiroz. 2009. "Towards a Model of Intersemiotic Translation." *The International Journal of the Arts in Society* 4.4: 203–210.

Cetera, Anna. 2011. "Komentarz. *Makbet*." Trans. Piotr Kamiński. Warszawa: WAB. 197–228.

Delgado, Kasia. 2015. "The New *Macbeth* Trailer Looks Like an Episode of *Game of Thrones*." RadioTimes.
https://www.radiotimes.com/news/2015-06-04/the-new-macbeth-trailer-looks-like-an-episode-of-game-of-thrones/

Gutt, Ernst-August. 2000. *Translation and Relevance*. Manchester: St. Jerome.

Jakobson, Roman. 1959. "On Linguistic Aspects of Translation." *On Translation*. Ed. Reuben A. Brower. Boston: Harvard University Press. 232–239.

Kurzon, Dennis. 2017. "Thematic Silence as a Speech Act." *Implicitness: From Lexis to Discourse*. Ed. Piotr Cap and Marta Dynel. Amsterdam: John Benjamins. 217–232.

Lehmann, Courtney. 2012. "Out Damned Scot: Dislocating Macbeth in Transnational Film and Media Culture." *Film and Literature*. Ed. Timothy Corrigan. London: Routledge. 310–328.

Leigh, Danny. 2015. "Interview: *Macbeth* director Justin Kurzel: 'You're getting close to evil.'" *The Guardian*.
https://www.theguardian.com/film/2015/sep/24/macbeth-director-justin-kurzel-australian-film-maker-snowtown

Shakespeare, William. 1964. "Macbeth." *William Shakespeare. The Complete Works*. Ed. Peter Alexander. London and Glasgow: Collins. 999-1027.

Sperber, Dan, and Deirdre Wilson. 1995. *Relevance: Communication and Cognition*. Oxford: Blackwell.

Stam, Robert. 2005. "The Theory and Practice of Adaptation." *Literature and Film*. Ed. Robert Stam and Alessandra Raengo. Oxford: Wiley Blackwell. 1–52.

—. 2012. "Beyond Fidelity: the Dialogics of Adaptation." *Film and Literature*. Ed. Timothy Corrigan. London: Routledge. 74–88.

Venuti, Lawrence. 2012. "Adaptation, Translation, Critique." *Film and Literature*. Ed. Timothy Corrigan. London: Routledge. 89–103.

Vinay, Jean-Paul, and Jean Darbelnet. 1995. *Comparative Stylistics of French and English: A Methodology for Translation*. Trans. J.C. Sager and M.J. Hamel. Amsterdam and Philadelphia: John Benjamins.

Dominika Lewandowska-Rodak
ⓘ https://orcid.org/0000-0003-1673-9443
University of Warsaw

The Art of Translating Alasdair Gray

Abstract

This paper aims to address and explore the problem of rendering Alasdair Gray's prose in Polish, by focusing on his works' extra-narrative elements. It seeks to identify the difficulties and limitations in translating an author of this kind – a writer, but also, and perhaps primarily, an artist, whose texts function as book-objects, relying heavily on artwork as well as typographical experimentation. The analysis, centred on Gray's *Lanark, 1982, Janine* and *Poor Things*, leads to a discussion of the broader question of translating these books in which the actual text is only part of the story.

Keywords: Alasdair Gray, Scottish fiction, translation, visual art, typography, book design, book-object

1. Introduction

When one considers the question of translating Scottish literature, surely the first and most obvious difficulty that comes to mind is the problem of language. Scotland's complex and ambiguous linguistic make-up indeed has proved to be one of the main preoccupations for many of the country's leading authors. It was the question of language that lay at the heart of the Scottish renaissance of the 1920s and the literary and cultural thought of Hugh MacDiarmid, and that interest has since continued, taken on by such notable figures as James Kelman or Irvine Welsh, both of whom make it the centre of their narrative attention. There is, however, a prominent Scottish literary figure whose work – written mostly in standard English – may actually seem quite straightforward in linguistic terms, and yet, as translation material, presents a considerable challenge; that figure is Alasdair Gray. This article seeks to discuss the writer's oeuvre as material for translation into Polish, focusing exclusively on certain extra-narrative aspects which determine the specificity of Gray's body of work. It looks at the writer's three most important novels: *Lanark. A Life in Four Books*, *1982, Janine* and *Poor Things*, as well as the Polish translation of the last of these texts (so far the only work by the author to appear in Poland), in order to attempt to explore how Gray's unique vision could be approached for the rendition to retain the unique character of the original.

2. Alasdair Gray as Writer and Artist

Alasdair Gray is a writer with a very particular vision – vision actually being the key word in the context of his literary career. He is a story-teller, but also, and perhaps in a sense primarily, a visual artist. Both of these forms of his creativity have been commonly noted and discussed by critics and scholars. On the one hand, Gray has been viewed and portrayed as a playful (postmodern)[1] experimentalist who habitually recycles a great variety of narratives, turning his writings into sites of elaborate intertextuality and metafictionality. On the other hand, he is discussed in terms of his art, as manifested both outside of literary production and within it, where his illustrations, book designs and radical use of typography are seen as extensions of his playfulness and experimentalism. However, as Glyn White observes in his book *Reading the Graphic Surface: The Presence of the Book in Prose Fiction*, such a division – Gray as a writer vs. Gray as an artist – is in fact artificial and also reductive, for it diminishes the fundamental significance of the author's visual approach to his literary work (161–162). Then again, it needs to be noted that when asked about the role of his art in his writing, Gray himself deemed his illustrations an afterthought, "not essential to the text, but intended to make it more enjoyable" (Axelrod n.p.). And yet, while it is perhaps somewhat risky to contradict an author with regard to the nature of their own work, there are numerous indications that suggest that the illustrations, as well as all the other visual aspects of Gray's literary works, are in fact far more than an afterthought.

3. The Book-Object: The Convergence of Text and Image in *Lanark*

It does seem that the route by which Gray had come into literature did more than provide inspiration for the plot of his partly autobiographical debut novel *Lanark: A Life in Four Books* and equip him with the ability to decorate this text, as well as his subsequent literary works, with intricate visual detail. The writer was educated in the plastic arts; he studied design and mural painting in Glasgow, and continued to work as a visual artist throughout his literary career. It was during his university years that he began writing *Lanark*, his debut novel and *magnum opus* which took him almost thirty years to complete and was intended to be a modern epic, containing "everything [he] knew" (*Paris Review* 21). This is a highly revealing comment, as part of this knowledge that Gray wanted to incorporate in his novel clearly had to do with a unique understanding of literary production itself, one marked by a very strong awareness of the materiality of the book, an awareness that was to become a fundamental characteristic of his output. For, in Gray's brand of literature, the book is not a neutral tangible form of the text, a simple means of presenting a story, but an actual physical art object in which the

material and the imaginative combine into one organic whole. As John Sutherland put it, "Where other novelists write fiction, Gray creates books" (22). This means that the author's vision extends from the front cover to the back blurb. Thus, in *Lanark*, the story of Duncan Thaw/Lanark, an artist, and his city, is rendered not only in text but also through a highly particular book design, a distinctive use of typography, and art itself, in the form of Gray's intricate images featured on the cover and introducing each of the novel's four books.[2]

While the precise nature of the link between *Lanark*'s complex illustrations and the novel's narrative can be subject to discussion,[3] it is evident that their function is by no means purely decorative, as both their content and style dynamically engage with the textual sections. Moreover, the fact that – just like the text – the images are clearly marked by an epicness, and that they rework images by other artists (Hobbes's Leviathan, the engraving depicting "An Anatomical Dissection being carried out by Andreas Vesalius," and several others)[4] is further proof of Gray's artistic consistency and the comprehensiveness of his vision. Finally, the fact that they actually also include numerous textual elements clearly confirms them as part of Gray's overarching literary vision. Indeed, the novel offers another image to reinforce this fusion of the visual and the textual, namely the two road-signs encountered by Lanark and Rima in the intercalendrical zone, which show the way to Unthank, but replace the distance or the road number with a relevant chapter number (Gray 2002, 395, 391).

With its ingenious use of all these devices, *Lanark* is not only an impressive turning point in contemporary Scottish literature, and, as Moira Burgess puts it, "a new beginning in Glasgow fiction" (247), but also an introduction to an inimitable and striking creative vision. Gray himself pointed out that it had been his intention to produce only one novel, one volume of poems, one collection of short stories, one book of artworks and one book of plays (Acker 48), but in a way he did achieve this singularity, as it may be argued that all of his works actually converge into one work, all texts into one text. Mark Axelrod notes that Gray's illustrations are "doubtlessly Gray" (n.p.), but the same goes for his oeuvre. His imagery, literary and visual style all make for the whole of a unique body of literary art, of which *Lanark* is the first chapter (or – following the novel's example – the first book).

4. *1982, Janine*: Meaningful Typography

In the case of the writer's second novel, *1982, Janine*, the authorial treatment of the book-object proves even more comprehensive. While *Lanark* concluded traditionally (or at least some editions did), with a blurb featuring a standard plot summary and excerpts from the book's reviews, *1982, Janine* is all Gray – complete with the back cover which informs the reader that

> [t]his already dated novel is set inside the head of an aging, divorced, alcoholic, insomniac supervisor of security installations who is tippling in the bedroom of a small Scottish hotel. Though full of depressing memories and propaganda for the Conservative party it is mainly a sadomasochistic fetishistic fantasy. Even the arrival of God in the later chapters fails to elevate the tone. Every stylistic excess and moral defect which critics conspired to ignore in the author's first books, *Lanark* and *Unlikely Stories, Mostly*, is to be found here in concentrated form. (Gray 1986, n.p.)

Although this work does not feature any illustrations apart from the cover image, it nevertheless resonantly confirms Gray's visual imagination, a concept this time taking the form of extreme typographical experimentation.[5] In the chapter entitled "The Ministry of Voices," the shape of the text begins to reflect the protagonist's mental breakdown, splitting into the titular voices which speak synchronically, merging into a chorus and bringing on the novel's narrative and textual climax.

Such a formal explosion – which Edwin Morgan quite fittingly termed a "typographical bonanza" (96) – may seem like a case of postmodern textual play. In fact, however, this is by no means a stylistic exercise, as a conventional transcription of the said fragment, rendering these different voices one after another, their words running from left to right, would completely change the ideological and emotional makeup of this critical fragment. What the text does here is visualise an auditory and psychological phenomenon. It is evident that this is not an instance of inconsequential formal playfulness, but an inventive use of the writer's plastic imagination. In fact, Gray himself confirmed this – in the previously-mentioned interview conducted by Mark Axelrod, he revealed that given the novel's interior monologue structure, it was not a matter of choice to render the protagonist's mental breakdown in this way, explaining: "I do not know how else I could have done it" (Axelrod n.p.). Thus, typographical manipulation is yet again shown to be an essential aspect of the writer's epic literary intent.

5. *Poor Things* vs. *Biedne istoty*: Losing Gray's Vision in Translation

All of the artistic strategies discussed so far unequivocally confirm the elemental nature of Gray's literary production as book-making rather than book-writing. It therefore seems only natural that these seemingly extra-narrative elements of Gray's texts should be treated as a constitutive part of the work (for they are in fact part of the book as a whole), providing the reader with the full picture of the author's vision. The covers, the blurbs, even the reviews and biographical notes – these are all integral to the comprehensiveness of the writer's oeuvre and should be viewed as such. And this brings us to *Poor Things*, and its Polish translation, authored by Ewa Horodyska and published by Państwowy Instytut Wydawniczy. In a sense, it is understandable why this text has been chosen for the first – and so far the only – attempt at introducing Gray to Polish readers. Although not as

ambitious a project as its two predecessors, *Poor Things* is arguably Gray's most accessible and most entertaining major novel. Intelligent and narratively playful, it is still a prime example of contemporary Scottish fiction and a solid introduction to the writer's work. However, even though with regard to the plot it may be more manageable than *Lanark* and *1982, Janine*, at the same time this novel is possibly Gray's most complete take, both in visual and textual terms, on his idea of the book. First of all, here, too, we have the author's striking cover design which constitutes a pictorial introduction to the plot, as well as characteristic blurb information. This one reads:

> What strange secret made beautiful, tempestuous Bella Baxter irresistible to the poor medical student Archie McCandless? Was it her queer origin in the home of monstrous Godwin Baxter, the genius whose voice could perforate eardrums? This story of love and scientific daring storms through Victorian operating theatres, continental Casinos and a Parisian brothel to its happy end in a decent, old-fashioned Scottish marriage. (Gray 1993, n.p.)

Again, with his unique voice, Gray provides not only information about the plot but also in a way introduces himself, establishing his characteristic authorial tone. By contrast, the Polish cover offers a rather minimalist design that is completely unrelated to the original artwork, and although it does show the three main protagonists, the way in which they are portrayed (simply standing together) fails to indicate their unique interrelationship – evocatively captured by Gray's image where Archibald is embracing Bella, who is embracing Godwin (and sitting on his lap), who is, in turn, embracing the two of them. Aside from the Polish cover's narrative irrelevance, its conventional portrayal of the trio is also, arguably, a rather curious artistic choice for a grotesquely comic postmodern reworking of the Frankenstein myth, involving a mad scientist and a "monster" made up of the body of a young woman and the brain of the fetus she was previously carrying. One could perhaps suspect that the decision not to use some version of the original cover may have had something to do with copyright, but when we take a look for instance at the French translation, which retains much of Gray's imagery, it becomes clear that it was most likely the Polish publisher's conscious choice.[6] Moreover, the writer himself brought up this subject, as when discussing his preference for designing his works, he noted that his control did not extend to foreign editions (Axelrod n.p.).

The fact that the Polish cover does not quite belong to the novel is, incidentally (and somewhat amusingly), conveyed by the translated text itself. While the publisher chose to do away with several elements that may not seem like an immediate part of the central narrative (although they are very much part of the book and the writer's literary vision), they did keep the author's acknowledgements. In the original, these are actually hidden on the copyright page, rendered in small, inconspicuous font; in the translation, however, they occupy quite a prominent

position. And in them, amid Gray's usual helpful identification of sources which he used for his narrative, we find information regarding the epigraph on the book's cover, that is Gray's oft-repeated motto "Work as if you live in the early days of a better nation," which he identifies here as originating from a poem by Denis Leigh (Gray 1997, n.p.). The only problem is that the Polish edition does not feature this or any other epigraph. What may seem like a minor insignificant mistake actually pointedly illustrates the incompleteness of the translation.

As for the images within the text, the Polish publisher decided to radically reduce their number. Thus, the opening pages of the translation in no way resemble the richly decorated and typographically extravagant original, instead offering a completely straightforward, unadorned table of contents.[7] Ultimately, what has been kept is the portraits of the main protagonists, including the crucial picture of Bella which identifies her as "Bella Caledonia," thus drawing an analogy between the evolution of the heroine and the country, as well as the images featured in "Notes Critical and Historical" concluding the narrative. In contrast, among that which has been omitted is, curiously, a highly significant image depicting female consciousness, returned from death (which opens and closes Archie's narrative), as well as all the extensively used anatomical drawings taken from *Gray's Anatomy*, through which the human body and the body of the text meaningfully converge, and which become another site of Gray's intertextuality.

One could perhaps argue that the inclusion of the portraits should give the Polish reader a sense of Gray's artistic style and could consequently be considered enough. There is, however, a fundamental difference between the inclusion of four pictures, which might then assume a purely illustrative role, and these portraits being part of a comprehensive visual framework, not additional material but an integral part of a whole. That is if we assume that Polish readers do figure out that the portraits are Gray's – after all, in the text they are attributed to William Strang, and without any notion of the author's work as a designer of his books, this information might actually be accepted at face value. But even if they are recognised as Gray's, their decontextualisation results in a considerable shift in meaning and should consequently be viewed as a case of mistranslation.

Another element that did not make it into Horodyska's text[8] is the original's first two pages. Page one offers biographical notes on "the novel's author," dr Archibald McCandless, and the editor, Alasdair Gray, described as "a fat, balding, asthmatic, married pedestrian who lives by writing and designing things" (Gray 1993, n.p.). Page two features reviews of the novel. Usually, of course, the publisher can freely edit or altogether remove this section, without any consequence to the text. But there is nothing usual about these reviews. Here the apparently authentic comments from existing publications are interjected with opinions offered by "The Times Literary Implement" or "Private Nose" who lauds *Poor Things* for "[satirising] those wealthy Victorian eccentrics who, not knowing how lucky they were, invented The Emancipated Woman and, through

her, The British Labour Party – a gang of weirdos who kept hugging and dropping the woolly socialism of their founders until Margaret Thatcher made them drop it forever" (Gray 1993, n.p.). Again, the Polish reader remains oblivious to Gray's signature auto-irony, and misses this early indication of the novel's strong political undertones.

Finally, the last significant element that has literally got lost in translation is a particular fragment of Bella's letter – a letter which makes up a substantial part of the narrative, detailing her physical and mental journey towards full maturity. In this specific fragment, the female protagonist, who goes on to become one of the authorial voices seeking to assert control over the story, experiences a moment of breakdown, which, significantly and somewhat analogously to what we have seen in *1982, Janine*, takes a visual form, in this case of almost illegible scribbles. In translation, this whole six-page-long passage is missing, which further impoverishes the narrative. It is rather telling that a Polish essay on *Poor Things* written by Jerzy Jarniewicz and featured in his book *Lista obecności: Szkice o dwudziestowiecznej prozie brytyjskiej i irlandzkiej* [Attendance List: Essays on Twentieth-Century British and Irish Prose] opens with a discussion of Gray as a book-maker, but as it moves on to the novel itself, this aspect of the text remains unaddressed (92–95) – and rightly so, given its non-existence in the Polish version.

6. Misrepresentation of the Visual as Mistranslation

If we assume that the goal of literary translation is to render the meaning of a literary text in another language, then one could argue that in *Biedne istoty* this goal has not been fully achieved. Naturally, someone may say that the Polish version cannot be truly equivalent to the original since no translation is. They might say that the editorial decisions that shaped this rendition should be treated as an interpretation of Gray's novel. But if this interpretation finds the visual aspects of Gray's work negligible, inessential to our understanding of his literary project, then it is a misinterpretation. It appears that the true nature of this book has either been misunderstood or disregarded by the publisher. The reader of Horodyska's text will learn from the included biographical note (different from the one in the original) that Gray studied the plastic arts, but they will have no idea about how this education shaped his literary vision. They will not know about the author's treatment of the book as a complete art-object, about the fact that the experimentalism and playfulness extend beyond the actual narrative, adding a further dimension to the work's inherent open-endedness. As it has already been pointed out, all these aspects of the text, the insistence on its materiality, are not simply a matter of a literary convention. They have serious ideological implications, offer a certain philosophy of the book, and literature, a proper discussion of

which would require a separate article. Alasdair Gray may have been a playful and often humorous writer, but he certainly was very serious about literary production and the things that literature can do for a nation; consequently, his writing should be taken equally seriously.

7. Conclusion: A Case for Translation Experimentation

All in all, Horodyska's rendition of Gray's *Poor Things* is a perfect example show-casing why Polish literary translation should seek to be a little less conservative and conventional, and instead more freely embrace the spirit of the original text. This was a great, and unfortunately missed opportunity to offer a much needed new inventive approach, because a book like this and an author like this seem like the ideal material to explore the creative side of the translation process. With a writer such as Gray, addition seems a far more relevant strategy than a normalising reduction of the source text. Thus, rather than remove the illustrations featuring English inscriptions, and do away with Bella's scribbles, it would have perhaps been better to contextualise them, allowing oneself to play the writer's game and become creative. With the author assuming the role of the editor, the translator could, and possibly should have, assumed an equally editorial role, revealing her intrusion into the text, adding from herself where it is required, where it would help represent the intricate and multi-layered totality of the original narrative, so that it could be grasped by the Polish reader. If translating poetry takes a poet, then translating a mad, playful visionary tale should take someone willing to give this tale – and, indeed, any other tale by Gray – an equally mad, playful visionary treatment. If we accept André Lefevere's notion of translation as essentially a mode of rewriting – editing actually being another such mode (235) – then this notion could certainly be put to a worthwhile use in devising an approach to *Poor Things* that would do the novel justice. An approach of this kind would also have to rely heavily on experimentalism, advocated by Lawrence Venuti as a way to capture the foreignness of a translated work (42).

The assumption that Gray himself would possibly appreciate and endorse such literary treatment of his text seems to find its confirmation in his final literary venture – which is a new contemporary translation of Dante's *Divine Comedy*, "decorated and Englished in prosaic verse by Alasdair Gray." *Hell* and *Purgatory* (the two parts that came out before the writer's death) list Gray as the author, alongside Dante. And while this is a new English-language version of the 14th-century classic, described on the blurb as an "original translation," in fact the term – translation – seems somewhat out of place, since Gray, by his own admission, did not know Italian (*Paris Review* 20). The author himself called his text "a rhymed paraphrase," by which he meant that it is a rendition of Dante's work reworking eight different translations into English, all of which he found

unsatisfactory (*Paris Review* 20–21). While this is a fundamental issue that would, again, require a separate discussion, Gray's *Divine Comedy* also sees the author take less elemental liberties with the text, which further indicate that in his mind, translation fell within the sphere of literary creativity; therefore, his version of *Hell* features such sentences as "Gee up, pimp! No girls here to sell!" (Gray 2018, 73), or "One wee jag in the arse will do no harm?" (Gray 2018, 83), as well as replacing the Ghibelline and Guelph political parties with Whigs and Tories (Gray 2018, 43, 127, 129). Thus, translation becomes yet another form of creative literary play within the writer's vast and eclectic repertoire of narrative practice. It would seem only logical for the translators of his work to follow suit.

Given the treatment that *Poor Things* received in Polish translation, it is perhaps better that so far no publisher has decided to take on *Lanark* or *1982, Janine*. Then again, if treated properly, as the ingenious complete book-objects that they are, these texts could do much to energise the Polish publishers' largely conventional approach to literary translation, not to mention the fact that the ingenious work of one of Scotland's most prominent writers would certainly be a valuable addition to Poland's literary polysystem.

Notes

1   The writer himself was uncertain about such categorisation, or indeed the term itself, explaining that he "never found a definition of postmodernism that gave [him] a distinct idea of it" (Axelrod n.p.).
2   This is a case of complete authorial control, down to the last detail, which has been retained in subsequent editions. As Glyn White notes, "the choice of typeface, Garamond, and the proportions of the text area in all British editions originate with Gray" (162).
3   Glyn White references Alison Lee's *Realism and Power: Postmodern British Fiction*, disputing her argument that "[t]he illustrated title pages […] exert tremendous control in shaping the way the reader reads the text" (Lee 103–104; White 181), and arguing instead that they "do not exert tremendous 'control' over the reader's interpretation, they simply complicate the issue. They do not explain the prose nor are they explained by it. In the same way that Lanark and Thaw provide a context for each other so do images and text provide contexts for each other" (White 192).
4   This is confirmed, in typical Gray style, in the first hardback edition. As noted by Glyn White, the frontispiece to the novel features an inscription which then, curiously, disappears from all subsequent editions, and reads: "WITH ALLE-GORICAL TITLE PAGES IMITATING THE BEST PRECEDENTS" (181).
5   As we find out from James Campbell's article "Clydeside Michaelangelo," "Gray has kept up his eccentric literary habits in the years since his first

novel appeared and has continued to design the books himself, some-
times – as in the case of his second novel, *1982, Janine* – employing
typography so complex that he insisted on a contractual clause permitting six
proof revisions" (n.p.).

6   It has to be noted that the Polish publisher is by no means the only offender
     in this respect. For instance, certain Russian and German editions of *1982,
     Janine* involve cover art that also could not be "less Gray": the former fea-
     tures a red-latex-covered muscular man wearing a short-sleeved shirt and
     a tie, bringing to mind a narrative more along the lines of Bret Easton Ellis's
     American Psycho; the latter takes the fetishistic pornographic element to the
     very forefront, with a red cover showing two nude women dressed only in
     long gloves and equipped with a whip and what looks like a metal rod.

7   In fact, one image has been added – it precedes the whole text, depicts an el-
     egantly dressed couple and, again, is in no way related to Gray's characteristic
     aesthetic, nor does it fit in with the Gothic nature of the narrative.

8   While this is Horodyska's work, it should be noted that the issues that the
     present article discusses are most likely the result of the publisher's decisions
     and may have had nothing to do with the translator.

References

Acker, Kathy. 2002. "Alasdair Gray Interviewed by Kathy Acker: 1986." *Alasdair
     Gray. Critical Appreciations and Bibliography*. Ed. Phil Moores. London: The
     British Library. 45–57.

Axelrod, Mark. 1995. "A Conversation with Alasdair Gray by Mark Axelrod."
     https://www.dalkeyarchive.com/a-conversation-with-alasdair-gray-by-mark-
     axelrod/

Burgess, Moira. 1998. *Imagine a City. Glasgow in Fiction*. Argyll: Argyll Publishing.

Campbell, James. "Clydeside Michaelangelo." *The Guardian*.
     https://www.theguardian.com/books/2007/oct/20/art.fiction

Gray, Alasdair. 1986. *1982, Janine*. Edinburgh: Canongate.

—. 1993. *Poor Things*. Edinburgh: Canongate.

—. 1997. *Biedne istoty*. Trans. Ewa Horodyska. Warszawa: PIW.

—. 2002. *Lanark: A Life in Four Books*. Edinburgh: Canongate.

—. 2018. *Hell. Dante's Divine Comedy Part One Decorated and Englished in
     Prosaic Verse by Alasdair Gray*. Edinburgh: Canongate.

Jarniewicz, Jerzy. 2002. *Lista obecności: Szkice o dwudziestowiecznej prozie bry-
     tyjskiej i irlandzkiej*. Poznań: Rebis.

Lee, Alison. 1990. *Realism and Power: Postmodern British Fiction*. London:
     Routledge.

Lefevere, André. 2004. "Mother Courage's Cucumbers. Text, System and Refraction in a Theory of Literature." *Translation Studies Reader*. Ed. Lawrence Venuti. London: Routledge. 233–249.

Morgan, Edwin. "Tradition and Experiment in the Glasgow Novel." *The Scottish Novel since the Seventies*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press. 85–98.

Paris Review. 2016. "The Art of Fiction no. 232: Alasdair Gray." *Paris Review* 219: 19–40.

Sutherland, John. 1996. "Review of Mavis Belfrage." *Times Literary Supplement.* 22.

Venuti, Lawrence. 1995. *The Translator's Invisibility.* London: Routledge.

White, Glyn. *Reading the Graphic Surface: The Presence of the Book in Prose Fiction*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.

Izabela Szymańska
https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7360-847X
University of Warsaw

Transedicting Literature: R.L. Stevenson's
A Child's Garden of Verses in Polish

Abstract

This paper analyses the abridged Polish rendition of Robert Louis Stevenson's collection of poems *A Child's Garden of Verses*, entitled *Czarodziejski ogród wierszy* (1992, selected and translated by Ludmiła Marjańska), using André Lefevere's idea of translators and compilers acting as rewriters in cultural exchange. It argues that the manipulation witnessed in preparing the Polish collection can be described as a case of transediting, a notion usually applied to news translation not to literary translation. The article considers the interaction of translation, selection, illustrations and editing decisions (such as sequencing poems) in producing a volume that differs significantly from the original. It also considers the possible motifs of the transeditors, including the image of childhood and the child reader. Finally, it touches upon the issue of the impact of this transediting on the Polish reception of the volume.

Keywords: R.L. Stevenson, *A Child's Garden of Verses*, manipulation, transediting, image of childhood

1. Introduction: Rewriting and Transediting

In his influential study *Translation, Rewriting, and the Manipulation of Literary Fame* André Lefevere pointed out that "[t]he non-professional reader increasingly does not read literature as written by its writers, but as rewritten by its rewriters" (4), drawing our attention to how texts are constantly "recycled" in contemporary culture. He described translation as rewriting and manipulation according to the ideological and aesthetic demands of the target culture (5) and this view is largely accepted in contemporary descriptive translation studies, with the term "manipulation" treated descriptively, without an implication of negative evaluation. Of particular significance for the analysis to be presented here is that Lefevere sees rewriting being at work not only in translation but also in compiling, historiography, anthologisation, criticism and editing (9), all those activities being able to contribute to images of writers, works, periods, genres, even whole literatures (5).

This paper will examine how translation works together with selection, editing and illustration to create an image and interpretation of a literary classic for a new audience. The example to be considered is Robert Louis Stevenson's collection of poems *A Child's Garden of Verses* and its abridged Polish rendition *Czarodziejski ogród wierszy* from 1992.

The interest of contemporary descriptively-oriented translation scholars in manipulation understood as the target text's "departures" from the source text, and in its reasons going beyond differences between language systems, as well as its impact on the interpretation and reception of translated texts, highlights the fact that all interlingual transfer involves a degree of manipulation, since it rewrites the text for different readers, using a different language in a different cultural context (Oittinen 39), and that texts presented to the recipients as translations often depart in various dimensions and to various degrees from what Andrew Chesterman calls a default concept of a translation. In connection with his proposal of a model to describe varied profiles of translated texts Chesterman suggests that the "folk" default prototype of "a translation" is a text that has the same function and structure, the same (or very similar) style, represents the same text type, renders all the content of the source text, and has been prepared by a single translator, among other parameters (208).[1]

Actual texts that are made available to recipients in the target language are often in less prototypical relations with their source texts, a very widely researched realm of that being film subtitles. Another non-prototypical example is news and political discourse translation (see an overview of research in Schäffner 870–874), where the production of a piece based on a different-language source is normally collaborative work, and commonly involves selecting information, omitting (cutting), adding explanations, summarising, reorganising, as well as choosing illustrations and their placement in relation to the text. In this sphere interlingual transfer is conceived as inextricably connected with other journalistic tasks, and texts are reshaped, synthetised, transformed – in short edited – to be useful and relevant for a new set of recipients. Schäffner's discussion (874–875) reveals many scholars' uneasiness about calling this process "translation," which strongly suggests some impact of an underlying concept of default "translation" along the lines of Chesterman's proposal. In some research on news translation the term "transediting" is applied to capture the complexity of the process (see Schäffner in its roots and the possible definitional problems). Following Chesterman's assumption, highlighted by his prototypical approach, that drawing a sharp line between "translations" and other kinds of rewritings is neither possible nor necessary from a descriptive perspective, I am still going to borrow the term "transediting" as a convenient shortcut for the particular kind of non-prototypical translation witnessed in the case of the verse collection to be analysed here. I am going to argue that Stevenson's *Garden* has been transedited into Polish, with interesting consequences for the reception of this book.

2. Robert Louis Stevenson's *Garden*

A Child's Garden of Verses (first published in 1885) includes 66 poems arranged in four sequences: "A Child's Garden of Verses," "The Child Alone," "Garden Days" and "Envoys," preceded by a poem in which the book is dedicated to Stevenson's nanny Alison Cunningham.[2] This "much-loved collection" (Dunnigan ix) is considered a classic piece of English-language literature for children; however, as is common in this "genre," it exhibits a dualism of address. It presents a reflection on childhood and on the necessity of growing up from an adult perspective, a feature which, as pointed out e.g. by Adamczyk-Garbowska (139), makes books for children also inspiring and intriguing for adult readers. There is also a dualism in the speaking persona: the collection's main strategy is "to relive childhood from an adult perspective" which makes the child voice of some of the poems speak with "a depth of thought usually absent from the average child" (Lawrence 179). The voice in some other poems, especially in the last sequence "Envoys," seems to be that of an adult. This ambivalence is also stressed by Fielding, who finds it unclear "whether the speakers of the poems are children rehearsing for adulthood, or the adult poet ventriloquising his lost past" (111).

Popular references to Stevenson's *Garden* often resemble the following one, found on the back cover of the Wordsworth Classics edition from 1994, describing the poems as "a masterly evocation of childhood from the pen of the author of *Treasure Island* and *Kidnapped.* They are full of delightful irony, wit and the fantasy worlds of childhood imagination […]. But they are also touched with a genuine and gentle pathos at times as [the poems] recall a world which seems so far away from us now." The world of Stevenson's book is claimed to be "ordinary yet magical, bound by the rhythms of day and night, garden and bedroom; a sentient companionable world of sun and moon" (Dunnigan ix). The volume features toys, childhood games, nature's beauties and exotic journeys; "the child persona describes how he is able to use his imagination to transport himself to 'the pleasant Land of Play/to the fairy-land afar'" (Lawrence 161). According to Julia Reid "[s]peaking to adults as well as children, the volume articulates a yearning for the past, for the lost world of childhood imagination" (47).

But there are also decidedly darker places in this garden, with motifs of sickness (derived from the author's own childhood experience) and of solitude being quite prominent, the latter featuring in the title of the second sequence "The Child Alone." Reid points out that: "[t]he Arcadian 'delights' celebrated in the poems can perhaps be understood […] as a release from the travails of the sick-room; Stevenson's portrayal of his mind's 'unnatural activity' also provides a darker reading of the child's imagination as morbid or pathological. […] Childhood is beset, too, by shadowy 'night terrors'" (48).

Since illustrations are going to play an important part in the analysis of the Polish version, let us note that throughout the decades the original has inspired

many artists, whose pictures reflect the various possibilities of interpreting the collection, and sometimes also the influence of the stereotypical view of childhood as a time of joy, play and being sheltered, despite the dark atmosphere of some of the poems. The first illustrated edition from 1895 had Art-Nouveau-style drawings by Charles Robinson (1870–1937), which were highly appreciated and often reprinted, gaining him many further commissions – he illustrated, among others, Andersen's tales, the Grimm brothers' tales and *Alice's Adventures in Wonderland* (cf. "Charles Robinson (illustrator)"). His pictures are very far from sentimental or Arcadian; many of them are highly stylised and more symbolic than purely depictive; they are also relevant for the present analysis because he did not hesitate to represent artistically some of those shadowy terrors haunting Stevenson's child.

Crucial to this shadowy side of the *Garden* are pieces such as "The Land of Nod," quoted in (1) below, and "North-West Passage," a sequence of three poems describing how scary it is to go up from the living room to the bedroom, of which the middle one, "Shadow March," is quoted in (2):

(1) "The Land of Nod"
 From breakfast on through all the day
 At home among my friends I stay,
 But every night I go abroad
 Afar into the Land of Nod.
 All by myself I have to go,
 With none to tell me what to do –
 All alone beside the streams
 And up the mountain-sides of dreams.
 The strangest things are there for me,
 Both things to eat and things to see,
 And many frightening sights abroad
 Till morning in the Land of Nod.
 Try as I like to find the way,
 I never can get back by day,
 Nor can remember plain and clear
 The curious music that I hear. (Stevenson 1994, 39)

The uncanny atmosphere of "The Land of Nod" is brilliantly captured by Robinson's phantasmal illustration (Stevenson 1994, 40). Let us note that dreams and phantasms in literature function as ways of confronting the unconscious and of experiencing the complexity of the self, especially its darker side (Slany 157–160). Furthermore, "children's literature" sometimes also explores the motif of a child abandoning the Arcadian sphere and escaping for a while into the dream-projected sphere of horror (Slany 170).

As regards "The Shadow March," let us note the frequency of expressions that evoke fear, which are underlined:

(2) "Shadow March"
    All around the house is the <u>jet-black night</u>;
        It <u>stares</u> through the window-pane;
    It <u>crawls</u> in the <u>corners,</u> <u>hiding</u> from the light,
        And it moves with the moving flame.

    Now my little <u>heart goes a beating like a drum</u>,
        With the <u>breath of the Bogies in my hair;</u>
    And all around the candle and the <u>crooked shadows</u> come,
        And go marching along up the stair.

    The <u>shadow</u> of the balusters, the <u>shadow</u> of the lamp,
        The <u>shadow</u> of the child that goes to bed--
    All the <u>wicked shadows</u> coming tramp, tramp, tramp,
        With the <u>black night</u> overhead. (Stevenson 1994, 80)

Most adults today do not expect such an atmosphere in "children's literature," which reveals the prevailing image of childhood which influences the contemporary production and translation of texts for young recipients (Oittinen 41–42) to be that of a time of innocence, joy and security, which should be protected (Cross 16–17) from contact with undesirable models and from disconcerting visions of sad or fearful experiences. On the other hand, research on traditional folk tales and fairy tales suggests that the wide presence of horror in them, though questioned by many as inappropriate for young readers, represents the complexity of the human psyche and has a therapeutic aspect, as it helps in coping with fear by showing that others experience it too (Slany 51–52). Thus, the dark sides of Stevenson's *Garden* make the vision of the child's world complex and real, not filtered through the protectionist attitude.

    The gloomy tone of some of the poems leads Lawrence to suggest that the *Garden* exhibits "also a Gothic intrusion of the underworld, which is present in Stevenson's other fictional works of the same period" (162), including *The Strange Case of Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde.* Lawrence interprets the appearance of 'bogies,' 'fairies' and 'shadows' in the *Garden* (exemplified by "The Shadow March") "not only as ghostly reminders of Stevenson's mortality […] but also as imaginative versions of the Scottish identity he wished to create for himself" (162). Thus, Lawrence sees the landscape of Stevenson's garden not as "that of a typical Victorian children's fairy tale but drawn from a much darker Scottish folk tradition in which 'fairies' were denizens of the underworld" (172), regarded as "spirits of the dead, fallen angels or as the souls of unbaptized babies," the implication being that "children had an affinity with supernatural creatures" (170). He also traces the "Scottish Gothic" in the characteristic ambivalences of this collection: a mixture of vigour and decrepitude, tension between the real and the remembered, alienation from childhood by virtue of distance and age, recollection leading to a fracturing of the self, and being haunted by one's double.

This last motif is particularly visible in the famous poem "My Shadow," quoted in (3) below, where, as Lawrence argues, "the speaker playfully attempts to distinguish 'the shadow' from himself but the association becomes clear: metaphorically the shadow *is* the child, or what the child becomes when sickness takes control of his body" (176). In stanza 4 the child is dissociated from his shadow, which may be a representation of a split self or of the body parting with the soul, i.e. death. Let us note that the motif of losing one's shadow was frequently explored in 19th-century literature as symbolic of one's losing a part of one's personality or of the dark side of psyche taking control over a human being (Kamińska-Maciąg); a vivid example is Hans Christian Andersen's scary tale *Skyggen* (*The Shadow*) (Slany 149–151):

(3) "My Shadow"
    I have a little shadow that goes in and out with me,
    And what can be the use of him is more than I can see.
    He is very, very like me from the heels up to the head;
    And I see him jump before me, when I jump into my bed.

    The funniest thing about him is the way he likes to grow--
    Not at all like proper children, which is always very slow;
    For he sometimes shoots up taller like an india-rubber ball,
    And he sometimes goes so little that there's none of him at all.

    He hasn't got a notion of how children ought to play,
    And can only make a fool of me in every sort of way.
    He stays so close behind me, he's a coward you can see;
    I'd think shame to stick to nursie as that shadow sticks to me!

    One morning, very early, before the sun was up,
    I rose and found the shining dew on every buttercup;
    But my lazy little shadow, like an arrant sleepy-head,
    Had stayed at home behind me and was fast asleep in bed. (Stevenson 1994, 42)

The closing poem of the collection, "To Any Reader," quoted in (4), is also highly relevant to the above interpretation:

(4) As from the house your mother sees
    You playing round the garden trees,
    So you may see, if you will look
    Through the windows of this book,
    Another child, far, far away,
    And in another garden, play.
    But do not think you can at all,
    By knocking on the window, call
    That child to hear you. He intent

> Is all on his play-business bent.
> He does not hear, he will not look,
> Nor yet be lured out of this book.
> For, long ago, the truth to say,
> He has grown up and gone away,
> And it is but a child of air
> That lingers in the garden there. (Stevenson 1994, 139)

It highlights the duality of readership, the duality of perspective, since the speaker here is definitely adult, and finally the motif of isolation and loss: the child of the past cannot be reached, is gone (almost as if dead), a child of air (almost like a ghost).

3. The Polish Version

The following part of the paper will investigate how this many-faceted collection has been rendered into Polish. Due to space limit the analysis will focus on several issues which can be viewed as representative of the general approach taken and interpretable in terms of manipulation.

The book was prepared by Nasza Księgarnia, the leading Polish publisher of literature for young children, established in 1921, working as a state enterprise during the communist period and privatised in the early 1990s. The profile of the publisher and the appealingly colourful, traditionally realistic illustrations abounding in floral motifs (by Anna Stylo-Ginter, b. 1934, specialising in children's books, cf. "Ilustratorzy Naszej Księgarni") indicate that the child reader is foregrounded. In the Polish translating tradition, children's poems are treated rather freely, as an inspiration to write creatively, and often domesticated in terms of versification conventions and cultural background (see e.g. Barańczak 2004 and the discussion in Szymańska 2015; Adamczyk-Garbowska 1988: 125–128). Interestingly, such an approach was not followed here. Ludmiła Marjańska (1923–2005), a reputed poet and translator, indicated in the book as responsible for both the selection and the translation of the poems, usually followed the source-text versification patterns and stanza structures, as well as the meaning, very closely. The Polish poems, and especially the illustrations, suggest that the cultural background was not intended to be greatly adapted – the children wear late 19th-century upper middle-class clothes, live in 19th-century British-style houses and play with old-fashioned toys. This approach seems to have been worked out by the team working on the Polish version; certainly it was not influenced by the source-text edition indicated as the basis for the translation, which was the 1985 Victor Gollancz edition featuring Michael Foreman's illustrations, completely different in style, and modernising the setting (cf. "Michael Foreman on illustrating…")

Several clues about the general approach are provided by the poem about the lamplighter, entitled "Latarnik" in the Polish volume. The translator and the illustrator presented the recipients with an obsolete activity and old-fashioned setting and the English surname of the lamplighter is kept (with the only footnote in the book concerning its pronunciation). On the other hand, as can be expected knowing the traditional Polish norms of translating for children, the Christian names of the children mentioned in the poem are domesticated.

It seems then that the collection was treated as a classic, without an attempt to modernise the setting or to adapt the formal features of the poems or their contents. Interesting and telling manipulation, however, occurs in the sphere of selection, supported by illustrations, showing that there was a certain general concept behind the collection. Out of the original 66 poems (leaving aside the dedication poem whose exclusion was quite obvious given its mainly biographical and historical significance), 35 were included in the Polish volume, naturally then we can ask whether there is some discernible principle of selection (leaving aside the issue of the translator's individual taste). Taking into account the Polish title, which translates as *An Enchanting Garden of Verse*, with the significant addition of the word *czarodziejski* ['magic/enchanting'], which evokes the fairy-tale convention, and the floral motifs dominant in the illustrations, it seems that the concept chosen to structure the Polish collection was the Arcadian garden of childhood imagination and play, leading to the backgrounding or eliminating of other aspects of the original. Let us look at some examples that support this hypothesis.

The Polish volume opens with "Do czytelnika" ['To the reader'],[3] a translation of "To Any Reader" (ex. 4), which in the original collection is the ending:

(5) Tak jak mamusia patrzy co dzień
    Z okna, czy bawisz się w ogrodzie,
    I ty spójrz teraz: jakiś chłopiec
    Biega po ścieżkach, w piasku kopie.
    Już okna książki są otwarte
    I – jak w ogrodzie – wśród jej kartek
    Chłopiec się bawi, skarbów szuka.
    Lecz choćbyś w okno i zastukał,
    On nie usłyszy. Pochłonięty
    Zabawą milczy jak zaklęty
    I nie rozgląda się dokoła.
    Nic go z tej książki nie wywoła.
    Cóż, prawdę wyznam wam w sekrecie:
    Ten chłopiec dorósł, zniknął w świecie,
    Lecz dziecko, którym był za młodu,
    Zostało, nie chce wyjść z ogrodu. (1992; trans. Ludmiła Marjańska)

This radical reversal is certainly significant – it introduces at the very beginning the concept of the book being a metaphorical garden, and also sets the perspective –

the reader does not look backwards on an unattainable lost childhood but is invited to look forwards into the book that promises play and a search for treasures. No reference to a treasure hunt can be found in the English poem and it may be guessed that the translator introduced it as an allusion to *Treasure Island*, or simply as a conventional motif of children's literature. The boy from the Polish poem "milczy jak zaklęty" ['is silent as if enchanted'], which is a set phrase but also evokes associations with magic and fairy tales. As was mentioned, this poem can be interpreted as revealing the Gothic side of Stevenson's *Garden* – in the Polish translation there is a subtle shift blurring such an interpretation. The boy who has grown up did not simply "go away" as in the English original, with all the possible ambiguity of this word; the expression used in this line "zniknął w świecie" ['he disappeared in the world'] alludes to the Polish idiom *pójść w świat* ['to go out into the world'], which implies finding a new place for oneself, discovering wide prospects. There is nothing corresponding to "a child of air" here – the child is quite concrete. Another feature of this poem used for framing the collection is the figure of the mother: the last poem of the Polish volume is "Do mojej mamy" (ex. 6a), a rendition of "To my Mother" (ex. 6b):

(6a) Ty, mamo, czytasz moje wiersze,
       Jakby czas dawny wrócić mógł,
       Słyszysz w nich moje kroki pierwsze:
       Tupot maleńkich nóg. (1992; trans. Ludmiła Marjańska)

(6b) You too, my mother, read my rhymes
       For love of unforgotten times,
       And you may chance to hear once more
       The little feet along the floor. (Stevenson 1994, 131)

There is a change in modality here – instead of "you may chance to hear" in Polish we have "słyszysz" ['you hear']; consequently the mother seems to be able to connect with the child of the past much more easily than in the English poem. This effect is strengthened by "jakby czas dawny wrócić mógł" ['as if the old days could come back']. With Mother at the beginning and at the end, the Polish *Garden* seems much more secure than the English one.

A closer look at the composition of the Polish volume reveals that of the 35 poems included in it 21 explore the motif of a child in a garden or more widely a child in contact with nature; nature is also the site of friendly magic and an incentive for youthful imagination, which is stressed by illustrations. To mention just two examples, the poem "Wszystko kwitnie" ['All is in Bloom'], a rendition of "Flowers," is accompanied by a conventional picture of fairies in white dresses and hennins, dancing among flowers and wild strawberries, while "Opowieść o piratach," a translation of "The Pirate Story," very much in line with the text, has an illustration showing children sailing in a basket across a meadow

whose greenery turns into sea waves. Seven poems show or suggest a child indoors, usually playing; naturally, the motif of play is also frequently present in the garden/nature group. Another motif represented in the Polish collection is that of venturing from home into a different, gaze-expanding space by travel – real ("Nad morzem" – "At the Seaside," "Pożegnanie wsi" – "Farewell to the Farm," "Z okna pociągu" – "From a Railway Carriage") or imaginary ("Opowieść o piratach" – "The Pirate Story," "Dokąd płynie łodka?" – "Where Go the Boats?," "Podróże" – "Travels," "Moje łożeczko" – "My Bed Is a Boat").

The sequencing seems to follow the cycle of the seasons: first we get most of the verses showing nature in bloom and children playing outdoors; poems that can be related to going on holiday, i.e. to summer, can be found in the middle of the volume ("Nad morzem" – "At the Seaside," "Pożegnanie wsi" – "Farewell to the Farm," "Z okna pociągu" – "From a Railway Carriage"); the last part mostly features the verses that show the child indoors and includes poems related to winter (e.g. "Zima" – "Winter-time"). It is interesting to note that "Książki z obrazkami" – "Picture Books in Winter," which mentions "seas and cities, near and far" (Stevenson 1994, 92) is followed immediately by "Podróże" (a translation of "Travels"), which can then be interpreted as a child's dream about exotic journeys inspired by picture books. All that indicates that the selection of poems and their sequencing (which is quite different from the sequencing of the original) were decided on very carefully, according to the translator's and editor's concept of the volume, in which the theme of Nature was obviously assigned a crucial role.

The only poem that mentions illness is "Kraj Puchowej Kołdry" ['The land of a down-filled quilt'] (a rendition of "The Land of Counterpane"), placed in the "winter part" towards the end of the volume, which again indicates that the young readers' experience of what happens in what season was taken into consideration. The poem shows a sick boy having to stay in bed and playing with his tin soldiers, imagining them in battle and himself a giant, so sickness is presented as alleviated by imagination and play. This is the last stanza:

(7a) I was the giant great and still
      That sits upon the pillow-hill,
      And sees before him, dale and plain,
      The pleasant land of counterpane. (Stevenson 1994, 37)

(7b) A potem byłem chorym olbrzymem,
      Co strasznie marznie całą zimę
      I cieszy się, widząc przed sobą modry
      Przytulny Kraj Puchowej Kołdry. (1992; trans. Ludmiła Marjańska)

Let us note that the Polish verse creates a more secure and warm atmosphere, applying concepts like *przytulny* 'cosy' (instead of the more general and insipid

word *pleasant*, whose most common Polish equivalent would be *przyjemny*), *puchowa kołdra* 'down-filled quilt' and *cieszyć się* 'be happy.'

The only poem centred around sleep and dreams included in the Polish book is "Moje łożeczko" ['My little bed'],[4] a rendition of "My Bed is a Boat" (Stevenson 1994, 62), in which the boy dreams about a sea voyage and in the last stanza (ex. 8a) returns to the safe port of the morning. This poem features the nanny as a figure of security; interestingly, in the original she just helps the boy "to embark" in the first stanza, but in the Polish version she is also introduced into the last stanza (ex. 8b), as part of the image of the safe port:

> (8a) All night across the dark we steer
> But when the day returns at last,
> Safe in my room, beside the pier,
> I find my vessel fast. (Stevenson 1994, 63)

> (8b) I pływam całą noc wśród mórz,
> A rano słyszę głos niani,
> Wiem, że mój statek zawinął już
> Bezpiecznie do przystani. (1992; trans. Ludmiła Marjańska)

Penny Fielding points to an intriguing detail of this poem, namely that the boy imagines himself as a prudent sailor taking some food or a toy with him. The food, however, is, quite curiously, a slice of wedding cake, which she interprets as making the child simultaneously "charmingly naive" and "strangely anticipatory of an adult world which is both 'prudent' (an unchildlike world) and sexual" (111). In the Polish poem the stanza in question reads:

> (9) Czasami, gdy opuszczam port,
> Zwyczajem przezornych żeglarzy
> Biorę na drogę ciastko lub tort,
> Zabawkę lub co się nadarzy. (1992; trans. Ludmiła Marjańska)

The food is "ciastko lub tort" ['a cake or a gâteau']; the Polish word *tort* ['a gâteau'], valuable for the translator as it rhymes with *port,* lacks the connotations of the English "wedding cake" – it primarily evokes "birthday cake," so the possible sexual undertone of the original is not present. The translator probably did not consider this detail important enough to introduce the phrase *tort weselny*, which would require a different rhythmical pattern for the stanza.

Such detailed choices, sometimes probably induced primarily by the requirements of rhyme and rhythm, nevertheless introduce a more conventional imagery and a more secure atmosphere into the Polish *Garden*. A very telling case of such a shift, supported by a picture, occurs in the poem "Fairy Bread":

(10a) Come up here, O dusty feet!
       Here is fairy bread to eat.
       Here in my retiring room,
       Children, you may dine
       On the golden smell of broom
       And the shade of pine;
       And when you have eaten well,
       Fairy stories hear and tell. (Stevenson 1994, 71)

(10b) Chodźcie, zakurzone nóżki!
       Tutaj was nakarmią wróżki.
       Dostaniecie w moim cieniu
       Zamiast mleka i razowca
       Woń żywicy, pszczół brzęczenie
       I złocisty blask janowca.
       Gdy pożywisz się na zdrowie,
       Wróżka bajkę ci opowie. (1992; trans. Ludmiła Marjańska)

There is a touch of mystery in this poem as to the speaking persona: for example Charles Robinson's illustration interprets it to be the voice of a witch luring children under her influence (which may perhaps be linked with the aforementioned Scottish vision of fairies). In the Polish rendition (ex. 10b), entitled "Zaproszenie sosny" ['An invitation from a pine tree'], *wróżka* ['a fairy godmother'], definitely not a witch, gives the children "the aroma of resin, the buzz of bees and the golden glitter of broom" "instead of milk and wholemeal bread" and tells them stories, but the voice is given to the pine tree, shown in the accompanying picture as shadowing the children, which brings out the idea that nature is a site of safety.

The Polish collection does not include the most "Scottish Gothic" and disturbing poems that were mentioned above, featuring supernatural creatures, phantasms and fear, i.e. "The Land of Nod" (ex. 1) and "North-West Passage" (ex. 2). Eliminating sad and disconcerting parts was not uncommon in the older Polish practice of translating children's literature; for instance Adamczyk-Garbowska mentions that in the first rendition of *Peter Pan in Kensington Gardens* the image of children's graves and of Peter as a grave-digger was omitted (156); similarly, Slany points out that in the 1950s it was common to rewrite traditional fairy tales to mitigate their cruel or horrifying aspects, deemed to have a negative influence on the child's psyche (16). The translator of the *Garden* also eliminated most of the poems from the "Envoys" sequence, probably judging them as too much rooted in the author's family and cultural background, and retaining only "To any Reader" (ex. 5) and "To my Mother" (ex. 6a), which were assigned the framing function, as was argued above. Thus, the Scottish and personal identity aspect of the original collection was eliminated, which is in fact unsurprising, as it must have been considered difficult to grasp and irrelevant for young readers in a different cultural context.

Let us mention several more examples of memorable verses from Stevenson's *Garden* that were not included in the Polish collection, which may potentially reveal the principles of selection. The translator eliminated the poems that have a "moralising" trait juxtaposed with irony, for example "Whole Duty of Children" (ex. 11) – overt moralising is not considered attractive to modern children and is not a part of modern pedagogy, while irony does not suit the Arcadian garden:

(11)   A child should always say what's true
        And speak when he is spoken to,
        And behave mannerly at table;
        At least as far as he is able. (Stevenson 1994, 19)

The exclusion of "System" (ex. 12), which is also a highly ironic poem, may be additionally attributed to the wish to avoid disturbing and difficult topics, such as poverty and social inequality:

(12)   Every night my prayers I say,
        And get my dinner every day;
        And every day that I've been good,
        I get an orange after food.

        The child that is not clean and neat,
        With lots of toys and things to eat,
        He is a naughty child, I'm sure –
        Or else his dear papa is poor. (Stevenson 1994, 43)

The Polish volume also lacks a rendition of "Foreign Children" (Stevenson 1994, 59), which can be interpreted as showing the child persona taking a rather patronising attitude towards exotic cultures, calling some aspects of his own way of life "proper" – which would be considered improper from a contemporary pedagogic perspective – or as an ironic comment on such patronising (or perhaps even imperialistic)[5] attitudes, but such an interpretation requires both an ability to recognise irony and some background knowledge that young readers in a different time and culture are usually not expected to have.

The translator probably wanted some humour in the collection, since she chose to include the poem entitled "Kiedy dorosnę" ['When I'm grown up'] (ex. 13a), a rendition of "Looking forward" (ex. 13b):

(13a)   Kiedy nareszcie będę dorosły,
        Po męsku załatwię ważną sprawę.
        Powiem chłopakom tonem wyniosłym:
        "Niech nikt nie rusza moich zabawek!" (1992; trans. Ludmiła Marjańska)

(13b)   When I am grown to man's estate
        I shall be very proud and great,
        And tell the other girls and boys
        Not to meddle with my toys. (Stevenson 1994, 31)

Humour also seems to play the key role in the Polish version of "My Shadow," the "Gothic" poem about a child haunted by his shadow (ex. 3). Charles Robinson's illustration seems to follow this interpretation, the "haunting" quality being suggested by the multiplication of the same image at the bottom of the page. The Polish poem and its illustration choose another interpretation, that of a child curious about a natural phenomenon, playing and experimenting with it – the verse is accompanied by five pictures of a very energetic boy wearing a vividly red suit, jumping or taking different poses and exploring the changing shape of his shade. Let us only quote stanzas 3 and 4 of the Polish version:

(14)   Wstałem kiedyś wcześnie rano,
        Zanim jeszcze wzeszło słońce,
        By zobaczyć krople rosy
        Na kwitnącej jerychonce,
        A mój cień, ten śpioch, ten leniuch
        Czy myślicie, że też wstał?
        Został w domu i spokojnie
        W moim łóżku dalej spał!

        Czasem biegnie tuż przede mną
        I nie mogę go dogonić,
        Czasem depcze mi po piętach
        I wciąż muszę myśleć o nim.
        Tak się przy mnie trzyma blisko!
        Czy się boi zostać sam?
        Ja się tak nie trzymam niani,
        Przecież trochę wstydu mam. (1992; trans. Ludmiła Marjańska)

Here, the translator opted for shorter lines than in the original, which makes the Polish version more dynamic than the English poem. Additionally, he original stanzas 3 and 4 are reversed, giving the sequence quoted in (14) above, as a result of which the fragment about parting with one's shadow, being the finale of the original and hence particularly noticeable, is moved earlier, and thus likely to receive less attention. In the resultant Polish stanza 3 the boy jokes patronisingly about the shadow, using the informal words *śpioch* ['sleepyhead'] and *leniuch* ['lazybones']. The more jocular and emotional tone of the translation is also suggested by the exclamation mark at the end of stanza 3, absent in the original stanza 4. The change in the arrangement of stanzas leads to the punchline of the translation being the fragment jocularly suggesting the superiority of the

boy over the shadow which is afraid to stay on its own, which shifts the focus of the poem.

The last example, which I find particularly intriguing, is "Auntie's Skirt," a very sensuous poem, capturing in a compact image a child's fascination with sound and graceful movement:

> (15a)   Whenever Auntie moves around,
>   Her dresses make a curious sound,
>   They trail behind her up the floor,
>   And trundle after through the door. (Stevenson 1994, 36)

> (15b)   Gdy tylko niania się poru<u>sz</u>y,
>   <u>Sz</u>ele<u>s</u>t jej <u>s</u>pódnic wpada w u<u>sz</u>y.
>   I choć zniknęła już za drzwiami,
>   <u>S</u>unie po ziemi ich ak<u>s</u>amit. (1992; trans. Ludmiła Marjańska)

The Polish version "Spódnice niani" ['Nanny's skirts'] (ex. 15b) is even more sensuous, with the frequent /s/ and /š/ sounds (underlined) iconically representing the movement and sound of the textile. I find this verse poetically most appealing of the whole Polish collection and it is not at all surprising that the translator wanted to include it since Polish provides such rich resources to achieve in this case striking sound effects. Curiously enough, however, the auntie is replaced with a highly unrealistic image of a nanny wearing a velvet dress with a train, the attire of a lady. Did the translator (or the editor) sense an improper decadent fin-de- siècle sexual undertone in the boy's fascination, and decided that the figure of a nanny, conventionally associated with elderly women in Polish, would be less risky in this respect? If an additional factor involved in decision-making was the wish to limit the number of non-child characters in the volume, *mama* (Mum), who appears in several poems, would be equally handy in terms of the number of syllables needed, and more believable in terms of the apparel.

4. Conclusion

As has been demonstrated by the above analysis, the relationship of the Polish collection with the original is far from that of prototypical translation: in addition to subtle shifts in detailed aspects of particular poems, significant manipulation occurred through the selection and arrangement of poems. If the original collection is treated as an integral literary work, its elements interacting in offering varied possibilities of interpretation, some of which have been discussed above, the far-reaching intervention in this integrality through selection eliminated some of those possibilities and foregrounded others. The vital role of omission, rearrangement and illustration in creating a new integrality of the Polish collection,

structured around the motif of an Arcadian garden, the wonders of nature and the cycle of seasons, supports the claim that even though much less frequently than journalistic texts, literary texts are sometimes also transedited rather than translated in the prototypical sense, in order to accommodate the requirements and expectations of the target system.

The factors that probably induced the transediting of Stevenson's *Garden* into the Polish *Czarodziejski ogród* have already been identified in the course of the analysis. To summarise, let us point out that a tendency to filter texts through the protectionist attitude to childhood and children, and to eliminate elements that may be considered inappropriate, disturbing, incomprehensible or controversial by adults in the particular culture and time is identified by translation scholars as one of the decisive factors in the practice of translating for children in many countries (e.g. Oittinen 39–41; Borodo 20–21). The Polish transediting team (into which I include the illustrator) seemed to have followed the usual assumptions about what is appropriate and appealing to the child addressee, and about what adult buyers of books find acceptable and tempting. Their work projects the image of childhood (Oittinen 41–42) being a joyful, secure and mostly sunny time of play and of being fascinated with a beautiful idyllic world, with the "Gothic" definitely banned. Consequently, it seems that the child reader has been given priority and the role of the adult recipient has been reduced to the "controller," not a potentially interested addressee.

The Polish rendition does not seem to have gained much popularity, which is not surprising since on the Polish market translated children's poetry is much less prominent than prose (Adamczyk-Garbowska 43), one of the reasons being undoubtedly the very strong position of domestic poetry for children in the Polish literary polysystem. However, there is an interesting comment in an article by Bogumiła Staniów, reporting on the results of a survey about formative reading experiences. One of the respondents listed *Czarodziejski ogród wierszy* among the favourite books of their childhood, describing it as follows:

> rozbudza wyobraźnię, tej książki nie czyta się od początku do końca, do niej się zagląda, odwiedza się ją, spaceruje się po niej [...] jak w ogrodzie, każda stronica żyje, płynie, huśta się, pada w niej deszcz i świeci słońce […]. (Staniów 4)

> [it stimulates your imagination, this is not a book to be read from cover to cover, you look through it, visit it, walk through it […] like in a garden, every page is alive, flows, swings, there is rain and sunshine in it]. (trans. I.S.)

It is also significant that in the entry about Stevenson in the very solid Polish compendium *Słownik literatury dziecięcej i młodzieżowej* [A Dictionary of Literature for Children and Teenagers] (Tylicka and Leszczyński 372) we find the following reference to the *Garden*:

[…] opublikował zbiór wierszy dla dzieci *Czarodziejski ogród wierszy* (1888, wyd. pol. 1992), zawierający krótkie wiersze liryczne, wspomnienia z dzieciństwa, świetnie oddające dziecięcą ciekawość świata, wyobraźnię i czar dziecięcych zabaw.

[he published the collection of verses for children *An Enchanting Garden of Verses* (1888, Polish edition 1992), including short lyrical poems, childhood memories, perfectly reflecting children's curiosity about the world, imagination, as well as the charm of childhood games]. (trans. I.S.)

The use of the Polish title and the interpretation provided suggest that only the Polish volume was taken into account, and the original was probably not consulted.

Both those mentions confirm my analysis: through transediting, Stevenson's *Garden* has been reshaped into an unambiguously Arcadian, idyllic and enchanting place, much more secure and sunny than the original, even though not devoid of some reflection and nostalgia. On the theoretical plane it is worth pointing out that not only the average reader but also the specialists in literary studies who compiled the dictionary overlooked the information indicated in the book, namely that *Czarodziejski ogród wierszy* is a selection from a larger work, and assumed that it represents very closely the functions and atmosphere of the original. This is a very interesting indication of the functioning of the aforementioned idealised default notion of translation in the actual reception of translated literature.

If *Czarodziejski ogród wierszy* has somehow influenced the perception of Stevenson's works on the Polish market (which is unlikely since it had one edition only) it certainly corresponds to *Treasure Island* rather than to *Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde.* As was already mentioned, this kind of shift, eliminating the darker side of the original, is not uncommon in children's literature, whose intercultural transfer is greatly influenced by the current views on what is proper and desirable for young recipients. In this case it is unusually clear that the shift has been achieved jointly by translation, selection, illustration and edition, which confirms the power and impact of Lefevere's 'rewriters,' some of whom we could name transeditors.

Notes

1   Hejwowski (24–27) uses a similar notion of "a prototypical translation," defining it as one aimed at maximal equivalence in terms of the interpretation evoked in the mind of the recipient.
2   There are some editions of selections from the volume which abandon the division. See e.g. http://www.gutenberg.org/ebooks/19722
3   Back translations of the Polish titles are provided only when there is a significant departure from the original title. All the Polish poems are quoted from

Stevenson 1992, which is unpaginated, so references to page numbers are skipped.

4   The use of a diminutive form in this title brings our attention to the issue of diminutives in the whole collection, since this is a significant stylistic feature licensed by the Polish tradition of translating children's books and highly indicative of the assumptions made by the translator about the language expected in such literature and suitable for young readers (see. e.g. Adamczyk-Garbowska 113–115). An analysis of this aspect of the Polish *Garden* cannot, however, be undertaken here for reasons of space.

5   On the impact of imperial ideology on British children's literature and toys of that time, reflected also in Stevenson's *Garden*, see Kozaczka.

References

Adamczyk-Garbowska, Monika. 1988. *Polskie tłumaczenia angielskiej literatury dziecięcej. Problemy krytyki przekładu.* Wrocław: Zakład Narodowy im. Ossolińskich.

Barańczak, Stanisław. 2004. "Rice pudding i kaszka manna: O tłumaczeniu poezji dla dzieci." *Ocalone w tłumaczeniu*, 3rd edition. Kraków: Wydawnictwo a5. 65–75.

Borodo, Michał. 2017. *Translation, Globalization and Younger Audiences. The Situation in Poland.* Oxford: Peter Lang.

"Charles Robinson (illustrator)."
    https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Charles_Robinson_(illustrator)

Chesterman, Andrew. 1998. "Causes, Translations, Effects." *Target* 10.2: 201–230.

Cross, Julie. 2012. *Humour in Contemporary Junior Literature*. London: Routledge.

Dunnigan, Sarah. 2019. "Introduction." *The Land of Story-Books. Scottish Children's Literature in the Long Nineteenth Century.* Ed. Sarah Dunnigan and Shu-Fang Lai. Glasgow: Scottish Literature International. ix–xxix.

Fielding, Penny. 2010. "Stevenson's Poetry." *The Edinburgh Companion to Robert Louis Stevenson*. Ed. Penny Fielding. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press. 102–117.

Hejwowski, Krzysztof. 2015. *Iluzja przekładu. Przekładoznawstwo w ujęciu konstruktywnym.* Katowice: Śląsk.

"Ilustratorzy Naszej Księgarni."
    https://nk.com.pl/anna-stylo-ginter/78/ilustrator.html

Kamińska-Maciąg, Sylwia. 2013. "'Człowiek bez cienia' w opowiadaniach fantastycznych Mikołaja Gogola." *Slavia Orientalis* LXII.3: 391–403.
    http://journals.pan.pl/dlibra/publication/96588/edition/83336/content

Kozaczka, Adam. 2019. "Symbolism and Empire: Stevenson, Scott, and Toy Soldiers." *The Land of Story-Books. Scottish Children's Literature in the Long*

Nineteenth Century. Ed. Sarah Dunnigan and Shu-Fang Lai. Glasgow: Scottish Literature International. 174–191.

Lawrence, Adam. 2013. "'Playing among the graves' in Colinton Manse: Robert Louis Stevenson's 'Scottish Gothic' Garden of Verses." *Journal of Stevenson Studies* 10:161–185.

Lefevere, André. 1992. *Translation, Rewriting, and the Manipulation of Literary Fame*. London: Routledge.

"Michael Foreman on illustrating *A Child's Garden of Verses.*" http://www.scottishbooktrust.com/blog/reading/2017/11/michael-foreman-on-illustrating- a- childs-garden-of-verses

Oittinen, Riitta. 2006. "No Innocent Act. On the Ethics of Translating for Children." *Children's Literature in Translation. Challenges and Strategies*. Ed. Jan Van Coillie and Walter P. Verschueren. Manchester: St Jerome Publishing. 35–45.

Reid, Julia. 2010. "Childhood and Psychology." *The Edinburgh Companion to Robert Louis Stevenson*. Ed. Penny Fielding. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press. 41–52.

Schäffner, Christina. 2012. "Rethinking Transediting." *Meta: Translators' Journal* 57: 866–883. https://www.erudit.org/fr/revues/meta/2012-v57-n4-meta01064/1021222ar. pdf

Slany, Katarzyna. 2016. *Groza w literaturze dziecięcej. Od Grimmów do Gaimana.* Kraków: Wydawnictwo Naukowe Uniwersytetu Pedagogicznego.

Staniów, Bogumiła. 2011. "Lektury inicjacji czytelniczych." *Biuletyn EBIB* 4/2011 (122): 1–5. http://www.ebib.pl/images/stories/numery/122/122_staniow.pdf

Stevenson, Robert Louis. 1992. *Czarodziejski ogród wierszy.* Trans. Ludmiła Marjańska. Warszawa: Nasza Księgarnia

—. 1994. *A Child's Garden of Verses* (Wordsworth Classics)*. Ware, Hertfordshire: Wordsworth Editions Limited.

Szymańska, Izabela. 2015. "Barańczak a sprawa kota." *"To życie cieniem tylko jest przelotnym…" Pamięci Stanisława Barańczaka*. Ed. Ewa Kujawska-Lis. Olsztyn: Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu Warmińsko-Mazurskiego. 85–102.

Tylicka, Barbara, and Grzegorz Leszczyński, ed. 2002. *Słownik literatury dziecięcej i młodzieżowej.* Wrocław: Zakład Narodowy im. Ossolińskich.

J. Derrick McClure
ⓘ https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2934-4574
University of Aberdeen

Translating Polish Poetry into Scots:
An Ethical Question

Abstract

Though ideally a translator should have a sound knowledge not only of the language of the source text but of the literary culture from which it has arisen, examples can readily be found of satisfactory poetic translations made by translators with little or no knowledge of the original language. Examples also abound of cases where an inadequate knowledge of the source language has led a translator into errors of interpretation, which may or may not be counterbalanced by felicities of expression in the target-language text. The author's Scots translations of poems in Polish, a language of which he has only a rudimentary knowledge, are presented and examined as case-studies of the practical and ethical problems of translating from an imperfectly-known language.

Keywords: translation, poetry, Polish language, Scots language, Tadeusz Różewicz, Adam Mickiewicz, Piotr Sommer, Feliks Konarski

---

1. Translation: Quality of Writing in the Target Language

This paper is based mainly on my own experiences of translating poetry, but I of course hope the issues raised will be of general interest: principally, the question of how well a translator needs to "know" the source language in order to produce valid poetic translations. *Prima facie*, a natural assumption is that the "ideal" translator of a poem is a reader who has, first, a thorough knowledge of the source language and of the literary culture of which it is the medium; and second, a full familiarity with the target language and a degree of technical skill in handling it sufficient to produce a text comparable to the original in respect of literary merit. The second of these is surely indispensable: if a poetic translation, or what is offered as one, is markedly inferior as a work of art to its original, the translator is culpable not only from a literary but from an ethical point of view, since he will be giving readers of the translation the impression that the original is less worthy of respect than in fact it is. As an example, consider the following lines from Leopardi's *A Silvia*, and Christopher Whyte's translation:

Tu pria che l'erbe inaridisse il verno,
Da chiuso morbo combattuta e vinta,
    Perivi, o tenerella.

Before winter could turn the meadows wan
an insidious disease eroded your
fragility, and overcame you, and
you died. (in Jack et al. 35)

The translation of the whole poem is certainly not *bad* (I have, admittedly, picked some of its least satisfactory lines to illustrate my point), but it has undeniable faults and infelicities, shown unmistakeably in this tiny extract. Leopardi's rhymes and alliterations are gone without trace, his graceful hendecasyllabic and hepta-syllabic lines are replaced by lines with no consistent metrical pattern at all, and some of the line divisions are simply perverse. The word order of Leopardi's first line is unusual, but the words themselves are not (except for the aphœresis of *inverno* to *verno*): Whyte's *wan*, by contrast, whether used in its original literal sense or (as here) metaphorically, is not a familiar word in English; and the emotional charge of the adjective is un-called for, to say the least, in a poem whose emotional force assuredly needs no augmentation. "[A]n insidious disease eroded your fragility" not only is tongue-trippingly awkward with its cataracts of unstressed syllables: *eroded* suggests an action different from and much less forceful than what is conveyed by *combattuta*, and by rendering part, and only part, of the meaning of Leopardi's vocative *o tenerella* by the abstract noun *fragility*, Whyte has completely lost the sense of intimacy which is a key feature of the original poem. *Tenerella* is quite impossible to translate exactly in a single English word; but on no showing has Whyte made even a passable attempt: even Alasdair Mackie's simple "sweet lass" in his Scots translation of the same poem (in Jack et al. 33–34; also in Mackie 366–367) is more satisfactory. Anyone who imagined that by reading this version he was acquiring a knowledge of Leopardi would be under a complete misapprehension. Whyte is a poet of high reputation and proven ability; but misapplied skill can result in an unsatisfactory translation as surely as can a simple lack of skill.

2. Translation: Understanding of the Source Language

As there is no difficulty in demonstrating, then, the ability to write as well, or nearly as well, in the target language as the original poet has done in the source is an absolute necessity in poetic translation. The other condition, though, is more debatable. That good poems which are literary re-statements of ideas expressed poetically in another language *can* be made by writers ignorant of the original language is hardly questionable. As an example, the companion anthologies

by France and Glen (1989, translations into Scots and English) and Thomson (1990, translations into Gaelic) both contain works by George Campbell Hay stated to be from Croatian originals. But they are not from the Croatian originals. They are from Italian versions in Salvini 1942. This fact is not mentioned in either anthology, though in Hay 1948 and Hay 1952, where the translations were first published, it is stated specifically. Salvini's anthology does not contain the Croatian poems, and Hay, polyglot though he was, could not have read them in any case. The Italian renderings are without distinction of any kind: they are printed in lines and stanzas and to that extent reflect the fact that they are translations of poetry, but make no pretensions to being poetry in their own right. Hay's renderings are poetry of merit, achieved by freely elaborating on the plain prose of the Italian (for discussion see McClure 2007). It is permissible to imagine (and indeed, to expect) that the Croatian poets, had they seen and been able to read Hay's versions, would have been gratified at having inspired poetry of such quality, but since Hay's poetic embellishments to the Italian texts were of course done with no reference whatever to the originals, they would certainly see substantial differences between their work and his. In any event, to describe Hay's poems as being "from the Croatian of …" is wholly misleading.

Hay's *Poeti Croati Moderni* translations should not be measured directly against the Croatian originals, for the simple reason that they were not offered as translations of these and were not intended to be compared to them. The case of versions which *are* offered as translations of specific foreign originals is somewhat different. A translator's moral responsibility to produce something closely and recognisably related to the original is much more strongly present in such a work than in one where the translator has simply used the original as an inspiration to his own creative skill. And an extra dimension to the difficulty of meeting this obligation is present in the case of translations by writers without the requisite knowledge to work directly from their originals and obliged to use an intermediary translation; for the obvious reason that the second translator must place an unconditional faith, which may be misplaced, in the accuracy of the translation from which he is working. As an example which I have previously examined more fully (McClure 2018), to an Italian translator with no knowledge of Gaelic, the process of putting an English translation of a Gaelic poem into Italian is from one point of view exactly the same process as doing so with an original poem in English. But in addition to the possibility of inadequacies or imperfections in the Italian translation of the English, there is the certainty that any inadequacies or imperfections in the English translation of the Gaelic will leave their mark in the Italian.

3. Translation: The "Either True or Fair" Fallacy

It goes without saying that any poetic translation will differ from its original in some respects. I have expounded before now on what I call "the 'either true or fair' fallacy," that is, the naive and misguided notion that the process of poetic translation is a matter of striking some kind of balance between literal accuracy and poetic merit, as if the two existed in a fixed relationship: the resources of the target language will always be different, sometimes vastly different, from those of the source; and the right to manipulate the target language so as to produce the best and most fitting effects which it can afford, regardless of how closely they resemble those achieved by the original poet, is not a licence granted to a translator but a fundamental *sine qua non* of the practice. But there is, clearly, an enormous difference in principle between a non-correspondence from the original to the translation resulting from a simple failure on the translator's part to recognise, understand or appreciate what the original poet has done, and one which results from a deliberate artistic decision made by a translator who has understood the original perfectly well. If taxed with the first, the translator can only resolve to do his homework better in future; if with the second, he can retort with the first and greatest practitioner, not only in the Scottish but arguably in the entire European tradition of poetic translation, Gavin Douglas: "Quha can do better, sa furth, in goddis name!".[1] Yet, a distinction must be made between the *ethical* and the *literary* aspects of such cases. Clearly a translator should not make simple mistakes; yet even a mistake need not reveal itself in the poetic quality of the translation. Leopardi's "per poco / il cor non si spaura" does not mean "for a wee the hert faas lown" (Mackie 368), but the segmental and rhythmic pattern of Alasdair Mackie's cadence is masterly nonetheless. The difference in principle need not be a difference in practice, at least if judged solely by the results.

The conclusion to which this line of argument points is that the task of assessing a translated work as a *poem* and that of assessing it as a *translation*, though clearly linked, are not directly related; and an overall assessment must balance the two, taking account of the poet-translator's intention. (A key question here is whether the translation is or is not designed to assist readers who are actually studying the works of the original poet.) Poet-translators in their works may run the whole gamut of what Dryden called metaphrase, paraphrase and imitation: two outstanding Scottish examples from different periods are William Drummond of Hawthornden and William Soutar (for discussion see McClure 2001 and 2000). And a poet-translator *may* work from originals in a language he knows well or one which he knows imperfectly, or from intermediary versions made out of one he does not know at all: Drummond was perfectly at home in the French, Italian and Spanish of his models, whereas Soutar's renderings of Pushkin, Pasternak, Ady and Bloomgarten were made from English translations – on which he immeasurably improved. The simplistic (and dangerous) conclusion

that a work's status as a good poem may *excuse* its being a bad translation is no more warranted than the converse proposition would be: overall judgement is a case of balancing the two aspects of the poet-translator's achievement in the light of his intention; and an infelicity in either aspect is not nullified, though it may be counterbalanced, by success in the other.

And if the foregoing is seen as a device for covering my back in the discussion of my own work which is to follow, this may be entirely correct.

4. Translation: The Author's Experience and Practice

I can, by now, claim a fair degree of experience in translating poetry into Scots. In this I am deliberately making my own contribution, whatever its value may be, to the imposing corpus of translations which form an integral part of Scots poetry in the 20th and 21st centuries, a corpus to which almost every major poet in the field, and many minor ones, have contributed. Many, perhaps most, of these translations were made directly from the originals by poets who could claim, if not native-speaker fluency, at least a sound knowledge of their source languages: Alasdair Mackie's renderings from French, Italian and Russian, or Douglas Young's from Gaelic and the classical languages, are cases in point. For my own part, the languages from which I have translated most extensively are Italian, in which I am tolerably competent, and Gaelic, of which I have a knowledge of the grammar and vocabulary but a much lesser degree of conversational fluency. Other languages from which I have translated are French, German and Spanish. In all these cases, and in that of Old English, I have at least a working knowledge of the languages. Occasional translations from Provençal, Sicilian and Milanese (Frédéric Mistral, Marco Scalabrino, Carlo Porta) have been made with reference to the facing-page translations into French and Italian with which the poems are published: their relationships to the national languages are usually clear, and the points of comparison a source of great interest. The only time I have translated from an English rendering of a work in a language of which I have no knowledge at all, namely Flemish, was when invited by Frank Adam to translate his *De komiekenkonferentie van Rochefort*, which I rendered as *The Comic Confeirin o Creiff*; but even there the relationship of the language to German ensured that it was not entirely opaque. Polish, however, is more dubious. The main result of two years and more of trying to learn it is an impression of almost fiendish difficulty, not mitigated by assurances from kind informants that even native speakers sometimes make mistakes in the intricate inflectional systems of nouns, pronouns and adjectives. However, the Polish poems to which I have been introduced (principally by Agnieszka Skrzypkowska, postgraduate law student at Aberdeen University, to whom I record my gratitude) made an instant appeal, and tempted me at once into the venture of producing Scots renderings. I did so using English

translations, both poetic and literal, but at all stages making sure, by consulting a printed dictionary and online translation tools, that I at least knew what each word meant, and how each sentence was constructed; that is, my translations *are* made from the originals, but with considerably more help in understanding them than I require when translating from Italian or French.

My practice as always has been to produce translations in a comparable poetic form to their originals. If a model poem rhymes and scans, I incorporate rhyme and some regular metre into my translation. If the metre is impossible to reproduce exactly, for example if the translation is from a syllable-timed language like French, I replace it with one which reads well in Scots; and I have at times allowed myself some laxity in rhyming: for example, since rhymes are much easier to find in Italian than in Scots, when translating an Italian sonnet with only two rhymes in its octave I have often used four. My medium is most often the general (i.e. non-regional) literary Scots as it has been developed in the modern period; but since Scots is an extremely flexible and multi-faceted language with an abundance of dialects and registers I at times use a regionally or socially marked form, such as North-East Doric or Clydeside demotic.

5. Examples and Discussion

Free verse poetry is, in an obvious sense, the easiest kind to translate. My example here is Tadeusz Różewicz's "Ocalony" ('Survivor'). (The original poems and the translations are printed after the main body of the article.) Though not organised into regular lines, the poem certainly exploits the rhythm of the language (Polish is a stressed-timed language like Scots) in a more than random manner; and I have attempted to do likewise in the translation. The opening line is in Polish a trochaic tetrameter, and rendered in the Scots as an iambic trimeter "I'm twenty-fower year auld" (not just "I'm twenty-fower," though the meaning would be the same without the last two words). In "Wyc't tae slauchter / I wan throu" I have used an idiom implying "come through [a task, difficulty or ordeal] successfully" for *ocalałem*, in order to end the phrase on two heavy monosyllables. I have slightly paraphrased "To są nazwy puste i jednoznaczne" to "Thir wirds is tuim an differs nane" to bring another forceful monosyllable to the end; and in the following sequence of antonymic pairs I have reversed the order of "wróg i przyjaciel" for a rhythmic symmetry with the preceding line, and chosen translation equivalents which fortuitously give patterns of alliteration and assonance: a slight embellishment of the original which I trust is not presumptuous. I have simplified the grammar of "Człowieka tak się zabija jak zwierzę," again partly for the rhythm; have made explicit the fact that the *ludzi* are dead to obtain an alliteration, and invited an emphatic stress on *thaim* to underline the bitter nihilism of the statement. Alliteration has been my guide in the translation of *pojęcia* as *wittins* ['information, knowledge

imparted']: later I translate it as *thochts* for the same reason. The obvious translation for "cnota i występek" would be "virtue and vice," and though neither word is specifically Scots both would be perfectly understandable in a Scots poem[2]; I have, however, chosen to render it as "guid natuir an ill": in the recurrence of the idea a few lines later, this wording underlines the stated falsity of the opposition.

My Scots version, overall, is in *slightly* less free verse than its model and is not an entirely literal translation; however, it is for those with a more intimate understanding of the language and style of the original than I have to judge whether my translation fulfils its responsibility to its model.

When translating a poem in a definite and well-established metrical format, a corresponding format in the target language is required. The sonnet form is a classic example. Polish sonnets are written in alexandrine (thirteen-syllable) lines; Scots ones in iambic pentameter. In translating sonnets from Italian, the problem which invariably arises is that since Italian words are often longer than their Scots (or English) translation equivalents a translator is liable to find himself faced with the problem of filling up a line: I am familiar with this, since one of my most prolific translation sources has been Cecco Angiolieri. The same is true of Polish, but here the effect is countered at least to some extent by the longer line. In translating Adam Mickiewicz's Crimean sonnets – poems of which the pervading theme of exile and longing for the calf-ground is certain to appeal to a Scottish reader or translator – I have found, as always, that the main difficulty is in maintaining rhymes and a strictly regular metre: *most* often, I have not been obliged either to pad the lines out or to omit material in the original; but not always.

The phonaesthetic power of Scots words is, as is well known, one of the greatest assets of the language as a medium for poetry. *Hirstie*, used of land and meaning 'barren, unproductive' as well as simply 'dry,' could perhaps be criticised as saying more than *suchy*, and *scaps* 'extents of barren ground' reinforces the same idea. An issue which frequently arises in Scots translations is that the words chosen are liable to have greater semantic force than those to which they correspond in the original poems; but here I simply follow other translators in availing myself of the resources at my disposal. *Kelter*, suggesting rapid, irregular, tumbling motion, will surely do for *nurza* (my dictionary translates this verb as *plunge*); and also provides some alliteration. The same ornamentation literally fell into my lap from the fact that the Polish word *fali* translates accurately as *swaws* 'waves' and "kwiatów powodzi" requires only a grammatical change to become "flouers at sweel" ['surge']. *Leck*, meaning 'a flat stone or rocky islet in the sea,' was chosen to underline the tactile contrast with *thrissle-taps*. A *cairn* is 'a pile of stones set up as a landmark'; not the same thing as a *kurhan*, which is 'a burial-mound': if charged with avoiding the dark overtones of Mickiewicz's word, my reply is that for many readers *cairn* will instantly recall Burns's rhyme "[…] where hunters fand the murdered bairn"! "Thon skyrie clift" ['shining fissure'] is admittedly one point where I have departed from the original; but

besides the necessity of finding a rhyme, the idea of a river seen in the distance, in semi-darkness, as a *clift* in the landscape is not impossible; and *skyrie* is in keeping with the imagery of this quatrain. My alteration of *Akerman* to *Moldavia* is another liberty; but it is partly for the metre and partly because the substituted name is at least slightly more likely to be recognised by Scottish readers; and is not a serious geographical inaccuracy. (Given the transformation of the geopolitical map of South-Eastern Europe between Mickiewicz's time and the present, I have chosen the historical form Moldavia rather than the name of the contemporary independent state Moldova. I am open to persuasion, however, on whether this is indeed the best procedure.) Another unavoidable loss is Mickiewicz's dexterous use of the place-name as a rhyme word, coming as the climactic point of the entire octave. A *sokół* 'falcon' is probably not the same kind of bird as a *gled* 'kite,' but since the essential implication is of a predator the substitution may stand; the *wąż* is not specifically identified as an *ether* 'adder,' but since a disyllabic word was needed, the same applies; making the snake's *piersią* 'breast' into its *side* preserves the rhyme and alliteration (and in any case, *breast – breist* in Scots – seems an odd word to use of a snake). Finally, an inescapable dilemma was presented by the fact that though *Litwa* has only two syllables in Polish, *Lithuania* has five, that is half a line, in Scots. If my shift of rendering "głos z Litwy" as "Baltic vyce" is criticised, besides the metrical argument I offer the consideration that the poet's birth town of Zaosie or Zavosse is not in fact in what a modern reader understands by *Lithuania* but in Belarus. Incidentally, in translating another of the Crimean sonnets, "Pielgrzym" ['The Exile'], I did retain the name Lithuania, rendering the lines

> Litwo! piały mi wdzięczniej twe szumiące lasy
> Niż słowiki Bajdaru, Salhiry dziewice,

as

> Och, Lithuania! Your reishlin wuids
> Mair sweetly sang tae me nor bird or lass
> O Tatar steppes…

but at the cost of submerging the two specific geographical allusions under one heading. Here as always in such cases, a translator's only possible retort to criticism is: well, how would *you* do it?

Polish literature has not been a prolific source for Scottish translators. Since Polish is not a language which many foreigners learn, this is to that extent understandable, but the close, long-established and enduring links between the two countries make it also a matter for regret. *Bardachd na Roinn-Eòrpa an Gàidhlig* (Thomson) contains one poem by Zbigniew Herbert translated by Iain Crichton Smith and three by Tadeusz Różewicz translated by Christopher Whyte;

European Poetry in Scotland (France and Glen) one by Józef Czechowicz translated by Burns Singer and two by Piotr Sommer translated by Douglas Dunn. His translations are into English: I have put one of the Sommer poems into a demotic Scots, reflecting the dreary urban setting. This form is unmistakably (I hope) different from the literary Scots which I have used for the Różewicz and Mickiewicz translations: distinctively Scots lexical items are almost absent, but colloquialisms like *yir missis*, *fags* and *blethers*, the common interjection *ken* (like "you know"), the hesitation-filler "sort o like" and the contemporary slang *coupon* for 'face' demonstrate that a spoken register is being used. The phonetically spelt *yir* instead of *your* also emphasises, in intention at least, the sound of a speaking voice.[3] My translation method is different too: I have virtually ignored the syntactic structures, though not the lineation, of the original, and written in the loosely-constructed sentences of an untutored speaker's monologue, a format which certainly suits the disorganised sequence of thoughts expressed. Neither rhyme, alliteration nor any consistent rhythmical pattern is used. My intention has been to suggest the imaginative world of, say, James Kelman, renowned for his fictional evocations of the gloomy and circumscribed lives of the urban working class. I am not sufficiently well acquainted with Sommer and his work to know whether this would meet with his approval; but hopefully it may stand.

Finally, I offer an attempt, which may be considered presumptuous, at translating an inspired Polish war song, "Czerwone maki na Monte Casino," into singable Scots verse. The stirring paean to the heroism of Poland's troops, like all things of its kind, may have lost some appeal in the present age, but to another nation with a long history of military prowess it cannot fail to strike a sympathetic chord, and in any event the respectful commemoration of a victory won by the self-sacrificing heroism of the combatants is morally unimpeachable. The essential thing which I have endeavoured to preserve in my translation is the insistent "rum-pa-PUM" rhythm: not a difficult task, in fact. The rare Gaelic-derived word *scarnach* 'scree' in the first line was chosen not only for its phonaesthetic vividness but because it sounds well in the musical context. Ideally, a syllable sung on the upbeat in a setting with this rhythmic structure should be long (that is, should contain a long vowel, a diphthong or a consonant cluster, and/or should precede a word boundary) and a high-sonority vowel (i.e. one like [a] or [ɔ] rather than one like [i] or [ɪ]). *Scarnach* fulfils these conditions: *larachs* 'ruins' would have been a closer translation, but lacking the internal cluster of resonant voiced consonants *–rn–* would not have been so satisfying to sing. Other cases where the position of a syllable on an upbeat in the tune has guided my choice in the translation are *spang'd*, *mynins*, *gyties*. Cases where I have unfortunately had to settle for a short syllable in a position where a long one would have been better are *scuggit* and *thonner*. In the former case the word would be more effectively sung with a "Scotch snap" rhythm than by prolonging the vowel.

6. Conclusion

All these examples, no doubt, are open to criticism on some grounds or others, but in the last analysis, poetic translation is a purely pragmatic activity. There are no rules more precise than the obvious ones that a translator must write as well as he can, in the sense of producing the most literarily satisfactory a poem as he can in the target language, and must avoid obvious mis-translations unless (as may happen) there is simply no feasible alternative. And since the venture of translating poems which accord well with the literary tradition of the target language and make a strong appeal to the translator is very enticing, a translator may yield to the temptation of exercising his skill even in a language of which his knowledge is very limited. Whether this particular translator would have done better to resist the temptation is for his readers to judge.

THE SOURCE TEXTS AND THEIR TRANSLATIONS INTO SCOTS:

Ocalony

Mam dwadzieścia cztery lata
Ocalałem
Prowadzony na rzeź.

To są nazwy puste i jednoznaczne:
Człowiek i zwierzę
Miłość i nienawiść
Wróg i przyjaciel
Ciemność i światło.

Człowieka tak się zabija jak zwierzę
Widziałem:
Furgony porąbanych ludzi
Którzy nie zostaną zbawieni.

Pojęcia są tylko wyrazami:
Cnota i występek
Prawda i kłamstwo
Piękno i brzydota
Męstwo i tchórzostwo.

Jednako waży cnota i występek
Widziałem:
Człowieka który był jeden
Występny i cnotliwy.

Szukałem nauczyciela i mistrza
Niech przywróci mi wzrok słuch i mowę
Niech jeszcze raz nazwie rzeczy i pojęcia
Niech oddzieli światło od ciemności.

Mam dwadzieścia cztery lata
Ocalałem
Prowadzony na rzeź.

Tadeusz Różewicz

Survivor

I'm twenty-fower year auld.
Wyc't tae slauchter
I wan throu.

Thir wirds is tuim an differs nane:
man an baest
fainness an hatrent
faeman an feire
mirk an licht.

Killin fowk's like killin baests,
as I hae seen.
Hash't-up corps in cairt-drauchts:
thare nae savin thaim.

Wittins is nocht but wirds.
Guid natuir an ill
truith an lees
fairheid an ugsomeness
bauldness an couardiness.

The wecht o guid natuir an ill's the same,
as I hae seen,
in a cheil whas natuir
wes guid an ill baith.

I'm seekin a teacher, a maister
wha'll gie me back my sicht, my vyce, my hearin,
wha'll gie thair names back tae things an thochts,
wha'll twyne the licht frae the mirk.

I'm twenty-fower year auld.
Wyc't tae slauchter
I wan throu.

JDMcC, efter Tadeusz Różewicz

Stepy akermańskie

Wpłynąłem na suchego przestwór oceanu,
Wóz nurza się w zieloność i jak łódka brodzi,
Śród fali łąk szumiących, śród kwiatów powodzi,
Omijam koralowe ostrowy burzanu.

Już mrok zapada, nigdzie drogi ni kurhanu;
Patrzę w niebo, gwiazd szukam, przewodniczek łodzi;
Tam z dala błyszczy obłok? tam jutrzenka wschodzi?
To błyszczy Dniestr, to weszła lampa Akermanu.

Stójmy! – jak cicho! – słyszę ciągnące żurawie,
Których by nie dościgły źrenice sokoła;
Słyszę, kędy się motyl kołysa na trawie,

Kędy wąż śliską piersią dotyka się zioła.
W takiej ciszy – tak ucho natężam ciekawie,
Że słyszałbym głos z Litwy. – Jedźmy, nikt nie woła.
                                    Adam Mickiewicz

The Akerman Steppes

I sail amang the hirstie ocean's scaps,
I kelter throu the green, my cairt a keel,
Throu swaws o reishlin parks, throu flouers at sweel,
I pass the coral lecks o thrissle-taps.
Doun comes the mirk; nae gait, nae cairn in sicht,
Seekin the starns tae guide I gome the lift.
Thon glentin scog sae hyne, thon skyrie clift:
The Dneister is't, Moldavia's leamin licht.
Rist nou – whit lown! I hear the cranes at flee:
The gled's ee follas thaim, but sauf thay'll bide;
I hear the gress showd wi the butterflee,
The sprats skiff't wi the ether's slidderie side.
Quaet in the saucht, I harken aiverie
For Baltic vyce – Nane comes. Haud furth; we'll ride.
                        JDMcC, efter Adam Mickiewicz.

Między przystankiem a domem

Idziesz odwiedzić przyjaciela po pokazie filmów,
twoja żona została w domu sama,
twoja matka, o której zaczynasz myśleć
po wyjściu z autobusu, jest w innym mieście,
chora, wczoraj dostałeś od niej telegram;

między przystankiem autobusu linii 140-bis
a domem przyjaciela (czyli: przechodząc obok
zamkniętego sklepu, kupując papierosy
w kiosku przed domem oraz jeszcze w windzie),
zanim wejdziesz do mieszkania i zaczniesz
tę wieczorną konwersację z nim i jego żoną, jesteś sam;
twoje dziecko wyjechało wczoraj
do rodziców twojej żony, jest samo,
bez ciebie i bez swojej matki.
Myślisz o tym wszystkim zanim otworzą się drzwi,
gdy śnieg prószy ci w twarz, chociaż jest
trzecia dekada marca, przemierzając szybko
ten krótki dystans między przystankiem a domem.
Nagle zauważasz tę codzienną samotność, jakby wbrew sobie
i wbrew tym, o których myślisz.
Piotr Sommer

Atweesh the Bus-stop an the Hous

Efter the picturs ye're awa tae see yir mate,
yir missis is at hame by hersel,
yir maw (ye jist stertit thinkin about her
when ye got aff the bus) is in some ither toun
no weel, ye got a telegram fae her yesterday.
Atweesh the 140A bus stop
an yir mate's hous – ken, whaur ye pass
a shop at's shut an gae tae the kiosk tae get yir fags,
an when ye're jist in front o the hous,
an when ye're still in the lift –
afore ye gae intae his hous
an sit doun tae yir nicht o blethers wi him an his missis
ye're aa by yirsel.
Yir laddie gaed aff yesterday tae see his gran an granda.
He's by his sel, he hisnae got you nor his maw.
Ye're thinkin about aa this afore the door opens,
wi the snaw spatterin yir coupon (altho it's near the enn o March)
an ye're hurryin the couple o steps
atweesh the bus-stop an the hous.
An suddenly ye think tae yirsel:
ilka day, this lanesomeness,
sort o like agin aabody,
an agin yirsel,
an agin the fowk ye're thinkin o.
JDMcC, efter Piotr Sommer

Czerwone maki na Monte Cassino

Czy widzisz te gruzy na szczycie?
Tam wróg twój się ukrył jak szczur.
Musicie, musicie, musicie
Za kark wziąć i strącić go z chmur.
I poszli szaleni, zażarci,
I poszli zabijać i mścić,
I poszli jak zawsze uparci,
Jak zawsze za honor się bić.

Czerwone maki na Monte Cassino
Zamiast rosy piły polską krew.
Po tych makach szedł żołnierz i ginął,
Lecz od śmierci silniejszy był gniew.
Przejdą lata i wieki przeminą.
Pozostaną ślady dawnych dni
I tylko maki na Monte Cassino
Czerwieńsze będą, bo z polskiej wzrosną krwi.

Runęli przez ogień, straceńcy,
Niejeden z nich dostał i padł,
Jak ci z Somosierry szaleńcy,
Jak ci spod Racławic sprzed lat.
Runęli impetem szalonym,
I doszli. I udał się szturm.
I sztandar swój biało czerwony
Zatknęli na gruzach wśród chmur.

Czy widzisz ten rząd białych krzyży?
Tam Polak z honorem brał ślub.
Idź naprzód, im dalej, im wyżej,
Tym więcej ich znajdziesz u stóp.
Ta ziemia do Polski należy,
Choć Polska daleko jest stąd,
Bo wolność krzyżami się mierzy,
Historia ten jeden ma błąd.
                              Feliks Konarski

Reid Poppies on Monte Cassino

Dae ye see 'mang the scarnoch up thonder,
Hou thay're skoukin like rattons, your faes?
Nou ye maun, nou ye maun, ye maun cleek thaim
By the hause, fling thaim doun frae the braes!
An thay gaed, in a widdreme o feerich,

An thay gaed, tae tak vengeance an kill,
An thay gaed, steive an staaward as ever,
For thair honour as ever thay will.

Reid poppies on Monte Cassino,
Drank the bluid frae our Polish men's skaith.
Sodgers fell as thay spang'd throu the poppies,
But thair feerich wes starker nor daith.
Tho years will gae bye, an yearhunners,
The mynins o thon days will thole,
An the poppies on Monte Cassino
Growe reid frae the bluid o the Pole.

Throu fire gaed the weirdit yins breengin,
The bullets felled mony a man,
Like the hempies wha wan Samosierra,
An wan Racławice or than.
Wi the bensil o gyties thay chairgit –
Richt throu. Thair assaut bure the gree.
An the reid an white banner o Poland
Ower the cloud-scuggit scarnoch waff't free.

Dae ye see thonner raw o white crosses?
Thare the Pole pledged his honour an swure.
The further, the heicher ye ettle,
Ye'll see thaim spreid wide, mair an mair.
This field an this moul belangs Poland,
Tho the distance tae Poland is lang,
An sen freedom is meisured by crosses,
It wes here, jist, at history gaed wrang.

JDMcC, efter Feliks Konarski

Notes

1   In the Prologue to his translation of Virgil's *Aeneid*. See Coldwell ed. 1957–64.
2   As I have argued repeatedly, it is a complete fallacy to imagine that Scots consists only in those words which are not part of the general English lexicon. Thousands of words are common to all forms of Anglo-Saxon-derived speech, and belong as fully to Scots as to metropolitan or international English.
3   Many Scots writers do use *yir* or *yer* for "your" even in literary writing: I prefer the unmarked form in that register to avoid the suggestion of a socially-marked pronunciation. This whole area of Scots orthographic practice is chronically uncertain: for a detailed discussion see McClure 1997.

References

Coldwell, David, ed. 1957–1964. *Virgil's Aeneid Translated into Scots Verse by Gavin Douglas*. Scottish Text Society Third Series, vols. 25, 27, 28, 30. Edinburgh: Blackwell.

Dryden, John. 1712. Preface to *Ovid's Epistles, Translated by Several Hands*. London: Jacob Tonson.

France, Peter, and Duncan Glen, ed. 1989. *European Poetry in Scotland*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

Hay, George Campbell. 1948. *Wind on Loch Fyne*. Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd.

—. 1952. *O na Ceithir Àirdean* [From the Four Directions]. Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd.

Jack, R.D.S., M.L. McLaughlin, and C. Whyte, ed. 1987. *Leopardi: A Scottis Quair*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

Konarski, Feliks. "Czerwone maki na Monte Cassino." *teksty.org* http://teksty.org/patriotyczne,czerwone-maki,tekst-piosenki

Mackie, Alastair. 2012. *Collected Poems 1954–1994.* Ed. Christopher Rush. Uig, Isle of Lewis: Two Ravens Press.

McClure, J. Derrick. 1997. "The Spelling of Scots: A Difficulty." *Englishes Around the World* 1 (*Studies in Honour of Manfred Görlach*). VEAW G18. Ed. Edgar Schneider. Amsterdam: Benjamins. 173–184.

—. 2000. "William Soutar's *Theme and Variation*: the Gamut of Literary Translation." *Terranglian Territories: Proceedings of the Seventh International Conference on the Literature of Region and Nation, Germersheim 1998*. Ed. Susanne Hagemann. Frankfurt: Peter Lang. 141–159.

—. 2001. "Drummond of Hawthornden and Poetic Translation." *The European Sun. Proceedings of the Seventh International Conference on Scottish Language and Literature, Mediaeval and Renaissance, University of Strathclyde, 16–21 August 1993.* Ed. Graham Caie, Roderick J. Lyall, Sally Mapstone, and Kenneth Simpson. Phantassie: Tuckwell Press. 494–506.

—. 2007. "George Campbell Hay's Translations from Italian Poetry." *Fil súil nglais: A Grey Eye Looks Back. A Festschrift in Honour of Colm Ó Baoill.* Ed. Sharon Arbuthnot and Kaarina Hollo. Ceann Drochaid: Clann Tuirc. 87–96.

—. 2018. "Bringing Gaelic Poetry to Europe." *Imaging Scottishness: European and Domestic Representations*. Ed. Aniela Korzeniowska and Izabela Szymańska. Warszawa: Wydawnictwo Naukowe Semper. 58–70.

Mickiewicz, Adam. "Stepy akermańskie." *Polska-poezja.pl*. https://polska-poezja.pl/lista-wierszy/27-adam-mickiewicz-stepy-akermanskie

Różewicz, Tadeusz. "Ocalony." *poezja.org*. https://poezja.org/wz/R%C3%B3%C5%BCewicz_Tadeusz/1187/Ocalony

Salvini, Luigi. 1942. *Poeti Croati Moderni a cura di Luigi Salvini*. Milano: Garzanti.

Sommer, Piotr. "Miedzy przystankiem a domem." *wolnelektury.pl*. https://wolnelektury.pl/katalog/lektura/sommer-miedzy-przystankiem-a-domem.html

Thomson, Derick S., ed. 1990. *Bardachd na Roinn-Eòrpa an Gàidhlig.* Glaschu [Glasgow]: Gairm.

Elżbieta Niewiadoma
ⓘ https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4634-1594
University of Warsaw

An Analysis of the Polish Translation of Grant Morrison's *Arkham Asylum: A Serious House on Serious Earth*

Abstract

Grant Morrison's work has greatly added to the Scottish graphic novel tradition. In this regard, this paper will look at the recent Polish translation of the 25th anniversary edition of one of his iconic and groundbreaking Batman graphic novels, *Arkham Asylum: A Serious House on Serious Earth.* A brief description and publishing history of the graphic novel will be provided, followed by an analysis of the quality, style and publishing history of the translation in order to produce a final commentary on how Morrison's work has been rendered into the Polish language. It is concluded the translation is largely faithful to its original although it is marred with a number of careless and confusing errors which ultimately have an impact on the reading experience.

Keywords: graphic novel, Scottish graphic novel, comic translation, literal translation, Grant Morrison, English-Polish translation

1. Introduction

The 1980s saw an interesting development in the American comics industry, specifically for the publishing house Detective Comics, now known widely by their abbreviation, DC. At that time, DC was looking for new writers for their graphic novels, and was turning their attention to Great Britain in the hope of finding a new talent. One of these newly discovered talents happened to be Grant Morrison, a young comic-book writer from Scotland working then for *2000 AD,* the renowned English science fiction comic-book anthology. Born in Glasgow in 1960, Morrison was heavily influenced by mystery and detective stories, as well as fantasy, science fiction and even the occult; he personally cites such individuals as Enid Blyton, Michael Moorcock, J.G. Ballard, J.R.R. Tolkien, Alfred Hitchcock and the renowned occultist Aleister Crowley as having played an important part in his life (Hasted 55). These influences bled into his work, and as such successfully aroused the curiosity of Karen Berger, one of DC's editors at the time.

As described in the biographical documentary *Talking with Gods*, Morrison was invited to London for a meeting, during which he pitched what would become an iconic Batman graphic novel work: *Arkham Asylum: A Serious House on Serious Earth.* This cemented Morrison's role in the so-called British invasion of American mainstream comics, being among the first wave of successful writers and artists from Great Britain (Mazur and Danner 175).

Arkham Asylum came out in 1989, and even though it was first published as a 48-page book, its length ended up nearly tripling, largely due to the surrealist and abstract artwork done for the graphic novel by Dave McKean (Halm 67). Morrison created a plot that focused both on Batman and on Amadeus Arkham, the founder of Arkham Asylum. The stories of the two characters intertwine; the plot centred on Batman is directed towards his arrival at the asylum and his subsequent escape from it, while Amadeus Arkham's plot sheds light on how the infamous asylum itself came to be. Amadeus Arkham's story is demonstrated through his diary logs, which provide a literary flashback device that contrasts with the present-day plot within the comic. Both plots have their own villains as well; Batman's features the Joker, along with such villains as Two-Face, Crock, the Mad Hatter, Scarecrow, Clayface, and Maxie Zeus. Amadeus Arkham's plot features the serial killer Martin "Mad Dog" Hawkins, the first patient of Arkham Asylum.

Surrealist and expressionist in its nature, *Arkham Asylum* deals with layers of symbolism allowing for various interpretations of panels and scenes. McKean's artwork provides many visual clues, while Morrison's script contains many references to both popular culture and high literature, as well as the occult. Hence, the graphic novel often becomes vague with its minimal dialogue and surreal illustrations; McKean took care to use photography combined with a blurred, traditional comic style in his illustrations, resulting in: "a simultaneously lifelike and surreal depiction of the asylum, its inhabitants, and the events of the story" (Halm 69). Morrison himself acknowledges how heavily symbolic the short work is, stating that: "because I was doing stuff that was so symbolic, and Dave [McKean] was doing his own stuff that was symbolic, we eventually had two symbol systems merrily fighting each other, with the reader trying to make sense of it all" (Hasted 66).

Arkham Asylum also distinguishes itself through its unusual lettering done by Gaspar Saladino; aside from minor characters whose speech bubbles are lettered in standard comic font, every other character "talks" in a way that reflects their character and personality. For instance, the Joker's words are written in a jagged, red font without a speech balloon, while Batman's words are written in white on a black balloon. Such use of lettering was unusual and unique for comics at the time; often, the lettering did not diverge from the classic black-on-white structure. Therefore, *Arkham Asylum* pushed forward the idea that the graphic design of the words themselves could serve as an aid in character creation.

However, despite *Arkham Asylum's* ingenuity, intellectual depth and impressive sales, its reception was fairly lukewarm. It was met with harsh criticism that even Morrison did not expect, and which he cites as a rather big disappointment to him (Hasted 67). This was mostly ascribed to the nature of the graphic novel; its confusing panel placement, unusual lettering and overwhelming amount of obscure symbolism alienated many readers (Singer n.p.) and caused misunderstanding: "the unusual narrative structure and style of Arkham Asylum caused it to be dismissed as either pretentious or confusing, particularly by an audience expecting a more traditional Batman story" (Halm 69).

Nevertheless, *Arkham Asylum* is still considered to be a classic and one of the most important Batman graphic novels ever published. It was released twice as a special edition in 2004 and 2014, to celebrate its 25th anniversary. Both editions included additional content, such as afterwords, author notes, the author's and illustrator's biographies, photographs of Morrison's original storyboard sketches, as well as Morrison's original script for the comic. Due to its importance and influence, it comes as no surprise that both *Arkham Asylum's* regular issue and subsequent special editions were translated and published into many languages, including Polish.

2. The Polish Publication of *Arkham Asylum*

The regular edition of *Arkham Asylum: A Serious House on Serious Earth*, was translated into Polish under the title *Azyl Arkham: Poważny dom na poważnej ziemi* and published in 2005 by the publishing house Egmont. The first Polish edition was very limited,[1] but was followed by a release of the special edition in greater quantity in 2015, ten years later. The translation of the graphic novel was done by Jarosław Grzędowicz, the lettering by Marzanna Giersz. In 2015, in the Polish 25th anniversary special edition, the translation of Morrison's script was credited to Tomasz Sidorkiewicz. However, it has not been specified who translated Karen Berger's afterword, or the brief descriptions to additional illustrations included in this special edition. Fragments from literature, such as Lewis Carroll's *Alice's Adventures in Wonderland* and Philip Larkin's "Church Going" have been reprinted from previously published Polish translations of the two works.

The following sections will analyse the translation of the special edition, taking into account the translation of the graphic novel itself, as well as the additional content, particularly Morrison's script. Furthermore, select publishing choices regarding the Polish translation will be addressed. *Arkham Asylum* does not have page numeration, therefore given page numbers have been established independently for purposes of clarity and singling out specific translation examples. As such, the first page is counted as the one which first features dialogue.

3. The Translation of the Title

A translation query that is perhaps immediately noticeable is the Polish translation of the title itself. It could be rightly argued that the translation of *asylum* as *azyl* is erroneous; after all, in Polish, *azyl* is a noun used in phrases that mean to seek shelter or refuge, such as "szukanie azylu" ['seeking asylum']. These phrases are often mentioned in the context of political asylum.[2] However, Arkham Asylum has been known to Polish fans as Azyl Arkham ever since the first translations of the location began to appear. Previous Polish translations opted for a more literal translation whilst disregarding semantics but staying true to the alliterative ring of the phrase. Even though a more correct translation would be "Szpital Arkham" ['Arkham hospital'], it simply does not have the mysterious connotation Azyl Arkham has. Therefore, the publisher's choice could be deemed as proper; translating Arkham Asylum as anything else but Azyl Arkham would most likely dissatisfy its readers. The translation of titles often requires consideration beyond the scope of equivalence. In a paper on film-title translation, Santaemilia-Ruiz and Soler Pardo discuss how important it is to consider the translation of titles outside of the realm of translation studies, and to look at it within the context of continuity, entertainment and advertising (212). Therefore, much like in the translation of *Arkham Asylum*, the matter of keeping the strict dictionary meaning of words when translating is pushed aside by publishers, editors or people in charge of marketing; this becomes irrelevant when promoting a certain work that is to be sold to a chosen audience. Rather, consistency and recognition is key, and becomes a very important factor when dealing with a work that is known by a certain title, and no other, to the general public or to fans.

The translation of the subtitle, *A Serious House on Serious Earth*, is interesting to note as well. On the cover of the Polish edition it is translated quite literally: *Poważny dom na poważnej ziemi*. However, on the first page the reader comes across a fragment of the Polish translation of Larkin's poem by Jacek Dehnel, which is supposed to include the subtitle but is clearly dissimilar from that encountered on the cover: *Dom to poważny, stoi na ziemi poważnej* ['A serious house it is, standing on a serious earth']. It can be inferred that the Polish translation of the subtitle for the cover was done differently in order to preserve the style of the original title itself. However, the translated fragment included at the beginning of the comic is preserved in its original form, effectively informing the reader where the subtitle comes from while not interfering with Dehnel's reprinted translation fragment.

4. The Translation of Proper Names

Another important aspect to look at within the Polish translation of *Arkham Asylum* are proper names, specifically character names which are featured in abundance.

Most of them were not translated, and rightfully so; non-English speaking fans familiar with Batman and its main recurring characters know them primarily by their English names. Furthermore, it is important to consider the identity of the superhero or villain which is closely connected to their name. As Anna Mehren argues in her paper dedicated to the translation of names in superhero comics: "The hero is empty without his name; it is his identifier, what makes him admired by common people and feared by villains. This is why it is so important to bring the meaning of the alias as closely as possible to the target language" (171). The Polish translation of *Arkham Asylum* follows this notion to a certain extent, as some names are translated: "Mad Hatter" is translated as "Szalony Kapelusznik," "Black Mask" as "Czarna Maska" and "Scarecrow" as "Strach na Wróble." It may seem puzzling as to why these names have been translated and not others. In the context of a similar example, Mehren rightfully notes that: "decision making about those matters is in most cases a task for the publisher [...] without direct insight into a publishing house's policy [...] any attempt at determining what strategies are followed when dealing with these matters would be reduced to a mere exercise of guessing based on reasoning" (164). As such, it is hard to determine what the motivation and whether it was the publisher's or translator's initiative to translate these three specific names. In the case of the Mad Hatter, it is very possible that a translation was implemented due to the connection with Carroll's *Alice's Adventures in Wonderland*; the most popular Polish translation of the classic children's book gives Mad Hatter's name as "Szalony Kapelusznik." Similarly, the translation of Scarecrow was most likely implemented due to the association of the name with *The Wizard of Oz*. Regardless, these name translations do not harm the integrity of the characters, as the Polish versions refer to the characteristics of the villains, just like the English counterparts.

Another interesting name translation appears in the case of the character of Martin "Mad Dog" Hawkins. The name is translated in the graphic novel as follows:

(1) His name is Martin Hawkins. "Mad Dog" Hawkins.
Nazywał się Martin "Mad Dog" Hawkins. Prawdziwy "Wściekły Pies."
[lit. 'He was called Martin "Mad Dog" Hawkins. A true "Mad Dog."']

It can be seen that Grzędowicz did not translate the original name and surname, but transferred the nickname, and then included its translation, along with an implicit explanation as to the reason for the English nickname with the use of the emphasising word *prawdziwy* 'true.' This was most likely done in an effort to avoid explanatory footnotes. After all, an explanation of sorts would be necessary, as Hawkins is a very minor villain within the Batman universe. Aside from occasional references in other Batman works, *Arkham Asylum* is the only graphic novel in which he is actually present in the narrative. Thus, Polish readers would most likely not be familiar with him at all.

However, most names are transferred, not translated in the Polish edition of *Arkham Asylum*, and thus rely on the reader's prior knowledge of the characters and the meaning of their names. For example, the Joker remains in Polish as "Joker," similarly to Batman, Two-Face, Clayface, Killer Croc and so on. Realistic English anthroponyms, e.g. of the psychiatrists in Arkham Asylum, are kept in English and not translated or given Polish equivalents. The only minor adaptations in the case of proper names have to do with adjustments regarding the rich inflection structure of the Polish language, examples being *Amadeusza Arkhama* ['Amadeus Arkham's'] or *Drogi Batmanie* ['Dear Batman' (voc.)]. Such changes are more than justified, as they are needed in order to preserve grammatical structure and meaning.

5. The Translation of Dialogue

Given the confusing nature of *Arkham Asylum* due to its abstract art and intertwining double plot, it is not surprising that mistakes have been made during the process of translation. The translation of dialogue in *Arkham Asylum* features many minor mistakes which can be attributed to a number of reasons. In some instances, it appears the translation was done in a rush or without properly referencing the source material, possibly because the translator did not closely look at the illustrations. Other times, it seems that the translator was at a loss or confused as to the dialogue and either overtranslated or mistranslated altogether. Instances of fairly literal translation can be observed too; naturally, Grzędowicz did not disregard Polish grammar structure, at the same time remaining as close to the source text (ST) as possible, compromising little in way of structure and vocabulary.

The following are examples of close and partial adherence to the ST that can be found throughout the dialogue:

(2) I ask him why he chose to destroy only the faces and sexual organs of his victims.
Zapytałem, dlaczego masakrował jedynie twarze i organy płciowe swych ofiar.
[lit. 'I asked why he massacred only the faces and sexual organs of his victims']

(3) You're going to hit me with all the local folklore now, right?
A teraz wyjedziesz z tym całym lokalnym folklorem, tak?
[lit. 'And now you'll come out with all that local folklore, right?']

(4) It's salt. Why don't you sprinkle some on me, honey?
To sól. Może mnie trochę posypiesz, skarbie?
[lit. 'It's salt. Maybe you will sprinkle a little, darling?']

Examples (2) and (3) show a certain consistency on the part of the translator to translate syntagmatically, which consequently results in mistakes. In (2) it can be seen that "sexual organs" has been translated as "organy płciowe," while in (3) "local folklore" has been rendered as "lokalny folklor." The term "sexual organs" should have been translated as "narządy płciowe," and while "lokalny folklor" is not entirely wrong, the speaker in question is not referring to art as the Polish word *folklor* tends to denote, but local legends or stories. Therefore, a more adequate solution would be to translate the phrase as "lokalne legendy" ['local legends']. It is important to note that the second example features a rather semantically disparate translation of the word *destroy*, which has been translated as *masakrować* 'massacre.' It is interesting how instances of phrasing that is too literal are intertwined with such semantic overreaches or, for instance, clever solutions for idiomatic phrasing, as can be seen in the third example; the translation of the phrase "You're going to hit me with" ['A teraz wyjedziesz z tym'] captures its casualness very well.

Example (4) shows just how awkward the phrase sounds in Polish. Due to Polish inflection as well as the copied punctuation, it is not clear what exactly Batman is supposed to sprinkle on the Joker, despite salt being mentioned in the first sentence. An alternative solution would be to simply use *przyprawisz* 'to season' instead of *posypiesz* 'to sprinkle.' While a word change would help the original meaning come across more smoothly, the fragment is still awkward in its phrasing; Grzędowicz does a near word-for-word translation, preserving English punctuation and syntax. As such, an ideal correction of this translation would involve changing not only the syntax, but the punctuation as well: *To sól. Przypraw mnie nią, skarbie* ['It's salt. Season me with it, darling']. The proposed translation captures Joker's tone and keeps the phrase free of awkwardness.

It is worth noting that in comic translation, a literal approach may sometimes be inescapable due to space constraints: "comic books represent not only the typical constraints of language [idiolect, double meanings, idioms, et al.] but also space limitations […] comics provide information not only through words but they are also linked to an image and the translator should confine translation to the space they have" (Scott J. n.p.). However, due to available contemporary technology, image manipulation and retouching is much easier and less expensive today than it used to be. Granted, publisher costs have to be taken into account, but, for instance, if there is a need to reshape speech balloons so that the target text (TT) can be included comfortably, it is usually done so (Zanettin n.p.). In the case of *Arkham Asylum*, this task is simpler in the case of the Joker's dialogue, which is not contained within any speech bubbles. It can be seen that in some instances, the Polish translation of the Joker's dialogue is slightly longer than the original (Grzędowicz and Sidorkiewicz 46). This seems to have benefited the translation greatly, as Grzędowicz translates the Joker in a way faithful to his character, instilling Polish diminutives, colourful phrasings and quips that make

up the Joker's grotesque and humorous speech, without having to be concerned about space constraints. For example, when in the ST the Joker calls Batman *sweetheart* and *honey pie*, we have in the Polish TT *kwiatuszku* 'flower (dim.)' and *pysiaczku* 'sweetie pie,' which are true adaptations to the faux fond tone the Joker expresses towards Batman.

However, the aforementioned way of translating rarely occurs, especially for other characters which have their speech graphically confined to word balloons. An example of this is as follows:

(5) You okay? You know you don't have to go in there. Let me organize a swat team or something.
     Co jest? Słuchaj, nie musisz tam iść. Mogę wziąć antyterrorystów i….
     [lit. 'What's going on? Listen, you don't have to go there. I can take the counter-terrorists and...']

As can be noticed, Commissioner Gordon's words have been shortened, ultimately projecting a more terse exchange. The use of the blunt "Co jest?" contrasts with the concerned "You okay?." Likewise, the last sentence has been significantly simplified, the translator opting to even change Commissioner Gordon's full sentence into an unfinished one. This shortening is understandable due to how small both the panel and speech balloon are in both cases. *Arkham Asylum* varies between large, spacious illustrative panels and small, claustrophobic ones, which in turn are specifically designed to play off each other visually, enhancing the notion of simultaneously feeling trapped and overwhelmed. Therefore, despite the technological possibility of manipulating speech balloon sizes and even illustrations, doing so in excess would severely hinder the intended visual reception.

Another example of such an issue are the panels depicting fragments of Amadeus Arkham's diary. Amadeus Arkham's speech bubbles are small and featured on the backdrop of elongated and narrow panels, creating a clear Gothic impression; as a result, the words appear in small font. Therefore, it is most likely the reason why, for instance, Amadeus Arkham's words are often translated in a literal manner, in turn creating an awkward effect:

(6) I returned to the family home on a cool Spring morning in 1920, shortly after mother's funeral.
     Do rodzinnego domu powróciłem zimnego, wiosennego dnia w 1920 roku. Zaraz po pogrzebie matki.
     [lit. 'To the family home I returned on a cold, Spring day in the year 1920. Right after my mother's funeral.']
(7) And outside, far off, a dog barks, on and on through the whole restless night.
     A gdzieś daleko szczekały psy. Bez końca, przez całą długą bezsenną noc.

[lit. 'And somewhere far away the dogs barked. Without stopping, throughout the entire sleepless night.']
(8) She opened her own throat with a pearl-handed razor.
Poderżnęła sobie gardło brzytwą o rączce wyłożonej macicą perłową.
[lit. 'She cut her throat with a razor with a handle inlaid with mother-of-pearl.']

In examples (6) and (7) the ST is rendered literally into the TT, and the sentences are awkwardly broken up; this creates a rather clumsy, isolated sentence when a comma would have sufficed, as in the original. There is also a change in word order and tense in example (6), while in example (7), instances of omission and grammatical number can be observed. Example (8) shows a clumsy translation of the compound noun, *pearl-handed*, which is translated as "brzytwa o rączce wyłożonej macicą perłową [lit. 'A razor with a handle inlaid with mother-of-pearl']. It is clear Grzędowicz opted for a descriptive translation of the razor in question, even though it would have been enough to write, for example, "o perłowej rączce" 'pearl-handled.' Such an adaptation would have been simpler to read and also would have saved space. These clumsy translations influence the impression the reader forms of Amadeus Arkham, who as a character is a learned, eloquent man, something that is reflected in the writing style of his diary entries in the ST. The Polish translation significantly changes that style, one that is more compact and awkward instead of lofty and poetic, subsequently altering character portrayal.

Unfortunately, there are also mistranslations that can be found in the Polish TT, and while some are less significant than others, they still have a certain impact on the reading experience. The following examples illustrate common mistakes throughout the translation:

(9) Problems out of town.
Kłopoty w mieście. [lit. 'Problems in town.']
(10) You heard him folks! Hit the trail!
Słyszeliście chłopaki! Puścić ich! [lit. 'You heard it folks! Let them go!']
(11) Not even a cute, long-legged boy in swimming trunks?
Jak to, nawet ślicznego, długonogiego chłopca w obcisłych kalesonach?
[lit. 'How come, not even a lovely long-legged boy in tight long-johns?']
(12) Time to begin the evening entertainment, I think.
Czas na popołudniowe zajęcia. [lit. 'Time to begin the afternoon entertainment.']
(13) Doors open and close, applauding my flight.
Drzwi otwierają się i zamykają, oklaskując mój upadek.
[lit. 'Doors open and close, applauding my fall.']

The error in (9) is easy to notice; Batman, who utters the words, clearly says he was having trouble outside of Gotham, not in it as the translation implies. Example (10) is more inconspicuous, but indeed constitutes a mistake. In the context of the sentence, the Joker is talking to the hostages, which is indicated by the idiom "hit the trail," meaning 'to leave.' Therefore, Grzędowicz most likely misunderstood the idiom, thinking the Joker was referring to his underlings. The mistake may have been brought about by the accompanying illustration, which depicts two ambiguous looking men that could be either hostages or other asylum prisoners.

Example (11) features an overtranslation and a mistake; the Joker is referring to swimming trunks, not long-johns. It can be assumed that the translator misunderstood *swimming trunks*, as a clear solution would have been to translate the term into its Polish equivalent *kąpielówki*, something Grzędowicz did not do. Example (12) is more apparent in its error; the Joker is talking about evening entertainment, not afternoon entertainment as the Polish translation says; after all, the plot of *Arkham Asylum* takes place during the late evening and night-time. Example (13) shows that Grzędowicz misunderstood the meaning of the word *flight*. In this part of the graphic novel, a panic-stricken Amadeus Arkham runs through the asylum, opening and slamming doors shut behind him. Thus, *flight* is used here in the context of fleeing. Grzędowicz's erroneous translation is confusing, as it gives the reader the impression that Amadeus fell, and that the doors were slamming shut and opening of their own accord, which is not the case.

Aside from the exemplified mistranslations, there also occur a number of curious translation decisions within the TT, some more questionable than others. An example of this would be a seeming oversight where the word *clocks* (Morrison 23) was substituted with the word *przekładnia* 'transmission' (Grzędowicz and Sidorkiewicz 23), even though the illustration features clocks. Another example is the decision to translate a rhetorical question as a statement:

(14) Aren't I good enough to eat?
      Jestem tak dobry, że można by mnie schrupać.
      [lit. 'I am so good, that I could be munched on.']

Such a decision was most likely taken due to the fact that the Polish phrasing, which carries a similar meaning to the rhetorical question, is more idiomatic and natural. A similar choice can be observed with the translation of the culture-specific phrase *funhouse* (Morrison 16), which is translated as a more generalized term, *wesołe miasteczko* 'amusement park' (Grzędowicz and Sidorkiewicz 16). The choice is not surprising, as there is no exact translation for the term funhouse, which is more culture specific to the USA, and the general term does not have an impact on the reception of the dialogue. Another interesting translation of a culture-specific phrase can be seen in the following example:

(15) At home to Mr. Tetchy, aren't we?
     Bzdyczymy się dzisiaj, tak? [lit. 'Huffing about today, yes?']

The phrase "at home to Mr. Tetchy" refers to an imaginary person we are not happy to have at our place (Paul Q. n.p.). Furthermore, "to be tetchy" means to be irritable or moody, which is essentially what the Polish translation is implying; the phrase *bzdyczymy się* 'to huff about' was taken from the adjective *nabzdyczony* 'huffy.' While Grzędowicz latched onto the meaning of the word 'tetchy' itself, the outcome is fairly positive, as the translation of the entire phrase is similar semantically to the source.

6. Lettering

What is particularly noteworthy regarding the Polish edition of *Arkham Asylum* is the outstanding lettering done by Marzanna Giersz throughout the graphic novel. As already mentioned, it plays a crucial role within the work, as it is both an important visual and narrative element. Therefore, a skilled letterer for a translation is of great importance; translation scholar Federico Zanettin rightfully points out that a letterer can even act as a translator, as comics often have a "tendency to treat words as visual elements" (n.p.). Giersz's lettering clearly adheres to this notion, as not only have respective character dialogues, signs and inscriptions been lettered nearly identically as in the original, but also, for instance, almost all onomatopoeic sounds have been translated into their Polish equivalents and manipulated graphically so as to look the same. This is especially commendable since translating sound effects is not easy: "onomatopoeia is particularly difficult to translate because even if a particular sound is heard similarly by people of different cultures, it is often expressed using different consonant strings in different languages" (Salor and Marasligil 8). The only issue that appears with the lettering is that, as a Polish reviewer claims, some of it makes the text challenging to read (Wronka n.p.). This is largely due to the fact that Polish spelling involves letters with diacritics, which become hard to notice in the style of Saladino's unorthodox lettering.

7. The Translation of *Arkham Asylum's* Script and Additional Content

As mentioned above, the special edition of *Arkham Asylum* features much additional content, and the Polish edition includes its translations. Noteworthy are the translations of "patient cards," which are self-written blurbs by each patient in *Arkham Asylum*, including Batman himself. The text font as well as the style and tone of each blurb is preserved in the Polish translation, showcasing the personality

of each villain as intended in the original. Likewise, the biographical notes about McKean and Morrison have been translated without any noticeable concerns, as have Karen Berger's afterword and Grant Morrison's introduction to his script.

However, Morrison's *Arkham Asylum* script is the highlight of the additional content. The script contains the dialogue as well as directives, commentaries and footnotes meant for the artist to follow when creating illustrations. In the Polish special edition, this script is translated in a way that could be called two-fold; the commentary, footnotes and directives by Morrison are translated by Tomasz Sidorkiewicz, but the dialogue in the script itself is Grzędowicz's translation. The only exceptions are the additional translations of cut dialogue which were probably done by Sidorkiewicz. Therefore, while Sidorkiewicz is the one credited, it is clear that it was Grzędowicz's dialogue translation that was reprinted in the script itself, as the aforementioned translation issues are all present. Although no comment on this has been provided by the translator or publisher, it can be deduced that this was done for the sake of continuity; if the dialogue found in *Arkham Asylum's* script were re-translated in its entirety by Sidorkiewicz, or even simply corrected, but the translation by Grzędowicz were kept as it was in the graphic novel itself, it would be very confusing for the Polish reader. It would create a false impression of the dialogue in Morrison's *Arkham Asylum* script being drastically different from the one in the finished and illustrated graphic novel, which is not the case. Aside from a few cut scenes, Morrison's dialogue proposition in his original *Arkham Asylum* script was largely kept as it was in the published version with illustrations. Furthermore, it is important to note that Morrison's *Arkham Asylum* script provides a panel-by-panel guideline as to how the graphic novel was envisioned; changing the dialogue would make it harder for the reader to navigate the script and find parts of interest.

Even though Grzędowicz's translation is included, Sidorkiewicz's translation of Morrison's directives and footnotes within the script are done conscientiously. Few typos and mistakes can be found; a notable one is the translation of the word *nurse* into *zakonnica* 'nun.' Sidorkiewicz keeps the casual tone of Morrison's script, which is for example seen through the translation of Morrison's endearing way of referring to the occultist Crowley; "Uncle Aleister Crowley" is translated faithfully into *Wujek Aleister Crowley*, pointing to Morrison's fascination and knowledge of the occult figure. Furthermore, Sidorkiewicz preserves all references to literature, architecture and pop culture, not omitting anything. Names and titles are mostly left in English for ease of reference, save for some instances of architecture (e.g. "Chartres Cathedral" has been translated as "Katedra w Chartres"). The original formatting is kept as well, including Morrison's notes on the margins of the script, which are also translated and lettered in such a way so as to mimic his hand-writing. Crossed out or blotted out words are also carried on to the Polish version of the script; in some instances, even the spacing is mimicked, such as on page twelve of the script where a large open space is kept as in the

original. Therefore, substantial effort was put into the translation of Morrison's script, especially from a visual point of view, excluding the actual dialogue which was preserved, together with its mistakes.

Further additional content is kept as it is in the original; photographs of Morrison's original plot synopsis and character cast are included, as well as his hand-written and hand-drawn storyboards, thumbnails and notes. However, save for the descriptive blurbs, this content is not translated, and understandably so; Morrison's handwriting is mostly illegible. Therefore an attempt at translating the content into Polish would be futile and unnecessary. The content was not meant to be read, but simply showcased.

The last pages of the special edition include illustrations from McKean and other artists, and are reprinted in the Polish version just as in the original, with one exception. On the last page, an afterword by Polish journalist Kamil Śmiałkowski is printed over an illustration of the Joker. While the one-page afterword is valuable in how it emphasises the importance of Morrison and other British Invasion writers in the graphic novel industry, one cannot help but wonder as to why it was simply not printed on an additional page at the end. It is likely that there was a strictly set number of pages that could be published, and the afterword, which could have been added at the very end of the publishing process, was deemed important enough to be printed over the illustration. This is what the editor-in-chief of the Egmont publishing subsidiary, "Klub Świata Komiksu" ['Comic World Club'] Tomasz Kołodziejczak implies. Kołodziejczak explained in a Q&A that it was decided a Polish afterword would be vital for new readers ("Egmont odpowiada" n.p.). However, it is important to note that much information about the British invasion, the circumstances of Morrison's hiring, and Morrison's own interests and context for the creation of *Arkham Asylum* can be found in Karen Berger's afterword and in his biographical note and introduction, all of which have been translated. Therefore, the decision to include a rather redundant afterword seems odd.

8. Conclusion

Arkham Asylum: A Serious House on Serious Earth is an iconic work regarded as one of the most important Batman graphic novels published to date. It influenced not only the American comic industry, but greatly contributed to the Scottish graphic novel tradition and its canon. As such, the Polish translation of the 25th anniversary special edition of this important work deserves both criticism and praise. While there are a number of translation issues, as well as certain questionable publishing choices, the core of the translated work is largely intact. Panel arrangement, illustrations, lettering as well as most additional content are faithful to the original, having been translated and graphically manipulated

accordingly. While not perfect, the dialogue is translated fairly well; proper names are not translated for the most part, and a certain number of attempts to translate wordplay occur.[3] However, the overall dialogue translation shows a literal tendency. As a result, along with a significant number of overtranslations and mistranslations, a stylistic clumsiness emerges which ultimately has an impact on the reading experience. *Arkham Asylum* is known for its reading difficulty, but with the additional translation and publication mishaps, the translation only seems to create greater difficulty for the Polish readership.

These issues have not gone unnoticed by Polish readers, who in fact have pointed out that despite the release of the new edition, there has been no effort to correct previous mistakes. In the Q&A with Kołodziejczak, an anonymous user points out the mistakes in the Polish special edition of *Arkham Asylum*, and asks about the possibility of a corrected reprint in the future, noting that for such a masterpiece, one would like to have a perfect copy ("Egmont odpowiada" n.p.). However, Kołodziejczak's response is dismissive, calling the "documented" (sic) mistakes subjective, and consequently stating that another Polish version of *Arkham Asylum* will not be released, nor will additional copies be printed ("Egmont odpowiada" n.p.). The response is not as surprising as one might think; even if the translation errors had been noticed after the first regular printing, any additional corrections in the subsequent editions would have resulted in additional costs.

On the other hand, the graphic novel's additional content is clearly translated better; the highlight of it is Morrison's script, which is translated and adapted into Polish with care, excluding Grzędowicz's reprinted translation. As was deduced, the graphic novel translation was probably reprinted in *Arkham Asylum's* script without corrections so as to avoid reader confusion. Therefore, we can presume it was not altered to any significant degree, even if Sidorkiewicz were up to the task.

Regardless of its problems, *Azyl Arkham: Poważny dom na poważnej ziemi* is a welcome rarity in its own right, as special editions of comic books are not often published in Poland. The state of comic book translation and its availability here today is significantly better than a few years ago; publishers take on work eagerly, and translations of both popular and niche titles are more readily available for fans, who now have the option of simply walking into bookstores and buying comic books, or even signing up for a monthly subscription (Smoter n.p.). However, availability does not equal quality, something that Polish fans regularly notice in the translations of their favorite titles. As was evidenced by the Q&A with Kołodziejczak, readers are indeed grateful for the publishing (or republishing) of iconic works, but also express a need for translations that are more careful and meticulous. It is also important to note that research on comic book and graphic novel translation is still a largely underdeveloped area (Zanettin n.p.), and is lacking in information, proper studies and available statistics. As Zanettin points out, "comics translation […] encompasses all different aspects of the transfer of comics and their publication in a foreign country, and is concerned with the

practices of graphic artists, letterers and editors as well as those of the 'translator proper'" (n.p.). Therefore, a study of comic book translation is not simply a matter of looking at the text; it is a matter of looking at the visual elements and publication history as well. Hopefully in the future, coherent graphic-novel translation criteria will emerge, criteria that will encompass to a certain degree all the elements included in the creation of graphic novels.

Notes

1 Egmont has not released information on the number of copies published in 2005, but Polish fans have commented on online forums on how limited in quantity the original translation was, estimating the number to be no more than a 1000 copies.

2 While the main connotation of asylum is to seek refuge, official dictionaries do recognise it as possibly referring to an asylum, but often in a historical, outdated context (*Wielki słownik angielsko-polski PWN Oxford*).

3 In a few instances, Grzędowicz translates rhyme and alliteration in a clever way, for example in the translation of Mad Hatter's limericks (Grzędowicz and Sidorkiewicz 58–59) or the Joker's word play (Grzędowicz and Sidorkiewicz 23).

References

"azyl." *Wielki słownik angielsko-polski PWN Oxford*.
    https://oxford.pwn.pl/szukaj/azyl.html

"Egmont odpowiada: KŚK." 2015.
    http://alejakomiksu.com/nowosci/22243/Egmont-odpowiada-KSK-listo-pad-2015/.

Grzędowicz, Jarosław, and Tomasz Sidorkiewicz, ed. 2015. *Azyl Arkham: Poważny dom na poważnej ziemi*. Warszawa: Wydawnictwo Egmont Polska.

Halm, Matthew. 2012. "Batman: Arkham Asylum A Serious House on Serious Earth." *Critical Survey of Graphic Novels: Heroes & Superheroes.* Ed. Bart H. Beaty and Stephen Weiner. New York: Salem Press. 67–70.

Hasted, Nick. 1995. "Interview with Grant Morrison." *The Comics Journal* 176: 52–82.

Mazur, Dan, and Alexander Danner. 2014. *Comics: A Global History, 1968 to the Present.* London: Thames & Hudson Ltd.

Mehren, Anna. 2011. "Peculiarities in the Language of Superhero Comics: The Names of the Characters and Their Translation into Spanish." *New Approaches to Specialized English Lexicology and Lexicography*. Ed. Isabel Balteiro. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing. 153–174.

Morrison, Grant, ed. 2014. *Arkham Asylum: A Serious House on Serious Earth*. New York: DC Comics.

PaulQ. 2016. "At Home to Mr. Tetchy." https://forum.wordreference.com/threads/at-home-to-mr- tetchy.3179648/

Salor, Erinç, and Canan Marasligil. 2013. "Translating Comics: It's not Just in the Bubble." *Norwich Papers* 21: 1–10.

Santaemilia-Ruiz, José, and Betlem Soler Pardo. 2014. "Translating Film Titles. Quentin Tarantino, on Difference and Globalization." *Babel* 60.2: 193–215.

Scott J. 2010. "The Translation of Comic Books." http://translation-blog.trustedtranslations.com/difficulties-translating-comics-2017-04-21.html

Singer, Marc. 2005. "A Serious House on Serious Earth." http://notthebeastmaster.typepad.com/ weblog/2005/10/a_serious_house.html

Smoter, Mateusz. 2018. "Kolekcji u nas dostatek – o wydawanych w Polsce kolekcjach komiksowych." https://nietylkogry.pl/post/o-wydawanych-w-polsce-kolekcjach-komiksowych

Wronka, Tymoteusz. 2015. "'Batman. Azyl Arkham:' Dzieło sztuki – recenzja." https://naekranie.pl/recenzje/batman-azyl-arkham-dzielo-sztuki-recenzja.

Zanettin, Frederic. 2018. "Translating Comics and Graphic Novels." https://www.researchgate.net/publication/324497649_Translating_comics_and_graphic_novels.

Filmography

Grant Morrison: Talking with Gods. 2010. Dir. Patrick Meaney. Prod. Sequart Organization.

Contributors

GILLIAN BEATTIE-SMITH lectures in Linguistics at The Open University. Gillian's research area is women's creation and performance of identity. She is currently writing a book on the Scottish journal of Sarah Stoddart Hazlitt. Her research subjects also include Dorothy Wordsworth, and Elizabeth Grant. Her work is published by Routledge and in journals. Gillian is a Senior Fellow of the Higher Education Academy, with published scholarship in online and blended learning and teaching. She is the founder of, and manages, the group, Scottish Women Writers, which promotes awareness of women's writing in and about Scotland. She lives in the Scottish Borders.

ALEKSANDRA BUDREWICZ works at the Institute of Modern Languages (Pedagogical University of Cracow, Poland). She graduated in Polish and English Studies. She studied in Poland (Cracow – Jagiellonian University, Pedagogical University) and in the UK (London – University of London); in 2016 she was a Visiting Fellow at the Institute of Modern Languages Research (School of Advanced Study, University of London). She has published on Polish, English and American literature, as well as on literary translation and comparative literature; in general she has published 3 books and more than 50 articles. Her major field of interest and research includes the Polish reception and translations of British writers such as William Shakespeare, Charles Dickens, George Eliot and William Morris.

TOM HUBBARD is a semi-retired academic whose last full-time posts in 2011–2012 were, successively, Lynn Wood Neag Distinguished Visiting Professor of Scottish Literature at the University of Connecticut and Professeur invité at the University of Grenoble. He is a novelist, poet, and the author, editor or co-editor of many books and scholarly articles. He was the first Librarian of the Scottish Poetry Library and is a Fellow of the Association of Scottish Literary Studies as well as a Member of the Széchenyi Academy of Arts and Letters, Budapest. He gave the present paper as a keynote address to the 2018 Scotland in Europe conference at the University of Warsaw.

BARRY KEANE is Associate Professor in Comparative and Translation Studies in the Institute of English Studies at the University of Warsaw. He has written widely in the fields of Classical Tradition, Irish and Scottish literature, and Polish literature. His book publications include the Polish-to-English verse translated and

critical editions of the works of Jan Kochanowski and the Baroque poetess Anna Stanisławska; and most *recently Irish Drama in Poland* (2016) with Chicago Press/ Intellect Ltd, and critical and bibliographical themed monographs on the Polish Renaissance (2018) and the Polish Baroque (2019) for *Oxford Bibliographies*.

MONIKA KOCOT, PhD, is Assistant Professor in the Department of British Literature and Culture at the University of Łodź, Poland. She is the author of *Playing Games of Sense in Edwin Morgan's Writing* (Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang, 2016) and co-editor of *Języki (pop)kultury w literaturze, mediach i filmie* ['Languages of (Pop) Culture in Literature, Film, and Media'] Łódź: Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu Łódzkiego, 2015) and *Nie tylko Ishiguro. Szkice o literaturze anglojęzycznej w Polsce* ['Not Only Ishiguro. Essays om Anglophone Literature in Poland'] Łódź: Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu Łódzkiego, 2019). She has published articles on contemporary Scottish poetry and prose, Native American writing, and comparative literature. She is a member of the Association for Cultural Studies, the Association for Scottish Literary Studies, Scottish Centre for Geopoetics, and Polish Cognitive Linguistics Association. She is the President of The K.K. Baczynski Literary Society.

ANIELA KORZENIOWSKA is Professor in Translation Studies and Head of the Department of Applied Linguistics and of the Scottish Studies Research Group at the Institute of English Studies, University of Warsaw. Her academic fields of interest and her publications cover both Translation and Scottish Studies, with emphasis on Scotland's languages and literature, and their translation. Of special concern are issues of identity. She is co-organiser of the "Scotland in Europe" conferences and has co-edited five volumes of articles within the Scotland-in-Europe/Europe-in-Scotland theme.

DOMINIKA LEWANDOWSKA-RODAK is Assistant Professor at the Institute of English Studies, University of Warsaw. Her research interests include contemporary Scottish and English prose with particular emphasis on urban writing, photography theory and literary translation. She is a member of the Scottish Studies Research Group established at the University of Warsaw's Institute of English Studies. She has published articles and book chapters on the works of several contemporary Scottish and English novelists, as well as a monograph entitled *Iain Sinclair, London and the Photographic: The Significance of the Visual Medium for the Writer's Prose*, exploring the links between Sinclair's London writing and photography theory.

J. DERRICK MCCLURE is an Honorary Senior Lecturer in the English Department of Aberdeen University (retired from teaching 2009). Publications include *Why Scots Matters, Language, Poetry and Nationhood* and *Doric: the Dialect*

of North-East Scotland (monographs), *A Kist o Skinklan Things* (anthology of selected 20th-century Scots poetry, with annotations and glossary), eleven multi-author volumes edited singly or in collaboration, over 120 refereed papers in learned journals, conference proceedings volumes and festschrifts, and translations from, among others, Charles Baudelaire, Jorge Luis Borges, Wilhelm Busch, Aonghas Pàdraig Caimbeul, Lewis Carroll, Heinrich Heine, Alfred Kolleritsch, Sorley McLean, Schoschana Rabinovici, Antoine de Saint-Éxupéry and William Shakespeare.

ELŻBIETA NIEWIADOMA is a PhD student at the Institute of English Studies at the University of Warsaw. She teaches English writing and grammar. Her research focuses on the comic medium and comic book/graphic novel theory, with emphasis on works written in the English language. She is particularly interested in the translation of English comics into Polish, and conducts studies pertaining to the translation of both printed and digital titles. Furthermore, she is actively researching the comic medium in the digital age and studying how it is influenced by the Internet. Her thesis, entitled: "The Webcomic Dimension for Our Millennial Space: Translation Queries in the Context of Contemporary Theoretical Investigation" encompasses the aforementioned subjects of interest.

MARK Ó FIONNÁIN teaches English, Irish, Irish Culture and Translation Studies at the John Paul II Catholic University of Lublin. He is the author of *Translating in Times of Turmoil*, on the translations into Irish by Liam Ó Rinn of Adam Mickiewicz. His main areas of interest and research include Irish, Scottish Gaelic and Manx, their literatures, and related issues of translation. He is also a qualified Irish language translator and has translated into Irish from both Russian (short stories by Daniíl Kharms and Aleksándr Vvedénski, and the novel *Омон Ра* by Víktor Pelévin) and Polish (stories by Sławomir Mrożek, and the graphic novel *KOSTKA*).

AGNIESZKA PISKORSKA is Associate Professor at the Institute of English Studies, University of Warsaw. Her research interests include relevance-theoretic pragmatics, figurative language, translation studies and verbal humour. In her work, she explores the notions of indeterminacy and weak effects, and attempts to account for various functions of communication in relevance-theoretic terms.

PETRA JOHANA PONCAROVÁ is a Senior Lecturer at the Department of Anglophone Literatures and Cultures, Charles University, Prague. Her research focuses on modern writing in Scottish Gaelic, especially on Derick Thomson, Tormod Caimbeul, Sorley MacLean, and Ruaraidh Erskine of Mar. Her latest publications include a chapter on Derick Thomson in the collective monograph *The Poetics of Place and Space in Scottish Literature* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2019)

and the upcoming *Scotnote* on Derick Thomson (Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 2020). Her Czech version of Tormod Caimbeul's seminal Gaelic novel *Deireadh an Fhoghair* (*Konec podzimu*, 2018) is the first rendition of the novel in any foreign language.

EWA SZYMAŃSKA-SABALA is Assistant Lecturer at the Warsaw School of Pedagogical Sciences. She teaches British literature and culture and second language acquisition. She completed her PhD on the subject of doubling and duality in novels by Scottish women writers of the 1990s. Her research interests include contemporary Scottish fiction, Women's Studies, Neo-Victorian literature, and discourse analysis. She has published articles on Ali Smith, Jackie Kay, Kate Atkinson, A.L. Kennedy, Janice Galloway, and Jessie Kesson. She also holds a Master Degree in Polish Literature from the University of Warsaw.

IZABELA SZYMAŃSKA is Associate Professor at the Institute of English Studies, University of Warsaw. Her research interests include theoretical linguistics, especially the Construction Grammar framework, and translation studies. In the latter area her leading topics are the interface between linguistic and cultural aspects of translation, the dynamics of translation norms, translating for children, and multiple translations of literary works. She is the author of the monograph *Mosaics. A Construction-Grammar-Based Approach to Translation* (2011) and many articles on translation theory and practice, especially on translations of the classics of English children's literature in Poland. She co-organises the "Scotland in Europe" conferences and has co-edited five collected volumes on Scottish culture and its interactions with European culture.

IRMINA WAWRZYCZEK is Professor of Anglo-American cultural history at the Maria Curie Skłodowska University in Lublin, Poland. Much of her research work centres on British and American print media texts, past and present, as expressions of various aspects of cultural identity. She has recently ventured into the interdisciplinary study of tourism promotion media as areas of dynamic national and regional identity making processes.